310.5
CUK-H00596-104-003-CRCU001

# THE
# CALCUTTA REVIEW

*An Illustrated Monthly*

Established 1844

THIRD SERIES

Volume XLVI

104

JANUARY—MARCH
1933

CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
Acc. No.

PUBLISHED BY
THE UNIVERSITY OF CALCUTTA

CUK-H00596-104-CRCU001
910.5
003

THE

# CALCUTTA REVIEW

*An Illustrated Monthly*

Established 1844

THIRD SERIES

Volume XLVI

104

JANUARY—MARCH
1933

PUBLISHED BY

THE UNIVERSITY OF CALCUTTA

CRCU 1

| | |
|---|---|
| *First Series* ... | 1844 |
| *New Series* ... | 1913 |
| *Third Series (Monthly)* ... | 1921 |

# THE CALCUTTA REVIEW

## Volume XLVI ; Numbers 1—3

## JANUARY—MARCH, 1933

### CONTENTS

Page.

The Punjab University Convocation Address—Sir Hassan Subrawardy, O.B.E., M.D., F.R.C.S.I., Vice-Chancellor, Calcutta University ... 1
From a Ruined Garden (*Poem*)—Wade Oliver ... 12
Gautama Buddha—(*Poem*)—Wade Oliver ... 12
Western Influence in Bengali Literature—Rabindranath Tagore ... ... ... ... 13
Romanticism—Dhirendranath Ghosh ... ... 15
Thoughts suggested by some Elizabethan Plays—Rashranjan Basu ... ... ... 33
Laxey (*Poem*)—Leland J. Berry ... ... 38
Ernest Dowson—Amiyakumar Sen, M.A. ... ... 39
Co-education—Vaman H. Pandit ... ... 59
Frail Lovers—(*Poem*) Gurdyal Singh Wadalia ... 64
Kalidas as a Dramatic Artist—Makhanlal Mukherjee... 65
History of the East India Company's Trade in Bengal (1757-1765)—Kali Kinkar Datta, M.A. ... ... 71
Reunion (*Poem*)—H. W. B. Moreno ... ... 111
The Literary Ideas of Gustave Flaubert as revealed in his Correspondence—By Millicent A. Das, M.A. ... 113
Ever-Never—Never-Ever (*Poem*)—David W. Cade ... 134
The Cloudy Day—Hrishikesh Bhattacharyya, M.A. ... 135
The Wrong Heaven—Hrishikesh Bhattacharyya, M.A. ... 137

Reviews :

Truth about India—Priya Ranjan Sen ... ... ... 141
O Oriente Portuguese—Priya Ranjan Sen... ... ... 141
Justice for Hungary—Priya Ranjan Sen ... ... 142
The Heart of Hindusthan—H. C. R. C. ... ... 143

Page.

OURSELVES :

Our Vice-Chancellor's Speech ... ... ... 144
Result of the Preliminary Scientific M. B. Examinations, November, 1932 ... ... ... ... 149
Result of the First M. B. Examination, November, 1932 ... 149
Result of the Second M. B. Examination, November, 1932 ... 149
Result of the Third M. B. Examination, November, 1932 ... 150
Jogendranath Ghosh's Research Prize in Comparative Indian Law for 1932 ... ... ... 150
A Protest—Mrs. C. A. F. Rhys Davids ... ... 151
The Reply—Amulyachandra Sen, M.A. ... ... 152
Krishnakumari-Ganesh Prasad Medal and Prize ... ... 152

The Message of Shelley's "Prometheus Unbound"—James H. Cousins ... ... ... 155
Rise of the Calcutta Money Market in relation to Public Borrowing and Public Credit—P. Datta, M.A., Ph.D. 171
Karma (*Poem*)—Leland J. Berry ... ... 204
~~New Cotton Goods Tariff—Krishna Kumar Sarma 205~~
Question and Answer (*Poem*)—Mohinimohan Chatterjee, M.A., B.L. ... ... ... 214
The Services of the Muslims to the Sanskrit Literature—Prof. M. Z. Siddiqi, M.A., Ph.D. ... ... 215
Palmieri's Song (*Poem*)—Leland J. Berry ... 226
The Religion of Man—K. C. Sen ... ... 227
Indian Script Palaeontology—Atulkrishna Sur, M.A. ... 261
To Light (*Poem*)—N. N. Chanda ... ... 266
On Untouchability—N. K. Venkateswaran ... 267
Among the New Books— Leland J. Berry ... 271
Because of Love and You (*Poem*)—Leland J. Berry 278

REVIEWS :

The Man who went on Business—P. R. Sen ... 279
Tuberculosis of the Lungs—A. Chatterjee ... ... 280
Theory and Practise of Commerce and Business Orgainsation—B. Ramachandra Rau. ... ... ... 280
The Ottawa Agreement—B. Ramchandra Rau ... 281
Woman Labour in India—B. Ramachandra Rau. ... ... 283
Men, Myths and Movements in German Literature—J. G. B. 284
A History of Fire and Flame—J. G. B. ... 287

OURSELVES :

The Mouat Medal ... ... ... 290
The Mahendranath Ray Prize and Medal for 1932 ... 290
The Kedarnath Banerjee Gold Medal for 1932 ... ... 290
The Maharaja Sir J. M. Tagore Gold and Silver Medals for 1931 291
Sir C. V. Raman takes leave ... ... ... 291

Page

Some Problems of Education in Bengal—Syamaprasad Mookerjee, M.A., B.L., Barrister-at-Law, M.L.C. ... 293
Theories of Illusion in Indian Philosophy—S. C. Chatterjee, M.A. ... ... ... 305
Morning (*Poem*)—R. J. N. Maher ... ... 316
The Old Agency Houses of Calcutta—N. Das, I.C.S. ... 317
The Problem of Financial Settlement in a Federated India—Akshaykumar Ghoshal, M.A. ... ... 327
Heroes and Savants (*Poem*)—P. M. Hari ... ... 350
Social Life in Jaina Literature—Amulyachandra Sen, M.A. ... ... ... ... 351
To Calcutta (*Poem*)—John J. Pinto ... ... 368
Old Punctuation and New—J. C. Ghosh, M.A. ... 369
Recovery of Calcutta by the English—Kalikinkar Datta, M.A. ... ... ... 377
Vision of Life (*Poem*)—Mohinimohan Chatterji, M.A., B.L. ... ... ... ... 399
When will the Federation come into Being ?—Haricharan Mukherjee ... ... ... ... 403
Song of Renunciation (*Poem*)—Wade Oliver ... 408

Reviews :

An Anthology of Haiku: Ancient and Modern—Kalidas Nag ... ... ... ... 409
Outlines of Indian Philosophy—S. K. Das ... ... 413
The Contribution of Ancient Greece to Modern Life—Priyaranjan Sen ... ... ... ... 414
The Principles of Civil Government—B. Ramachandra Rau... 414
Empire and World Currency—B. Ramachandra Rau ... 415

Ourselves :

Lal Chand Mookerjee Endowment ... ... ... 418
XVIIIth International Montessori Training Course to be held in Barcelona, Spain ... ... ... 422
India Institute of Die Deutsche Academie offers Stipends to Indian Scholars for the Akademie year 1933-1934 ... 42[illegible]
Report of the Second Convention of the Federation of Indian Students Abroad, held in Munich on the 20th and 21st December, 1932 ... ... ... 427
A New Ph.D. ... ... ... ... 430
Sir Praphullachandra Ray Fellowship ... ... 430
Date of the M. B. Examination ... ... ... 431
Date of the B. Com. Examination ... ... ... 431

## *List of Contributors and their Articles*

Page.

*Basu, Rashranjan*
Thoughts suggested by some Elizabethan Plays 33
*Berry, Leland J.*
Laxey (*Poem*) ... ... ... 38
Karma (*Poem*) ... ... ... 204
Palmieri's Song (*Poem*) ... ... 226
Among the New Books ... ... 271
Because of Love and You (*Poem*) ... 278
*Bhattacharyya, Hrishikesh, M.A.*
The Cloudy Day ... ... ... 135
The Wrong Heaven ... ... 137
*Cade, David W.*
Ever-Never—Never-Ever (*Poem*) ... ... 134
*Chanda, N. N.*
To Light (*Poem*) ... ... 266
*Chatterjee, S. C., M.A.*
Theories of Illusion in Indian Philosophy ... 305
*Chatterjee, Mohinimohan, M.A., B.L.*
Question and Answer (*Poem*) ... ... 214
Vision of Life (*Poem*) ... ... ... 399
*Cousins, James H.*
The Message of Shelley's "Prometheus Unbound" 155
*Das, N., I.C.S.*
The Old Agency Houses of Calcutta ... ... 317
*Das, Millicent A, M.A.*
The Literary Ideas of Gustave Flaubert as revealed in his Correspondence ... ... ... 113
*Datta, Kali Kinkar, M.A.*
History of East India Company's Trade in Bengal (1757-1765) ... ... ... 71
Recovery of Calcutta by the English ... 377
*Datta, P., M.A., Ph.D.*
Rise of the Calcutta Money Market in relation to Public Borrowing and Public Credit ... ... 171
*Ghosh, Akshaykumar, M.A.*
The Problem of Financial Settlement in a Federated India ... ... ... 327
*Ghosh, Dhirendranath*
Romanticism ... ... ... 15
*Ghosh, J.C., M.A.*
Old Punctuation and New ... ... 363

Page.

*Hari, P. M.*
Heroes and Savant (*Poem*) ... ... 350
*Maher, R. T. N.*
Morning (*Poem*) ... ... 316
*Mukherjee, Syamaprasad, M.A., B.L., Bar.-at-Law, M.L.C.,*
Some Problems of Education in Bengal ... 293
*Mukherjee, Makhanlal*
Kalidas—a Dramatic Artist ... 65
*Mukherjee, Haricharan*
When will the Federation come into Being ? ... 403
*Moreno, H. W. B.*
Reunion (*Poem*) ... ... ... 111
*Wade Oliver,*
From a Ruined Garden (*Poem*) ... ... 12
Gautama Buddha (*Poem*) ... ... 12
Song of Renunciation (*Poem*) ... ... 408
*Pandit, Vaman H.*
Co-education ... ... ... 59
*Pinto, John J.*
To Calcutta (*Poem*) ... ... ... 368
*Sarma, Krishnakumar*
New Cotton Goods Traffic ... ... 205
*Sen, Amiyakumar, M.A.,*
Ernest Dowson ... ... ... 39
*Sen, K. C.*
The Religion of Man ... ... ... 227
*Sen, Amulyachandra, M. A.*
Social Life in Jaina Literature ... ... 351
*Siddiqi, Prof. M. Z., M.A., Ph.D.*
The Services of the Muslims to the Sanskrit Literature 215
*Suhrawardy, Sir Hassan, O.B.E., M.D., F.R.C.S.I., D.P.H.,*
*Vice-Chancellor, Calcutta University*
The Punjab University Convocation ... ... 1
*Sur, Atulkrishna, M.A.*
Indian Script Palæontology ... ... 261
√*Tagore, Rabindranath*
Western Influence in Bengali Literature ... 13
*Venkateswaran, N. K.*
On Untouchability ... ... ... 267

Page.

*Wadalia, Gurdyal Singh*
Frail Lovers (*Poem*) ... ... ... 64

*Index of Articles*

Agency Houses of Calcutta ... ... ... 317
Bengali Literature, Western Influence in ... ... 13
Buddha, Gautama ... ... ... 12
Calcutta, To (*Poem*) ... ... ... 368
Co-education ... ... ... 59
Convocation Address, The Punjab University ... 1
Cotton Goods Traffic, New ... ... ... 205
Dowson, Ernest ... ... ... 39
Day, The Cloudy ... ... ... 135
East India Company's Trade in Bengal, History of the 71
Education in Bengal, Some Problems of ... 293
Ever-Never—Never-Ever (*Poem*) ... ... 134
Federation come into Being, When will the ... 403
Financial Settlement in a Federated India, the Problem of 327
Garden, From a Ruined (*Poem*) ... ... 12
Gustave Flaubert as revealed in his Correspondence, The Literary Ideas of ... ... ... 113
Heaven, The Wrong ... ... ... 137
Heroes and Savants (*Poem*) ... ... 350
Illusion in Indian Philosophy, Theories of ... 305
Jaina Literature, Social Life in ... ... 351
Kalidas—a Dramatic Artist ... ... 65
Karma (*Poem*) ... ... ... 204
Laxey (*Poem*) ... ... ... 38
Life, Vision of (*Poem*) ... ... ... 399
Light, To (*Poem*) ... ... ... 266
Love and You, Because of (*Poem*) ... ... 278
Lovers, Frail (*Poem*) ... ... ... 64
Money Market in relation to Public Borrowing and Public Credit, Rise of the Calcutta ... ... 171
Morning (*Poem*) ... ... ... 316
New Books, Among the ... ... ... 271
Ourselves ... ... ... 144, 290, 418
Palmieri's Song (*Poem*) ... ... ... 226
"Prometheus Unbound" The Message of Shelley's ... 155
Punctuation New and Old ... ... ... 369
Question and Answer (*Poem*) ... ... 214

Page.

Recovery of Calcutta by the English ... ... 377
Religion of Man, The ... ... ... 227
Renunciation, Song of (*Poem*) ... ... 408
Reunion (*Poem*) ... ... ... 111
Reviews ... ... ... 141, 279, 401
Romanticism ... ... ... 15
Sanskrit Literature, The Services of the Muslims to the 215
Script Palaeontology, Indian ... ... 261
Thoughts suggested by some Elizabethan Plays ... 33
Untouchablity, On ... ... ... 267

THE CALCUTTA REVIEW

JANUARY, 1933

## THE PUNJAB UNIVERSITY CONVOCATION ADDRESS[1]

MR. VICE-CHANCELLOR, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,

Allow me to express to the authorities of this University my great appreciation of the honour they have done me by asking me to address this Convocation. I am very much indebted to them for the courtesy they have shown to the Calcutta University by inviting its Vice-Chancellor to be the speaker at to-day's function.

It is a great pleasure to me to be here to-day in the capital town of the great land of five waters, which has been for centuries the theatre of epoch-making events in history. From the days when the Aryans crossed over from beyond the Hindukush, down to modern times, the Punjab has been the gateway of India, the place of interchange of the cultures of many nations: Iranians and Turanians, Greeks and Scythians, Aryans and Dravidians, Mongols and Chinese, of people from the East and people from the West. The Punjabi, one of the finest specimens of mankind, embodies in him the result of a wonderful interracial and intercultural synthesis. His physical impressiveness is as arresting as his mental alertness is remarkable. Among the sons of the Punjab and the alumni of this University have been men who have won distinctions in many and varied fields of activity. We have had amongst them distinguished soldiers, renowned sportsmen, captains of industry, leaders of political thought, illustrious religious and social reformers, great poets and philosophers. At the present moment the Department of Education, Health and Lands of the Government of India is in charge of a gifted and versatile son of the Punjab. I could go on recounting the names of many other worthy sons of this province who have shed lustre on the spheres of their respective activities and spread the name and fame of their mother-land.

---

[1] Delivered by Sir Hassan Suhrawardy, Lieut.-Colonel, O.B.E., M.D., F.R.C.S.I., D.P.H., Vice-Chancellor, Calcutta University, at the University of the Punjab, on Friday, the 23rd December, 1932.

## PERIOD OF MOMENTOUS CHANGES

Graduates of the University of the Punjab, it is a source of deep gratification to me to offer you my sincerest congratulations. You have my very best wishes for your success in the future which is now opening out before you. You have had exceptional opportunities here of obtaining knowledge and skill, and you will have greater opportunities in the spacious days to come of serving your country. You are beginning your life at a period which is fraught with the deepest moment to the future of your country: you are on the threshold of great constitutional reforms, leading to increased responsibilities for the children of the soil; you are in the midst of changes in age-old customs and social traditions; you are in the throes of a great economic and industrial upheaval. Great will be your share in the shaping of the future destiny of your mother-land. It is your duty to devote your time and energy to the proper understanding of the essential features of our national development so that you may worthily play your part in the great task which lies ahead.

## SOCIAL TRANSITION

While it is essential to recognise that changes are necessary, it is equally important to note that blind and superficial imitation of other nations and of other countries may lead to disaster, While there is much that is dead and effete, in our customs and practices, there is also much that is worth preserving. You are not truly educated, if you do not understand the relative fitness of things and do not develop in yourselves an attitude of discriminating criticism in regard to social problems. Things like untouchability, purdah system, early marriage, caste-restrictions, are impediments to future advancement which you cannot afford to tolerate for ever. The development of a democratic spirit is hardly consistent with the prevalence of social habits which perpetuate distinctions between man and man. I appeal to you, young men and women, to bestow your serious thought on these important problems of national well-being.

### INFLUENCES AT WORK

With regard to changes due to the operation of Western influences, to contact with other countries and with higher and more liberal education, it is essentially necessary to adopt a sane and balanced view. Without hesitation I would like to recognise the fact that the influence of Western civilisation, of scientific advancement and education has, on the whole, exercised a beneficial influence on our country. I must, however, warn you against the superficial adoption of Western modes of living without the proper assimilation of Western culture and civilisation and of the ideals which guide everyday life in the West. I would like to impress on you that whereas there is a good deal to be adopted and assimilated for our own benefit from the civilisation and culture of the West, you should always treat with respect and veneration your age-old traditions and civilisation, so that you may never run the risk of getting reformed out of recognition, losing your own identity and individuality. It should not at all be difficult to build upon the foundations of our past greatness a beautiful and enduring structure with a happy blend of the best in the methods and ideals of the West and of the East.

## ECONOMIC EVOLUTION

I should now for a moment like to turn to the economic changes that are beginning to take place in our country. You very often hear the slogan that India has great economic resources, and that if these were properly utilised, our country would be one of the richest in the world. As a matter of fact, estimates of our national production and income show that India is perhaps one of the poorest countries on earth, and I feel it my duty on this important occasion to make a few observations on our economic development, in which some of you will, I hope, take your due share.

## EXPANSION OF AGRICULTURE

Let us take agriculture first. It is obvious that with the help of a systematised policy of agricultural advance, our ryots can produce more and improve the quality of the crops as well. The Punjab Land Alienation Act has proved a boon to your agricultural population, but still I venture to think that the indebtedness of the rural population is as bad in the Punjab as in other provinces. How to free the agricultural population who are victims of money-lenders, whether it can be done by the extension of the co-operative movement or the institution of a Land Mortgage Banking System or by any other means, are questions which should engage the serious thoughts of the educated classes. I am convinced that rural reconstruction in its different aspects is an occupation to which many of our educated men can turn their attention, not only without any loss of dignity, but with real profit to themselves and their country.

## INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT: COTTAGE INDUSTRY

Turning towards industrial expansion, I find that almost all categories of industries—large, middle-sized, and small—afford suitable careers for men possessing the necessary talents and skill. When we realise that it is only a very small fraction of our total population that lives in large cities and is connected with large-scale industries, the need for developing medium-sized and, specially, cottage industries becomes most pressing. We must so devise our industrial policy as to afford chances to the cultivators to increase their agricultural output and thereby improve their purchasing power. I feel sure that the urgent task in our country on the industrial side is the development of medium-sized and, as I have mentioned above, specially of cottage industries. It will provide the agricultural labourer with work during the time he is off his agricultural occupations. It will improve the income of the ryot and his purchasing power and thus contribute to a gradual rise in the standard of living of the nation. Perhaps the safer policy for our country would be one of industrial decentralisation rather than of concentration.

* * *

## OVERCROWDING IN UNIVERSITIES : VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE

I would now like to speak for a moment on the important subject of University Education. "The Universities have been hampered in their work by being overcrowded with students who are not fitted by capacity for University education and of whom many would be far more likely to succeed in other [illegible]" Wh[illegible] —has been a great increase in the number impressive, answers do not indicate that the students have an adequate appreciation and understanding of the problems raised. Many of them repeat the answers they have been drilled to learn. While thus the powers of memory are exercised, I am afraid, those of understanding and judgment are not brought into adequate use. It does not matter if our questions are not so distinguished or not so pedantic. Our aim should be to ascertain whether the students have had a thorough understanding of the basic and fundamental principles of the subject in which they are examined.

It will be a good thing if instead of giving undue importance to the passing of University examinations as a qualification for entering posts under Government and elsewhere, special tests are instituted for the various kinds of service.

A large percentage of persons who are mentally and constitutionally unsuited for higher education will do well to be diverted to industrial and commercial channels and given a start upon a useful career while they are still young enough to learn. By a judicious and proper application of psycho-analysis and experimental psychology, we may be able to direct the energies of our young men in the right path, and thereby save them from pitfalls and untold miseries in their after-life.

I am convinced it will save Government a good deal of expenditure in the judicial, the jail and the police departments, if they spend a comparatively small scrutiny is necessary in selecting persons for a career in the higher work of research in a University. I do not deny that there has been some excellent work done in Arts and Science in our Universities, and with pardonable pride I may draw attention to what has been accomplished in the Post-Graduate Departments of my own University and in the departments of Chemistry and Biology in the University of the Punjab. But I must also admit that research work has been made a fetish of, and much of it is made to order, with loss of perspective in dealing with materials. There are so many who empty their note-books into print without realising that raw material will have to be understood and assimilated before it can yield fresh materials or discoveries.

No responsible teacher should present to his students or his readers work which is merely one of scissors and paste. Research work can only be considered valuable and desirable, if the facts gathered, preferably for the first time, are so linked up and are so elucidated that new ideas and new principles can be drawn from them. We must be able to throw new light upon the subject, or discover the inter-connectedness of important fields of work and make some definite contribution to knowledge, whether in Science or in Letters.

## SCOPE OF UNIVERSITY EDUCATION

I am rather diffident to discuss or to speak on the scope of the present system of University Education. The matter is now engaging the attention of the Punjab University Enquiry Committee. But I venture to express the opinion that like the Khalsa College at Amritsar the Punjab has the possibilities of providing not one, but many ideal places to serve as intellectual centres, amidst historic environments and living forces which help to mould the strength of mind and the character of a nation. Whether you decide to have one University or more, whether your University be of the unitary type for direct teaching, or of the federal type with affiliated colleges in different parts of the province, I venture to express the hope that you will not allow one University to be a replica of another. Their ideals and ultimate aims may be the same, but each must have a distinctive stamp of its own. For example, one University may give more attention to the claims of ancient and modern languages and the liberal professions, another may devote itself to scientific subjects and specialise in applied science, while yet another may take up technological, mechanical and vocational instruction.

The organisation and maintenance of a University require expenditure of large sums of money, and until larger educational endowments are made by the princes and the people of the country, it may not be found practicable on financial grounds to encourage the establishment of new Universities. Extra-mural institutions specialising in suitable branches of study and all-India institutions at different centres, run on cheaper lines than Universities, may meet the national demand for higher scientific education. For instance, the Punjab is eminently suited for the establishment of an all-India institution for special training in Agriculture.

## FACTORS OF POLITICAL UNREST

I would now like to make a very brief reference to the causes of political unrest amongst the educated classes. Unemployment is certainly an important factor. I am, however, convinced that the political unrest and upheaval we are witnessing everywhere have a psychological and a pathological background due to defective nutrition and nervous overstrain. I would like to invite the special attention of all members of Government in the different provinces of India and also of the Hon'ble Sir Fazl-i-Husain to this important problem, and start with the least possible delay an enquiry into the causes of ill-health among the masses of this country,—into the psychological, physical, pathological, economic and environmental factors, which are responsible for the unbalancing of the minds and the warping of the imagination, and the distorting of the ideals of many of our youths. It appears to me that poor food, unemployment, overcrowding in the Universities with students unsuitable for higher education, are some of the chief factors. It is therefore essential to conduct a detailed survey of the food resources of the country and to classify indigenous food materials in categories of their nutrition value and encourage and guide our youngmen to take to professions and callings which they are financially, physically, intellectually and temperamentally fitted to pursue.

We are on the threshold of great constitutional reforms. It is in the fitness of things that the educationists of our country should consider the ways and means of overhauling and reorganising the entire machinery of University Education in order to bring it in conformity with the requirements of time and the needs of the country.

## INTER-COMMUNAL UNITY

I cannot conclude my address without drawing the attention of our graduates to the important topic of unity amongst the different communities of India. When I look upon the bitterness with which communal strife has been carried on in this country within the last few years I am mortified to feel that education has apparently lost its true mission. The Universities must be regarded as the training centres for turning out broad-minded, tolerant and self-reliant citizens. Education must drive off from within our minds the darkness of ignorance and emancipate us from the bondage of bigotry and denominational bias,—must teach us to avoid exclusiveness, narrowmindedness and selfishness.

Graduates of the University, having drunk at the same fountain of knowledge, is it not natural to expect you, the youths of the Hindu, Muslim, Sikh and other communities of India, to cultivate mutual understandings and friendships in the class-rooms, in the field of sports and manly games, which will enable you to go out into the world as brothers and comrades in arms for the realisation of your great ideals ?

There can however be no true friendship and goodwill without a feeling of equality and without breaking down the barriers of snobbery and the tyranny of Caste. Those who may be advanced in education and in opulent circumstances should provide every facility for the better education of those who are educationally backward, so that through liberal education, the greatest gift of mankind, they will be in a position to look eye to eye with one another and appreciate one another's point of view.

Different communities should allow one another to maintain their own identity and treasure their own traditions. One community should not try to overpower, stifle or efface the other out of existence, but help it to develop its special culture and genius. Like flowers of different hues and shades, of different degrees of perfume, sweetness and beauty, students of the University, of all castes and creeds, enrich and beautify the garden of your country.

My young friends, I cannot conclude my address better than by repeating the soul-stirring words of some of our Hindu and Muslim poets which have been compiled and linked together by me—

هم چل پڑے هین لیکن منزل ابهي هے کوسون
اور سخت مشکلون مین هے کاروان همارا
آپس کي دشمني کے یه دن نهین هین هرگز
پهلے هي جبکه دشمن هے آسمان همارا
حُبِ وطن کا ملکر سب ایک راگ گائین
لهجه جدا هو گرچه مرغان نغمه خوان کا
یه وقت هے که کهه دین سب هو کے یک زبان هم
هندي هین هم وطن هے هندوستان همارا

آ ملکے غیریت کے پردون کو پھر اٹھا دین
بچھڑون کو پھر ملادین نقش دوئی مٹا دین
مندر مین هو بلانا جس دم پجاریون کو
آوازهٔ اذان مین ناقوس کو چھپا دین
اگنی هے وه جو نرگن کہتے هین پیت جسکو
دھرمونکے یه بکھیڑے اس آگ سے جلا دین
مذهب نهین سکھاتا آپس مین بیر رکھنا
هندی هین هم وطن هے هندوستان همارا

"The caravan has started on its journey, but the goal is still far off, many are the difficulties, arduous is the journey before us.

Oh unlucky ones, this is not the time nor the occasion for disruption, pettiness and jealousies.

Let us all sing to the same tune of the love of the mother country, though the melody and the voices be different."

Now is the moment when we should all unite and with one voice say, "We are *Hindis* (Indians) and the land of Hindusthan is our mother-land."

Come along, let us unite, and discard the veil of other-ness ; unite those who have straggled away from the fold and efface the difference of 'you' and 'me' and become one.

Let the call summoning the votaries to the place of worship be such that the music of the temple of the Brahmin may be drowned in the voice of the Muazzin.

May the fire of love consume all the elements of discord and reduce the different denominations into one precious mass.

Religion does not teach you to harbour feelings of distrust and grudge against each other; we are all children of *Hind*, the same Mother India, the land of *Hindustan* is our common mother country.

## FROM A RUINED GARDEN

In the gardens of Shah Jahan
I heard a peacock cry;
And time was an un-returning dawn
Under a molten sky.

And the wonder that once was Ind
Was a raucous rattle, a note
Blown on wings of a searing wind
From a crazed peacock's throat.

WADE OLIVER

## GAUTAMA BUDDHA

Up to the threshold where his young wife slept,
Nestling their infant son in soft embrace,
Like a ghost in the white of the moon he crept,
And sorrow lay in his eyes and on his face.
"This is another tie to break," he sighed,
And turned him forth, and rode through the white moonlight
Into a distant world where no voice cried,
Save the woe of the world he yearned to set a-right.

A startled peacock cried upon the dawn ;
Above the rice-fields rose the burnished sun ;
And she awoke to a prince and lover gone,
He to the lonesome road, and the quest undone;
Over his eyes the white of Nirvana stood,
And the world's woes were a bell crying in his blood !

WADE OLIVER

# WESTERN INFLUENCE IN BENGALI LITERATURE

*A Review.**

I have read Prof. Priyaranjan Sen's "Western Influence in Bengali Literature" with deep interest and pleasure. The author has chosen for his thesis a subject which for a long time has been waiting for adequate exploration by scholars. His work throws much light on the early stages of development of our literature and presents in a lucid manner a connected account of the formative influences that have helped in its self-expression.

Sufficient emphasis however has not been laid on the fact that it is this power to assimilate cultural influences from outside which proves the creative vitality of Bengali literature. Originality in literature lies in its capacity to absorb the universal in all literatures and arts and give it a unique expression characteristic of its particular genius and traditions. Then again, the human mind being one, parallel developments along similar lines can be traced in different literatures not suggestive of mutual influence but denoting independent pursuit of truths which are universal. This is specially true of the production of great minds whose highest realizations often present a remarkable harmony of kinship even though they may be widely separated by distance and time.

It is not true to say that a literature alienates itself from the masses by following its highest inspiration, by tuning itself to the spirit of the Age, and accepting the fruits of wisdom garnered by the mind of man through centuries of effort and achievement. The function of literature is not to stoop down to the level of the average mind but to lead it to a wider understanding of eternal values of life which may be unfamiliar to them owing to the narrowness of their cultural experience. Literature is not for the satisfaction of minds that remain static in their own standard of enjoyment. I am sure that the works of great geniuses like Shakespeare, Goethe and others need special training of taste before they can be fully appreciated and that the education has been gradual for the general readers which has reached the present stage of sensitiveness. We are grateful that Bhavabhuti never hesitated to write in his own magnificent style though he was doubtful about its acceptance by the multitude as is proved by the verse containing his aggressive self-laudation contemptuous of the capacity of the uncultured. Kalidas, instead of writing Sakuntala, could have written doggerels for popular comprehension but that would have been a tragedy not only for. his own genius and for eternal literature but for all his countrymen, both his contemporaries and of succeeding generations, who have been redeemed and sustained by the greatness of his writings. It is an artist or writer constantly seeking to satisfy the multitude who betrays their, deepest human nature and is spiritually isolated from them.

---

* *Western Influence in Bengali Literature*, Mr. Priyaranjan Sen, Calcutta University, 1932.

I hope that the author will follow up his present work and deal with his subject in fuller detail. He is eminently fitted for this task because of his erudition and his gift of clear, and systematic exposition.

RABINDRANATH TAGORE

# ROMANTICISM

In all studies of Romanticism there seems to exist some confusion of issues. The main problem that confronts us is simple. What is that particular something the presence of which, in poetry or in any other forms of art-expressions, may be said to constitute Romanticism? But the reply to this simple question has been rendered difficult by certain indirect methods of approach usually adopted by critics, which obscure the vital elements of the problem. One such method has been to confuse a particular expression of Romanticism with Romanticism itself. When the reader, for example, comes across Keats's famous lines about

> Charmed magic casement opening on the foam
> Of perilous seas in fairy lands forlorn:

he is delighted with Pater's evasive dictum about the addition of strangeness to beauty as constituting the most satisfactory description of what Romanticism is. When again he is enveloped by the weird and eerie atmosphere of the Middle Ages, and is informed that the Romantic must have something to do with mediaeval *Romances*, the conclusion seems to him to be perfectly legitimate to identify Romanticism with the revival of, or a revived interest in that dubious imaginary world which we call the Middle Ages. The nature poetry of Wordsworth again, with its endless vistas of suggestions surpassing the obvious meaning of words, leads him to fumble indecisively with such phrases as a " return to nature " or a " spiritual interpretation of nature " as perhaps embodying the essential element he is in search of. A recent and stimulating critic has made much of the haze of distance as being a characteristic element of Romanticism. And then there is that mysteriously suggestive phrase of Watts-Dunton—" The Renascence of Wonder"—which so vaguely flickers on the borderland of understanding, as to leave us suspended in the region of unformed convictions.

That each of these expressive statements gives us partial glimpses into the nature of the truth admits of no doubt. And yet precisely because all of them have elements of truth that we are not able to accept any of them as expressing the whole truth. Each of these statements, in so far as it affirms its own content, denies, to that extent, the implications of the others, and hence must be in its very nature unsatisfactory, incomplete, and uncertain. But still, so long as we treat each of these as approaches to the vital elements, their utility in carrying us to the central principle of Romanticism must be recognised.

( 2 )

I believe it does not admit of any doubt that Romanticism is a certain quality inherent in a form of art which gives it an individuality. But whether that quality appertains to the subject-matter, or to the artistic treatment, or to the creative mind that reproduces itself in a work of art, is a question not so easily decided. It is to this uncertainty that we must trace the original source of confusion. Take, for example, those lines of Keats already quoted,—the quotation of which indeed, is unavoidable in any treatment of Romanticism,—

> The same that oft-times hath
> Charmed magic casements opening on the foam
> Of perilous seas, in fairy lands forlorn:

Now, wherein lies the individualising quality of these lines? Is it in the peculiar artistic treatment which the poet has accorded to the castle by lifting it out of its concrete architectural associations and establishing it in a vague and shadowy world, to the creation of which is summoned all the rich treasury of imaginative associations hoarded in our mind;—in other words, to paraphrase Pater, by adding a quality of strangeness to an object that we already feel to be beautiful in its emphatic setting in the actual world? Or are we to see this essential quality in the peculiar nature of the subject-matter itself,—"memorable touches of far-off Bible and legendary romance?" Or, again, is that quality quintessential to the mind of the poet, "the magic quality of the Celtic temperament," as Matthew Arnold has happily phrased it?

Take another and a far more simple instance:—

The feast was over in Branksome Tower,
And the lady had gone to her secret bower,
Her bower that was guarded by watch and by spell,
Deadly to hear and deadly to tell;—
Jesu Maria! shield her well.

Here, again, we are tantalised by the same uncertainty. Does the appeal of these lines lie in their association with the Middle Ages? Or in their suggestion of distance, of remoteness? Or in their supernatural machinery?

Let us take another example, and a more complex one,—

The sea that bares her bosom to the moon,
The wind that will be howling at all hours,
And are upgathered now like sleeping flowers:
For this, for everything we are out of tune.

Are these lines romantic because of the spiritual interpretation of nature that they suggest? Or because they expand the mind with a feeling of elemental wonder? Or is it because they give us a conception of nature that is saturated in the sensitised personality of the poet?

Now, I believe, it will be conceded that the passages I have cited are essentially Romantic. And yet that precise something that differentiates them from the "Classic" into the isolation of their own specific quality, eludes the limits of a rigid definition. Neither the incitement to wonder, nor the suggestion of distance, nor the resurrection of the remote, nor any of the other qualities that have been already referred to, can be regarded as constituting the essence of Romanticism.

There is a certain value in that time-worn method of studying the three constituent elements in every work of art which we may now profitably adopt;—*viz.*, an examination of a work from the standpoint of subject-matter, the style or expression, and the creative mind of the artist. When a particular object comes under the influence of the re-creative energy of an artistic soul, and is chiselled or expanded until it assumes a certain style,—a certain external appearance or form, —it becomes the subject of our aesthetic contemplation; and it is then that we analyse it in search of its essential meaning and purpose,—the ultimate reason of its existence. Let us take into consideration each of these elements, and see how far it leads us.

First, as regards the subject-matter:

I think it will not be difficult to agree that Romanticism cannot be a quality attaching to a subject-matter irrespective of its nature. Odysseus sailing across the unchartered ocean,—

Alone, alone, all, all, alone,—
Alone on a wide, wide sea:

certainly gives us a subject-matter that is full of incipient romance. And yet can we by any interpretation of the term call Homer's epic romantic? Or take the exquisite pastorals of Virgil;—they are steeped in the seductive atmosphere that we associate with a particular aspect of English Romanticism. And yet, is not the very word Virgilian reminiscent of suggestions that are essentially anti-romantic? Again, nothing can be more poignantly subjective than the underlying *motif* of Milton's *Samson Agonistes,*—

But chief of all
Oh loss of sight! of thee I most complain;
Blind among enemies: oh worse than chains,
Dungeons, or beggary, or decrepit age.

But in spite of this subjective *motif, Samson Agonistes* remains the finest drama in English literature in the purely classic style. We may, therefore, arrive at the presumptive conclusion that

Romanticism has got nothing to do with the subject-matter of the poem. In the hand of a Pater, the story of Eloisa and Abelard would assume the cold and statuesque repose of the purest classic workmanship. And Goethe was able to impart to the story of Faust a severe dignity and reticence that stands out in sharp contrast to the sweeping periods of Marlowe.

The question that will next demand examination is, whether Romanticism has anything to do with the treatment which a poet accords to a particular subject-matter. Is it in any way connected with the way in which a particular idea happens to be expressed? A straightforward answer to this question is rendered impossible for the reason that it involves a subtle metaphysical question that baffles analysis. The question is,—Is it at all possible to dissociate a mode of expression from the mental idea it seeks to express? In the domain of art, all expression must out of a sheer inner necessity be suited to the idea it has to express; it is fashioned thereto by an irresistible psychological necessity; and the absolution of all art is ultimately to be sought in the degree of approximation that exists between the idea in its original inception and its final expression. When we say that all poetry is inevitable we are only implying this, that in poetry the idea receives absolute expression; for according to the strictest logical interpretation, every idea can only have one expression;—and *that* comes to the poet spontaneously. While, therefore, it would not be wrong to say that Romanticism is inherent in the treatment accorded to a subject-matter by an artist, it would be fundamentally true to say that it inheres in the mind itself which selects and adopts its own mode of treatment to meet its psychological obligation.

Thus out of these considerations, at least one definite conclusion emerges, and it is this :—The subject-matter of a poem is comparatively of little importance ; it is only a convenient medium which the artistic mind selects to satisfy its need for self-expression. The artistic treatment again is of minor importance; it is entirely dominated and controlled by the mind of the artist. But what is of the utmost importance is the creative mind, which seeks to realise itself on an imaginative plain through some mediate symbol; which seeks in other words to objectify its self-recognition at a particular moment of experience in some external form. And whenever we are concerned with the ultimate principles, conditions and limitations of a work of art, it is with the quality of the mind that is startled into self-recognition by some thrilling experience that we have to do primarily. Romanticism, therefore, should be definitely related to a certain condition of the creative mind which embodies itself in poetry, painting, music or sculpture, as the case may be.

( 3 )

What then, is that mental condition to the expression of which in terms of art the name Romanticism is applied?

(An analysis of the human mind will show that it has two primary moods. In the one, the human mind is pervaded by a sense of profound and inward contentment with the facts of existence, as they actually are,—a love of the external, objective world of our sense perception; a feeling that this world is the best of all possible or impossible worlds, and all that they may connote;—that we need not go beyond it in search of peace and blessedness. In the other, the human mind rebels against "the whole mass of the motley facts of life,"—believes itself to be an alien in a hostile scheme of things which stifles its aerial essence with its smothering solidity, and yearns for something which transcends all these facts and evanesces into the remote and the infinite in which all that is hard and defiant in the real world bursts as mere bubbles in the air.) The one finds expression in the serene beatitude in which Wordsworth steeped himself in moments of sheer spiritual exaltation ;—when for example, he says,

> 'Tis her privilege
> Through all her the years of this our life to lead

CPCU 1

From Joy to Joy: for she can so inform
The mind that is within us, so impress
With quietness and beauty, that neither evil tongues,
Rash judgments, nor the sneers of selfish men,
Nor greetings where no kindness is, nor all
The intercourse of daily life
Shall e'er prevail against us, or disturb
Our cheerful faith, that all which we behold
Is full of blessings.

For the other, we can go to any of the Romantic poets. This, for example, from Clough will do as well as any:—

Oh Perfect! if it were all; But it is not.
Hints haunt me for ever of a more beyond;
I am rebuked by a sense of the incomplete,
Of a completion over soon assumed
Of adding up too soon.

The former mood finds expression in Classic art; the latter in Romantic art.

In Classic art, life is glorified and made beautiful and holy and something that in itself possesses "a supreme value over and above all other things." But the Romantic poet regards life "as false nature," he is chained down to life by 'a heavy weight of hours,' he is tired with life and cries for "restful death," or is "half in love with easeful death." To the Classic poet, contemplation of the sufferings and woes of life only serves to add to the value and beauty of life; in the words of a writer on Nietzsche, "They (the Classic poets) contemplated suffering and pain in the light of an aesthetic manifestation of the universal Will of which all life is but the manifestation." But the Romantic poet contemplates life only to be crushed under "the heavy and weary weight of this unintelligible world," and instead of rising to the height of his argument and "justifying the ways of God to man," all his soul is aflame with "a devotion to something afar, from the sphere of our sorrow." Nowhere is this incapacity to envisage the hard facts of life so apparent as in the tragic heroes of Shakespeare. Hamlet cries out, "Oh that the too, too solid flesh would melt." To Macbeth, "life is a tale told by an idiot full of sound and fury, signifying nothing." The whole of King Lear turns upon the idea—

As flies to wanton boys, we are to the gods,
They kill us for their sports.

It is a feeling of the utter meaninglessness of life, or of helpless impotence or tragic futility, that imparts to a Shakespearean tragedy its stormy atmosphere. It is also worthy of notice that even in his comedies, Shakespeare's lovers never find their bliss in the actual world but they are transported into an ideal world, the world of the Forest of Arden or of Midsummer Nights' Dream,—a world sheltered and protected from the "wind that blows in the night," and destroys the flower ere its day is done.

( 4 )

A sense of dissatisfaction, then, with the real world, often leading to a desire to escape from that world, constitutes the very essence of Romanticism. Hence, it has two distinct but correlated aspects. There is in the first place, a vehement protest against the actualities of existence ; and, in the second place, a yearning for some completer synthesis, where the actualities of life will lose their edges and will not grate upon the senses and the feelings. It is thus, both an emphatic denial and a bold affirmation ; and it is in a large measure this oscillation between two opposite tendencies that constitutes the peculiar fascination which Romanticism exerts over the susceptible mind.

Hence, at all times, Romanticism has been on the one hand revolutionary and destructive ; and on the other, imaginative and creative. It now raises itself in an attitude of violent rebellion against all those elements which have tended to arrest the fluidity of life into set forms and moulds,—thus conspiring against that instinct for expansion which is the attribute of the soul. But at the next opportunity, it is impassionated with a longing to create or discover another world where the storm and stress' of the soul may be quieted in an atmosphere of peace and beauty. The cry of the romantic poet must at all times be the cry of Omar Khayyam—

> Ah Love! could thou and I with Fates conspire
> To break this sorry scheme of things entire,
> Would we not shatter it to bits and then
> Remould it nearer to our heart's desire.

These lines may be said to sum up the vital essence of Romanticism in all its several manifestations. There is in it that world-embracing dissatisfaction with "this sorry scheme of things entire," that complex mood of infinite longing and tragic helplessness; "the yearning that craves for expression, yet defies expression, the inconclusive struggle between emotional apprehension of life and the articulation that must transcend personal emotion."

## ( 5 )

The distinction between Classicism and Romanticism will be more real if we refer ourselves to the more concrete forms of art, *viz.*, painting or sculpture,—forms of which an immediate sensuous perception brings with it the hall-mark of conviction in no uncertain fashion. Thus in the works of Raphael and his contemporaries, we have the representation of the impalpable and mystic spiritual experience so characteristic of the age, *e. g.*, in the wonderful Madonnas of Raphael, or in the Christ of Leonardo da Vinci. Again in the modern English pre-Raphaelite school, we have the expression of a profound sense of weariness behind all its minute and meticulous emphasis on picturesque details, *e. g.*, in the Pandora of Rossetti or in the Autumn of Millais. Contrast with such pictures a piece of Phidian sculpture or a statue of Buddha, and the elemental difference between the two will be unmistakable. The whole expression of the latter is one of profound and inward contentment from a sense of perfect and complete realisation. In the former, we have representation of a spiritual aspiration or of a discontent arising from a possible sense of irrefutable imperfection. Buddha, serenely satisfied with the great truth which he had realised within himself ; Apollo gloriously conscious of his divine perfection,—are these not fundamentally opposed to our vision of Christ, with that look of passionate yearning irradiating from his countenance, or of the Madonna eager to lose herself in the Infant God in her arms?

( 6 )

Romanticism, we have noted, has a negative side of denial, and a positive side of affirmation. It might be said that Romanticism denies only to affirm more vehemently ; affirms in order to imply a comprehensive denial. In its aspect of negation it received considerable impetus from the French Revolution, and manifested as a violent protest not only against all existing institutions as such, but against the very conditions under which life has to be lived in this planet. It would be not without interest to pass under rapid survey the different forms which this protest and this revolt took in the poets of the English Romantic movement.

The loudest and the most emphatic of these revolutionaries is undoubtedly Byron, who has proclaimed his rebellion in verses that blaspheme against the very foundations of life. Mr. Arnold has sought the seeds of Byron's Titanism in his Celtic temperament, which after all is Romanticism as conditioned by the wild surroundings amidst which the Celts lived. Everywhere in Byron's poetry, we have this Titanism of the Celt... "his passionate, turbulent indomitable reaction against the despotism of facts."

The reaction against what Mr. Arnold called "the despotism of fact" even more subtly interpenetrates the lyrical cry of pain which exhausts itself in the poetry of Shelley. "Tameless and swift and proud" as his spirit is, Shelley is chained down by a heavy weight of hours, and he falls upon the thorns of life and bleeds. Take up any of his more characteristic poems, and we will recognise the same all-pervasive dissatisfaction with the real world, and the same restless yearning to burst the chain that ties him down to the earth and to find in death that consummation which life denies ;—and even there he is pursued by the soul-killing doubt—"Lest the grave should be, like life and fear, a dark reality."

In Coleridge's poetry the revolt and the yearning are both exclusively personal. They give rise to a strain of melancholy, a feeling of futility before the baffling conditions of life. It never becomes so shrieking or tempestuous as in Byron or Shelley, but yet, it is this elemental sense of dissatisfaction that forms the vital element in Coleridge's poetry.

Almost on the same level with Coleridge stands Keats. Garrod refers to a "shyness of the actual" in Keats's poetry ; we regard this as the essence of Romanticism. On the other hand, there is in Keats's poetry, an unconscious but insistent effort to create for his imagination "an ideal atmosphere unaffected by the social influence of his age." (Courthope.)

It is only in the poetry of Wordsworth that this aspect of Romanticism is not fundamental. He does indeed refer to "the heavy and weary weight of this unintelligible world," but only to show how the heaviness can be made to evaporate and the weight to become less wearying and oppressive, and the world to lose itsaspect of unintelligibility. Wordsworth's poetry is inspired by a reaction against the mechanisation of life in these days, and is therefore as much protestant in its implications as the more obvious rebellion of Byron and Shelley, and the more personal distress of Keats and Coleridge. Let it at the same time be remembered that so far as Wordsworth extorted satisfaction out of the facts of life, he approximated to the Classic attitude, as has been recognised by several of his most ardent admirers. Wordsworth has a strenuous moral fibre by the strength of which he is able to raise himself far above all pessimism. Indeed in his poetry such half-truths as pessimism and optimism might imply are finally resolved into a glorious and glowing synthesis, where the mind is poised in the stable equilibrium of self-realisation. This is nowhere so apparent as in those magnificent narratives which express through all the tragic hostility of enveloping circumstances "the beauty of life, and the exuberant power of life," desiring eternity for the realisation of its infinite possibilities.

## ( 7 )

What has been already referred to as the positive side of Romanticism is to be found in the continuous search for avenues of escape from the world of facts, and the imaginative reconstruction of an ideal world where the mind can realise the ineffable satisfaction of fulfilment.

The simplest and the most obvious means of escape from the real world was to go back to the past. In this sense we are all more or less romantic; often and anon we become sick of the present with its overwhelming emphasis on facts and we wistfully revert to that fabulous Golden Age, where all our unrealised and unrealisable dreams and desires are accommodated in a scheme of perfection. In romantic poetry, this reversion to the past was accomplished with a swift and easy facility. Thus it carried us backwards to the luminous age of Greek mythology, where all rivers and mountains were haunted by nymphs and naiads, dryads and hamadryads,—where, in the words of Keats,—

Holy were the haunted forest boughs,
Holy the air, the water and the fire.

In the elemental simplicity of that beauty-intoxicated age the romantic poets found a sanctuary from the troubles that assail and overthrow the equilibrium of life.

Greater was the fascination of the Middle Ages, which were so delightfully interwoven with tales of magic and diablerie that in their eager desire to escape from the drab and dreary life of the present, it seemed to these poets to be just the world where their unquiet souls might attain their dreams of fulfilment without being disturbed by the scepticism of contemporary age.

The escape from the real world was further effected with the help of what Coleridge called "the shaping power of the imagination," the power to create a new world of ideal beauty "embroidered with dim dreams," where the mind can luxuriate in voluptuous ease, or be thrilled with vivid ecstasy. This imaginary world having ideal completeness can be seen in the romantic narrative poetry of Keats, Shelley and Coleridge.

A further way of escape was discovered by Wordsworth when he threw over the incidents of common life, "a certain colouring of imagination whereby ordinary things should be presented in an unusual aspect." This differs from the former in so far as it did not do away with the actual world, but only enveloped it with "the light that never was on sea or land." It is a curious process of imaginative transformation of the actual world, which is so satisfying to the weary mind that many regard this to be the very essence of poetry.

Again the Romantic poets tired with life often regarded it as illusory :

> We are such stuff
> As dreams are made of, and our little life
> Is rounded with a sleep.

This is chiefly to be found in Shelley. In the intense vision of Shelley, reality loses its militant solidity and becomes strangely vaporous and shadowy. It is this which leads him to fall back with so much uncritical ardour upon the Platonic conception of ideas as being the ultimate substance of which reality is but an unsubstantial shadow.

Aspiration towards totality or the infinite is so common an element in Romantic poetry in its reaction against the finite littleness of life that German philosophical critics have identified it as the very life and spirit of Romanticism. It is Shelley's "devotion to something afar;" it is Keats's yearning after "fellowship with essence," whence he "rises into a sort of oneness" and his "state is like a floating spirit." Of course, its sublimest expression is to be found in those wonderful lines of Wordsworth about the shadowy recollections of childhood joys—

> Which, be they what they may,
> Are yet the fountain-light of all our seeing,
> Uphold us, cherish, and have power to make
> Our noisy years seem moments in the being
> Of eternal silence.

* * * * *

> Hence in a season of calm weather
> Though inland far we be
> Our souls have sight of that immortal sea which brought
> us hither.

Finally, working through an elaborate process of analysis, Mr. L. Abercombie sees in Romanticism an withdrawal from the outer experience to concentrate on inner experience, and we may regard this as another means of escape from the limitations of actual life. Of course to identify Romanticism with that limited world of inner experience would be to restrict Romanticism either within that limited world where the mind alone creates in entire oblivion or disregard of the outer world; or it would be exaggerating the limits of that world till it became co-eval with all that Romanticism might imply. At any rate, it would effectively exclude the poetry of Scott and might be made to include the Imaginary Conversations of Landor. For this reason we have suggested that while Romanticism does imply and involve a rejection of the outer world of experience, the withdrawal or escape from it is effected variously by the different poets.

( 8 )

Because Romanticism is too much pervaded by this rejection of all that constitutes empiric reality, it has aroused the ire of the robust-minded thinkers and artists of modern times, who see in it only the germs of that decadence which infected English literature of the later 19th century. Thus Bernard Shaw suspects Romanticism to be the cause of all the sentimental mid-Victorian priggishness which weaves round the novels of Dickens and the poetry of Tennyson a peculiar atmosphere of unreality. There is again that stimulating critic, Irving Babbit, roundly telling us that Romanticism is in itself the source of all decadence, being itself the child of that arch decadent, Rousseau. Finally this chorus of protest is exquisitely rounded off by Rudyard Kipling in his own inimitable way:

> Romance ! those first class passengers,
> they liked it very well,
> Printed and bound in little books, but
> why don't poets tell ?
> I'm sick of all those quirks and qualms,
> the loves and doves they dream ;
> Lord send a man like Bobbie Burns, to
> sing the song of the steam.

That there is much in these adverse criticisms essentially true not even the stoutest champion of Romanticism will deny. The self-analytical self-introspections of many of the poets seem to indicate a morbid pathology that repels robust thinkers. Also their tendency to ignore life often made the poets recluses in the world of art and imagination, or led them to absolve themselves from all serious responsibilities of life,—thus fostering a spirit of unhealthy monasticism. It is a fact that Romanticism places on idealism at such an exaggerated value, that often made the poets slaves of mere sentiment which could lapse into prettiness with only too much facility. But the danger in these days being so much in the way of belittling Romanticism it will not be remiss if a brief reference is made to the signal contributions of Romanticism towards the enrichment and strengthening of the foundations of life.

( 9 )

To an Indian, what appeals most in the Romantic conception of life and art is its recognition of the claims of intuition to perceive immediately the ultimate nature and principles of reality which baffle the intellect of men. This intuitional perception has been well-defined as " the power of penetrating the ordinary objects of experience and perceiving meanings and relations lying beneath the surface and of revealing these elements not isolated and at random, but as part of a new synthesis.'' The entire epistemology of the Upanishads centred round this idea; but in the West it was for the first time affirmed with all the emphasis of a definitely personal realisation by the great Romantic poets. Coleridge said, ''All truth is a species of revelation, and the deepest truths are available only by a man of deep feeling.'' The poetry of Wordsworth is pervaded by this vision which transcends the common formulæ of the understanding with the help of a penetrating insight, and realises a truth ''not standing upon external testimony but carried alive into the heart by passion; truth which is its own testimony, which gives confidence and competence to the tribunal to which it appeals and receives them from the same tribunal.''

In the second place, Romanticism created in men a love of nature for its own sake, which made the poets approach the beauties of nature with a caressing tenderness, a wistful fondness for all its delicate nuances, its subtle harmonies of light and shade, all the qualities which give it its enveloping atmosphere. It was not that poets did not feel attracted by nature before ; but whereas formerly poets used natural landscape for purposes of embroidery, decoration and an effective background, now they looked upon nature as something capable of responding to the moods of a poet spontaneously, ready to minister to their spiritual and moral needs, and to drown all their sorrows and heart-aches in a wave of beauty.) It has been suggested by Rabindranath Tagore that this attitude to nature has found its way into Western literature from Eastern sources ; that the influence of Kalidas's Sakuntala, newly translated from Sanskrit by William Jones, was potent in this direction. What validity such a theory might have it is not easy to assess. (But the fact that here we have for the first time in Europe a recognition of the personality of Nature, a perception of the independent existence of Nature, surely pre-disposes the mind to study the probable sources of such a conception ; and in such a study, India is sure to loom large by reason of her peculiarly subtle feeling for external life.) We are of course not affected in our present study by these considerations. Let us recognise the immense expansion of the world of poetry that has resulted from this attitude to nature.

In the third place, Romanticism has tended to liberate life from the circumscribed groove in which the social man is liable to move and think, and which arrests the fluidity of life. In Classic art, life was stereotyped into set moulds and forms,—forms of transparent beauty, moulds of self-complacent strength, deriving therefrom that graceful equilibrium which we associate with that art. But in Romantic art, life constantly overflows restrictions ; the artist is swept away from the sphere of limitations into a region of daring experiments. Impossible situations, abstract idealism, visionary splendours, magnificence which no eye has seen, music that defies definition, fragrance that exhales the atmosphere of paradise, these are the substances out of which the Romantic artist creates a wonderful world for his mind to dwell in and luxuriate in bliss.

There can be no doubt that Romanticism has extended the horizon of man's imagination on all sides. The limiting conditions of life make man seek that which is illimitable. We thus find the romantic poets using words which are "winged" in the truest sense of the term, words that carry us flying through the impalpable regions of infinitude. Hence the romantic poets find it necessary to employ symbols that suggest more than lines or words that express. They evoke our memory through the channels of images and ideas that reproduce themselves through associations and memory. Hence symbolism has become one of the most accepted medium and expression which the romantic artist employs.

Finally in the world of artistic and literary forms, Romanticism has been the originator of striking innovation and invention. Romantic poets have tried to re-capture in the music of their poetry, the complex rhythm of life in all its manifestations. They have sought to arrest in the lines of their painting and sculpture the delicate romances of nature in all their evasive subtlety.

DHIRENDRANATH GHOSH

# THOUGHTS SUGGESTED BY SOME ELIZABETHAN PLAYS

## ( 1 )

Life is holy. It has a moral basis and justice is its backbone. He who acknowledges them not is an out-law, a reprobate—be he a crowned monarch or a common highwayman. A thing not rightly acquired is a misappropriation,—be it a kingdom or a trinket. Its retention debaseth the mind and corrupteth the heart. But how lovely is innocence and injured innocence, how lovelier still! Before its youthful presence, unrighteousness—a deformity—stands abashed like a guilty thing surprised. From the height of humanity it falls till it reaches the lowest pit of grovelling baseness and passes into regions where fierceness abides. Unacquainted with the crooked ways of iniquity, innocence walks abroad with the courage of a born hero. The twin sisters of affection and sympathy keep him company to wipe away the sweat of his summer fatigue and enliven him with a benignant warmth against the chill blasts of unprosperous winter. Beauty, the Queen of Spring, attended by her sweeter sister Chastity, unsolicited greets him and vows eternal fidelity to him in the privacy of her flowery retreat. It lies not in the power of a brutish instinct, committed to wrong-doing, to despoil the sweetness of this elysium of happiness with threats or violence. Swift-foot jealousy—a curse of earthly life—might raise a dust-storm of suspicion only to be dispelled by the light April showers of love-tears and the swift vernal breeze of love-sighs. The sweet serenity of this happy land is uncongenial for wolfish evil to dwell in, which beats a hasty retreat leaving innocence, smiling and graceful, its victor and lord.[1]

---

[1] Philaster by Beaumont and Fletcher.

(2)

Chastity has ever outshone beauty in woman. The evanescent charms of the one are nothing to the consistent grace of the other. Blessed is the woman that unjustly deserted, with her happiness blasted through unholy machinations, never turns away from him who is once admitted into the sanctuary of her heart and whose memory like an evergreen shrub thrives in the congenial soil of her mind, watered by her unfeigned tears and nursed by her sweet devotion. The imperfections of matter ever yield the palm to the purity of the spirit. But a maiden, born ever so high and noble, who yields her virgin fort, be it to the king, is an uncouth bitch under the dissembling cloak of beauty, capable of killing her paramour lolling his head on the defiled bed and wallowing in the mire of pollution. Her own vicious breath makes her flee from herself and excites murderous feeling in her kindred. The humblest of men never puts up with any outrage to his womenfolk. Bloodshed is its inevitable sequel. To be entrapped in the snares of beauty, lured by carnalism, has ever been the bane of flesh. But to force a strumpet as an unsullied virgin on an unsuspecting youth, already in love with a maiden, chaste as Diana, is a piece of devilry befitting the purgatory.[2]

(3)

Love's bower is a perpetual sunshine. Leafy spring, mild zephyr and smiling flowers are his ministering angels. Fond kisses, soft whispers and throbbing hearts evoke a sweet symphony that keeps the air vibrant. The lovers glide through the sunny glade scattering joy, mirth and laughter. In this world of romance where purity plays with innocence, Religion—the primeval Dame, is an unwelcome guest. Her frosty breath turns love's rosy tints into livid blue. Her scowling look stops blood's merry course, chills heart's wild thrills and dissolves lip's ruddy glow. But nothing has yet shackled love, nothing can. A Jessica will always find a Lorenzo, come what may. Her glowing passion ever breaks through barriers of schism and sets the quick panting emotion free to fly where it listeth. Warm blood is impetuous and nothing that opposes it is spared.[3]

---

[2] The Maid's Tragedy by Beaumont and Fletcher.

(4)

Vanity is a one-eyed Queen of imperious temper. Foul-mouthed malice and fire-brand jealousy, like the ever-watchful dragon defending the golden fleece, guard her unbounded domains. Ambition is her precursor and self-praise her standard-bearer. Ever mounted on the high-mettled charger of success she rides rough-shod over the feelings of others. Adventurous in spirit and tyrannical by nature she never rests till her supremacy is acknowledged with a low obeisance. Brought up in the artificial atmosphere of false adulation, she shuns the natural sunshine of candour and truth. Parasites, cowards and time-servers sing her praise and adorn her court. Under thraldom even a queen, resplendent like sun in her splendour and serene as the moon in her benignity, would invite the very devils of the hell to her aid to blacken spotless chastity and employ all the engines of destruction to bring honest truth under subjection. But she has never succeeded in this. Her greed for praise is insatiable. Half the follies of the world own allegiance to her.[4]

(5)

That man has not been born yet whom beauty attracteth not. Beauty is a born aristocrat. Homage is her waiting-maid and

The Maid of Honour by Philip Massinger.

[4] The Picture by Philip Massinger.

respect her birth-right. Cupid's fairest creation,—a perpetual curse—dogs her steps through her brief earthly sojourn. Tragedy and she have been twins ever since creation. In the hot-house of unceasing watch and utmost devotion such delicacy thrives sheltered from unfeeling touches. The least slight or slackness leads to disaster. Friendship founded on the bed-rock of sincerity when left alone with her is transformed into a lustful passion preying upon the very object vowed to preserve her unsullied in the absence of her lord protector. Conscience is thawed and lust aroused from its torpor by her bewitching looks. To malign the unspotted whiteness of chaste beauty with all the dejection of a feigned remorse and cause the fairest bloom to be plucked out from the pliantest stem by the very hand that nursed it to its admiring growth is a foul trick of faithless friendship. Too much doting on beauty argues weakness even in a hero that moves the heart of his victorious opponent by his native courage and honest frankness.[5]

## ( 6 )

The serenity and sweet composure of heaven lies about a pious soul at all times, till it shuffles off the mortal coil. Threats and persecution beat against it with ineffectual violence of waves against a rocky shore. It stands rooted to its convictions with the consistency of a submarine cliff amidst tides and tumults. It treats with like indifference all earthly weal and woe. The fever of passion, the elation of hope or the numbness of despair never darkens its gaze "through golden vistas into heaven." A vision beatific fills it with uncloying sweetness before which pomp and vanity mules and pukes. In this height of self-conscious purity even the soft whispers of coy love move it not. Life and death are to it as toys to a prattling babe.[6]

---

[5] The Duke of Milan by Philip Massinger.

[6] The Virgin Martyr by Philip Massinger.

( 7 )

In this world of hollow show a man is judged not by what he is but by what he appears. Artful lying, loud swaggering, pretended indignation were devised to deceive others but never for self-deception. A man may be the dread of his foes but an obsequious slave to his own goatish lust hid in the unlit corner of his mind. He may be the brightest jewel in the crown of his country but a pest of his own home, a torture to himself and a monster preying upon his own blood. Nothing is farther from heaven and nearer to hell than an incestuous creature—thirsting after a child of his own loins—a maiden of blooming youth, of meek obedience and natural sweetness. Happiness and he are as poles asunder. The iniquities of a sinful life never escape the lashes of a just retribution. The worst calamity that has ever befallen man is by himself.[7]

( 8 )

Beauty—an evanescence—is a blazing flame and one not pure in heart should approach it not, lest he be singed. Love and sensuality—how mocking ! One a monster and the other, a god, are twins engendered in the womb of heart by this earthly faery. A man, be he the father, is an unclean swine, if loose desires possess him at the beauty of his son's fiancee. Peace and happiness take a hasty departure from such a region yielding place to sooty melancholy. But ever blessed are true lovers ! Earthly calamities, like dark storm-swept clouds revealing the smiling blue of the heaven in all its lovely glory, enhance the soothing sweetness of fast-beating hearts resting on each other A gracious hand of divinity cuts the knot of their sufferings in twain and brings them close that have burnt holy incense at the altar of unshaken fidelity.[8]

RASH RANJAN BASU

---

[7] The Unnatural Combat by Philip Massinger.

[8] The Lover's Melancholy by John Ford.

# LAXEY

Laxey has a wheel
Far famed I'm told,
But then it don't appeal
I'm left quite cold
For wheels I see at home
Both large and small
'Tis not for wheels I roam
No' not at all!
But Laxey has a beach
Of shingle and of stones
Not an easy one to reach
At least, to lazybones
But oh! you will agree
It's simply splendid fun
To watch the Laxey Sea,
Toss in the Laxey Sun.

LELAND J. BERRY

# ERNEST DAWSON

" Life," says Shelley, " is a dome of many-coloured glass which stains the white radiance of Eternity." Its varied colours are but the reflected glory of the human mind. We receive from life only what we give. The fountains of our joys and sorrows gush from the depths of our soul. Our personality transfigures the world in which we live ; we invest it with our own ideals, colour it with our own emotions. Ours is the visionary gleam which flits over its face ; ours again, the sombre gloom which often darkens it. Man is the dreamer and life his dream. To the strong in faith the entire universe is but the vesture of the Eternal Father, God. To those who have fallen on the thorns of life yet can still retain their idealism, this world shines with an ethereal beauty which radiates from beneath its outward form of decay. .But all are not gifted with this illumination of the spirit ; few, indeed have the power " to strip the painted curtain of this scene of things." There are men—and poets also—who are gifted with an exquisite sense of beauty, but have no strength, either of spiritual experience, or of a robust intellectual outlook, to uphold them in their struggle for existence. To natures, so constituted and so developed, life is a grim terror. It is fate, unrelenting and inscrutable, which ruthlessly smothers their own personality. They are blind to things at their best and base their ideal world on a conception of things at their worst.

Such a nature was Ernest Dawson's. Like the Pierrot of his play he wants to live in the midst of " visions, strange and sweet. " He remembers his days of innocent childhood when "in single glee" he chased the flitting creatures of beauty in his world of experience. "The soft wood sounds, the rustlings in the breeze," the eglantine stooping down to "woo the maidly violet," and, last but not the least, Music, its echoes "stealing upon his senses with unlooked for weal"—all create for him a world of dreamy langour in which he yearns to be. The poet is sorely distressed; tired of his "old joy in the rout and masquerade" of life, weary of all memories and care, all joy and mirth, he seeks forgetfulness; utter oblivion must steal into his soul with the soft music which echoes his heart's complaint. He hankers for the realm of fancy, where

> Drawn by a team of milkwhite butterflies
> Whom with soft voice and music of thy maids,
> Thou urgest gently through the heavenly glades;
> Mount me beside thee, bear me far away
> From the low regions of the solar day;

* *

Even in the midst of the sordid experiences of everyday life he seeks for "the lustrous kingdom of the heart" and dreams how,—as the Moon-lady describes,—

> Calm is it yonder, very calm; the air
> For mortal's breath is too refined and rare;

his imagination conjures up before his mind's eye a vision of sensuous beauty, a world where

> Hard by a green lagoon our palace rears
> Its dome of agate through a myriad years.
> A hundred chambers its bright walls enthrone,
> Each one carved strangely from a precious stone.
> Within the fairest, clad in purity
> Our mother dwelleth immemorially:
> Moon-calm, moon-pale, with moon-stones on her gown
> The floor she treads with little pearls is sown;
> She sits upon a throne of amethysts,
> And orders mortal fortunes as she lists.

She is the symbol of the spirit of Beauty in nature;

> And dreamers all, and all who sing and love
> Her power acknowledge and her rule approve;

Her votaries

> Forthwith forget all joyance of the day,
> Forget their laughter and forget their tears,
> And dream away with singing all the years.
>
> (Pierrot of the Moment)

Sharply set off against this background of a dreamy sensuous world of beauty stands, so the poet avers, the humdrum world of everyday existence. It is a realm of cruel insincerity, where men are "polished, petulant, malicious, sly." The keen rapier-play of wit and repartee, the merciless thrust of quips pregnant with malice, the innocent-looking inuendo which glibly destroys reputations—all combine to make of it a scene very uncongenial to the delicate sensibilities of imaginative dreamers. These sordid experiences naturally weigh upon the spirit of man; they crush the poet's personality; they cast a gloom, as it were, over nature herself. Our poet becomes weary of life. His whole world of thought and imagination is coloured by this melancholy conviction. When his beloved Neobule dies it seems to him, as if she

> ...........too tired
> Of the dreams and days above!
> Where the poor, dead people stray,
> Ghostly, pitiful and gray
> Sleeps the sleep which she desired.
>
> (A Requiem)

April comes "with dainty step brushing the young, green grass." She is fair and beautiful; and

> ......all her flower-like beauty, as a glass
> Mirrors out hope and love.
>
> (My Lady April)

Yet she is tearful as well ; tears tremble down her sad face, her languid eye-lashes wear traces of them. Does she then, asks Dawson, " Weep for very wantonness ? " Or is it not that rather

> ......she doth dimly foresee
> Across her youth the joys grow less and less,
> The burden of days that are to be :
> Autumn and withered leaves and vanity
> And winter bringing in barrenness ?
> (My Lady April)

Weary of the day's toil and anxiety, the shades of evening comfort him with hopes of repose.

> Labour and longing and despair the long day brings;
> Patient till evening men watch the sun go west.

They seek oblivion "of all the vanities observed by the sun "—and the yearning of the human soul for rest makes her hanker for the last of our evenings when our spirit will cry out "sufficient unto the day were the day's evil things " (Vesperal).

The world may still allure man ; its worldly wisdom may urge him on—

> Go forth and run, the race is to the brave;
> Perchance some honour tarrieth for thee !

But the weary heart of the poet remains inert. It does not feel the inspiration. The only answer it can give is the answer of despair, of hopeless despondency. Death is inevitable, why should we then struggle ? Wherefore should we

> .................strive or run
> On dusty high-ways ever a vain race ?

For, is it not certain that the " long night cometh, starless, void of sun " (Sapienla Lunae) ? Tempest-tost and cast away from the sympathies of men the derelict soul of the poet seeks consolation and repose. She goes to all shelters, likely and unlikely, but finds no solace. And in the restless struggle of his life, the quiet sleep of the dead in their solitary graves has a strange significance for Dawson. Those "dear dead people with pale hands" urge the poet to join them in their places of rest. The death of a child leaves a profound impression on his mind. He would fain be like the child; fain would he find repose in the eternal sleep of death.

> Yes to be dead,
> Dead here with thee to lay
> When all is said
> 'Twere good by thee today
> My weary head.
> The very best!
> Ah! child so tired of play
> I stand confessed:
> I want to come thy way,
> And share thy rest.
> (The Dead Child)

This pessimistic outlook on life finds a poignant expression in Dawsons' poetry. It darkens the entire atmosphere with thoughts of failure and misery. In dirge-like cadences the poet takes up all that is joyous and beautiful in the world and strips it bare of its radiance. His vision becomes bleared; he cannot look at the brighter aspects of life even when he speaks of them; he mumbles and hesitates. Verily his life is one valley of the shadow of death and

> The fire is out, and spent the warmth thereof
> (This is the end of every song man sings!)
> The golden wine is drunk, the dregs remain,
> Bitter as wormwood and as salt as pain;
> And health and hope have gone the way of love
> Into the drear oblivion of lost things.

He looks around him but finds no single ray of hope. His companions are no longer sympathetic; in the unnatural twilight of his imagination they too become unreal, mere shadows of themselves, ghosts flitting hither and thither through the gloomy atmosphere of his world. With pale, indifferent eyes he sits and waits for the inevitable advent of death, for the curtain to fall and the gate to close upon his distressed soul. And sadly does Dawson remind us "This is the end of all the songs men sing" (Dregs).

2.

To a soul so distressed life is transient. He does not find either in himself or in the world around any spirit nor any power upholding it till eternity. He has not that strength of intellect which can transmute in the light of a consistent theory the phenomenal world into one organised whole nor can he develop that faculty of intuitive vision which can penetrate into the depths of reality and discern the one behind the many. Such a poet, and Dawson was one, is always eager for new sensations; and existence to him is a mere cluster of such sensations. Moreover recoiling as he does from its actual, bitter experiences, he loses touch with reality and lives entirely in a world of shadows. To him,

> They are not long, the weeping and the laughter,
> Love and desire and hate :
> I think they have no portion in us after
> We pass the gate.

His life is a mere interlude between two unknown realities; a path, faintly illuminated for a while before finally relapsing into the profoundest darkness. It is primarily one of sensations and has no eternal existence. "They are not long," sings the poet,

> They are not long, the days of wine and roses:
> Out of a misty dream
> Our path emerges for a while, then closes
> Within a dream.
> (Vitae Summa Brevis Spem Nos Vetat
> Incohare Longam)

It is thus "a little while," just—

> A time to sow and reap
> And after harvest a long time to sleep;

and even in this little "bank and shoal of time" we grow old and leaden-eyed and grey; we lose our old dreams, our wild passionate pleasures, our buoyant joys and ardent desires.

Nor has the poet a more definite conception of a future life. He has no firm conviction about its very existence—only vague surmises regarding its nature. Is our life after death, asks Dawson, one of repose and forgiveness? Shall we then forget our old cares, our past animosities and abide in peace?

> In lands profoundly shaded
> From tempest and from sun:
> Ah! once more come together,
> Shall we forgive the past,
> And safe from worldly weather
> Possess our souls at last?

Or is it one of vain regrets? Is it a dark unknown whence our very imagination shrinks? Will the joys and even the sorrows of our earthly existence enthrall us there as well—compelling our disembodied selves to stretch forth a hand just to have a fresh contact with those "green, remembered meadows," of this pleasant earth, our mother?

> And vainly there foregathered
> Shall we regret the sun?
> The Rose of love, ungathered?
> The bay, we have not won?

Again, who knows but that all the cares and anxieties of our life, our bitter struggles for existence may cease when we die? The poet is not sure that our soul "hath elsewhere its setting and cometh from afar." On the contrary, it is, with men like him, a plausible creed that

> ......... the world's dark marges
> May lead to Nevermore,
> The stately funeral barges
> Sail for an unknown shore.
> (Amantium Iræ)

Death consequently has with him a greater significance than life. His songs are often songs of the setting sun reddening the western horizon as day lies dying; or of the wintry day with its chill and gray sky, its piercing north-wind which withers up all verdure from the face of the earth. He would fain conjure up before his mind's eye visions of decrepitude, its gaze bleared by senile decay and its visage wan "with the weight of yesterdays" (Mositura). Human destiny he sums up in simple words of bitter significance:

> Short summer-time and then, my heart's desire,
> The winter and the darkness: one by one
> The roses fall, the pale roses expire
> Beneath the slow decadence of the sun.
> (Transition)

3.

The "Pierrot of the Minute" is a characteristic expression of his outlook on life. In it Dawson describes in verses of graceful melody the hankerings of his poetic temperament. His weariness of life, his yearning for an intense experience of love are all depicted here under the veil of an allegory. His soul seeks some unbodied joy, he knows not what. It wistfully enquires

> Is there no oracle, no voice to speak,
> Interpreting to me the word I seek?

In the ethereal music that seems to float gently in the atmosphere around, he finds vague intimations, as it were, of the indefinable urgings of his own heart. They almost teach him what he would fain learn, half-revealing the strongest impulses that are driving him towards his unknown destiny. The prophetic scroll, the symbol of his dim-descried longings, tells him that Love can remove the painful void in his life. It merely suggests the remedy but is significantly silent about the details of its action. "Here is indeed more writing, but too faint to read." Characteristically the soul of the poet, laps herself up in soft Lydian airs. He creates around him a wonderful realm of sensuous beauty to escape from the everyday experiences of his life. He feels the entire world panting for love, for union.

The soft wood sounds, the rustlings of the breeze
Are but stealthy kisses of the trees.
Each flower and fern in this enchanted wood
Leans to her fellow and is understood.
The eglantine, in loftier station set,
Stoops down to woo the maidly violet.

The spirit of beauty comes to him. She laments that a being so beautiful, so "arrayed in innocence" should have his entire future destroyed for one single emotional experience. She warns him: "If thou wouldst be wise, return unknowing" for he alone is safe who flies. But the poet's soul will never be satisfied unless he gazes on the countenance of this wonderous beauty, "too luminous though it be for mortal sight." What does he care even if

Whoso seeks her she gathers like a flower—
He gives a life and only gains an hour.

He can hazard everything for this moment of intense emotion; he can venture his whole life for an hour. He wants

That for a moment he may touch and know
Immortal things.

and for the time being,

> ......... forget all weary things of the earth,
> All memories and cares, all joy and mirth.

This spirit of beauty, however, has nothing spiritual about her, nor is there in the dreams of the poet any the slightest hint of an earnest quest for "Intellectual Beauty." Dawson is not Shelley. He lives in an atmosphere altogether different. To him are not vouchsafed the beatific visions which enraptured the soul of the earlier poet. He seldom witnesses the transformation of the entire universe by the radiance of love. He cannot recognise in his beloved the "shadow of beauty unbehold," nor "the veiled glory of this lampless universe." She does not consecrate with her own hues all that she shines upon. On the contrary, she is less of an etherial spirit and more of a person. The poet knows her and her alone; in communion with her, he forgets everything,—his name, his race, all his past experiences. He simply desires to fade into the realm of fancy far away from the fret and fever of life. He feels and appreciates the "divine completeness of a kiss." It might be

> ......more cold than I could dream
> Aretus sits, watching the boreal stream:
> But with its frost such sweetness did conspire
> That all my veins are filled with running fire.

His senses, and not his soul, hanker after this spirit of sensuous beauty. They revel in her

> ............Radiant mouth
> Fragrant with all the spices of the south.

They want to pursue her "golden face" and learn each line of it, "like music note by note." They are enraptured by her beautiful long lashes and her radiant smiles. Such being the nature of his beloved Spirit of Beauty his love becomes

> A most sweet folly
> Full of mirth and melancholy;

and his future destiny is most significantly portrayed by his immortal Beloved when she sings :—

> In and out the woods and valleys
> Circling, soaring like a swallow
> Love shall flee and thou shalt follow.
> Though he stops awhile, and dallies
> Never shalt thou stay his malice!
> Go forth and seek in each fair face in vain,
> To find the image of thy love again.
> All maids are kind to thee, yet never one
> Shall hold thy truant heart till day be done.

One who has, even for a moment, been in blissful communion with this spirit of beauty can never be satisfied with mortal loves.

> Whom once the moon has kissed, loves long and late,
> Yet never finds the maid to be his mate.

## 4.

Dawson, like many other poets of the modern age, recognises that the physical and the spiritual are inextricably bound together in human life.

It is, in fact, one of the most significant characteristics of modern English poetry—this recognition of the composite nature of the human personality. Modern poets have rehabilitated the flesh in the world of man's spiritual progress. We no longer accept the older ascetic ideal of life ; nor do we think that self-mortification is necessary for the salvation of the human soul. On the contrary, this body of ours is " the inmost ultimate council of judgment ; " it is not the enemy but the helpmate of man's spiritual nature. The new test for modern man is not whether he has been successful in starving the old Adam in him; but, in the words of Browning,

> Thy body at its best,
> How far can that project thy soul on its lone way ?
> (Rabbi Ben Ezra).

We can never be blind to this newer and higher conception; it is an idea too potent to be brushed aside. This changed attitude towards life is not without its influence on our conception of love as well. Love is no longer " the desire of the moth for the star ; " it no longer worships from afar. On the contrary, it believes that " in the flesh grows the branch of life, in our soul it bears fruit," and so strong is this newer ideal that even a Dawson, who had little or no appreciation of Platonic love entirely removed from the world of everyday experience, had to admit :

> As man aspires and falls, yet a soul springs
> Out of his agony of flesh at last,
> So love that flesh enthralls shall rise on wings
> Soul-centred, when the rule of fleshi s past.
> (Quid Non Speremus Amantes)

There are even moments of intense emotional experience when the poet seems to rise above himself, above his own world of " love's inconstancy " into regions of the pure spirit. The very " defeat " of love is then glorified; it is clothed with a radiance all its own. Though parted from his beloved, her presence, " mere encounter with her golden face, " makes the whole world beautiful. There is no grief in such separation ; for even after such parting, is not the beloved

> .........Still a star
> Deeply to be desired, worshipped afar
> A beacon-light to aid
> From bitter-sweet delight, Love's masquerade?

On such occasions the poet touches Shelley and lives in an atmosphere of idealised emotions. In these rare moments of the poet's experience the Beloved, like the immortal creatures of Shelley's imagination, is felt as transmuting the entire universe into forms of beauty. Like theirs too, her looks revive the drooping soul of the lover and make it "riper in truth and virtuous daring grow" (To Harriet..., Dedication, Queen Mab). Dawson feels

> Love that is love at all,
> Needs not an earthly coronal;
> Love is himself his own exceeding great reward,
> A mighty Lord!

He is almost Platonic when he breaks forth into a song of praise to this mighty God Love who recks of no defeat and misery but, in his proud self-sufficiency, rules the entire world of the lover's existence. He is indeed "Lord over life and all the ways of death," "mighty and strong to save" his votaries from all troubles and anxieties of their destiny.

It would have been a blessing indeed if our poet could always remain in so rare an atmosphere of poetic vision or even if he could retain faint memories of such dreams. We would then have been spared much that is sordid, much that is earthy in his melodious verses. But that was not to be. Arthur Symons, his biographer, has given us an able portrait of his character. He is careful to point out that "To Dawson... nature, life, destiny, whatever one chooses to call it, that power which is strength to the strong, presented itself as a barrier against which all one's strength only served to dash one to more hopeless ruin.........He was unhappy and he dared not think.........Dawson had exquisite sensibility, he vibrated in harmony with every delicate emotion, but he had no outlook, he had not the escape of intellect." The result was as might have been well expected. Unable to realise the dreams of his life in this world, he sought to forget his dreams in a ferment of animal life, in gross amusements and sordid experiences. He deliberately gave himself up to dissolute and dissipated ways of life, flung himself recklessly into riotous living and hastened, consciously or unconsciously, to an inevitable early grave. Seeking to escape from life, he suddenly confronted death.

Such being the real nature of the poet it was impossible that he should, for any great length of time, remember ever so faintly, the beautiful visions of spiritual love which had sometimes sustained him in his grief. With him, at this stage of his mental development, the highest type of love is pastoral.

Oh I would live in a dairy,
  And its Colin I would be
And many a rustic fairy
  Should churn the milk with me.

He bids adieu to Paris ladies ; for,

Ye are brave in your silks and satins
  As ye mince about the Town ;
But her feet go free in patterns
  If she wear a russet gown
(Soli Cantare Periti Arcades)

It is more often merely sensual. Wine, woman and song are, the poet assures us, the three things which garnish our way and we would be doing our youth wrong if we do not gather them while we may. Dawson cannot now understand

Why wine-stained lip and languid eye,
And most unsaintly Maenad air,
Should move us more than all the rare,
White roses of virginity ?
(Rondeau)

His philosophy of life is, consequently, thoroughly pagan :

Love wine and beauty and the spring
  While wine is red and spring is here

And through the almond blossoms ring
The dove-like voices of thy dear.
Love wine and spring and beauty while
The wine hath flavour and spring masks
Her treachery in so soft a smile
That none may think of toils and tasks.
(Wisdom)

Such love cannot indeed be constant. The allurements which beset human life on all sides prove too strong for such a pagan. New desires and new pleasures hurry him onward and do not allow him to linger long on one beloved object. The very transitoriness of life makes him eager to enjoy it to its very dregs. " While life is ours " so advises the poet,

While life is ours
Hoard not thy beauty rose and white
But pluck thy pretty fleeting flowers
That deck our little path of light.
For all too soon we twain shall tread
The bitter pastures of the dead :
Estranged, sad spectres of the night.
(Amor Profanus)

Such love makes no vows. It is free and unfettered like the wind on the hill. The lovers want " only to walk in love's land " a little way ; only to learn his lessons a little while ; just to love and linger for some little time and then part for ever, for :

A little while and night shall come
A little while then let us dream;
Beyond the pearled horizon lie
Winter and night: awaiting these
We garner this poor hour of ease,
Until love turn from us and die
Beneath the drear November trees.
(Autumnal)

There are, in his songs of love, the same joy in life, the same devil-may-care attitude which are associated with the lyrics of the seventeenth century Cavaliers. The poet does not care whether love lasts for ever or not; nor does he want to tempt fate by vows of constancy. Our destiny wills otherwise; we can only, "kiss when kissing pleases" and "part when kisses pall." The beloved cannot, under such circumstances, expect lasting affection. "You ask my love," sings Dawson,

You ask my love completest
As strong next year as now
The devil take you, sweetest,
Ere I make such a vow.
Life is a masque that changes,
A fig for constancy,
No love at all were better
Than love which is not free.
(To his Mistress)

When, however, the poet is brought face to face with the tragedy of parting he cannot, for any length of time, retain this attitude of indifference. In his poems as well as in his life, we can discern two Dawsons—one, gentle, charming, almost "virginal" in his devotion, with "an infinite tenderness" and an "infinite respect" for womanhood; another, heedlessly drifting about amidst sordid surroundings, wallowing in sensual pleasures. It is the nobler Dawson that sobs through his songs of parting. The death of his beloved overshadows his entire universe, life loses all its varied interest and victory its joy (Vanities). Music gives him no consolation; roses pale into faint shadows of their former beauty. In the anguish of his heart the poet laments,

No man knoweth our desolation;
Memory pales of the old delight;
While the sad waters of separation
Bear us onward to the ultimate night.
(Exile)

He now lives in the past. The eyes of his beloved, her lips, her very personality haunt him day and night. In the midst of his dissipations her face swims before his mind's eye and reminds him of his past happiness. He may try to drown his sorrow in " madder music " and " stronger wine,"

> But when the feast is finished and the lamps expire
> Then falls thy shadow, Cynara! the night is thine
> And I am desolate and sick of an old passion
> Yea! hungry for the lips of my desire. (Non Sum
> Qualis Eram Bonae sub regus Cynarae)

It is in these moments of parting that the love-lorn poet wistfully yearns for a future life. He would fain believe that even after death there might be some hope of reunion.

> Yet crossed that weary river,
> In some interior land,
> Or anywhere, or ever,
> Will she stretch out a hand?
> And will she understand?
> (Vanitas)

There are again other moments when Dawson keenly feels the indifference of his beloved. In spite of her cruel rejection of his love the poet does not lose heart. On the contrary, he yearns for her presence and wants to approach her on some more fortunate occasion with his " burden of waste days and drifted rhyme." He dreams dreams and sees visions of love's fulfilment when " her calm eyes down drooping maidenly " will change and grow soft (Vain Hope). Sometimes he " steels " his heart and strives to forget his cruel mistress. He wants to forget her and live a life of total indifference. But alas! the very sight of his Beloved makes him forget everything and yearn for her love (Vain Resolve). These vain hopes and resolves still more vain, give us a Dawson far removed from the Devil-may-care Cavalier of the earlier lyrics. He is no longer a votary of " love wine and beauty " no longer a trifler of women. Woman is now the only source from which he receives comfort and consolation in the midst of the sorrows of his life.

> But when the storm is highest, and the thunders blare
> And sea and sky are riven, O moon of all my night!
> Stoop down but once in pity of my great despair,
> And let thine hand, though over late to help, alight
> But once upon my pale eyes and my drowning hair,
> Before the great waves conquer in the last vain fight
> (Seraphim)

This is certainly a spiritual ideal of love far higher than what he had expressed in his lighter moods. It comes direct from the depths of his personality where even the most sordid experiences of his life were not able to extinguish the light of his poetic vision. This dual personality is, indeed, the bane of his life. The struggle between the noble and the sordid elements of his character practically exhaust him and sick of this eternal conflict, the poet pathetically prays :

> Let us go hence, some-whither strange and cold
> To Hollow lands where just men and unjust
> Find end of labour, where's rest for the old,
> Freedom to all from love and fear and lust.
> Twine our torn hands! Oh pray the earth enfold
> Our life-sick hearts and turn them into dust
> (The Last Word)

5.

It was only natural that his bitter experiences should make the poet long for rest. But rest he never found in his common everyday existence. The peaceful life led by religious men had consequently a fascination for him. He profoundly admired the mental equanimity of persons belonging to the monastic orders.

> These heed not time ; their nights and days they make
> Into a long returning rosary,
> Whereon their lives are threaded for Christ's sake
> Meekness, vigilance and chastity.

Their prayers and penances rise like "fragrant incense" to the presence of their Saviour. The wild passionate world, "man's weary laughter and his sick despair" can never touch them. They are not of the world though they live in it.

> They saw the glory of the world displayed ;
> They saw the bitter of it and the sweet ;
> They knew the roses of the world would fade
> And be trod under by the hurrying feet.

They alone have the inner illumination of the spirit. The darkness of a despairing age never troubles them. We can only guess but they alone know that the dawn is not far distant. The strife and struggle through which Dawson had to pass invested the peace that reigned in the monastic cloisters with a deep significance all its own.

> Oh beatific life! who is there shall gainsay
> Your great refusal's victory, your little loss
> Deserting vanity for the more perfect way,
> The sweeter service of the most dolorous Cross.
> (Carthusians)

For,

> Surely their choice of vigil is the best!
> Yea! for our roses fade, the world is wide
> But there, beside the altar, there, is rest.
> (Nuns of the Perpetual Adoration)

The beautiful ceremonies of the Church oftentimes bring hope of peace to the wounded soul of the poet. "The voice of London, hoarse and blaspheming" is hushed into silence. The strange religious atmosphere of the Church—its" incense-laden air," its altar "dressed like a bride" and "illustrious with light"—instills into the mind of the poet a solemn calm which he finds nowhere else (Benedictio Domini). "The extreme unction" has now a pathetic appeal to the imagination of the poet. The atoning oil is spread with a renewal of lost innocence, and, all at once,

> The feet that lately ran so fast
> To meet desire, are soothly sealed
> The eyes that were so often cast
> On vanity are touched and healed.

Fain would the poet believe that

> ......When the walls of flesh grow weak
> In such an hour, it well may be
> Through mist and darkness, light will break
> And each anointed sense shall see.
>
> (The Extreme Unction)

Such was Dawson—an enigmatic personality eternally battling with his own desires and impulses. Unable to gain respite from sorrow he sank to a premature death.

AMIYAKUMAR SEN

# CO-EDUCATION[1]

Co-education means boys and girls should study together in one class-room. It is a plant of recent growth in India. It is a plant of tardy growth in Europe. Some are in favour of the system while others content themselves with throwing mud against it. Modern India is acting like Shakespeare's Hamlet, simply thinking good and evil of it. No sincere efforts have been made nor definite steps have been taken to introduce this system of education. We thought with the inauguration of reforms in 1919 that our ministers would do much but they have retarded the progress of education in general. Modern scientific civilization has vastly modified the vision of the world and new educational systems are being introduced in consequence of this. This system is in operation all over the civilized globe.

How India imbibed the system of the separation of the sexes in education ? Nor is there any convincing testimony that it existed in ancient India. Among Hindus, the female is considered as the other sweet-half of the male. Nay, even in some cases she enjoys a higher status than the male. She is linked and her presence is necessary in all the religious functions. This separation of the sexes, I think, is due most probably to the Muhmmadan and Mughal conquests in the Middle Ages. Those rulers introduced the barbarous system of Purdah and hence by and by the females were separated much more even in everyday affairs. Ancient Hindus knew not the Purdah system. In Deccan it was unknown. The Hindus of Northern India adopted it quickly, God knows whether as a fashion or out of necessity.

Mughals had a keen aesthetic sense for beauty. I wonder, why they wanted to cover these tender shrubs of nature with a thin silken cloth. Is it to heighten or mar it or to arouse the unnecessary attention of the passers-by. Is it that a covered beauty is more eloquent ? Thank God, those enlightened rulers did not enact that men should walk with blindfolded eyes. I am at a loss to reconcile this thought with their beautiful works in architecture. Perhaps they lacked a sculptor, who would have shown them that purity also consists in nudity.

---

[1] All rights of reproduction and translation reserved by the author.

Mothers educate while teachers only teach. Teachers are a store-house of book-knowledge. Except the class-room they know nothing of the practical world. Such is not the case with a woman-teacher. Her sympathetic outlook of life and practical bent of mind tell much upon the early environments of childhood. Mothers only know how to develop the faculties of the children. A single glance of a mother can teach more than a thousand teachers.

In all ages and in all climes mothers have played a prominent part in nation-building. In the Indian hermitages the breeze of joyful dawn of education blew freely with the tinkling of rosy ankle with tiny golden bells and *satis* went to heaven singing at each step. Naland, the centre of world's desire, was a glorious thoroughfare of learning for both the sexes. From Buddhist monasteries went forth bands of monks and nuns to preach the gospel of truth. There would be harmonious development of both the sexes if both are taught together. The girls shall enjoy a higher standard of honour. The boys will imbibe a higher standard of chivalry. Eyes of the girls will make boys more mannerly; for they admire and encourage manly virtues. It will banish the uncouthness and brutality of a boy. Boys and girls, if properly educated, shall snatch the blessings of a plenteous day and the earth shall show more fair.

It is always claimed that India is against co-education. Is it true? What are the chief grounds on which prominent Indian Educationists oppose it ? Let us glance at these crucial phases of co-education.

Much ink has been wasted and tongues have been dried in discussing the relative merits of these two systems of education. There are no disadvantages at all in the system of co-education, and a little understanding of the subject-matter will make it clear.

Co-education does not mean that boys and girls should be taught exactly in the same way. Some part in the teaching process must be common to both. It also does not mean that the methods suitable for boys should be imposed unaltered upon the girls. The interests of the two should not be subordinated at the cost of each other; for this some part of the curriculum may be on separate lines. A co-educational school must have competent teachers of both the sexes. Now, it is not very difficult for India for there are lots of educated ladies. Undoubtedly, there are certain subjects which women can teach better than men; while there are certain subjects which men can teach better than women. The atmosphere in such a school is of perfect equality. Recent Civil Disobedience movement has proved that Indian ladies are far superior in status and discipline and they can share the burden of harder toil along with men.

Advocates of the separation of the sexes claim :

(1) That by mixing the two the progress is retarded. Our experience is far otherwise. When the two study together the natural aptitudes get a full scope for automatic development.

(2) They say that it causes dislocation or break in the work, when girls are separated in the hours of needle-work, cookery, etc. In boys' school too it causes dislocation when the students go for science, drawing or any other optional subject. There ought to be a break in the work, for all the boys do not take the same subjects. So girls ought to go, never mind if it causes break. Time-tables should be arranged in such a way as to have fewer breaks.

(3) They say that the same sort of discipline is not suitable for both. Let there be twofold discipline according to the sex. I think in co-education discipline is more easily obtained.

(4) They say that a woman's work is far different from that of man. We agree. In co-education we have to bring both the sexes together for doing different work. All boys do not become pleaders or doctors, so let everyone choose the subjects according to one's liking.

(5) Lastly, they say, that in the transitional period of life when the new-born consciousness comes the two sexes should not intrude upon each other. They think it a sacrilege. It is here that the shoe of co-education pinches in India. If the boys and girls are brought up from childhood in a co-educational school, it becomes a matter of course and it naturally diverts the attention from the sexual aspects of life. Proper education of the sex-problems will mitigate this evil. It is only by this method that the two sexes shall learn much more about each other and both shall be able to acquire truthful views about life. Male egotism and female sentimentality will vanish away. It will go to solve the matrimonial mistake in life.

Decidedly co-education has many advantages. It will put a stop to the duplicating of staff in schools and colleges. It is more economical. It is very beneficial for a poor country like India. The principle being democratic is based on the idea of Equality of Sexes. It has a very wholesome influence on boys and girls and both develop a spirit of comradeship soon. Each will be benefited by the moral standard of the other. Neither will the boys think that they are supermen nor will the girls think that they are superwomen. In such an atmosphere brightness and demeanour of life will never fade away. It will stimulate the sporting spirit and life will be cheerful. It will easily go in forming the association of ideas and thus the two sexes will be benefited intellectually. The student-life instead of being dull would be linked with happy memories and unforgettable dreams. I cannot help being of opinion that it is nature's own plan. It is the most natural way of teaching both boys and girls. It will lift the veil of ignorance. Modern India is in urgent need of co-education. Will the Indian Educationists solve this problem satisfactrily?

Grand-fathers and middle-aged sires would be sorry why such a system did not exist when they were studying, and youths who have recently passed through the 'Alma Mater' shall be tempted to learn again.

This mingling flow of cultural stream shall reveal the gems of holy lore for Mother-land—the Everest of our dream; and the spirit now shall fly and harp the songs of yore.

VAMAN H. PANDIT

# FRAIL LOVERS!

Frail lovers! with vague yearnings torn,
Who waste away their souls love-lorn!
What gain, O what gain?
"Ask of the wild girl
That smiles in the lane."
Why, peasant girl, why ?
"Who calls them to sigh?"

Silk worms! that on the Mulberry are,
And love it but are torn afar!
What gain, O what gain?
"Ask of the Mulberry
That laves in the rain."
Why, Mulberry, why?
"Who calls them to die?"

Dew-drops! that come to kiss the green,
And wither in the fiery sheen!
What gain, O what gain?
"Ask of the bare earth
That draws us in vain."
Why, loveless earth, why ?
Who calls them from high?"

GURDYAL SINGH WADALIA

# KĀLIDĀS AS A DRAMATIC ARTIST

It sounds a truism when it is said that the more a dramatist can conceal himself behind the characters, the more successful he is; and it is generally well-recognised that the superior order of dramatic genius goes ill with a person who cannot keep himself aloof from the creatures of his imagination. Their thoughts and utterances are dramatic because they come out spontaneously of the "dramatic situation" and harmonise with the character as such. Otherwise they would have been of a purely lyrical character and would mar all the dramatic effect. This we find amply borne out by Shakespeare, whose each character is a world in itself, with which the dramatist sympathises for a time and, may be, lives completely in his being. But his own world remains apart, always receding in the background. This is considered—and that rightly—as one of the supreme merits of Shakespeare as a dramatist.

But according to many eastern and western critics, such is not the case with Kālidās, who is fondly dubbed the Shakespeare of India. It is a common truism of Kalidasian criticism that the genius of Kālidās was essentially of a lyrical order, and the highest merit of the Śakuntalam lies in some of the dramatic situations, in the complexity of opposed motives, and supremely in the fine lyrical passages (not utterances), strewn like gems with a lavish hand. Thus apparently seen, Kālidās has failed to harmonise every utterance with every situation of every character that is presented. For, who can think of such utterances of Duṣyanta, *e.g.*, চিত্রে নিবেশ্য পরিকল্পিতসত্ত্বযোগা, etc., as dramatic enough. Evidently, it is the poet himself who intrudes upon the privacy of Duṣyanta's feelings, and himself colours the utterances with all the smoothness and magnificence of his lyrical genius.

But this is, to say the least of it, a feeble estimate of Kālidās's dramatic genius. As we are going to show, Kālidās, specially in the Sakuntalam, has, with the instinct of a true dramatic genius, harmonised every utterance as well as every situation to his character. In this respect, the character of Duṣyanta, which beside that of Sakuntalā is the central character, presents the greatest difficulty as we have noticed above. So we shall herein deal with that character alone in a new light. Upon this count alone, our estimate of Kālidās as a dramatist *par excellence* will stand vindicated.

Kālidās has never in his dramas taken anything for granted—neither "the Superiority Complex" of Brāhmanism, nor the dry canons of Sanskrit dramaturgy. But nevertheless, his drama fulfils all that is required by the rules of Sanskrit dramatic art, and is a great model in that respect. The fact is, as will be evident presently, that the freedom of genius lies not so much in breaking down rules that look so obsolete and insufficient, as in transmuting them with a reality that is ever present in our everyday experience, and out of which the very rules were originally formulated.

As Shakespeare in Hamlet catches and recreates the very Sāgā atmosphere of old Denmark, similarly Kālidās creates for us the atmosphere of the holy grove of the pre-historic India. Again Kālidās visualises in the story of Sakuntalā in the Mahābhārata, the eventuality of a man of superior character and talent with a thoroughly sensitive and aesthetic nature, as also with a taste cultured by aesthetic attainments, in the same way as Shakespeare found of Macbeth or Coriolanus in Holinshed or Plutarch's Lives. It is apparent therefore that though Kālidās accepts the canon of dramaturgy in making Duṣyanta a ধীরোদাত্ত নায়ক; still with him the hero ceases to be a creature of convention and has all the living complexities of a real personage. Thus from the conception of character as such, we have in Duṣyanta the poet-artist and the man-of-action, all fused and presented in one. And this is so much nearer our heart that all that is best in us (readers or spectators) is drawn out in admiration for a character at once so human and divine, as much as man essentially is.

Now let us see how Kālidās has, from the very beginning, brought into prominence the dominant aesthetic nature of the hero. But it will do better to finger at once upon the Sixth Act, where Duṣyanta beguiles his heavy hours by laying his soul at the feet of the beloved drawn on the canvas by his own masterly hands and pencil. As সানুমতী commends—অহো এষা রাজর্ষেনিপুণতা, জানে সখ্যগ্রতো মে বর্ত্ততে ইতি (oh the skill of the great king—no longer a king but a bereaved lover and artist !—meseems my friend stands before me flesh and blood). But Duṣyanta is in the vein of the true artist, with whom all attempts of art are but feeble expressions of the beauty that haunts his imagination—and in the case of Duṣyanta his conscience also says—" যদ্‌ যৎ সাধু ন চিত্রে স্যাৎ ক্রিয়তে তত্তদন্যথা। তথাপি তস্যা লাবণ্যং রেখয়া কিঞ্চিদন্বিতম্ ." Again Duṣyanta like the true artist, feels in his personal sorrow the whole world of sorrow universalised and this inspires him with the artist's mission to recapture as much of the beauty as his distracted mind recollects now that the beauty itself is gone. The utterance of Duṣyanta in this connexion—সাক্ষাৎ প্রিয়ামুপগতাম্ অপহায় পূর্ব্বম্, etc.,—has a haunting pathos that gives his weary desolate heart no peace.

Again, in the forgetful nature of Duṣyanta we have the artist. The joy with an artist is always but a sleep, a forgetting. It is always flickering like the wick of the lamp at every gust of beauty that captures and takes him away in a whirl. Forgetfulness is in his very being; because his sub-conscious self is ever active. People who are always conscious have a hold on the present, but not on the "dark backward and abysm of time," when the soul was clothed in other vestures of decay. So when the sweet, lamenting song of হংসপদিকা creeps into his soul, the music could not but awake in Dusyanta the memories of love forgotten, and he felt ill at ease (*cf.* রম্যানি বীক্ষ্য মধুরাংশ্চ নিশম্য শব্দান্, etc.). Forgetfulness is the twin-sister of imagination and both are the hand-maids of an artist's mind. So unlike Greek tragedies, the curse of দুর্ব্বাসা could only accelerate the momentum of forgetfulness with dire effects. It was this forgetfulness that gave Shelley or Goethe no peace, driving them from one Beauty to another and at each time eluding the grasp of their towering imagination. It was this forgetfulness also that gave Duṣyanta no peace, till he could sublimate his "seeing eye" into a vision where there is the consummation of all perfection.

Thus we can very well see that such comparisons like মধু নমনাস্বাদিতরসম্, put in the lips of Duṣyanta, bespeak the aesthete to his very finger-tips ; as also his grand conception of Destiny discovers him as the supreme artist in such an utterance as চিত্রে নিবেশ্য পরিকল্পিতসত্ত্বযোগা, etc. And it is this aesthetic nature which stands before a beauty which embodies the artist's consecration and the poet's dream, and his very soul is drawn out in admiration with a speechless surprise almost akin to worship. It has been said by Rabindranath, Chandranath Basu and other famous critics of the Sakuntalam that the dominant note in the character of Duṣyanta was physical enjoyment, which was purged of its grossness through suffering due to a loss of his dearest possession. This might be true in a philosophic sort of way ; but it scarcely does justice to the character of Duṣyanta from a humanistic standpoint. Indeed if so represented, it becomes very difficult to follow the spiritual uplift to which he was destined later on. If one is of a normal type, in spite of intellectual attainments, one cannot be so soon disillusioned, unless he has a high spiritual ideal which is coursing underneath, and which is struggling for mastery. This can be the feeling only of an abnormal mind, to which category every true artist more or less corresponds. It is psychologically impossible that a thief can become, at three months' notice, changed into a saint. Here we are reminded of a familiar picture by Nandalal Bose, the famous artist, of Jagāi and Mādhāi, enjoying their drinking bout. The picture is a subtle psychological study. It suggests by depicting a slowness in the movements of the hands that they are not so much after the drink itself, and what they want is to drown their soul in its voluptuous enjoyment. This innate goodliness paves their future way to salvation.

That Duṣyanta pays respect to the sage in all humility is not of very much consequence to show that Duṣyanta was of a lofty nature. Indeed these are only outward manifestations and may be more or less due to habit. Still less can these be understood in the directly opposed presentation of Duṣyanta's character that so soon follows in its dire consequences. But Kālidās as a great artist brings out in subtle touches the innate good nature and lofty ideal that dominates Duṣyanta as being a great artist himself, who has drunk deep in the fountain of Beauty—Beauty of Nature and of Human form. This truly accounts for the fine height to which he rises in the long run and we expectantly wait for this triumph of humanity in its feebleness and strength against Destiny itself.

Thus, also, can we account for the marvellous insight shown by Goethe in his appreciation of the Sakuntalam, translated into German in a very mutilated manner from the imperfect English translation of it by Sir William Jones. Goethe himself had this essentially aesthetic eye for beauty, and in Duṣyanta Goethe found his own heart laid bare, the heart in which heaven and hell struggled incessantly for supremacy, as is so well portrayed by Emil Ludwig in his masterpiece of biography on Goethe. This dual personality as presented by Faust in the most poignant manner, and this constant sense of struggle against Destiny, we have in Duṣyanta transfigured in the peaceful serenity of Heaven. If the essence of tragedy lies in the divine urge for leaving behind the old for the new, whether of the atmosphere and environments of nature, or of mental life, then the life of Duṣyanta, as that of Śakuntalā, was tragic enough. And in the representation of the struggle from Darkness into Light, whether of the individual (as in Goethe's Faust or Hugo's Les Miserables), or of the whole humanity (as in the Indian epics, the saga legends, etc.), lies the abiding value of all great literature, as also, of the immortal work of Kālidās. So, rightly has Shakespeare said :

> " The poet's eye, in a fine frenzy rolling,
> Doth glance from heaven to earth, from earth to heaven."

which pre-eminently applies to Kalidasa whose vision of Heaven like that of Milton was not blurred by the sordid reality of the world, while Shakespeare was too much obsessed by the imperfections of the earth, which he loved so much. For with him all tragedy—and even comedy—was seeing the truth of human nature in the broken light of this frail humanity.

MAKHANLAL MUKHERJI

# HISTORY OF THE EAST INDIA COMPANY'S TRADE IN BENGAL (1757-1765)

The abuses in the field of internal trade did not escape the attention of Siraj-ud-Dowla, who complained "that the British had abused the privileges of trade granted them by their firman." But he was soon carried away from the throne of Bengal, and the disorder and weakness of the central authority that followed the battle of Plassey, allowed these abuses to grow from day to day. The moral effect of the victory of Plassey was very great, and it filled the minds of the Company's agents and gomasthas in Bengal with a strong desire for further aggrandizement in the field of commerce. By the general sanad issued by Mir Jafar on the 15th July, 1757, the Nawab confirmed the old privileges of the Company in definite and emphatic terms and passed strict orders against hampering English trade in any way.[1] Of course, theoretically speaking, "with regard to trade no new privileges were asked of Mir Jafar; none indeed were wanted by the Company who were contented with the terms granted them in 1716, and only wished to be relieved from the impositions to which they had been exposed from the arbitrary power of the Nawabs,"[2] but there is no doubt that the victory greatly increassd the prestige and influence of the Company. No sooner had this influence been felt than "many innovations were practised by some of the Company's servants, or the people employed under their authority."[3] The servants of the Company began to trade in articles which were before prohibited and they claimed also exemption from duties not only on exports and imports but on all articles in their private trade. Historian Orme has very aptly remarked: "...but as it is the nature of man to err with great changes of fortune, many, not content with the undisputed advantages accruing from the revolution, immediately began to trade in salt and other articles which had hitherto been prohibited to all Europeans; and Meer Jaffer complained of those encroachments within a month after his accession; which although checked for the present, were afterwards renewed, and at last produced much more mischief than even disintersted sagacity could have foreseen."[1] In July 1758 Mr. Scrafton wrote from Moradbag to P. R. Pearkes at Dacca "......There is likewise a complaint lodged against an English Gomastha at Chilmaree, that he gives protection to numbers of merchants who trade there, which has proved a loss to the Government of seventy thousand rupees. Also (there have been) several cases of under-protection to the Zemindars, Tenants and others."[2] The Gomasthas were also very often guilty of frauds and made private gains in Company's investments, *e. g.* Kusseaundah (Kusananda), a Gomastha of the Company's factory at Cassimbazar, had been found guilty of several frauds in the management of the investments; he had been detected in giving false accounts for the year 1756, in which he had over-charged Rs. 8,427 in the real cost of the goods provided by him.[3]

---

[1] *Vide*, Bolts, Considerations, Appendix, pp. 78.

[2] Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. I, p. 24.

[3] *Ibid.*

---

[1] Orme's Indostan, Vol. II, p. 189.

*Cf.* "The preference granted to the English, gave them great advantages when they came to deal with the weavers in the inland country, where the factors and gomasthas employed by the Company, on this change in the mode of providing their investment, were in general treated with great respect. This influence increased with the power of the English Company; so that 'after the defeat of Serajah-ud-dowla in 1756, that Nawab was made to engage 'that he or his officers should on no account interfere with the gomasthas of the English; but that care should be taken that their business might not be obstructed in any way.' "After these the Gomasthas so well availed themselves of this new acquired power, that the Company by their substitutes, had made their first Nawab Jaffer Ali Khan, in the year 1757, their black gomasthas in every district assumed a jurisdiction which even the authority of the Rajahs and Zemindars in the country durst not withstand." Bolts' Considerations, etc., p. 191.

[2] Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, p. 4.

[3] Letter to Court, December 31, 1758 A.D.

With a view to check the abuse of dustucks by the servants, the Company had established a number of "Dustuck Peons, with badges carrying a Persian inscription, signifying their being the Company's servants." With every dustuck one of those peons was sent, who was responsible for goods passing free of all duties and impositions and after the delivery of the goods, the peon was ordered to return the 'dustuck' to the President to be cancelled by him, so that no furture use might be made of it. For defraying these additional expenses the dustucks had been rated at Rs. 5 each.[1] The captains and officers of ships also carried on a large private trade to the great prejudice of the Nawab's as well as the Company's interest. In order to prevent this, the Company advertised that "no persons residing in the settlement are to purchase woolen goods, copper, lead, or iron from the Commanders or Officers of the Company's ships, without permission from the Import Ware-House Keeper for the time being, upon pain of losing the Company's protection and being expelled the settlement."[2]

But these regulations were not effective in preventing the abuses, which had become so rampant and universal. On the 13th January, 1759, Mr. Hastings wrote from
to Mr. W. B. Summer, Chief at Dacca:—"I have
letter from the Shahzada in which he com-
begun to carry on a large trade in salt,
o pay the duties on those articles,
ed others to do the same in your
ued will oblige him to throw
ga..................We have not,

himself has engaged in it without the Nawab's Perwannah."[1] An English Gomastha named Mr. Chevalier had carried a large cargo of salt to Chilmaree (Chilmary) and he had taken Muchulcas (written bonds) from all the other traders in the same article by which they were not allowed to sell any salt till his own quantity had been disposed of.[2] Worse than this happened, when Mr. Chevalier openly defied the authority of the Wadadar of the Baharbund Pergana, and refused to explain the commission under which he acted, on the latter's demanding it from him.[3] All these were communicated to the Nawab, who murmured greatly before Mr. Hastings, the Resident at Moradbag, and so Mr. Hastings again wrote to Sumner on the 26th July, 1759, complaining of Mr. Chevalier's conduct:—"Many complaints have been laid before the Nawab against Mr. Chevalier, who is accused of having acted in a very violent and arbitrary manner at Chilmaree, and Coreegaum,[4] by oppressing the merchants of those places in the monopoly of several commodities, particularly salt and tobacco, no one being allowed to buy or sell either of these articles but with his permission. A translation of a letter of the Wadadar of the Pergunnah, under the seal of Mr. Chevalier in answer to
made by him, to know by what authority he-
parts, I send you herewith on which

---

[1] Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, p. 5; Vansitta

[2] Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. I, p. 28.

[3] Mr. Chevalier's letter to Meer Atta (
"The letter, which you sent to my writer, I

remark, that the magistrates and public officers of the Government have an undoubted right to see the Company's Dustuck —having no other way to distinguish between the agents of the Company and others usurping the English name, nor the Company any means besides to secure their own privileges. It cannot, therefore, but appear strange in any person employed by the English that they should make any difficulty to show by what powers they are commissioned; unless they are conscious they are guilty of practices which ought to be concealed......................[1]

But all these complaints ended in smoke. Very soon the death of Miran and the mutiny of the soldiers made Mir Jafar's position extremely critical. What to speak of removing these grievances, which had been telling heavily on the resources of the country as well as on the purse of the native merchants, it became absolutely impossible for him to tide over the dangers with which he was now confronted. Disorder prevailed all round, taking advantage of which the rapacious Gomasthas and servants of the Company went on increasing the volume of their illegal trade.

By the time of Mir Casim's accession these abuses had reached the highest point of culpability. Many new factories had been established in every part of the country, both on the Company's account, and by private gentlemen, and "a trade was carried on in all sorts of goods, such as it was never yet the custom to trade in."[2] The manner of carrying on this trade had become highly objectionable. "A trade was carried on without payment of duties, in the prosecution of which infinite oppressions were committed. English agents and Gomasthas, not contented with injuring the people, trampled on the authority of Government, binding and punishing the

---

[1] Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, pp. 6-7.

[2] Mircasim's reply to the representations of the Board, Original Papers, Vol. I, pp. 170-173; Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 46-47.

Nawab's Officers wherever they presumed to interfere."[1] Mr. George Gray, Chief of the Maldah Factory, had committed great acts of oppression in seizing and imprisoning the Pischar of Hiramun, the Zemindar and Wadadar of Taajepoor, and in sending Sepoys and Europeans to purchase grain and erect new factories in every part of Purnea.[2] The behaviour of the Gomasthas at Dacca and Luckipur had become extraordinarily insolent.[3] "A party of Sepoys were sent to Sylhet by the Gentlemen of Dacca on account of some private dispute, who fired upon and killed one of the principal people of the place, and afterwards made the Zemindar prisoner and forcibly carried him away." The Chief and Council at Dacca wrote at this time "in a towering indignation at the boats being stopped, and their trade and privileges interfered with by the Nawab's Agents, (and) they ordered up Sepahis from Chittagong ;" but the Calcutta Council quietly replied, "it seems very probable from circumstances in Mr. Hastings' Minute, that the Gentlemen's Gomasthas there have been the principal causes of these disturbances ; there is reason to fear that Gomasthas and Agents have made use of very unwarrantable practice in their trade." The Council consequently countermanded the marching of the Sepoys.[1]

---

[1] Verelst's View of Bengal, p. 48.

[2] Complaint was made to the Nawab against Mr. Gray by Meer Sheer Aly, the Naib of Purnea. The Nawab sent a copy of this complaint to Mr. Ellis and desired him to redress it. (Letter from the Nawab to Mr. Ellis, dated 22nd January, 1762, *vide* Original Papers, Vol. I, pp. 136-37). To this Mr. Ellis replied :—"That Mr. Gray complained to Sheer Aly Cawn twice or thrice against the Zemindars, but receiving no answer nor redress, he was under the necessity of taking such measures" (copy of Mr. Ellis' answer to the Nawab's Letter, dated 4th February, 1762. Original Papers, Vol. I, pp. 137-38). At this time an officer of the Nawab named Coja Antoon had been accused of purchasing five maunds of saltpetre; he was imprisoned by Mr. Ellis and to answer for this charge he was sent to Calcutta, and after a confinement of three months, was delivered over to the Nawab for further punishment. Another charge against him was that he had given a certificate of some goods having been duly passed, which was a contempt of the Company's Dustuck. Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. I, pp. 302-04.

[3] Sergeant Brego's Letter to the Governor, dated Backergunge, 25th May, 1762 :— "A gentleman sends a Gomastha here to buy or sell; he immediately looks on himself as sufficient to force every inhabitant either to buy his goods or sell him theirs; and on refusal (in case of noncapacity) a flogging or confinement immediately ensues. This is not sufficient even when willing; but a second force is made use of, which is to engross the different branches of trade to themselves and not to suffer any persons to buy or sell the articles they trade in, and if the country people do it, then a repetition of their authority is put in practice; and again what things they purchase, they think the least they can do is to take them for a considerable deal less than another merchant, and oftentimes refuse paying that, and my interfering occasions an immediate complaint.......This place is growing destitute of inhabitants, every day numbers leave the town to seek a residence more safe; and the very markets, which before afforded plenty, do hardly now produce anything of use, their peons being allowed to force poor people.

Before justice was given in the publick but now every Gomastha is become a judge, and every one's house a cutcherry; they even pass sentences on the Jemindars themselves and draw money from them for pretended injuries, such as a quarrel with some of their peons or their having as they assert stole something, which is more likely to have been taken by their own people; but allowing they were robbed, I believe no Gomastha's authority extends so far as to take his own satisfaction on the Government."

These agents and Gomasthas further practised a method of carrying on business called 'barja' and 'Kichaunt,' that is, forcing the merchants and shop-keepers to take their goods at 30, 40 or 50 per cent. above the market price." [2] The following letter of Mahomed Ali, Collector of Dacca, to the English Governor at Calcutta, contains a true picture of the miserable state of the country : "In the first place a number of merchants have made interest with the people of the factory, to hoist English colours on their boats and carry away their goods under the pretence of their being English property, by which means the Shah-bunder and other customs are greatly determined. Secondly the Gomasthas of Luckypoor and Dacca factories oblige the merchants, etc., to take tobacco, cotton, iron and sundry other things, at a price exceeding that of the bazar, and then extort the money from them by force; besides which they take diet money for the peons and make them pay a fine for breaking their agreement. By these proceedings the Aurungs and other places are ruined. Thirdly the Gomasthas of Luckypoor factory, have taken the talookder's talooks (the farmer's farm) from the Tahsildar by force of their own use, and will not pay the rent. At the instigation of some people they, on a matter of complaint, send Europeans and Sepoys with a Dustuck into the country, and there create disturbances. They station Chowkeys (toll-houses) at different places, and whatever they find in poor people's houses they cause to be sold and take the money. By these disturbances the country is ruined, and the Reiats cannot stay in their own houses, nor pay the malguzaree (rents). In many places Mr. Chevalier has, by force, established new markets and new factories, and has made false sepoys on his own part, and they seize whom they want and fine them. By this forcible proceedings many hauts, gauts, and parganas (markets, landing places, and fiscal divisions) have been ruined."

---

[1] Proceedings, October 14, 1762 A.D.

*Cf.* "Can that plan be solid where nothing is fixed, and where the English Gomasthas shall be under no control, but regarding themselves far above the Magistrate of the country where they reside, take upon themselves to decide, not only their own disputes with the merchants and inhabitants, but those also of one merchant and inhabitant with another or is it possible that Government can collect their due revenue in such circumstances? " Proceedings, February 1, 1763 A.D.

[2] A letter from Governor Vansittart to Messrs. Johnstone, Hay and Bolts, dated Monghyr, December 15, 1752.

Similar complaints poured in from different quarters. Syed Rajab Aly, Zemindar of Burbezzo Pergana, wrote about the middle of the year 1762 :—" Now from Calcutta, Dacca, Chilmary and Rungamati, numbers of Englishmen and merchants and the people of Mons. Chevalier, bring into the pergunnah copper, tothenague, cotton, tinkall, salt, betelnut, tobacco, rice, Mugga dhootis, Seringa boats, lack, stick lack, dammer, dried fish, etc., and these people, assuming the name of the Company, force the ryots, who never dealt in such commodities, to purchase them at exorbitant price. Besides this, they violently exact large sums for presents and for their peon's expenses, and take at a low rate whatever oil, etc., they buy. By means of these oppressions the merchants, picars, ryots, etc.,of the Pergunnah have taken to flight, and the Hauts, Gauts, Gunges and Golas are entirely ruined. Moreover, they prevent the reiats from carrying on their business; they rob and plunder them wherever they meet them on the road and giving colours and certificates to the merchants of the Pergunnah, who formerly paid duties, they will not suffer any to be taken from them." [1] Durlabram made the same complaints to the Nawab regarding the behaviour of the Gomasthas in Silhet :—"..................but now Mr...................................and Chunderman and Coja Muscat, English Gomasthas, having brought a large quantity of salt in the aforesaid Chukla, oblige my Gomasthas by force and oppression to purchase it at an exorbitant price ; and having by violent means taken the buttywood trade into their own hands, they have put a stop to my business, whereby I suffer a great loss ; yet the Fougedar has oppressively exacted from me the usual rents, plundering my house and forcing me from my home, and my Gomasthas, by reason of the oppressions of the English Gomasthas and the rigour and violence with which the Malguzaree is exacted, have taken to flight." [2]

The Nawab's patience was at last tired out and he complained to the Governor in the following strong terms :—" And this is the way your gentlemen behave; they make a disturbance all over my country, plunder the people, injure and disgrace my servants with a resolution to expose my government to contempt ; and from the borders of Hindoostan to Calcutta, make it their business to expose me to scorn. In every Perganah, and every village, they have established ten or twenty new factories, and setting up the colors, and shewing the Dustucks of the Company they use their utmost endeavours to oppress the reiats, merchants and other people of the country. The Dustucks for searching the boats which you formerly favoured me with, and which I sent to every Chokey, the Englishmen by no means regard, but bring shame and

---

[1] Original Papers, Vol. I, pp. 201-202.

[2] Translation of a Letter from Durlabram to the Nabob, Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, p. 203.

disgrace upon my people, holding themselves in readiness, to beat and abuse them. Having established these new factories, they carry on such business as the Company never heard of; and every Bengal Gomastah make a disturbance at every factory, and thinks himself not inferior to the Company. In every Perganah, every village, and every factory, they buy and sell salt, betelnut, ghee, rice, straw, bamboos, fish, gunnies, ginger, sugar, tobacco, opium, and many other things, more than I can write and which I think it needless to mention. They forcibly take away the goods and commodities of the reiats, merchants, etc., for a fourth part of their value; and by ways of violence and oppressions, they oblige the reiats, etc., to give five rupees for goods which are worth but one rupee; and for the sake of five rupees they bind and disgrace an Assamese, who pays me one hundred rupees malguzaree; and they allow not any authority to my servants. Near four or five hundred new factories have been established in my dominions; and it is impossible to express what disturbances are made in every factory, and how the inhabitants are oppressed. The officers of every district have desisted from the exercise of their functions; so that by means of these oppressions and my being deprived of my duties, I suffer a yearly loss of near twenty-five lacks of rupees...........
................................

Be kind enough to take these matters into consideration without delay, for they expose my government to scorn, and are the greatest detriment to me."[1]

Sometimes the Nawab's officers also were not lacking in retaliatory measures. On the 7th October, 1762, Mr. Ellis wrote to the Governor and Council :—"..........at Ishanabad, the principal cloth Aurung, our Gomasthas, Dillols (dalals), etc., have been peremptorily ordered to desist from purchasing, and quit the place. Upon their noncompliance, they have been threatened, and abused in the most vile and gross terms and the washermen employed in whitening our cloths have been actually beat and peons put on them to prevent their going on in their business.''[1] The gentlemen at Luckipur[2] and Chittagong made similar complaints against the[3] Nawab's people, and the Chief of the Dacca Factory also wrote the following to the Governor :—" At every Chowkey our boats are stopped, the people insulted, and the flag used with the utmost and most gross contempt. Our advices, further adding that Mutchulcas have been taken from many habitants, prohibiting them on no account to have any onnections with the English."[4] In December, 1762, Messrs. hnstone, Hay and Bolts wrote to Meer Sheer Aly Khan, the Faujdar of Purnea :—"Our Gomastha Ramcharan Dass, being gone into those parts, meets with obstruction from you, in whatever business he undertakes; moreover you have published a prohibition to this effect that whoever shall have any dealing with the English, you will seize his house, and lay a fine upon him. We were surprised at hearing of this affair because the Royal Firmaun which the English nation is possessed of, is violated by this proceeding; but the English will by no means suffer with patience their Firmaun to be broke through. We therefore expect that, upon the receipt of this letter, you will take off the order you have given to the Ryots and in case of not doing it, we will certainly write to the Nawab in the name of the English and send for such an order from him, that you shall restore fully and entirely whatever loss the English have sustained, or shall sustain, by this obstruction; and that you shall repent having thus interrupted our business, in despite of the Royal Firmaun. After reading this letter, we are persuaded you will desist from interrupting will act agreeably to the rules of friendship, and so that you amity may appear and you will by no means stop t Company's Dustucks."[1] By the beginning of the year 17 Kaisoo Ray, the Dewan of Usker Aly. Khan, the Zillla

---

[1] Letter from the Nabob to the Governor. Received, May, 1762 A.D. Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 97-102. Compare with this the letter written by Mr. Hastings to the Governor, dated Bauglepoor (Bhagalpur), April 25, 1762 A.D.—*Ibid*, Vol. II, pp. 79-84. Mr. Hastings pointed out in his letter the same evil practices of the Company's Gomasthas and servants.

---

[1] Copy of a letter from Mr. Ellis to the Governor and Council, dated 7 October, 1762, *vide* Original Papers, Vol. I, pp. 207-208. The Nawab, however, wrote to the Governor that the washermen were not prevented from working for the Company : " You well know that the washermen pay no duties and that the Amils have no authority to interrupt them or prevent their washing or dressing their cloths. Was this affair really true, he (Mr. Ellis) would have informed Raja Nobit Roy of it and he would immediately have wrote to the Amil about it, but as it is altogether without foundation, he choses to make a false complaint to you................" A letter from the Nawab to the Governor, dated November 1, 1762 A.D.

[2] Extract of a letter from the Gentlemen at Luckypur to the Governor and Council, dated 14th October, 1762, *vide* Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, p. 209.

[3] Extract of a letter from the Chief and Council at Chittagong to the Governor and Council, dated 14th October, 1762, *vide* Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, pp. 210-211.

[4] Extract of a letter from the Chief and Council at Dacca to the Governor and Council, dated 8th October, 1762, *Vide*, Original Papers, Vol. I, pp. 210-211. The Council at Calcutta wrote to these gentlemen to be careful about their own Gomasthas (referring to the letter of Mohamed Ali, and not to use force without the Council's positive directions, as the President was himself going very soon. Consultations of the 18th October and 1st November, 1762, *vide* Original Papers, Vol. I, pp. 212-214.

---

[1] Verelst's View of Bengal, Appendix, pp. 191-192. We should mark the imperious tone of this letter, for which the writers were highly condemned by the Court of Directors in their Letter to the President and Council at Fort William in Bengal, February 8, 1764. *Vide ibid*, p. 192. The Nawab of Purnea replied :—" I received your letter from Ramcharan Dass, in which you write that I obstruct your Gomastha in your trade, and have published by beat of drum that whoever deals with English Gomasthas shall be fined or punished, all which I duly observe. What I have to offer on this subject is, that the Gomasthas of English gentlemen did give and receive money at interest to the officers of the King's revenues in my districts, which, by deaths and people running away, caused great outstanding debts, and in consequence of quarrels and disputes with my officers, by which the duties and revenues of my Phouzdarry have been quite impaired. That a stop might be put to these quarrels for the good of both your and our business, and that no one of my officers may take on credit from the factories of the English Gomasthas, but deal for ready money, agreeably to the order from the Nawab, I have taken Moochulcas, but am ready to assist the gomasthas of English gentlemen in everything they desire of me." Proceedings, January 17, 1763 A.D.

Mr. Hastings was of opinion that these retaliatory measures of the Nawab's people were due, more or less, to the evil practices of the Company's Gomasthas. His opinion is expressed in the following :—"As I have formerly lived amongst the country people in a very inferior station (a junior servant of the company at the silk Aurungs) and at a time when we were subject to the most slavish dependence on the government; and have met with the greatest indulgence, and even respect from the Zemindars and officers of the of Rajshahi, imprisoned the servants of many of the Company's dependants there.[1] In February 1763, some boats laden with salt, belonging to Messrs Lushington and Amphlett, and provided with the Bukshbunder's pass and the Company's Dustuck were going to Patna, but they were stopped near Rajmahal by Kutub Alum, the Faujdar of that place.[2] About the same time some saltpetre of the Company, which had been coming from Gazipur loaded on bullocks, was pulled off from the bullock's backs by the Nawab's Amil at Mangy in Sircar Sarun (Saran); the Daroga of Seisaun (?) stopped a boat laden with saltpetre belonging to the Company and took out the saltpetre; and the Faujdar of Rajmahal stopped four boats loaded with bettel-nut, which had a dustuck from the Chief of Dacca Factory, and made a demand of duties.[3] Mahomed Ali, the Nawab's Collector of Dacca, had also adopted some severe measures. He had writen to Abdoolla, Amil of Sundeep Paragana, not "to suffer a single Englishman in the country, and to punish whosoever shall take upon himself the name of an Englishman." On the death of Nehool, an old dalal of the Company, Mahomed Ali "put peons on his house and laid claim to his effects in wrong of an infant" who appealed to the English in the Dacca Factory for protection.[4] Syed Jalal Bokory,

---

Government, I can, with the greater confidence, deny the Justice of this opinion; and add further from repeated experience. (that if) our people, instead of erecting themselves into lords and oppressors of the country confine themselves to an honest and fair trade and submit themselves to the lawful authority of the government, they will be everywhere courted and respected." Hastings' opinion in the Consultations of the 1st March, 1763. *Vide* Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 354-355.

[1] Letter from the Governor to the Nawab, January 22, 1763 A.D., Persian Department No. 7. Long.

[2] Letter from the Governor to Kutub Alum, February 10, 1763, Persian Department No. 16. Long.

[3] Letter from the Governor to the Nawab, February 12, 1763 A.D., Persian Department No. 18. Long.

[4] The Chief of the Dacca Factory sent a party of sepoys " for the security of the house," and his step was approved by the members of the Board, who sent a letter to Mahomed Ali,

the Nawab's Chowkidar at Shahbunder, demanded an additional duty of Rs. 3,250 from Mr. Senior, who, after having paid the duty for 4,000 maunds of salt into the Shahbunder and taken a pass, sent away the salt; Syed Jalal had stopped the boats at every 'Ghat,' and taking an account of goods, demanded as much duty as he liked, and plundered the oarsmen and the helmsmen of all their effects. The Amil of Rungpur demanded duties on cloth, silk and all kinds of goods, and imprisoned the 'Dalals' and 'Pykers' of the Company. At Shengunge, in the district of Dinajpur, Ramnat Bhaduri, the Naib, set a guard of ten Burkundazes (armed retainers) over each of t[illegible] six English Gomasthas settled there and took money from them under the pretence that they must contribute their share to remove the fakirs.[1]

---

" warning him to desist from any such proceeding in future." Proceedings, February 3, 1763 A.D.

*Cf.* the letter written by Mr. Cartier, the Chief of the Dacca Factory, to Mahom Ali :—

" Sir,—The strange and violent proceedings of the different Sickdars, Zemindars, Chowkeedars in the district of Dacca in stopping the English trade, plundering their Gomasthas and servants, and affronting their colours, oblige me, as Chief of the Company's affairs at Dacca, to apply to you for satisfaction for these insults and to demand a reason for such an extraordinary conduct. I can scarcely believe, Sir, that these actions can be the result of your orders and much less Cossim Aly Khan's; but as you cannot be ignorant of the secret springs of them, I require of you a positive explanation concerning this matter. You must be sensible of the danger an invasion of the privileges granted to the English must be attended with and the resentment we have it in our power to show, and have shown in instances of the like nature. I choose to communicate my sentiments by letter, well knowing the many mistakes that happen in sending and answering messages, the sense of them very often being perverted." Proceedings, January 17, 1763.

[1] Letter from the Governor to the Nawab, March 7, 1763. Persian Department No. 31, Long. These Fakirs or Sanyasis were often very turbulent in this part of Bengal. Rennel in his Journals refers to a skirmish between his own men and some Sanyasis in Baar (near Bhutan). It should be, however, noted here that before the final breach with the English occurred, Mir Casim had, on many instances, paid heed to the complaints of the Gomasthas and servants of the Company. In his letter to the President, received 10th February, 1762, Mir Casim wrote :—" At this time Mr. Ellis, the Chief at Patna, writes that the Purnea and other Faujdars molest the Company's business. I have therefore wrote expressly to

Now it is important to know how the President and the Council in Calcutta and the Nawab as well tried to settle down these disturbances and how far their measures and motives were just and impartial. From March to June 1762, vigorous and lengthy debates took place in the Council, on the subject of trade, the nature and extent of it, the power of the English Factors and Gomasthas, and their right of using force in their own concerns. Variety of opinions prevailed but there was agreement in the one that redress was urgently needed. At last it was agreed that the Governor, attended by Mr. Hastings, should pay a visit to the Nawab, and regulate affairs with him. Accordingly they set out from Calcutta on the 12th October, 1762, and arrived at Murshidabad on the 3rd November.[1] The Nawab was at Monghyr, where the Governor arrived on the 30th November, and after frequent discussions and enquiries of various kinds, they agreed upon the following resolutions :[2] "(1) For the Company's imports and exports, the Company's dustuck (pass) shall be granted and respect should be paid to it. (2) For the private trade the pass of the government shall be given. (3) At the time of taking out the last mentioned pass the duties shall be paid according to the

---

the Purnea Faujdar, etc., not to interrupt the Company's trade, but always to assist them. I before wrote to the Bengal Faujedars and others not to impede the Company's business in any respect, and to advise you of anything that came before them. I am at great distance; therefore should anything happen write to the Faujedars and others, and they will act as shall most tend to benefit the Company's trade and business of my Subadderry.'' Original Papers, Vol. I, p. 139.

*Cf.* "That Turrut Sing, the Amildar of Gungypore (Jangipur) being convicted of killing Mr. Gray's Gomastha, has received sentence to be hanged at the place where the violence was committed, and Shijr Aly, Fouzdar, for endeavouring to screen him, and other bad behaviour towards our Gomasthas, will be dismissed from the Government of Purnea." Extract of a letter from the Governor, dated the 15th January, 1763. Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 190-194.

*Cf.* Another letter from the Governor and Mr. Hastings to the Council, dated at Monghyr, December 15, 1762 A.D. Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 150-164.

[1] Letter from the Governor to the Council, 19th November, 1762.

[2] The plan of these regulations corresponds in a great measure with that of 18th May, 1762. *Vide* a letter from Mr. Hastings to the Governor, Sessaram, May 18, 1762 A D. Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 90-95.

rates which shall be annexed to the agreement. (4) The duties shall be paid once for all, so that there shall be no delays on the road, or at the place of sale. (5) If any frauds shall be committed, notice shall be immediately sent to the nearest English factory, and to the nearest officer of the Government. (6) If any person attempts to pass goods, without a dustuck for inland trade such boats or goods, so attempted to be passed clandestinely, shall be seized and confiscated and notice be given to the nearest English Factory, and to the officer of the Government. (7) Goods without a Dustuck attempted to be clandestinely passed in company with boats or goods having a dustuck,—such goods or boats, so attempted to be passed clandestinely shall be seized and confiscated. (8) The Gomastas (factors), in every place, shall carry on their trade freely, and as merchants. In case of any dispute on either side, application shall be made to the officer of the Government, and justice shall be done. (9) If the Gomastha thinks himself aggrieved, he shall complain to his principal, and his principal according to custom shall appear to the Presidency, and redress shall be obtained."

The rates, mentioned in article three, were fixed at 9 p.c. on the prime cost, at the places where the goods would be provided. It is important to note that these rates fixed were something less than what had been paid by the English themselves at Luckipur in their private trade,[1] *e.g.*, on salt Rs. 9-14-3 pies per 100 maunds, tobacco, annas 4-0 per maund.[2] It was also much less than what was usually paid by other merchants in their private trade ; "besides that, the inconvenience was avoided of making a diversity, of payments which other merchants were subject to." [3]

---

[1] A letter from the Council to the Governor, dated 15th November, 1762, Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, p. 217.

[2] A letter from the Gentlemen at Luckipur to the Board, dated 5th November, 1762, Original Papers, Vol. I, p. 218.

[3] "After getting what informations we could, I agreed with the Nawab, that they should be rated at 9 p.c. upon the purchase price, which being paid before the dispatch of

At the time of his departure the Governor advised the Nawab that he should pass orders on his officers, directing them to act in accordance with those regulations, when these orders should be forwarded along with those of the President's from Calcutta together with circular letters from the Board to the factories.[1] The Governor promised that he would try his level best to get the consent of the Council to these regulations. "But the Nawab, confiding in that kind of promise conceived the hopes of keeping up his pretensions for duties; insomuch so that after some time had elapsed, he wrote to his officers everywhere to give them notice of the agreement he expected and to put them upon their guards; lest, meanwhile, and until the reglement should come up, the English private traders might find means to evade the custom and to escape duty-free. But, how could he expect that overbearing custom officers, and short-sighted toll-men would have so much sense and discretion as to keep such a secret locked up in their breasts, and meanwhile, manage with so much art, as not to lay themselves open to accusations by their precipitancy and

---

the goods, and the dustuck of the country Government taken, they should be liable to no further demands throughout the three provinces.........................................................

In my way down, I took an account from the agents of some Patna and Hugely merchants of what they had paid, and were liable to pay for the salt under their charge, by which you will perceive that the Sircary duties only, without reckoning the Dustore (that which is customary') taken at the several Chokeys amount by the lowest of the several informations, to more than 25 rupees per 100 maunds." A letter from the Governor to the Council, dated 15th January, 1763, *Vide* Original papers, Vol. I, pp. 239-240.

*Cf.* Haji Mustafa's note in Seir-ul-Mutakherin, Vol. II, p. 469 :—"The fact is, however, that in reality, and with the condition in appearance submitted to by Vansittart, but in reality annexed thereto by the Governor had a complete advantage over the natives, for whilst these were liable to that infinity of small duties and stoppages over the waters of Bengal (duties which independently of the Stoppages, amounted altogether to full 25 p. c.) the English themselves were to pay 10 p. c. for once and all; and that duty, once paid, their boats were exempted from all further stoppages and searches; an exemption which cannot be rated at less than 10 p. c. more: so that whilst the Company's public trade remained free, boundless and sacred, the private trade of their servants, which to that day had never existed was admitted as lawful under the single duty of 10 p. c. which 10 p. c. would, in time, become only nominal."

[1] Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 163-164.

forwardness? In fact, oppositions and stoppages having commenced in many places, the veil was torn away at once in two places: at Azimabad, where Mr. Ellis, Chief of the Factory, was highly incensed against the Nawab, and zealously attached to Mr. Amyatt, and at Jahangirnagar (Dacca) where Mr. Boston held a similar office. These two men equally incensed and equally impatient of restraint, and both unable to endure any more sent a force, which seized the Nawab's officers and brought them prisoners to the English factories, with intent to have them tried and punished by the Council of Calcutta, and to throw the blame of their conduct directly upon the Nawab and indirectly upon Vansittart."[1]

Unfortunately, at this critical moment, the members of the Board, with two or three exceptions, were all guided by selfish interests and feelings of personal rivalry; so they at once construed this to be an attack upon their privileges and threw out all sorts of invectives against Vansittart and the Nawab.[2] Major Carnac was desired to assist at the Board, that he might contribute his censure upon the President's regulations, and a resolution was taken to call down all the members of the Board from the subordinate factories to the Presidency.[3] In the meantime English subordinate factories daily sent to the Board fresh complaints of the interruptions of their business, which was done with such exaggerations as served to widen the breach still further. It was urged that their weavers could not be protected, because the President had forbidden protecting the dependants of the country's Government.[4] The Nawab also sent to the President similar complaints against the servants of the Company[1] At last, the Board decided on the 1st of March, 1763, that they had a right to trade in salt, betelnut, and every other article of inland trade, duty free and with the Company's Dustuck, equally with the foreign trade.[2] It was further decided that something should be paid to the Nabob, in conformity to the usual practice, not as the Nabob's right, but as an indulgence to him from the Board. Therefore they decided to pay him a duty of two and a half per cent. on salt.[3]

---

[1] Seir-ul-Mutakherin (Cambray Edn.), Vol. II, pp. 435-436; Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, pp. 250-252.

[2] Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, pp. 250-252. *Vide*, the Governor's Minute of the 1st Feb., 1763, in which he gives answers to the objections to the regulations, Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II.

[3] Extract of a Consultation of the 17th of January, 1763.

[4] "The dependants of the country government are plainly those who hold offices, trusts, or rents under the Government, and there is an established distinction between

On this occasion, the behaviour of the members of the Board in reducing the duties on salt to two and a half per cent. and in refusing duties in every other article of inland trade was highly uncompromising. The duty of 9 p. c. on the prime cost of the goods would have been "a very easy and advantageous accommodation for the English dealers in their trade;" and as the Nawab had "consented to accept that as an equivalent for all demands," it would have been proper for them to have readily agreed to it, as this would have secured a confirmed right to what had hitherto been always disputed.[4] Moreover, as has been already pointed out, it would have placed them in a distinctly privileged position than the native merchants.[5] But all prudence and judgment vanish away when hatred, rivalry and selfishness reign supreme.

Day by day affairs took a serious turn. The Dacca Factors informed the Board of a fray between the officers of the

---

them and the weavers, who are regarded as dependants of the merchants that employ them; and this is a distinction wellknown to all but those who through passion will not know it."

[1] Letter from the Nawab to the President, 22nd Feb., 1763, Original Papers, Vol. II, pp. 94-95.

[2] For further details, *vide* Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II.

[3] Consultations, 1st of March, 1763, Original Papers, Vol. II, pp. 75-87; Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, p. 417; "and this as a compliment, a favour, a consideration, not a right."

[4] Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 414-416. *Cf.* Vansittart's letter to Messrs. Johnston, Hay and Bolts, Dec. 15, 1762 A. D.

[5] *Vide ante*, note 37.

Government and a party of sepoys that had been sent to release some boats, stopped near Jaffergunge. The gentlemen at Patna also wrote that they had sent an officer with three companies of Sepoys to Mow, to free the business of the Factory, and to seize some persons who had given them interruptions.[1] Being unable to put up any longer with this anomalous state of things [2] the Nawab at last took the extreme step of abolishing all duties on inland trade for two years.[3] The Nawab fully expressed his point of view in this matter in his letter to the Board, dated, 22nd March, 1763 :—"The affair of the duty is as follows: on account of the oppression of the English Gomasthas, there has not as much as a single farthing been collected by way of duties. Nay, so far from it, you have combined with some of my people and taken penalties from others. And many merchants, who ought to pay customs, have carried their goods duty-free through your protection. Upon this account I have entirely given up the collection of duties and removed all Chowkis wheresoever established. For why should I subject my character to be reproached without cause on account of duties? If any one of my people insist on duties I shall severely punish him. As to what you write of your grounding your rights upon the Firmaund and former Sunnuds, I have been twenty or thirty years in this country and am perfectly well acquainted with the nature thereof. But you ought to remember that your Gomasthas, until the time of Meer Mahomed Jaffar Khan, traded only in some certain articles. Nay although I stood your friend, you were unable to provide ten or twenty timbers from Chittagong for building; but now in my administration, your Gomasthas make so many disturbances, and are guilty of so great injuries that I cannot enumerate them. Judge, therefore, from these circumstances, who is the oppressor, and who the oppressed."[1]

---

[1] Copy of a letter from the Chief and Council at Patna to the Governor and Council, dated 6th March, 1763. *Vide* Original Papers, Vol. II, p. 109.

For further details, *vide ibid.*

[2] *Cf.* "It appeared that an exemption from duties had thrown the whole trade of the country into the hands of the English. This, however, was the least evil. The country Government was destroyed by the violence of their agents; and individual tyranny succeeded to national arrangement. In the general confusion all were disposed to plunder the seats of justice, and carried on what they called a trade, by violence and oppression. The Nawab's officer either fled before them or joining the invader, divided the spoil. The barrier or the country government once broken down, it became impossible to stop the inundation. Mahomedan, Portuguese and Armenian alike, nay, every illiterate mariner who would escape from a ship, erected our flag, and acted as lord of the district around him." Verelst's View of Bengal, p. 105.

[3] "Perwannah from Mircasim to Raja Nobet Roy, dated the 19 Shauban, or 5th March, 1763 :—

"Having been certainly informed that the greater part of the merchants of my country have suffered considerable losses, and have laid aside all traffic, sitting idle and unemployed in their houses

Therefore with a view to the welfare and quiet of this kind of people, I have caused all duties and customs, chowkedaree Mangan, collections upon new-built boats and other lesser taxes by land or by water, for two years to come, to be removed, and my sunnud is accordingly sent to enforce it." Proceedings, March 22, 1763.

As soon as the Nawab's Perwannah for abolishing inland duties was out, it was resolved by a majority in the Board that " this exemption was a breach of the Company's privileges and that the Nawab should be positively required to recall it, and collect duties as before from the country merchants and all other persons who had not the protection of the Company's Dustuck."[2] The President and Mr. Hastings disagreed with the Board, and pointed out that "the Nazim of every Province has a right to do anything for the relief of the merchants trading under his protection without awaiting an order from the Court: besides at this time no court, nor has been for some years, and therefore the Nazim must of necessity manage their several governments as they shall judge best for the general good. And if either the Nawab Serajoo Dowla, Jaffer Ally Khan, or Cossim Aly Khan have a right to give up to us those duties which their predecessors received, or permit us to trade in articles we were before excluded from; of course they have a right also to make regulations in favour of trade in general."[1] The Nawab was strongly determined to take off customs in general and to lay trade entirely open. He therefore sent the following reply to the Command of the Council, in personal correspondence to Vansittart:—"It was notorious that merchants of all sorts made it a practice to pass their own goods under the name of English agents; and that as a release of duties to the latter would in fact amount to a general exemption also to most of the former, save only a few wretches too obscure to afford the expense of purchasing protectors, and too poor to afford duties that would be worth perception; he had therefore taken steps to suppress all customs and duties whatever, and to render the exemption general since as long as the principal merchants could find means to pass duty-free under an English mask, it would be hard to torment a few poor people who could submit to duties, but whose contributions would never repay the charges of perception. That as to the order of dismissing the English agents' prisoners in his camp, it was an injunction vain and absurd; since the English having first seized and confined his officers, these, of course, ought to be released first before the others could be dismissed at all."[2] The Court of Directors strongly condemned this action of the Board and rebuked every one except Vansittart and Hastings.[1]

---

[1] Original Papers, Vol. III, pp. 138-140. It should be noted here that in the President's Letter to the Board, dated 14th December, 1762 (Original Papers, etc., Vol. I, pp. 222-228) he mentions that in course of his conversation with the Nawab, on the subject of inland trade and duties, the Nawab had observed that " if the English Gomasthas were permitted to trade in all parts and all commodities custom free, his custom would be of little value to him, that it would be much more for his interest to lay trade entirely open; and collect no customs upon any kind of merchandise which would draw a number of merchants into his country and at the same time it would cut off the principal subject of the disputes which had disturbed the good understanding between us."

[2] Original Papers, Vol. II, p. 124.

---

[1] Proceedings, March 24, 1763.

[2] Seir-ul-mutakherin (Cambray Edn.), Vol. II, p. 453.

It is really difficult to understand as to how those members of the Board could base their right to internal trade, free of all customs and duties, on the Firmaund of 1717.[2] The Firmaund was never intended to throw open the internal trade of Bengal (*i.e.*, trade from place to place within the country in the commodities of the country, *e.g.*, salt, betel-nut and tobacco) to the servants of a foreign trading company, to the prejudice of the interest of the country merchants, as well as of the Nawab's treasury.[3] Neither Siraj-ud-Dowla nor Mir Jafar did understand it to be so.[4] It is doubtful if any sound principle of International Law can allow such treaties of commerce between two contracting parties, as would benefit one to the utter destruction of the other.[5]

---

"If what is all stated is fact, it is natural to think that the Nawab tired out and disgusted with the ill-usage he has received, has taken this extraordinary measure finding that his authority and government are set at naught and trampled upon by unprecedented behaviour of our servants and the agents employed by them in the several parts of the Nawab's dominions. If we are right in our conjecture, we positively direct, as you value our service, that you do immediately acquaint the Nawab, in the Company's name, that we disapprove of every measure that has been taken in real prejudice to his authority and government, particularly with respect to the wronging him in his revenues by the shameful abuse of Dustucks; and you are further to inform him that you look upon his and the Company's interest to be so connected that we wish for nothing more than to have everything put on such a footing that the utmost harmony may be promoted and kept up between." Separate Letter, London, 30th December, 1763, Wheeler's Early Records of British India, pp. 311-12.

[2] "The conduct of the Company's servants upon this occasion furnishes one of the most remarkable instances upon record of the power of interest to extinguish all sense of justice and even of shame." Mill's History of British India, Vol. III.

[3] Vansittart's Narrative, Vol. II, pp. 271-72.

[4] *Vide ante.*

[5] "We do not mean to enter into a discussion, respecting the political conduct of our late Governor (Vansittart) and his Council; but must say that an unbounded thirst after riches seems to have possessed the whole body of our servants to that degree, that they have lost all sight of justice to the country government and of their duty to Company. In reading the opinions of the several members of the late Council respecting illegal trade, by which they mean the articles of salt, betel-nut, and tobacco, we are astonished to find those among them who pretend to found their rights on the Firmans.

The remission of all duties on the internal trade for the foreign traders, while retaining it for the country merchants, would have meant nothing but a total stoppage of commerce by the country people. Further, the East India Company, a corporate body of merchants, had procured from the Mughal Emperor, at a great price, freedom from duties (except at the fort of Surat) for all goods belonging to the collective body. They did not lay out the money of the community for the benefit of private merchants, but for the benefit of the Company. So the true intent and meaning of the firmaund was to give the Company and its servants a free trade, clear of all customs, in articles of commerce to be imported and exported by shipping." It was such commerce, from which a mutual benefit could be derived by both the Company and the kingdom of the Nawab, that was intended by the Firmaund.[1] The members of the Board, blind with their own selfish interests, interpreted the Firmaund in a manner which suited their interests best. It is quite natural that they became filled with animosity against Mir Casim, who sought to strike a blow at their source of income from

---

Treaties of Commerce are understood for the mutual benefit of the contracting parties. Is it then possible to suppose that the Court of Delhi, by conferring the privilege of trading free of customs, could mean an internal trade in the commodities of their own country, at that period unpractised and unthought of by the English, to the detriment of their revenues and to the ruin of their own merchants. We do not find such a construction ever was heard of until our own servants first invented it, and afterwards supported it by violence; neither could it be claimed by the subsequent treaties with Mir Jafar (June, 1757) or Cossim Aly which were never understood to give one additional privilege of trade beyond what the Firmaunds expressed. In short the specious arguments used by those who pretended to set up a right to it convince us that they did not want judgment but virtue, to withstand the temptation of suddenly amassing a great fortune, although acquired by means incompatible with the peace of the country, and their duty to the Company." Extract of a letter from the Court of Directors to the President and Council at Fort William in Bengal, dated April 26. 1765 A. D. *Vide* Verelst's View of Bengal, Appendix, pp. 128-29.

[1] A letter from the Governor and Mr. Hastings to the Council, dated 15th December 1762, Original Papers, Vol. I, pp. 222-24.

private trade in order to protect his own country merchants. So from interchange of complaints and haughty words through letters, the two parties at last met in a serious conflict which ended in the victory of the Company's forces over those of the Nawab. The defeat of the Nawab gave a free scope to the continuance of these evils.

After this Mir Jafar was reinstalled as the Nawab of Bengal. A treaty was entered into with him on the 10th of July, 1763, by which it was agreed that " the English shall carry on their trade by means of their own Dustucks, free from all duties, taxes and impositions, in all parts of the country excepting the salt, on which a duty of two and a half per cent. is to be levied on the Rowana or Houghly market price; wherein, it is further agreed, that the late Perwannahs, issued by Cossim Aly Khan (Mir Casim) granting to all merchants the exemption of all duties for the space of two years shall be reversed and called in, and the duties collected as before."[1] This left the country open for the oppressions and plunderings of the Company's Gomasthas, and the sufferings of the country people and merchants increased to a great extent.

Mir Jafar sent the following representations[2] to the Board in Calcutta, through Major Adams, for regulating the internal trade of the country :—"As there are factories of the English Company at Cassimbazar, Dacca, Patna, and other places and Chiefs and Councillors are there whatever Dustucks there may be for trade let them be established under the seal of the English Company. And let them not interfere, nor grant recommendations in the affairs of the Revenues of the country as it is a means of weakening the authority of my officers.

---

[1] *Vide* Verelst's View of Bengal, Appendix, p. 128, Bengal and Madras Papers, Vol. III.

[3] Bengal Secret Consultations, Fort William, 2nd January, 1764. I. R. D. (Foreign).

Sepoys and Lircarries in the name of the Company go to the country and oppress the Ryots. If they are sent into the country for the Company's business let them have a certificate in the seal of the English Councillor and if they go into the country without a certificate and make a disturbance let them be punished.

Let not the English Gomasthas take possession of and set up their authority in any of the Zemindaree, or milky lands granted by the King rent-free, or for a very trifling consideration, nor receive money for protection called Meraein nor hold any Farms: and whoever has taken possession of any lands let him relinquish them and let not protection be granted to the Dependants of the Sircar.

Let there be Dustucks and the Company's seal with boats loaded with silver and goods and let them pass and repass giving copies to the Chowkey according to custom.

With regard to the Gomasthas of the English Company who are in different parts of the country excepting for the business of the English Company and Councillor's let them not for their own affairs and concerns send sepoys upon the Ryots, nor oppress them, force them to purchase their goods and if any dispute shall arise let them make it known to the officer of the Sircars and have it settled by him."

On the 6th of January, 1764, the Nawab sent a letter to the Board complaining of the many obstructions that he had met with in the province of Behar from the Patna Factory.[1] The Board was desirous of making some necessary regulations with the Nawab for preventing future disputes in the country, and, therefore, wrote to the Chief of the Patna Factory repeating, along with other instructions, the prohibition which had been already laid down "that no persons or their dependants residing under the Company's flag are to be permitted to hold Gaunges, Rents or any other offices from the country government."[1] The Chief of the Patna Factory replied to the Board on the 3rd February that the orders of the Board were duly obeyed and "that no gentlemen of the Factory or their dependants hold either Gunge, Rent or other offices from the country government..............."[2] But in other parts of the country, such as Cossimbazar, Rangpur, and Dinajpur, the people were labouring under "unlawful proceedings of many private European agents and their Gomasthas."[3] The following letter from the vakil (representative) of the Zemindar of Buzzoorgomeopore (?) to the Nowab gives a true picture of the condition to which the internal trade of the country had been reduced:—"The Pergunnah of Buzzoorgomeopore, etc., in the Zemindary of my master. By reason of the oppressions of the Factors of the Company and many other English traders of whom underneath is a list all inhabitants are fled. The people of the Factors take from the markets what they please at half price, cut down Bamboos and Trees belonging to the inhabitants and take them away by force, if any complains, they punish him for it. They press the inhabitants and carry them into the woods of Soondarbun, paying them only half their wages. They take possession of lands in the Sunderbun and make Tafsels of salt for which they pay no rents. They seize the salt of Tafsels of the Pergunnah and of the inhabitants. They force the inhabitants to take tobacco, salt and other articles and refuse to pay the legal duties on the Trade which they carry on. If we demand a sight of the Company's Dustuck they beat us with Bamboos, some of them pretend that they have been robbed: and insist on our making restitution placing peons upon us and putting us to great expense. They judge causes, and impose and exact fines. They send peons, and seize the Naib of the Pergunnah taking for a Tullabana (Peons' Fees) one rupee every day. They grant guards to many of the Taluckdars and Mollungees (salt-workers) in the country by which means we are prevented from collecting the King's Revenues and many of the inhabitants take shelter in the Factories and thereby avoid paying the rents. There is little chunam made within the distance of four days' journey from hence, the whole quantity made within the Pergunnah not exceeding 200 maunds. Notwithstanding Mr. Dobbries has established two Factories within my Pergunnah committing every species of injury and oppressing and violating the women of the Inhabitants and erecting Factories in places where none were ever before, drives away the inhabitants and upon the information of many people he takes upon him to recover debts of five and ten years' standing—whereof I request that you will grant me a Pergunnah that no one may be allowed to oppress the inhabitants that whosoever has not the Company's Dustuck may be obliged to pay duties and orders be sent to the people of the Factories that they do not send out Peons into the country without the knowledge of the Zemindar, and whatever affairs they transact that they give the Naib Zemindar a copy of the Dustuck by which they are authorised and that for such for which they have no Dustuck they pay the King's revenues accruing from them."[1]

---

[1] Bengal Secret Consultations, Fort William, 19th January, 1764, I. R. D. (Foreign).

---

[1] *Ibid.*

[2] Bengal Secret Consultations, Fort William, 13th February, 1764, I. R. D. (Foreign).

[3] *Bl. St. Cons.*, 30th April, 1764, I. R. D. (Foreign),

The Court of Directors in their letter, dated 8th February, 1764, informed the Governor and Council in Bengal that "from the receipt of this letter, a final and effectual End be forthwith put to the Inland Trade in Salt, Bettle Nut (betel nut), Tobacco and in all other articles whatsoever produced and consumed in the country; and that all European and other Agents, or Gomasthas, who have been concerned in such Trade, be immediately ordered down to Calcutta, and not suffered to return or be replaced as such, by any other persons.

"That as our Phirmaund Privileges of trading Duty-free are certainly confined to the Company's Export and Import Trade only, you are to have recourse to, and keep within, the Liberty therein stipulated, and given, as nearly as can possibly be done: But as by the connivance of the Bengal Government and constant usage, the Company's Covenant servants have had the same Benefit as the Company, with respect to their Export and Import Trade, we are willing they should enjoy the same; and that Dustucks be granted accordingly; but herein the most Effectual care is to be taken, that no excesses or abuses are suffered upon any account whatsoever nor Dustucks granted to any other than our Covenant servants as aforesaid. However, notwithstanding any of our former orders, no writer is to have the benefit of a Dustuck, until he has served his full Time of Five years in that Station: Free Merchants and others are not entitled to, or to have the benefit of the Company's Dustucks, but are to pay the usual Duties.

---

[1] *Cons. St. Bl.*, 7th May, 1764.

"As no Agents or Gomasthas are to reside, on account of private Trade, at any of the Inland Parts of the Country, all business on account of licensed private Trade is to be carried on by, and through the means of the Company's Covenant servants, residing at the several subordinate Factories, as has been usual."[1] For some time after the receipt of this letter, the regulations of this internal trade of Bengal received the attention of the Board in Calcutta.[2] The Board tried to put some restraints "upon those excesses which either ignorance or passion or self interest" led the English agents to commit in the country.[3] These agents were practically under no law, because the charter of the Company did not authorise the Company's Courts "to take cognisance of any crimes they might commit in those parts," and it had been also "laid down as a fundamental principle that the country Government shall have no power of them."[1] It was therefore resolved by the Board on the 3rd May, 1764, that "all the Europeans, Portuguese, Natives, and Armenian agents which are now up the country shall have notice given them to settle their concerns so as to return to Calcutta by the 30th November, and that after that time no European shall be permitted to go up the country under any pretence whatsoever or any other agent be employed in our own Trade but Bengal Natives.

---

[1] Bengal and Madras Papers, Vol. III, Wheeler's Early Records of British India, pp. 311-314.

[2] Letter to Anselm Beaumont, Resident at Midnapur, dated 3rd October, 1764. Midnapur Records, pp. 19-20.

[3] Bl. St. Cons, 3rd May, 1764.

With respect to the practice of carrying on the Inland trade by Force (called Burja or Guchaount) it is a practice which we entirely disapprove, and in order to put a stop to it as soon as possible it is agreed to send directions to Dacca, Rungepore and Maldah to prohibit it in the districts under their Factory but to do it with such care and discretion as not to affect the Company's Investment as we do not mean to invalidate the right derived to the Company from their Phirmaund always held over their own weavers."[2] The members of the Board were not unanimous in their opinion on these resolutions,[3] but it was at last decided in July, 1764, that all European agents should be recalled, and that they should have their respective places of residence in the country in such time as to arrive in Calcutta by the 31st December.[4] The members also thought that a scheme should be formed for carrying on the Inland Trade agreeably to the spirit of the orders of the Court of Directors.[5] We find in the Consultations, 17th October, 1764, that the Council in Calcutta proposed

[1] *Ibid.*

[2] *Ibid.*

[3] Bl. St. Cons, 21st July, 1764, for details about the opinion of the members, *vide* Appendix.

[4] *Ibid.*

[5] Bengal and Madras Paper, Vol. III; Verelst, View of Bengal, Appendix, p. 128. At a general meeting of the Proprietors held on the 18th May, 1764, it was pointed out by

the regulation of confining the trade of their servants in the article of salt to the capital cities of Patna, Dacca and Murshidabad on paying the Nawab two and a half per cent. This did not by any means "obviate the Nawab's objections arising from the distress of the poor and the injury to the revenues," for while the Company's people had to pay two and half per cent. the country people had to pay twenty or perhaps forty per cent.[1] The 5th article of the treaty concluded by the President and Council in Calcutta with Nazim-ud-dowla on the 20th February, 1765, confirmed "to the English the Privilege granted them by their Phirmaund and several Husbulhookums, carrying on their trade by means of their own Dustuck free from all Duties, Taxes and Impositions in all parts of the country, excepting the article on salt, on which a duty of two half per cent. is to be levied on the Rowna, or Houghley Market price."[2]

In conformity with the orders of the Court of Directors, as contained in their letter of 1st June, 1764, the Select Committee in its meeting of the 10th August, 1765, where Mr. William Summer and Mr. Verelst were present, took into consideration the subject of the inland trade in salt, betelnut and tobacco. It was decided that the following plan, which was esteemed to be the 'most correspondent with the Company's Orders and conducive to the Ends which they have

---

several members that the servants of the Company in India "ought not to be deprived of such precious advantages." The Court, therefore, resolved, "That it be recommended to the Court of Directors to reconsider the orders sent to Bengal relative to the trade of the Company's servants in salt, betel-nut and tobacco, and to regulate this important point, either by restrictions framed at home, or by referring it to the Governor and Council of Fort William to regulate this important Point, in such a manner as may prevent all future Disputes betwixt the Soubah and the Company." Bengal and Madras Papers, Vol. III; Verelst, View of Bengal, p. 107.

[1] Verelst, View of Bengal, Appendix, pp. 130-131.

[2] Court's Letter to Bengal, dated 19th February, 1766. In this same letter the Court of Directors complained that they considered this arrangement "as an express Breach and Violation of our Orders and as a determined Resolution to sacrifice the Interest of the Company and the peace of the country to lucrative and selfish views."

in view, when they require that the Trade shall be put upon such a footing as may appear most equitable for the benefit of their servants, least liable to produce disputes with the Country Government and wherein their own Interest and that of the Nabob, shall at the same time be properly attended to and considered," should be carried into execution :—"1st, That the Trade shall be carried on, by an exclusive Company, formed for that purpose and consisting of all those who may be deemed justly entitled to share. That a proper fund shall be raised by a Loan at Interest, for the supply and support of the same; and that it shall commence in the month of September ensuing or as soon after as may be found most convenient. 2ndly, That all salt, Bettlenut and Tobacco produced in or imported into Bengal, shall be purchased by this established Company and public advertisement shall be issued, strictly prohibiting all other persons whatever, who are dependent on our Government, to deal in those Articles. 3rdly, That application shall be made to the Nabob to issue the like prohibition to all his officers and subjects, of the Districts where any quantity of either of these Articles is manufactured or produced. 4thly, That the salt shall be purchased by contract, on the most reasonable Terms, giving the preference to the factories of Dacca, Chittagong, Burdwan, and Midnapore, for the produce of their respective Districts to the Fousdar of Houghley, and the other Zemindars, for the produce of Inglee, Tamlook, Mysidole, etc., and to such persons as may offer the most reasonable proposals, for the quantity produced in the Calcutta Lands.

"5thly, That the Bettle Nut and Tobaco shall, on like manner, be purchased by contract, under such Terms and conditions as upon proper Enquiry, shall appear to the Managers to be most conformable to the Interest concerned.

"6thly, That the contractors for the salt shall agree to deliver it at certain fixed Places at a stipulated Rate per % Maunds, comprehending such an Advance upon their contracts with the Zemindars and Molungees as may be esteemed an Equivalent to their Risk, Trouble and bad Debts.

"7thly, That as the Advances will be made by the contractors to the Zemindars, etc., at certain periods of the season, in the usual Manner, so shall the Advances from the Public Company to the contractors be made in proportion thereto.

"8thly, That the salt, Bettlenut, and Tobacco, thus purchased by the Public Company, shall be transported to a certain Number of Places for sale, to be there, and there only disposed of by their Agents; and that the Country Merchants may then become the Purchasers, and again transport the Articles whither they think they have the greatest Prospect of Profit; that by this Means, not only the frequent Oppressions the Inhabitants of the Country have suffered, by Europeans having Permission to traverse to every Place for the sale of those commodities, will be put a stop to, but, by thus reserving to the Natives and Merchants a competent share of the profits both in the Purchase and Sale, we may hope for the good Effect of removing the general odium that has prevailed from our seeking to deprive them of every Part of that Trade.

"9thly, That as it is apprehended some Difficulty will arise in securing the Produce of the Dacca and the Chittagong Districts, by reason of the Property of the Lands being scattered in a number of hands, all dependent on the Government. It is agreed, that Application shall be made to the Nawab, for Perwannahs on the several Zemindars of those Districts, as well as those of Houghley, etc., strictly ordering and requiring them to contract for all the salt that can be made on their Lands with the English alone, and forbidding the sale to any other person or persons whatsoever.

"10thly, that the Honourable Company shall either share in this Trade as Proprietors, or receive an annual duty upon it, as may offer to be most for their interest, when considered with their other engagements and demands at this Presidency.

"11thly, that the Nawab shall in like manner be considered, as may be judged most proper, either as a Proprietor, or by annual Nuzzeranah, to be computed upon inspecting a statement of his duties on salt in former years.

"12thly, that the manner in which the Honourable Company and the Nabob shall be considered, being once determined, the remainder of this Trade shall be divided amongst the Company's servants, arranged under certain classes, and each class to share a certain proportion of the capital stock.

"13thly, that a Committee of Trade shall be appointed to receive the management of this plan, and prosecute the same in all its branches: That they shall be immediately authorised to take measures for raising the Fund at interest, and to receive Proposals, and settle the contracts: And further, that for their assistance in this Work, a Person shall be appointed in the quality of their Secretary and Accomptant"[1] Mr. Sumner handed over to the Committee 106 Parwanahs [2] which he had received from the Nabob, through Mr. Sykes, who had recently visited Murshidabad, for "authorising and facilitating this trade," especially for giving effect to the 3rd and 9th regulations. He also presented to the Committee several other papers, which he had collected, regarding the Produce of the different districts and the conditions under which salt could be contracted.[3] About the appointment of this Committee of Trade, the Select Committee was of opinion that it should be composed of two members of their body and two gentlemen of the Council.[4] The Committee of Trade solicited in their letter to the Council in Bengal, dated 11th September, 1765, for "a Deed to secure the Proprietors in the Right to the same (reserved trade in the articles of salt, betelnut, and tobacco) during the continuance of their present engagements, to be renewed every season as long as it may be agreeable to the Honourable Company that this plan should subsist." The Council thought it proper to grant the requested "Deed," which was ordered to be prepared by Mr. Wittall for the security of the present proprietors, and also agreed to write to the Court of Directors for permission to renew the same.[1]

---

[1] Proceedings of the Select Committee, 10th August, 1765.

[2] Probably three of those are quoted in Bolts' considerations, pp. 176-178.

[3] *Ibid.*

[4] *Ibid.*

At a meeting of the 18th September[2] the Select Committee considered that it would be more for the interest of the Company "to be considered as superiors of this Trade" rather than "to be engaged as Proprietors in the stock" and that it would receive a duty on the following rates :—

"On salt, 35 per cent. valuing the 100 Maunds at the rate of 90 rupees, and in consideration hereof the present Collaree.[3] Duty to be abolished.

"On Bettelnut, 10 per cent. on the prime cost on tobacco, 25 per cent. on ditto."

It was also resolved that Proprietors in the stock for this trade were to be arranged into three classes. The first class should consist of the Governor with five shares, the second
the General with three shares, ten gentle-
with two shares, two Colonels each
5 shares). The second class was to be
plain, fourteen junior servants, and
ls; in all 18 persons, each of whom
e-third of a Councillor's proportion or
are (in all twelve shares for the second
ss should be formed of thirteen Factors,

---

s, 16th Sept., 1765.

ltations, 18th Sept., 1765.

y Khalari, corruptly collary, Collerie, Collurie, Khallary, etc.,
Bei is manufactured : a salt bed or pan; a mound of earth hollowed
at t aw and other materials are placed to serve as a filter for salt
wate which when freed from dirt and sand becomes brine for boiling."
Wil dian Terms.

four Majors, four First Surgeons at the Presidency, two First Surgeons at the Army, one Secretary to the Council, one Sub-accountant, one Persian translator, and one Sub-Export-Warehousekeeper ; in all 27 persons, each of whom was to be entitled to one-sixth of a Councillor's proportion, one one-third of one share (eight shares for the third class). Twelve shares in this trade were to be allotted to 18 persons, composed of the First, Senior and Junior merchants, Lieutenant-Colonels, and Chaplain or Chaplains, and eight shares to 24 persons composed of the Senior Factors, Majors, and Surgeons.

The Committee of Trade was to have power to form bye-laws and to enforce them with the approval of the Body of proprietors, and the books of the society were to be opened on the 1st of every September and closed on the 31st of the following August. This plan of the Select Committee was confirmed by the Council in Calcutta on the 25th of September, 1765, and it was then sent to the Committee of Trade with instructions to proceed accordingly.[1]

The Select Committee in its letter to the Court of Directors, dated 30th September, 1765, stated that this monopoly of trade in salt, betelnut and tobacco was established in the hands of a Company, composed of three
the Company's Covenanted servants
Chaplains and Head Surgeons, in order
veniences as a free Trade, prevent
committed, save this valuable Article of Co
and diffuse the Benefits resulting indiscrimin
your servants entitled to Dustucks" to the a
officers. "In admitting the Field Officers, and s
proportions allotted to each class," the members of the
Committee "had particular regard to the present situation
the Council and Field Officers, who were excluded from "many Emoluments they before Enjoyed." In their opinion,

---

[1] Bengal and Madras Papers, Vol. III.

gentlemen who had " risen to their stations with Credit and Reputation" were " entitled to something more than a mere subsistence. They have a Right to expect such Advantages .........as may enable them to return in few years, with Independence, to their own country."

If these were the objects of the Select Committee in establishing this monopoly of salt trade, let us see how it affected the people of the country. Monopoly of trade in a country is prejudicial to the interests of its inhabitants. Mr. Verelst however holds that "as the price of salt was fixed at two hundred rupees per hundred maunds, and all taxes, delays, and difficulties were removed by collecting the duty from the society, the Committee was able to ascertain the price at the several markets, which would effectually secure the consumer from every imposition."[1] He points out that Mr. Sumner enquired about the prices of salt for twenty years back and the price was thus fixed at the several markets " to which the Company transported salt, full fifteen per cent. lower than the price at which it was usually sold. From these markets it was carried by the natives ; so that the consumer must purchase his salt for less than had been ordinarily given." In support of his [illegible] following figures about the price of [illegible] the Society. From such medium. Mr. Verelst has also quoted figures about prices of salt from Mr. Sumner's papers and from some original papers in the possession of Mr. Rumbold as "proofs that the price of salt at Patna was nearly, if not precisely, *communibus annis*, the same before the society took place, during the continuance of the society, and after the abolition of it... .."[1] He has also quoted from 'Thoughts on the Affairs of Bengal' by Arch. Keir, who was so great a trader in salt that he employed 13,000 people in one season for its manufacture, the following sentences in support of his statements :—"That the Society for the trade in salt, bettlenut, and tobacco, instituted by Lord Clive and the Select Committee, was so far from being detrimental to the country, that those articles were not only sold dearer, but indeed at a lower rate, during the monopoly, at most places at least, than, at a medium, had been done for many years before, while there was a fixed price upon them, which no doubt, would have been of advantage to the people, had it been continued particularly with regard to salt." He admits that the price of salt increased, after the establishment of the Society, in and about Calcutta because "formerly the duties were levied on the passage of salt to different parts of the country and now the duty was levi[illegible] into Calcutta." But in his affected the interests of the people in general, as the "produce of the whole country was engrossed by the Committee, who paid at the rate of 75 rupees for what was sold in many places for upwards of 500 rupees per 100 maunds; which in effect was making a poor inhabitant pay at the rates of 6½ rupees for a quantity of salt which, in the course of the trade, he would have bought for one rupee."[1] He has quoted several documents in support of his view both in the body of his book as well as in the appendix.

We could have prepared a real picture of the condition of the people after the establishment of this Society, if we had been able to study the facts from some other disinterested authorities. The native writers are all silent on this point, and other records are also lacking. If Bolts' account cannot be regarded as historical because he was biassed against the company, no absolute reliance can also be placed on the accounts of Verelst or Sumner. Both the latter had taken part in the trade and had direct interest in the matter. So their accounts might be coloured by personal considerations.

We have already seen that the Court of Directors, in their letters to the Council in Bengal, had always expressed dissatisfaction with the conduct of their servants and gomasthas in Bengal for carrying on an illegal trade within the country, to the great prejudice of the interests of the country merchants, of the people, as well as of the Company. The Directors had hoped that the Select Committee, after its arrival in Calcutta, would be able to make a fair settlement in the field of internal trade.[2] But when they were informed about the Select Committee's plan through a letter from Bengal, dated 30th September, 1765, they discountenanced it wholly. They sent their sentiments and orders to

---

[1] Bolts, Considerations, p. 177.

[2] Letter to Bengal, dated 24th December, 1765.

Bengal in the following terms:—"We have in all our letters, from the first knowledge we had of our servants being engaged in the Inland Trade, strongly discountenanced and forbid it.—We have always treated it as a Breach of our Orders, a violation of the Phirmaund, and in a great Measure the cause of the late Wars: The amazing sums demanded for Restitution, in respect of losses sustained in this Trade, have opened our Eyes to the vast extent to which it has been carried; the oppressions of the unhappy Natives, that have attended the carrying it on, and which have pervaded all Parts of the Nabob's Dominions, have convinced us, that a Monopoly of the Necessaries of Life, in any Hands whatever, more especially in the Hands of the English, who are possessed of such an overruling Influence, is liable to the greatest Abuses.

* * * * *

With respect to the Company, it is neither consistent with their Honour nor their Dignity to promote such an exclusive Trade. As it is now more immediately our Interest and Duty to protect and cherish the Inhabitants and to give them no Occasion to look on every Englishman as their national Enemy, a sentiment we think such a Monopoly would necessarily suggest; we cannot therefore approve the plan you have sent us for trading in salt, Bettle-Nut, or Tobacco or admit of this Trade in any shape whatever; and do hereby confirm our former orders for its entire Abolition."[1] It was, therefore, resolved by the Select Committee on the 16th of January, 1767,—"That the Society of Trade shall be abolished and the inland trade totally relinquished on the first day of September next."[2]

KALI KINKAR DATTA

---

[1] Letter to Select Committee, dated 17th May, 1766, paras. 31, 36.

[2] Verelst, View of Bengal, p. 119.

# REUNION

Here lies she on her bed with flowers bright,
Across the moorland, on the curving way,
Away from din, from passers' curious sight,
Gently reposing, dreaming dreams alway.

Here did her feet trip lightly in the past,
Here did she gaze in wonderment around,
Here did she come to seek her home at last,
Here in this virgin soil, this hallowed ground.

Here yet she lies within her grass-grown bed,
And what she sees, no earthly lips define,
The seed is sown, the tender flower shed,
The soul in union with a Love Divine.

And when the visions glow behind the veil,
She sees, what though I strive, I never see,
She hears the echoes which I cannot hail,
The freshening dawn o'er regions bright and free.

I see the daffodil, the blushing rose,
The violet and the scented wild-thyme field,
She sees the asphodel that softly blows;
And the bright fruits that precious nectar yield.

No spring to smmmer grows, nor autumn yields
To winter, weary, wan and long,
There in those verdant bright Elysian fields
Joy finds its voice in one eternal song.

Here have I stood in sombre quietude
To list in vain for what those voices say,
Have yearned within this solemn solitude
To get a glimpse of that bright light of day.

Have sought the Way, beyond the gates ajar,
That leads unto the distant Mystic Shrine,
The Way that winds to summits yet afar,
The path she once had trod when she was mine.

But she has passed the portals raised on high,
While here I stand in wild despondency
With nightly vigils, heaving sigh on high,
To scent the fragrance of her life to me.

And though I beat my breast against the bars,
Longing to break the bounds of earth and sky,
I still must see the sun, the moon, the stars,
The summer sicken and the autumn nigh.

Yet shall I bid those gates to open wide,
When myriad voices chant their welcome lay,
And like a traveller, step my way inside,
Till I shall reach the Shrine beyond the Way.

All ties of life far gone, I hope to greet
The gladsome shouts of that seraphic band,
And from among those mystic spirits sweet,
I long to clasp a tender lily hand.

H. W. B. Moreno

# THE LITERARY IDEAS OF GUSTAVE FLAUBERT AS REVEALED IN HIS CORRESPONDENCE

Flaubert is one of those writers who do not belong exclusively to one particular literary school. Appearing at a time when opposing theories were struggling for supremacy, he borrowed from both sides in order to construct for himself a personal system. Thus it is quite natural to find in his works classical, romantic and realistic elements. These differing tendencies were in agreement with his character. He tells us himself: " Not such a dreamer as they think, I shall observe as do the short-sighted, even into the very pores of things, because they stick their noses into them. There is in me, speaking from the literary point of view, two distinct beings; one who is carried away by oratory, lyricism, great eagle-flights, all the grandeur of the sonorous sentence and the highest ideals; another who digs and delves at the truth as much as possible, who loves to be as precise about the smallest details as about the greatest, who wants to make you feel almost materially the things he reproduces." But he does not develop one of these tendencies to the exclusion of the others. On the contrary, he gives free rein now to one, now to another, and so he can be described as something of an eclectic.

This form of art is one of the most difficult. The writer must know how to choose and re-unite the best elements of the different schools in order to produce the beautiful. He shows thus a universal type of art, but he risks at the same time a lack of depth. He must then confine himself to certain limitations, so as not to lose in depth what he gains in expanse of field. In order to secure this depth the writer must have observed meticulously the human mind, to know those sentiments which are of all time and of all periods; he must be able to eliminate what is purely individual, and keep to what is essentially general, thus assuring to his art the power of living. Writers such as Montaigne and La Fontaine are good examples of this principle. So long as Montaigne wrote essays dealing with himself 'for his relatives and friends,' that is, showing forth *only* what was particular to himself, the interest was not universal. But when he took as the centre of his essays his 'ego,' as the ego of the human race, stating that any ordinary life serves to illustrate the lives of everybody, we have something living, which has a lasting interest, which is profound, which is true art and consequently the beautiful. As for La Fontaine, he effaced himself from his works purposely, 'to please.' That was the maxim of all his contemporaries, the classicists.

Now a means is necessary to give expression to these sentiments, and here is where the art of the man of letters comes into consideration. Flaubert was called the 'Christ of Literature,' because his ideal of art was so high that he literally killed himself through his efforts to attain it. There has been a great deal written and said about Flaubert and his art. Even contradictory theories about him have been evolved. Albalat differs in opinion from Faguet. Faguet claims that Flaubert had to work hard in order to write well, because in reality he wrote badly, and the proof of it lies in the mistakes and provincialisms of his correspondence. That is saying too much; Flaubert did not pay much attention to his letters. Happy to be at ease, he let himself go, like a schoolboy in the fields, and even took pleasure in offending grammar and purity of language. What is remarkable is that Flaubert became a classical writer, as much so as Chateaubriand, while incarnating the inverse of spontaneity and ease. Everything is thought out and calculated in his works. But, says Albalat, it is the method which produces the savour of this style. The art of Flaubert is such that it invites diverse opinions; what pleases some displeases others.

We shall then examine briefly what Flaubert himself says about his work as literary artist: and for this purpose we propose to turn to his correspondence, fairly large in extent, where he freely expresses the ideas which were dear to him. We shall seek the definition of his conception of art: what was his aim in writing, and his ideal; what importance he attributes to style, to subject-matter and to the other questions which normally ensue.

This correspondence stretches over a fairly long period of his life—from the year 1847 till his death in 1880. It is [illegible]ssed, for the most part to friends who were interested above all in literature, for example, Louis Bouilhet, Ernest Feydeaux, the Goncourt brothers, Louise Colet, and George Sand. One sees in these letters that literature and art are the supreme interests of Flaubert's life. "Love is not for me the first thing in life, but the second......I love art." And he was happy only when writing. "As soon as I am no longer busy with a book, or contemplating writing one, I am bored to tears...... When writing it seems to me that I am doing my duty, and that I am obeying a superior fatality."

On the death of his father in 1845, and because of a nervous disease from which he suffered, Flaubert gave up his studies in law and went to live at Croisset, alone with his mother. There he lived for thirty-four years until he died, working for his art without interruption, except for a tour in Brittany, a journey to the East, and occasional visits to Paris. Isolated as he was at Croisset, he found it necessary to write frequently to his friends in Paris. And this isolation was in full agreement with his philosophy of art. He believed that the artist must live, apart from the things and the world which betray him, for his vocation alone, mount in his 'ivory tower' and there, like a bayadère amongst her perfumes, remain alone with his dreams. This attitude is easy to understand when one looks into the character of

Flaubert. Together with this passion for literature which he had always, there was also something of an Alceste in him. He was not far from being a misanthropist. Like Alceste, he searched continually for a phantom ideal, and he suffered through not being able to seize it. These facts, added to an extreme sensitiveness and to his susceptibility to impression, explain this philosophy. Life for him was something so hideous that the only way to bear it was to avoid it. And that, according to him, could only be done through art, in the ceaseless search for truth expressed by beauty. "The only way to bear existence is to daze oneself with literature, as with a perpetual orgy. The wine of art causes a long in[illegible]cation, and it is inexhaustible. It is by thinking of oneself that one becomes unhappy."

Flaubert always scrupulously avoided all that was mediocre; he had no patience for those who aimed less high than himself. Musset, he says, will live because of certain qualities in his works, which he himself abjures. He has had some splendid outbursts and inspirations, that is all. He had not the strength to become a master; he believed neither in himself nor in his art, but in his passions. He celebrates with emphasis the heart, sentiment, love with a capital letter, to the detriment of higher beauties. This sort of thing makes many people think they are poets without having written a single line of poetry. This 'glorification of the mediocre' makes Flaubert indignant, and for him, amounts to the denial of all beauty and art. Béranger, too, he condemns because he was the 'poet of the mediocre.' All that was outside the confines of his art, Flaubert considered as of no importance. And the man who claims to be an artist has no longer the right to live as others do. He must adopt the principle of sacrificing all to art, "and the person of least consideration is himself."

Flaubert was not the only one to attach this enormous importance to art. The idea was rather *en l'air* at the time, but nobody carried it to such an extreme as he did. Another idea which he shared with his contemporaries was that of complete impassibility in art. That is to say, the author must not exhibit himself in his work. He must not display his own sentiments and passions. This was a principle to which he was constantly referring. For him, to put oneself into a work of art was only to end in weakness. For example on one occasion, criticising 'Graziella' by Lamartine, he says that it is a mediocre work although it has the possibilities of a fine story. He compares the conclusion with that of 'Candide': "the end where she does not die but is consoled, is most ordinary and bitter. Because of this, the end of 'Candide' is for me the outstanding proof of a genius of the first order. The lion's claw is marked on this ending, as tranquil and stupid as life itself. But that would have required *an independence of character* which was lacking in Lamartine."

So he considered that nervous susceptibility and an exaggerated power of feeling were weaknesses. He knew it through his own experience: "If it were necessary to feel in order to make others feel, I could write books which would make hands tremble and hearts beat, and as I am sure I shall never lose this faculty, which my pen gives me of its own accord and in spite of myself, in a manner which is often troubling; I pay little attention to it, and seek on the contrary not vibration but description." And: "If it were sufficient to have sensitive nerves to be a poet, I would be greater than Shakespeare or Homer, whom I imagine to have been a man of little nervous sensibility. The confusion about this is impious. Poetry is not a weakness of the mind, and this excessive sensitiveness is. Passion does not make poetry, and the more personal you are the weaker you will be. I myself have always sinned in that direction; I have always put myself into all that I have done. In the place of 'Saint Antoine,' for example, you find me; the 'Tentation' was written for me and not for the reader. The less one feels a thing the better one can describe it as it really is. But one must have the power *to make it felt.* This power is nothing short of genius." Further, when the writer desires to put himself into his work, there is the risk that the subject will run away with him, and then art suffers. The greatest productions of the human mind reveal nothing, or almost nothing, definite about their authors. Whatever lyrical qualities Byron may have had, how Shakespeare crushes him in comparison, with his superhuman impersonality! Can one tell even whether he was grave or gay? The artist must work in such a way that he gives to posterity the impression that he has not lived. "I can imagine nothing, says Flaubert, about the personality of Homer nor of Rabelais, and when I think of Michael-Angelo, I see, from the back only, an old man of immense stature, carving in the night by the light of torches." Without personal sentiments the horizon is widened and filled with serenity. The author, scattered in all his characters makes them live, and instead of one 'eternal declamatory personality,' which has no precision because of lack of sufficient details, we have human beings. "God knows the beginning and the end: man what intervenes. Art, like Him in space, must remain suspended in the infinite, complete in itself, independent of its creator. Let us respect the Lyre; it is not made for one man, but for men."

Concerning 'Madame Bovary,' he says that the story is a pure invention, and that it contains nothing of his own feelings or experiences. The illusion of reality in the book is brought about by this very principle of impassibility. Flaubert continually emphasises the idea. The artist must be in his work as God in his creation, invisible and all-powerful, he must make himself felt, but must not be seen. He must create and be silent. Independence of character, that is, the power to detach oneself from one's own individuality, is the secret of true greatness. He refuses to give one of the highest places to Dante, among writers like Shakespeare and Homer. These did not celebrate their petty village, caste or family feuds. The 'Inferno' was written for one particular period and not for all time.

In this connection, however, one cannot help but entertain certain doubts. Flaubert tends to exaggerate this theory—the theory on which 'Madame Bovary' is based and where he is convinced that he carried it out to its full. This masterpiece, while being an impersonal and scientific work, full of details observed in life itself (for example, the scene where Madame Bovary poisons herself, is perfect in exactitude), betrays all the same *certain of Flaubert's own sentiments.* He could never have depicted so vividly the pharmacist Homais if he had not been inspired by his hatred of stupidity and the middle classes. So, one must be careful to differentiate. This impersonality must be a quality of the execution of the work, and not of its conception. When we come to 'Bouvard et Pécuchet,' we find that it is no more than flesh and bone, the blood and vitality are missing. This work seems to have been likewise inspired by his hatred of human stupidity, but the personal element in its conception is so restrained that it becomes a pure abstraction, and thus fails to interest. There is, after all, a rich source of interest in the personal element of the conception of a work, and it is a mistake to suppress it. We have, for example, a man like Pascal, of an essentially scientific turn of mind, directing his interest towards religion—the great interest of his contemporaries—and what interests us in the result is not the religious ideas of the Jansenists set forth by Pascal, but his particular conception of religion.

From the theory of impassibility Flaubert proceeds to another—the scientific treatment of art. Raised above personal affections and nervous susceptibilities, art must be treated with the precision of the physical sciences. The method of the artist must be inexorable. When condemning 'Graziella,' Flaubert said that Lamartine was not possessed of the faculty of visualising life in a ' medical ' manner, of contemplating truth, which is the only way to succeed in creating great emotional effects. One can easily understand how he came to entertain this idea. He was born at the beginning of a scientific age, whose spirit he could fully appreciate, considering the environments of his youth, the hospital at Rouen, and the influence of his father the resident-surgeon. As has already been said, there was a good deal of the romantic spirit in Flaubert, but romanticism was entering on a period of decadence, and he realised the failings of the romanticists. This realisation served as a spring-board and hurled him, as it were, into the very midst of the scientific way of thinking. All the same, he had to struggle against the romantic side of his character. If one stops for a moment to consider the development of ' La Tentation de Saint Antoine,' one sees that it was his life's work. He began it when he was young, because the subject pleased him enormously. But, older and more experienced as an artist, he rewrote it, because he realised that instead of describing the Saint Antoine of history, he had created a new Saint Antoine, who was essentially himself. He never stopped thinking about it and only took it up again when he felt really sure that he could master the subject. He admits that he found the method exceedingly hard and the discipline difficult to keep up. It was like a sacrifice which he was continually making ' for the sake of good taste.'

Flaubert had great confidence in the idea that the further art was developed, the more scientific it would become. He upheld it with all his strength, in spite of the risk of unpopularity. " For I write not only for the reader of to-day, but for all readers who may appear as long as the language lasts. My merchandise, therefore, cannot be consumed now,—because it is not exclusively for my contemporaries. "

He grew impatient because people were slow in accepting this scientific attitude towards art. " Is it not time to bring justice into art? Impartiality in description will then attain the majesty of the law, and the precision of science." He attributed this tardiness above all to philosophy and religion. "Till now the novel has been nothing more than an exhibition of the personality of the author, and I would even include all literature, except in the case of two or three men perhaps. The poet is considered now as bound to have sympathy for everything and everyone, in order to understand and describe them. We are lacking in the scientific spirit: we are dabbling in a barbarism of savages: philosophy such as it is created, and religion such as it exists, are as coloured glasses, which hinder clear seeing, because one is prejudiced in advance and because people are too anxious to know why before knowing how."

The scientific spirit in Flaubert led automatically to certain other ideas, which are a little less important, perhaps, but not less interesting. He believed that, in the case of a masterpiece, the author does not consciously choose his subject, but on the contrary the subject imposes itself on the author. The ideal subject for a novel is the one which suggests itself suddenly like an inspiration. It is the main idea from which all the others flow. One is not free to write anything one wishes, or to choose one's subject, and that is what the public and the critics seldom realise. The secret of the masterpiece lies uniquely in the agreement between the subject and the temperament of the writer. What could be more scientific or reasonable? It is, in appearance, such an obvious truth that it is apt to be neglected as most truths of the same nature.

Flaubert himself was never sure that he had found the subject which suited him best. Taine, in stating that aesthetics were still waiting for their Geoffrey Saint-Hilaire, was expressing the same idea. He considered mankind as a superior creature, which produces philosophies and poems, just as silk-worms make their cocoons, and bees their hives.

The work which any man produces can first of all be explained with reference to his character.

As for the subjects of Flaubert's own works, they uphold, for the most part, this theory. Take first of all 'Salammbo,' and the 'Tentation de Saint Antoine.' All his life Flaubert was obsessed with the fascination of the Orient, and above all the Orient of ancient times. The mystery, horrors, splendour and colour satisfied his imagination. These two books existed in his mind from his very youth. So that their conception came spontaneously as a result of his temperament. As for the realistic aspect, Flaubert realised that that type of art was much more difficult, because it is not simply a matter of depicting the real, but *what appears to be the real*; and to do that it is necessary to deal with average humanity and the mediocre. Of the two literary types in Flaubert, referred to earlier, one was enamoured of detailed truth, and it is from this side of his character that 'Madame Bovary'—a masterpiece of realism—proceeds. 'L'Education Sentimentale,' and 'Bouvard et Pécuchet', can be classified with 'Madame Bovary.' Flaubert's mania was a hatred of stupidity, again a logical result of his character, which was at the same time proud and timid. Each work of Flaubert can then be said to be a direct result of a certain trait in his character.

Flaubert considered the art of criticism in the same way. He believed that it should be treated as a science, unbiased by any moral idea. It is useless to merely hold forth on this or that style, but necessary to examine carefully in what it consists, what relationship it has to others, and in what lie its vital qualities.

As the subject is the logical outcome of the author's temperament, so the events in a novel must be normal results of the characters of the people in the book, exactly as it happens in daily life. Criticising the "Two Roads" by Maricourt, he says: "From the narration of the earthquake the novel is no longer logical. I mean to say that the events have no longer their main-spring in the characters, these characters do not produce them. For it must be one or the other (even both) in reality. Events influence us and we cause them to react."

There we have a Flaubert who is essentially a logician and a reasoner. Like the majority of French writers, he appreciated clarity and precision. This comes in part from his gift of observation. From his youth he had been in the habit of contemplating the people and things which surrounded him. In a letter to Ernest Chevalier, written at the age of nine, he describes a lady who used to visit the house, and tell funny stories, and says he will write them down. And at the age of seventeen he was in the habit of taking notes on the passers-by. He was a born observer. We can, therefore, expect to see this turn of mind react on his work and literary opinions. We know that one of his ideals was to depict truth in the form of beauty: and he does paint truth according to nature. But one thing must be noted, he did not believe that truth should be described without a certain choice and discretion. He was indignant with those who made it their aim to describe crude reality without considering art. "Art must be respected above all." And when a book appeared with scandal as its object, he grew extremely angry. So, unlike Zola and his followers, Flaubert was not strictly a realist or naturalist. At times he even vigorously condemned the Zola school.

From this one normally asks: To what extent may truth enter into the composition of a novel? Flaubert exacts three things; exactitude in local colour, correct rendering of the atmosphere of the period, and truth in material and psychological details. His own practice before commencing to write a book was to make sure of an intimate knowledge of his subject. He read all that was available, and whenever possible visited the place which was to be the setting of the novel. For instance, before writing 'Salammbo,' he went to Carthage, and did not leave it until he was sure that he know all that was to be known about the city and its environs. In the 'Education Sentimentale' he followed the same procedure. He had introduced into his book a railway journey from Paris to Fontainebleau about the year 1818, and then learnt that there was no railway existing there at that time. So he began the whole description again, after having done some research by consulting the history of the railway and those of his friends who were experts on the subject. As for the atmosphere of the period of this same book, he reconstructed it by reading, among other things, the newspapers of the time.

He had enormous patience for verifying small details. In order to make sure of the symptoms of a certain disease which he wished to describe, he went to a hospital. "I passed a whole week hanging about the Santé-Eugénie hospital studying children with croup." And on another occasion he wrote to a friend in Lyons: "A character in one of my books describes her childhood. She was the child of labourers in Lyons. I want details about the households of such people." Inspite of his hatred of the middle classes of Rouen, he used to mix with them at fairs and balls in order to impregnate himself with the atmosphere of middle class life, which he was to describe in 'Madame Bovary.' He put his art even before his personal feelings. A letter written in 1863 to M. Froehner, editor of the 'Contemporary Review,' in reply to his criticism of 'Salammbo,' shows what pains Flaubert had taken to give an exact impression of the epoch described in this book. One could quote this letter as part of his literary creed.

As for the question of psychological truth, it came to him quite naturally, because of his habitual and continual observation of the people with whom he came in contact. It comes out in full force in the characters in 'Madame Bovary' and in 'Education Sentimentale.' These characters are not types, they are living beings, and after having read the books, one has the impression of really knowing the people. Take Madame Bovary herself; Faguet found in her the most complete picture of a woman in the whole of literature, including Shakespeare. In fact, Flaubert has given us her biography, her whole life minutely and patiently. One knows just what she is thinking, her sentiments and passions. The psychology is so perfect and so exact that one feels that if one met her, one would know just what she would say and do. Thus one has the impression that she is more vivid than people one has actually met in real life. The same thing applies to Charles Bovary and Homais. They are all human beings, and we have the advantage of seeing them through the eyes of a marvellous psychologist.

So, as has been stated, Flaubert sought truth, by means of exactitude in local colour, in atmosphere, in small details of daily life, and in psychology. But differing from the 'naturalists,' he did not make this the end and aim of his art. "Truth is not the chief consideration in art.' Art for him was *truth rendered by beauty*. From an early age he did not believe in the 'social mission' of the writer. The true aim of art should be neither to moralise nor to instruct, but uniquely to reproduce beauty.

Flaubert is, therefore, above all things a lover of beauty, whether it be of colour or form. Writing of Zola and Daudet, he points out that neither of them was interested in what was for him the aim of art—that is beauty. "I remember my heart beating and the violent pleasure I felt on contemplating a wall of the Acropolis, quite a bare wall. Well, I wonder if a book, independently of what it says, can produce the same effect?" When writing a book, Flaubert always tried to convey a definite impression. 'Salammbo' was to give the impression of purple, and it can justly be conceded that the effect is there. However, in 'Madame Bovary,' also a masterpiece, there is no question of striking colour effects. In this work he desired to suggest mouldiness and mustiness, and the "existence of wood-lice," and he follows another method, probably the most importance, that of creating beauty of style and form. This brings us to that aspect of art which was of extreme importance to Flaubert, and the one which occupied him most. Without beauty of style nothing can be beautiful. As we have already seen, he did not spend a long time selecting a subject; he took longer to accumulate his matter, but it was the style on which he spent all his energy. Reading what he says about this, one can understand why he has been called the 'Christ of Literature.' "I am harassed with writing. The style which is of greatest importance for me, wears out my nerves horribly. I am beside myself. There are days when I am ill with it, and nights when it makes me feverish." And, "The more I study style, the more I realise how little I know about it, and sometimes I am so profoundly discouraged that I am tempted to give it all up and try something easier." He never talks so passionately, nor with so much emotion, as when he refers to this all-important question of style. It was without any doubt his supreme pre-occupation. Most classical writers have known a similar torment, but no one has worked so hard, or with such perseverance as Flaubert. In the end it became an obsession. He has been criticised as lacking in spontaneity, and as not being able to write with the ease of a George Sand. But it was not that he could not write thus, but that he disliked and mistrusted this so-called easy style. For him, the labour was a condition of good style, and the trouble he took to satisfy himself on this point, is astonishing. It was quite usual for him to write eight variations of the same passage, and Albalat in his book on style quotes some examples from his manuscripts, where one can easily follow his method of polishing and repolishing unceasingly. He often took four or five days to write some three pages, and sometimes even longer. He had the habit of working late into the night, and it was always work before everything.

Flaubert always refused to hurry his writing, believing with Joseph de Maistre that "nothing is done well which is done quickly." "To hurry in literature is to ruin oneself. I am busy just now taking notes for a study in antiquity, which I will write very slowly this summer." And: "May I perish like a dog rather than hasten by a second a phrase which is not mature." The patience and conscientiousness with which he worked have rarely been equalled. He advises: "Neglect nothing, work, rewrite and do not leave the work until you are convinced that you have brought it to the utmost perfection of which you are capable. Genius is not rare to-day, but the quality few possess, and which one must try to develop, is conscientiousness." And he exclaims that if only the 'impious' statement that "genius is an infinite capacity for taking pains," were true, he would be one of the greatest geniuses.

His conception of the ideal style is best given in his own words: 'I can imagine a style which would be beautiful, with a cadence like that of poetry, as precise as the language of science, flowing as in waves with the sonority of the violoncello, and with fiery sparks. Prose was created yesterday; poetry is the ideal form in ancient literatures. All the combinations of prosody have been perfected, but those of prose are far from perfection......I like sentences which flow on without hindrance. Ideal prose is extremely difficult to realise; one must free oneself from the hackneyed phrase, and express modern ideas in the best possible way."

To perfect his rhythm, Flaubert worked at his sentences and tested each one by reading it aloud, always considering respiration and the ear: and he never judged a style before reading it aloud. Further he memorised pages of the best classical writers and declaimed them while pacing up and down his room. Some of his contemporaries ridiculed him for this, because they argued, a book is not written to be read aloud. Maupassant describes how Flaubert used to take up a sheet of manuscript, and holding it level with his eyes and leaning on one elbow, used to read it in a loud penetrating voice. He would listen for the rhythm of his prose, stopping now and then as if to catch a passing sonority, and placing the commas carefully, like the halts on a journey. And he himself maintains that a sentence has vitality only when it accords with respiration. Badly written sentences cannot pass this test, they oppress the chest and interfere with the beating of the heart and thus are not in agreement with the conditions of life. For this reason Flaubert proscribed all hiatuses, was so careful about punctuation, and the conclusions of his sentences.

To obtain absolute clarity, Flaubert paid great attention to composition. He avoided as much as possible the use of conjunctions and relative pronouns, because they tend to complicate a sentence. He criticised Lamartine as a bad writer because his sentences are awkward and heavy, and because he makes too frequent a use of the infinitive. There is an anecdote in the ' Journal des Goncourts ' about Flaubert in this connection. "The poor man has in his heart a regret which poisons his life. It will lead him to the grave. It is because in ' Madame Bovary ' he has two genitives following each other—' *une couronne de fleurs d'oranger* ' (a crown *of* flowers *of* the orange-tree). He is in despair about it; he tried to change it in vain, there is no other way of saying it."

Another thing to be avoided in good composition is the use of commonplace expressions—' ready-made ' Flaubert calls them—such as ' notabilities of society.' He admits that they are very convenient, but slovenly, and because of their banality they have lost force, and fail to convey the idea with strict exactitude.

Simplicity is another quality, but a difficult one to cultivate. 'I love that style which is hidden under an apparent simplicity, those images which stand out in a single word...... but it is not an easy affair to be simple.'

Of prime importance is the use of the '*mot juste*,' the exact word. Take any passage in any one of Flaubert's works, and it will be found that each word is the only word possible in that particular place. Not one can be replaced without taking something from the essential idea. Everywhere it is the right word in the right place.

However, composition is not everything in good style. In order to write well one must think well, because the idea is the foundation of the style. Flaubert was accused of paying too much attention to form, but for him the form and the idea were one and the same thing, and he could not conceive of the one without the other. The finer the idea the more sonorous will be the sentence. If the thought is precise and clear, the sentence must automatically be so too. If you know exactly what you want to say you will express it well. As Buffon says : " To write well is to feel, think and express well; the last being dependent on the two others, since one must feel strongly in order to think, and think in order to write." This was the precept of the earliest classicists. Boileau expresses it in ' L'Art Poétique,' and Fénelon in his ' Lettre à l'Académie.'

From this, Flaubert was led to the conclusion that in a novel ' ideas are facts.' It is more difficult to interest with ideas, but that depends on the style. He has at times several consecutive pages without a single event, descriptions of middle-class life and inactive love—the latter difficult to depict because it is at the same time timid and profound. He always entertained the idea of writing a novel devoid of matter, and which would be sustained by the style alone. " A book on nothing, without external attachments," says Flaubert, " and which would derive its vitality from the style alone, as the earth without being supported remains in space. A book where the subject would be almost invisible……I believe that the future of writing lies along these lines." Again an echo of Buffon who believed that a book lives only on the merit of its style: knowledge, discoveries and facts are no guarantee of immortality. Such things are beyond men, but style is the man himself. Intellectual beauties, which lie in style are so many truths, as useful and more precious to the human mind than those which form the subject-matter.

Another principle which Flaubert upholds in common with Buffon and Boileau, is the necessity of a plan, and to assure unity to a book. Speaking of 'Saint-Antoine,' he says that the book was not mature enough, he worked at the material elements of the book and, "I imagined that the scenario was complete and I put myself into it. Everything depends on the plan and 'Saint-Antoine' has none. The deduction of the ideas, strictly followed, has no parallelism in the linking up of the facts." And of 'Madame Bovary,' "The worst of it is that the psychological, grotesque, and picturesque preparations, which precede were very long, exacting, I believe a development of action in agreement with them. The prologue must not carry away the story, and I shall find it difficult to establish a proportion between the adventures and the thoughts……Every work of art must have a point, a summit like a pyramid, where the light strikes. It is not like that in real life, but art is not life." He gives great importance to the climax in the plan of a book, because that gives the impression of a whole. One must avoid, above all, disjointed fragments. The human spirit can create nothing, says Buffon, but if it is elevated by contemplation to sublime truths, if it unites and connects them, if it *forms a unity*, it can establish, on unshakable foundations, immortal monuments.

When they interfered with the plan, Flaubert was quite capable of sacrificing his most beautiful descriptions, however long he may have spent on writing and perfecting them. The symmetry of the work had to be preserved.

Flaubert was essentially a sincere man. He not only worked conscientiously and remained faithful to his principles but he firmly believed that good work depended on a good character. 'Honesty is the first condition of art.' The idea is not a common one, and it is interesting to consider. Further, Flaubert never wished to write for money. His love and respect for art rendered the idea abhorrent to him. His advice to young writers, given in his preface to the 'Last Poems' of Louis Boulhet is worthy of note.

"Go side by side, in the woods, reading poetry, letting your souls mingle with the sap of the trees, and the eternity of masterpieces. Lose yourself in dreams of history, in the amazement of the sublime. Devote your youth to the muse. Her love consoles the loss of others and replace them......Face insults, be ready for any sacrifice, armour yourselves against all proofs, write and publish! Then whatever comes, you will be able to look upon the wretchedness of your rivals without indignation, and their glory without envy: for the less favoured will be consoled by the success of the more fortunate and those who are strong will sustain the discouraged: each will bring to the community his particular gifts, and this mutual co-operation will keep out pride and stave off decadence. Then when one of you dies, let the others keep his memory fresh, so that you will have a stronghold against pettiness, a strength in weakness, and company in solitude."

Flaubert expresses an exceptionally high ideal of art: he not only counsels art for art's sake, but as a means of consolation for the misfortune of life. He was probably influenced to a certain extent, in the sentiment, by the period. It was a time when religion had ceased to satisfy, because of the scientific spirit which was just beginning to take a hold on the minds of his contemporaries. And, because an aim or religion is necessary in life, Flaubert offered that of art. It was his own, and he was a great and worthy example of his faith.

These are, then, the literary ideas, which can be gathered from Flaubert's correspondence. First the pursuance of art for the sake of art, as a remedy for metaphysical ills, and as a reason for living. This artistic fanaticism in Flaubert was not intoxication of the imagination, but the conclusion of a philosophical thought which did not desire to stagnate in pessimistic scepticism. Then there is the idea of impassibility in art, and the scientific treatment of it—ideas due to the natural reaction which followed romanticism. And since Flaubert considered art as the great consoler and as a moral support, it would have missed its object if it were to be only the expression of the personality of the author. Then there is the necessity for a certain compatibility between the subject and the character of the artist: and the events must be the logical results of the people in the book. Further, one must have truth in art, created by exactitude of local colour, material and psychological details, and of historical atmosphere. An important place must be given to beauty: the style must be clear, cadenced and precise: composition must be rigorously correct: nothing must be written in a slipshod way: and everything must be well thought out: a plan is necessary: and lastly the writer himself must be sincere.

These ideas, as we have shown, were not all original. As early as 1832 Gautier had declared himself the champion of 'art for art's sake,' in the preface of his 'First Poems.' He was supported by many of his contemporaries. No doubt the idea originated in the industrial and commercial activity, which developed, to the profit of the 'newly-rich' middle classes, and to the detriment of purely intellectual activities. This spirit also explains Flaubert's hatred of the middle classes. Moreover, we have shown which ideas Flaubert shared with Buffon, Boileau and the other classicists.

But original or not, these ideas have a value and an influence which last even to-day, for the modern novel is but the development of 'Madame Bovary'—the embodiment of all these ideas—and one is justified in saying that, so far, this book has not been surpassed. It is the living witness of the excellence of these ideas, which Flaubert knew so well how to practise, because he believed in them so sincerely, and because they were in such perfect accord with his own character and turn of mind. One can even say that the aim of the modern novelist is to realise the novel dreamt of by Flaubert—the novel which is independent of mere events. But for that it would be necessary for a second Flaubert to appear.

MILLICENT A. DAS

# EVER-NEVER—NEVER-EVER

Rolled within long streams of sunlight,
Tumbling over bannered cliff wall
Gulfing crowds in swirling elf-light.
Floods the noondays' high carnival

Conned have I the ancient glory filling moiling street,
Known the ways of sunlights traipsey art,
Mingling arc-lights making alchemy complete;
Pell-mell grouping ; gleaming Bagdads, counterpart.

City street to city visage, moulded sharp and over hard
Vampire face of woman frozen in a mirthless smile.
Miser souls of men who late have slain their lord,
Gaily garbed, a rabble ordered in a sidewalk file.

Close beside them always, filmy shadows gliding,
People of the misty land of golden Ever-Never,
In between the columned air near abiding;
Folk dream-born who thereby live forever.

These our doubles—fine as starbeams, Astrals,
Made of elements of the men we hoped to be,
Ere the struggle left us broken 'gainst an iron wall,
Made us faithless :Mimes of drear futility.

We will win there, past the borders of the mystery
To the place of seeming shadows; land of Ever-Never.
Be the thing the dream pretended—finally
In the high hills and broad fields of Never-Ever.

DAVID W. CADE

# THE CLOUDY DAY

(*Translation from Tagore's 'Lipika'*)

There's work each livelong day and people all about.

Every evening it seems that the last word is said thro' work and converse.

There's no time to feel that something unsaid still left behind.

The heart of the heavens is thick with clustering clouds this morning.

There's work before and men around.

But it seems to-day that what is within cannot all be spent thro' speech.

Man has crossed the far seas and mountains and stolen gems from out the deeps of the earth.

But to say all his say to another—that he has never been able to do.

That prisoned Word is beating its wings within my mind this cloudy morning.

Says that inner Man, "Where's that ancient mate of mine who would beggar my rainy cloud of all its showers ?"

That word meseems is tinkling the door-chain of my closed chamber to-day.

'What to do ?' I marvel.

Where's that wondrous He at whose call my message, bounding over the fence of labour, will go out on a tryst thro' the universe, song-taper in hand ?

Where's that eye at whose slightest hint all my pains unstrung will in a trice gather into one wreath of joy—will flash up into one long flare ?

Him alone can I give mine all, whose prayer is set to the proper tune.

Where's that all-destroying Supplicant
O where—on what crossing of the ways ?

The anguish of my inner chamber has put on ochre weeds to-day.

Out into the open path would it go, clear of all drab work,—a path straight as a lyre tuneful with the rhythmic trippings of some nameless dear.

HRISHIKESH BHATTACHARYYA

# THE WRONG HEAVEN

*(Translation from Tagore's 'Lipika')*

1

He was a thorough idler.

He had no work to do but was all full of hobbies.

He would put in a little earth on small squares of wood and arrange tiny shells there.

From afar they would look like irregular pictures—a flock of birds, an uneven pasture with cattle, or a hill with just the suspicion of a stream or a foot track.

He met with no end of scolding from his folk.

At times he would make up his mind to shake off his madness, but his madness wouldn't let him go.

2

There are boys who idle away the live-long year and yet get an easy pass in the examination. His case was just like this.

He sported away his life but learnt at death that his passport to heaven was sanctioned.

But fate follows man even to heaven.

Angels erred and he was taken to the busy paradise.

Here there's everything except leisure.

Men always complain, "No breathing while, friend!" and women say, "By-bye dear,—a huge lot to do!"

All say that time is precious but none feels that, that it is above price.

The general moan there is—"Awfully fagged—can't get along any more;"—yet everyone feels happy.

"Work's so crushing"—is, as it were, the common song of the land.

This poor thing has no place here and can't fit in anywhere.

He goes about wool-gathering and hinders the movements of the busy.

Wherever he feels like putting out his little spread for rest, he is warned that it's a little plot and seeds have been sown here. He has thus to get up and move away.

### 3

A busy slip of a girl comes everyday to draw water from the heavenly spring.

Her steps move like the quick notes of a guitar.

She has hurriedly made a loose knot of her hair. Still a few wild locks hang about her brow to have peep at her deep dark pupils.

The idler once stood quietly aside there, like a palm by a busy rill. The girl looked softly at him, even as a princess from her casement pities a beggar below.

"Alas poor thing! it seems you have no work in hand."

The idler sighed,—"I have no time for work."

The girl couldn't catch his meaning and said, "Would you have some work from me?"

"It's for this that I am waiting here," was the reply.

"What work would you prefer?" asked the maid.

The vagabond said, "Let me have one of those pitchers you carry every day."

"A pitcher? Why? Would you draw water?"

"No, I'll paint its surface."

The girl felt vexed and said, "No time to waste, by-bye."

But the idle ever get the better of the busy.

They meet by the spring every day and the idler asks, "One of your pitchers, pray, I'll paint its surface."

She had to yield at last.

All about the pitcher the idler drew many a coloured maze—many a check in lines.

The girl took up the thing and gazed at it.

Puckering up her brow she asked,—"What means all this?"

"Nothing" was the answer.

She took it home.

Alone, she turned it round and round and looked at it in many ways from varied angles.

At times would she get up from bed, taper in hand, and stare at the painted thing, silent.

Next day when the girl came to the spring, her steps, so busy heretofore, looked a thought slower. Her feet as they moved were a wee bit thoughtful musing on things without a meaning.

The idler stood there as before.

"What do you want?" asked the girl.

"More work from you" was the reply.

"What manner of work?"

"With coloured strands, if you please, I'll make you a ribbon for your hair."

"What comes out of it."

"Nothing."

Many coloured ribbons are made. Henceforward the girl takes long to do her hair.

Work goes unheeded,—time flies.

### 4

Meanwhile Work in the busy heaven showed big gaps which were filled with songs and tears.

The wise grew anxious and their synod met. They said, "No such thing ever happend in our history."

The erring angel admitted his lapse.

He said, "I have brought a wrong man to a wrong place."

The idler was produced before the council. His coloured turban and fine belt proclaimed the huge error.

The chairman said, "You must go back to the earth."

"Right," said the man with a sigh of relief, and took up his brush and colour-box.

"I'll follow," said the girl stepping in quick.

The ancient chairman grew absent-minded.

For the first time he saw a thing without a meaning.

HRISHIKESH BHATTACHARYYA

# Reviews

**Truth about India**: Verrier Elwin. George Allen & Union, London. 2*s*. 6*d*. cloth, 1*s*. paper. 1932.

This is an account of the present *impasse*, between England and India. Within the very brief compass of 44 pages, the writer has carefully brought together the relevant facts and his presentation of the case has the merit of force and lucidity. The seven appendices that follow help to make it well-documented, as much as one could wish, and there is an index which makes references to the contents an easy matter. No one who has read the book can help agreeing that it has been written in a spirit of loving service to Britain and India, and the words, "love of men as men must be in very deed the setting for the special love of our own nation," ring clear and true. The writer, as we understand from a note prefixed, has now taken up work for Gonds, in a remote village two days from the nearest railway station ; this volume must therefore be understood to be his last contribution on the present situation. The preface written by Laurence Housman shows the liberal Britisher's appreciation of the case presented, and all who are interested in the problem which seems to baffle even the "incorrigible optimist" will profit by a perusal of the book.

PRIYARANJAN SEN

**O Oriente Portugues.** Nova Goa, 1932.

The second and the third number of this antiquarian journal have been issued together in one volume and the papers published keep up the promise shown in the first issue which has been already noticed in the pages of this Review. The first article of the present issue is on the Religious History of Goa and is from the pen of the distinguished President of the Archæological Committee. It is divided into four chapters and includes an account of the different Missions and Church Organisations. The half-a-dozen illustrations that accompany it are worth mention. This is followed by Legislation in Ancient India which deals with sutras, smritis and samhit or codes of social conduct ; it is a brief statement of the position occupied by these codes which were, the author rightly points out, occasionally overriden by the the ruling given by a man prominent for his knowledge of and insight into things ; the concluding portion ought to have been developed and documented. The third paper deals with the death of the Duke of Alva. Next follows a descriptive list of national monuments with a few illustrations. Prof Pissurlencar has an interesting paper on the League between the Portuguese and the Bhonsla against Sambhuji. The other articles are of minor importance. We wish the journal a useful career.

Priyaranjan Sen

**Justice for Hungary**: The cruel errors of Trianon. Published by the Pesti Hislap, Budapest, 1930.

This is a highly interesting album, revealing the injuries done to Hungary by the blundering treaty of Trianon. The Great War had done to it damage in population as well as in territory, and the country was the worst sufferer in all Europe. This the editors have amply demonstrated by the numerous excellent sketches and graphs which stand out as models for propagandists. And one who goes through the work will have to admit that the treaty of Trianon, so far as Hungary was concerned, was the handiwork of greed, gross ignorance, and malicious deception ; that national minorities are protected in theory, but never in practice ; the League of Nations had received more than ten thousand complaints from oppressed minorities, but only a few had been considered, the rest were buried in archives. The Editors therefore submit that, for the lasting peace of Europe, for the reason ' nothing is settled that is not settled by right,' the peace of Trianon should be based on a more equitable distribution and adjustment of boundaries.

The statement of the case is followed by a rapid and graphic survey of the history of the Hungarian nation for a thousand years, its achievement in different branches of human culture, painting, literature, music, theatre, etc., and last, reproduction of the bust of illustrious Hungarians who have won international reputation,—men like Haydn and Sir Aurel Stein, and Munkacsy.

This is therefore an eloquent appeal which no right-thinking man can resist and the case of Hungary, wronged cruelly and brutally, is a warning to nations who may in these days entertain pious confidences in the Great Powers of Europe pursuing ideals of equity and justice when their interests are at stake.

Priyaranjan Sen

**The Heart of Hindusthan—by** Sir S. Radhakrishnan, second edition. G. A. Natesan & Co., Madras. Price Re. One.

The author of this little volume needs no introduction to the Indian public. An erudite scholar and a deep thinker, he is at the same time a master of clear diction and presents the most recondite problems of religion and philosophy in language which is understood by people with no pretensions to a metaphysical or theological training. Hinduism is a religion which well-nigh baffles definition and is, not unnaturally, often misunderstood not only by hostile critics but by followers and admirers. It is, therefore, a matter for congratulation that so distinguished a philosopher as Sir S. Radhakrishnan should undertake the task of disentangling the essentials of the Hindu *Dharma* from bewildering mare of dogmas, beliefs and practices.

The volume before us consists of seven discourses. They open with a description of the central features of the faith of the Hindus—its philosophical doctrine, religious exprience, ethical character and traditional faith. Hindusim, the author points out, is a process, not a result, a growing tradition, not a fixed revelation. It allows the utmost latitude in the matter of addressing and approaching the Supreme and has room for all kinds of men. In essence Hindu thought has much in common with those aspects of the truth of Islam and Christianity which really promoted culture and civilisation. " The differences among the living progressive religions of the world relate to accents and emphases, which are traceable to social environments and historic circumstances." The penultimate discourse is on Buddhism which is a later phase of the general movement of thought of which the Upanishads are the earlier. The volume ends with a succinct account of Indian philosopy.

It is possible to disagree with the author in regard to some points of detail, *e.g.*, the description of Krishna as a non-Aryan representative of the black peoples. But no one who reads the volume can fail to be impressed with the care with which the professor has sought to separate the kernel from the husk, and the deep insight he has shown into the thoughts and ideals of the vast majority of his countrymen.

H. C. R. C.

# Ourselves

## OUR VICE-CHANCELLOR'S SPEECH

We are glad to draw the attention of our readers, interested in the complex educational problem of our country as a vitally important social factor on which must largely depend the real progress of all communities in the present transitional stage of the whole country, to the eminently practical and valuable convocation address delivered at Lahore on the 23rd of December, 1932, by our Vice-Chancellor Sir Hassan Suhrawardy, Lt.-Col. O.B.E., M.D., F.R.C.S.I., D.P.H.

It does not on the face of it claim to be a learned speech but its usefulness is enhanced by the fact that from beginning to end it gives unmistakable evidence that every utterance is dictated by sound judgment and strong common sense and is the outcome of careful personal thinking on the part of a liberal-minded man in direct and intimate touch with our difficulties, deficiencies and needs. It will surely lead to "the proper understanding of the essential features of our national development" and to "discriminating criticism in regard to social problems." And that is what the country particularly needs to-day. In a rapid but intelligent survey the speaker has touched on, briefly but pointedly, momentous economic, political and social changes in our country, the crying need for agricultural improvement along right lines and industrial development suitable for the purpose of affording relief to the agricultural labourer and for opening out careers to educated young men confronted with the serious problem of unemployment, the dangers of overcrowded Universities inelastic in their methods of training, courses of studies and systems of examination, the absence of special tests in selecting candidates for posts in the various kinds of service under the Government and the necessity of distinguishing true from false research work and of regulating the scope of different Universities in different provinces in relation to environment so that "each may have a distinctive stamp of its own. One can easily quote a number of wise words from this short speech so impressive by reason of its sincerity and directness and thought-provoking character. But as our desire is that our readers will carefully read the speech itself and personally think over the problems referred to and the suggestions for remedy made in it we rest content with a reference to the acute observation regarding one of the important factors of political unrest, namely, its "psychological and pathological background due to defective nutrition and nervous overstrain." Let us also make one quotation from his concluding remarks on inter-communal unity :—

"When I look," he suggestively observes, with convincing personal touch "upon the bitterness with which communal strife has been carried on in this country within the last few years I am mortified to feel that education has apparently lost its true mission. The Universities must be regarded as the training centres for turning out broad-minded, tolerant
f-reliant citizens. Education must drive off from
inds the darkness of ignorance and emancipate us
f bigotry and denominational bias—must
exclusiveness, narrow-mindedness and

) publish the two following ex-
the "Advance" for our readers'

*December* 25, 1932:

-Chancellor of the Calcutta
Convocation of the
free from pedantic

platitudes and literary flourishes which do not serve any useful purpose, and contained a good deal of sound common-sense which is not always to be found in such pronouncements. Sir Hassan Suhrawardy briefly referred to the defects in the present system of education in the country, the need for inter-communal concord, the social transition through which India is passing, the essential conditions of economic evolution and the etiology of the prevailing political unrest in the country, and tackled all these questions as a practical man of the world. With regard to our University education, he laid his finger with unerring precision on some of its principal defects. "While there has been a great increase in the number of Universities and University men," he pithily remarked, "there does not, however, seem to have been a corresponding rise in the level of quality." The present examination system, he added, tends to encourage cramming, and "it will be a good thing if instead of giving undue importance to the passing of University Examinations as a qualification for entering posts under the Government and elsewhere, special tests are instituted for the various kinds of service." He also deplored the overcrowding in the Universities and observed that "a large percentage of persons who are mentally and constitutionally unsuited for higher education will do well to be diverted to industrial and commercial channels and given a start upon a useful career while they are still young enough to learn."

With respect to the imperative need for accelerating social reform,
Sir Hassan, while advocating the abolition of "things like
ability, purdah system, early marriage and caste restrictio
cated "the blind and superficial imitation of other
may lead to disaster. "It should not at all be
out, "to build upon the foundations of our p
enduring structure with a happy blend
ideals of the West and of the E
idea of basing the industrial an
on a purely western model. H
reconstruction, agricultural adv
medium-sized and, specially,
portion of his address was tha
young men to emancipate their m
denominational bias," avoid
fishness and "go out
for the realisation of

Perhaps the most important portion of Sir Hassan Suhrawardy's address was that in which he referred to the factors of political unrest. This is what he had to say on the subject:—

Unemployment is certainly an important factor. I am, however, convinced that the political unrest and upheaval we are witnessing everywhere have a psychological and a pathological background due to defective nutrition and nervous overstrain. I would like to invite the special attention of all members of Government in the different provinces of India and also of the Hon'ble Sir Fazl-i-Husain to this important problem, and start with the least possible delay an enquiry into the causes of ill-health among the masses of this country, into the psychological, physical, pathological, economic and environmental factors, which are responsible for the unbalancing of the minds and the warping of the imagination, and the distorting of the ideals of many of our youths. It appears to me that poor food, unemployment, overcrowding in the Universities with students unsuitable for higher education, are some of the chief factors. It is, therefore, essential to conduct a detailed survey of the food resources of the country and to classify indigenous food materials in categories of their nutrition value and encourage and guide our young men to take to professions and callings which they are financially, physically, intellectually and temperamentally fitted to pursue.

Sir Hassan's diagnosis of the trouble may not be quite as comprehensive as one might have liked it to be, but it is certainly very much nearer the mark an the remedy suggested by him much more efficacious than the campaign of repression upon which the Government has embarked to quell political unrest in the counry.

---

**Advance**—*Saturday, December* 31, 1932:

Lieut.-Colonel Sir Hassan Suhrawardy, Vice-Chancellor of the University of Calcutta, delivered last week an impressive address at the Convocation of the University of the Punjab. We do not propose to deal to-day with such commonplace facts of our existence as the backwardness of our society in certain directions, the deficiencies of our agriculture and tardy pace of our industrial development; these are recognised easily enough so far as the broad tendencies are concerned, some of them having been indicated by Sir Hassan himself. There would be complete agreement with his view that "the superficial adoption of Western modes of living without the proper assimilation of Western culture and civilization and of the ideals which guide everyday life in the West" leads to disaster and that " it should not at all be difficult to build upon the foundations of our past greatness a beautiful and enduring structure with a happy blend of the best in the methods and ideals of the West and of the East." The unchanging East is now a discredited metaphor, and the coming years are likely to see far-reaching changes in our social structure and in our political conditions. If civilisation is the effect of which culture is the cause, a new civilization is certainly in the making, for though the goal is still far off, the caravan is well started on its journey. Sir Hassan may claim his share in leading this caravan through the track of the decades to its ultimate destination, and as the Vice-Chancellor of the greatest University in the East, his is a leadership that has been acknowledged even in the remote Punjab.

But it is not for the repetition of the commonplaces of our social and economic life that we commend Sir Hassan's address to the notice of the public. The most impressive part of his speech is where he speaks as an educationist, and as a medical man. Here he gives us food for hard thinking. When at the height of the Non-co-operation movement, the University of Calcutta was dubbed as *Golamkhana*, the language was strong but the sentiment and feeling behind it was the same which have impelled the present Vice-Chancellor to condemn the existing system of University education, only using more decent phrases. Nor is Sir Hassan alone in this respect. Since the Sadler Commission published their historic report (now rapidly gathering an antiquarian interest) eminent educationists, no rabid thinker or talker any one of them, and Vice-Chancellors of Universities have deprecated the present system of higher education which has led, generally speaking, to a large-scale manufacture of service-hunters. " It will be a good thing," Sir Hassan suggests by way of remedy, "if instead of giving undue importance to the passing of University examinations as a qualification for entering posts under Government and elsewhere, special tests are instituted for the various kinds of service." We wish Sir Hassan had elaborated this point. It would seem, if his suggestion were accepted, that for the time being at any rate, it would accentuate, rather than diminish, the extent of unemployment among the educated classes of our country. There is no doubt that there is considerable waste at the top, and that a large number of post-graduate students, even of those reading for a general arts degree, are useless for the real purposes of a higher education and that something should indeed be done so that they might usefully engage in other occupations than the liberal and the professional and equip themselves accordingly. But this involves two things: on the part of the students, it involves the understanding that they must have reasonable chances of

finding other occupations for which they might be expected to equip themselves, such chances being hopelessly meagre at present ; and on the part of the Universities, they must learn the art of carrying on with a severely attenuated Fee Fund. Our Universities are still regrettably far from finding a perpetual flow of donations, legacies and endowments such as sustain the Universities in the West and in America ; of Government grants, the less said the better. There is much in Sir Hassan's suggestion that it is preferable to have, instead of one University over-burdened with multifarious branches of study, several Universities in each province, each with a distinctive stamp of its own ; for instance, one may cultivate the humanities, another natural sciences, a third technology and so on. Till adequate finances be forthcoming, " extra-mural institutions," Sir Hassan suggested, " specialising in suitable branches of study and all-India institutions at different centres, run on cheaper lines than Universities, may meet
nal demand for higher scientific education." The suggestion is
ous consideration by the Syndics of our Universities. There
ying that they are at present attempting to do too much.
save them from decline.

* * *

### ARY SCIENTIFIC M.B. EXAMINATION,
### EMBER, 1932

ates registered for the Preliminary
Regulations)

1932, was 71, of whom 59 passed, 12 failed, *nil* expelled and *nil* absent.

Of the successful candidates two obtained Honours in Bacteriology and Pathology, and *nil* in Pharmacology.

* * *

## RESULT OF THE THIRD M.B. EXAMINATION, NOVEMBER, 1932

The number of candidates registered for the Third M.B. Examination (under the New Regulations) held in November, 1932, was 70, of whom 42 passed, 27 failed, *nil* expelled and 1 absent.

Of the successful candidates *nil* obtained Honou Jurisprudence..

* * *

## JOGENDRANATH GHOSH'S RESEARCH P INDIAN LAW FOR

The following subject has been nath Ghosh's Research Prize in Co 1933.

To the Editor of the Calcutta Review

Sir,

On p. 343 of your Review for this year (1932), the writer of "Jaina-Buddhist Influence in the Gītā" says, that I have "recently pointed out" the probable inaccuracy of the view, that the Upaniṣads are prior to Buddha's age and marks me out as "thinking the Upaniṣads are post-Buddhistic."

These be big words to put into my mouth. They should have been accompanied by a careful reference to work, chapter and page. There is nothing of the kind. Nor can I trace that I have said them. I have subscribed to the view that the Upaniṣads are of many ages and that of the dozen or so considered as earliest, many betray an individual history. I have suggested, that *two or three* reveal changes in teaching which betray that they were teachings shortly prior to the beginning of the Śakyan movement. But nothing more. That the great majority of the minor Upaniṣads is of a later date than that beginning, is a view to support which there is no need to bring in a relatively incompetent testator as am I. Perhaps Mr. A. C. Sen will tell me (in confidence) where and how I have misled him. I have no wish to intrude further on your pages in this matter.

Chipstead, Surrey — Yours faithfully,

Oct. 6, 1932 — C. A. F. Rhys Davids

THE REPLY.

I must apologise to Mrs. Rhys Davids. The article in question was written many months ago and remained with the *Review* for long. I had no opportunity of going through the proofs before its publication, for in that case I would have taken steps to prevent misquotation, My remarks were based on information obtained from a respectable publication. I had no means of verifying the statements at the time by a reference to the original, for it was not available in India. The publication which misled me remained uncontradicted and still does so. I am forwarding a cutting to the authoress so that she might deal with it effectively. I quite admit I should have been more cautious and circumspect in relying on second-hand testimony, however respectable in appearance.

Vidyabhavana, Visvabharati, AMULYACHANDRA SEN
Santiniketan
Dec. 5, 1932

* * *

## KRISHNA KUMARI GANESH PRASAD MEDAL AND PRIZE

*First award to be made in 1936.*

The Council of the Calcutta Mathematical Society has chosen the following subject for the thesis to the author of which a gold medal and a cash prize of Rs. 200 will be awarded in January, 1936:—

The lives and the works of the ten Hindu Mathematicians: Varāha-Mihira, Āryabhaṭa, Bhāskara I, Brahmagupta, Lalla, Śrīdhara, Mahāvīra, Śrīpati, Bhāskara II and Nārāyaṇa.

The rules for the competition were published in the *Bulletin of the Calcutta Mathematical Society*, Vol. 22, Nos. 2 & 3, 1930, and they are reproduced below for ready reference.

(1) A research prize and gold medal shall be instituted to be named Krishna Kumari Ganesh Prasad Prize and Medal after the name of the donor's daughter.

(2) The prize and the medal shall be awarded every fifth year to the author of the best thesis embodying the result of original research or investigation in a topic connetced with the history of Hindu Mathematics before 1600 A.D.

(3) The subject of the thesis shall be prescribed by the Council of the Calcutta Mathematical Society at least two years in advance.

(4) The last day of submitting the thesis for the award in a particular year shall be the 21st March preceding that year.

(5) The prize and the medal shall be open to competition to all nationals of the world without any distinction of race, caste or creed.

(6) A board of Honorary Examiners, consisting of (*i*) the President of the Society, (*ii*) an expert in the subject nominated by the donor, or after his death, such an expert nominated by the donor's heirs, and (*iii-v*) three experts in the subject elected by the Coucil of the Society, shall be appointed as soon as possible after the last day of receiving the theses.

(7) The recommendation of the Board of Examiners shall be placed before the next annual meeting of the Society and the decision of that meeting shall be final.

(8) Every candidate shall be required to submit three copies (type-written) of his or her thesis.

(9) If in any year no thesis is received or the theses submitted be pronounced by the Board of Examiners to be not of sufficient merit, a second prize or a prize in a second subject, or a prize of enhanced value, may be awarded in a subsequent year or years as the Council of the Calcutta Mathematical Society may determine.

(10) The thesis of the successful candidate shall be printed by the Society.

THE CALCUTTA REVIEW

FEBRUARY, 1933

# THE MESSAGE OF SHELLEY'S "PROMETHEUS UNBOUND"

The arts, according to Hegel, are the most effective means that man has evolved for piercing through or casting aside the non-essentials of ordinary existence and touching the vast movement of the cosmic life. Among the arts he regarded the drama as the most complete and efficient means of this process of "polarisation." By this he meant the complete drama as represented on the stage.

But there has always been a type of drama to which complete incarnation would not be life, but death. Its happenings are beyond human simulation; its significances are not those of Leicester Square or Broadway. It is enacted at the top of a Jacob's ladder "pitched between Heaven and Charing Cross" up which the would-be spectator, who must also be a participant, of the drama must climb from Charing Cross to Heaven.

This drama is the true lineal descendant of the first of dramas, that drama which (as has been recorded by the seers of old in India) was composed by the Lord of Creation, and produced by the celestial stage-manager and author of the laws of the drama, Bharata, on a stage constructed by the cosmic architect, Visvakarmā, and set in the heaven of Indra, the Lord of the [illegible]. The drama of the tangible stage has laid upon it the duty [illegible] being the critic, interpreter and reflector of human life. The drama of the human spirit, composed by the creative impulse of humanity, not merely by its generative fever enacted in the light of the sun, not in the shadows cast by the moon or the limelight, demands that life shall reflect and ultimately embody it.

Shelley's "Prometheus Unbound" is a drama of this order. We do not go to it for facts concerning early Greece or the Europe of 1820, but for fundamental verities that are clamped to no age, therefore current in and applicable to all ages and places; ideas and thoughts that "look before and after" towards a golden age of "what is not" but was, and will be; an age which, because humanity has set out on a circumnavigation that will bring it back to its native harbour in the realm of the spirit, is at once in the romantic past and the still more romantic future.

This attitude to "Prometheus Unbound" has not, it must be admitted, the full approval of literary criticism. So eminent a critic as Professor Edward Dowden will not, in his "Life of Shelley," permit a search for anything more specific than "fortitude, justice, love, beauty, hope, unquenched desire," a fairly formidable list of excellences, all the same. Shelley embodied these powers in the drama, and set them in action; but their outer expression, according to Dr. Dowden, is only a poetical version of the teachings of William Godwin. In Dowden's view, Shelley's representation of humanity as a chained Titan, and of evil as a power external to humanity, is "to ignore the true conditions of human existence" and "to falsify the true conception of human progress." He tells us that "Shelley's ideas are abstractions made from a one-sided and imperfect view of facts.

To sift such criticism of Shelley would leave us in a circus-ring with much movement but little progress. Their fallacies will appear as we study the drama-poem. Meanwhile, for our encouragement, we may set against Dowden's inhibition on a search for significances in "Prometheus Unbound" the mo[illegible] balanced statement of Dr. C. H. Herford in his chapter on Shelley in "The Cambridge History of English Literature:"

" when he portrays the universe as at one with the moral strivings of man, he is uttering no fugitive or isolated extravagance, but the perennial faith of idealists of all ages. Under forms of thought derived from the atheist and materialist Godwin, Shelley has given, in 'Prometheus Unbound,' magnificent expression to the faith of Plato and of Christ."

Our quest is towards that faith which Shelley so augustly shared. But before essaying that positive task, it will be well to consider certain other criticisms of our time that stand in the way of a full realisation of the significance of the drama and of its author.

In a brochure on Shelley, Mr. Sydney Waterlow, M.A., says: "on the whole, 'Prometheus' has been overpraised." He is not quite sure why this should be so; " perhaps," he ventures, "because the beauty of the interspersed songs has dazzled the critics." As to why the drama does *not* qualify for overpraise he is quite explicit. Not only are the personages of " Prometheus Unbound " too transparently allegorical, but the allegory is insipid; especially tactless being the treatment of the marriage between Prometheus, the Spirit of Humanity, and Asia, the Spirit of Nature, as a romantic love affair. Mr. Waterlow thus makes four specific charges against the drama. Let us examine them.

When Ghiberti chiselled his figures on the doors of the baptistery at Florence, he did not expect that some day a critic would take objection to them on the ground that they were too transparently metallic. Yet that is what Mr. Waterlow does in objecting to the allegorical nature of " Prometheus Unbound." Shelley wrote it as an allegory. He tells us in the preface to the drama that he endeavoured to create " beautiful idealisms of moral excellence." He speaks of the " moral interest of the fable." Now a fable is usually permitted to be fabulous; and fable and allegory have one method in common: they speak of one thing and mean both it and something more. As a matter of fact, " Prometheus Unbound," is *not* too transparently allegorical to this critic in at least two points : he is not sure as to what Demogorgon stands for in the drama, though Shelley makes him call himself " Eternity :" and he finds the second act " full of the dreams of Asia," when, in fact, the dream part of the act has seventy dream-lines by Panthea, the sister of Asia, and only twenty by Asia, and these take up but a small portion of the act.

As to the charge or insipidity made by Mr. Waterlow against the allegory of " Prometheus Unbound," it may be remarked that there are not a few lovers of poetry to whom the story is the reverse of insipid either in the general sense of having no flavour, or in the literary sense of lacking spirit. The existence of these reduces the matter to the simple proposition that it may be insipid to Mr. Waterlow. But something more detailed has to be said in rebuttal of Mr. Waterlow's charge that Shelley's delineation of the relationship between the Spirit of Humanity and the Spirit of Nature reduces it to a " romantic love affair " and a piece of literary tactlessness.

The story of " Prometheus Unbound " as Shelley develops it is certainly a love affair. The whole drama celebrates the triumph of love. But it is aeons removed in both its external grandeur and internal significance from the triviality and sentimentality that hang about the phrase a " romantic love affair " and that Mr. Waterlow attributes to the drama. When Prometheus, in the first act, speaks of

> Asia ! who, when my being overflowed,
> Wert like a golden chalice to bright wine
> Which else had sunk into the thirsty dust,

he was not weaving mere romantic phrases, but expressing in splendid imagery a relationship more exalted, yet more intimate than ordinarily experienced between man and woman. Later, Asia speaks of Prometheus as her animating spirit, as he speaks of her as his means of manifestation. These are no drawing-room compliments, but the symbolical expression, in terms of human relationships, of the mystery of the cosmic duality-in-unity, of the two aspects, life and form, of one Being and one process. These operate in the atom as well as in the stellar sphere. They are bound together by the cohesive principle in the universe which is called love. "The air is full of marriages," says the poet in "The King's Threshold" of Yeats. Their highest expression is celebrated annually in Vedic India in the Marriage of Shiva and Parvati. They and their expression cannot be annulled by inattentive or insensitive criticism.

Another critic, E. W. Edmunds in "Shelley and his Poetry," writes: "The emotion of the romantic and revolutionary movements has, in 'Prometheus Unbound,' been caught in its most ethereal flight." This statement, standing by itself, would be true, but only half of the whole truth. The other half is that the emotional fervour of Shelley circled around the conceptions of his creative mind. The hope of the world, to Shelley, was not the dawn of emotions, but the dawn of mind ("The Revolt of Islam," V. I). He did not sing: "Emotions have gone forth..." but "Thoughts have gone forth whose powers can sleep no more" ("Islam," V. 6). Yet this critic says of the poem that it "must not be read for its story or even for its didactic meaning," and proceeds: "we do not test this drama with the intellect; those who attempt to do so will find it a meaningless rhapsody." He adds: "That does not imply that the poem has no definite meaning. Far from it. But the meaning only comes to those who are competent to hear the spirit-voices which haunt the atmosphere of all true poetry." Yet the most exquisite spirit-voices in the drama are those of the emancipated *thoughts* of humanity.

It is true, of course, that the creative artist is only concerned with external systems of thought or action to the extent that they serve his artistic purpose. But Shelley's purpose in "Prometheus Unbound" was neither artistic only, nor didactic only. His purpose was vital, the influencing of life through love. This purpose involves intelligence as well as feeling, and intelligence is orderly. But Shelley, being an original, produced his own order: he was not produced by it. Out of his intuitive response to the reality of life he made his own world which they who possess both eyes and ears may enter for their own pleasure, despite critical notice-boards. He is a poor artist indeed who does not carry about with him his own sun and moon and seven stars, or more. And Shelley was one of the richest. And now for the meaning of the "meaningless rhapsody."

Prometheus is generally referred to as a personification of mankind. Shelley in his preface calls him "the type of the highest perfection of moral and intellectual nature, impelled by the purest and truest motives to the best and noblest ends;" a specification of excellences that falls into the triangular design of human capacities—mental, emotional, and dynamic. Prometheus is therefore humanity as it is in potentiality, not yet in realisation. "That fair being whom we spirits call man" is hidden by "foul masks" which are moulded by "ill thoughts." The getting rid of these masks is the business of life and the subject of the dramatic poem.

Asia is the inner and receptive aspect of one entity whose outer and executive aspect is Prometheus. She is, as Prometheus says, the chalice or containing vessel for the overflow of his being. He is to her, as she says, the soul or animating principle by which she lives. Neither could exist without the other. Whatever may have been Shelley's definite knowledge (and he was a great reader as well as a great thinker) of the significances which the imagination of man had gathered around these personifications of archetypal life, it is a fact that they stood for fundamental aspects of the cosmic Being and its reflection in humanity. Prometheus is the eternal being (cosmic or individual) which creates its own self-limitation, even as he became the child of Earth, and the victim of Jupiter to whom he himself had given sovereignty. Asia is the supreme receptacle of the experiences of the empirical aspect of life, and is born of the waters, as was Aphrodite, her Grecian counterpart.

They are the *atman* and *buddhi* (the essential ego and intuition) of the Orient. Asia is the embodiment of wisdom, beauty and love, the unified highest degrees of the triple endowment of humanity, mental, aesthetical and active. With her are her sisters, Panthea (all-seeing),—who acts for Asia as the higher mind of man acts for the intuition, as the co-ordinating and generalizing agent between it, and the outturned aspect of the mind, personified in Ione, to whose questions Panthea gives the replies in the colossal fourth act in which Prometheus and Asia are invisible and silent, or, rather, have become merged in nature and humanity whose many voices, chanting the amazing chants of liberation through love, are their voices, with Panthea and Ione (the dual *manas* or mind of the Orient) as their hearers.

Jupiter, the antagonist of Prometheus, has been interpreted as "the personification of human institutions." A literary historian (W. J. Long in "English Literature") writes: "Shelley's philosophy (if one may dignify a hopeless dream by such a name) was a curious aftergrowth of the French Revolution, namely that it is only the existing tyranny of State, Church and Society which keeps man from growth into perfect happiness. Shelley forgot, like many other enthusiasts, that Church and State and social laws were not imposed on man from without, but were created by himself to minister to his necessities." Mr. Long's interpretation of Shelley on this matter is echoed by a younger writer, Mr. Aldous Huxley ("Do What You Will," chapter on "Fashions in Love:"): "Get rid of priests and kings, and men will be forever good and happy; poor Shelley's faith in this palpable nonsense remained unshaken to the end." Contrary to Mr. Long, who forgot his Shelley, the poet himself (through the spirit of the Hour) says that man's guilt and pain existed only because he himself either made or permitted the circumstances which brought them about. If Prometheus and Jupiter may separately be read symbolically, it is hardly too much to claim that the relationship between them may also be read symbolically, and that the giving of "the dominion of wide heaven" to Jupiter by Prometheus makes Prometheus the responsible origin of his own ills. And, contrary to Mr. Huxley, with the example of post-revolutionary France before him, Shelley would indeed have been blinded with excess of inner light if in his attacks on the outer manifestations of spiritual and social slavery he had mistaken the symptom for the disease. But a full understanding of Shelley's attitude makes it clear that he was at least as much concerned with pathological origins as with their effects, and that the "palpable nonsense" in the minds of the critics is a reversion of the palpable sense of Shelley's teaching that, when man has achieved goodness and happiness, external instruction and rulership will have become unnecessary.

We shall get away from the difficulties of wooden or precocious interpretation of Shelley's glorious "fable" if we take Prometheus as the figure of expanding human life on its positive side, and Jupiter as the figure of restrictive law or form. In the beginning of things, as recounted by Asia (Act 2, Scene 4) Saturn, "from whose throne Time fell, an envious shadow," withheld from the earliest inhabitants of the earth the powers and qualities of positive, active life. Prometheus, however,

> Gave wisdom, which is strength, to Jupiter,
> And with this law alone, 'Let man be free,'
> Clothed him with the dominion of wide heaven.

In other words, Life (personified by Prometheus), finding its manifestation indefinite under the dominion of Time only, placed itself under the dominion of Law (personified by Jupiter). Had Life been fully developed at this early stage, Law would have been simply an easy channel for it to flow through. But Life was rudimentary, incoherent, inarticulate, and as such needed the defining and developing opposition of Law, as the would-be athlete needs the opposition of system and apparatus in order to gain strength. This opposition is expressed by Shelley as the tyranny of Jupiter, the wielding of the power of Law, pure and free himself from the laws of action (*Karma*). "By the accident of good fortune a man may rule the world for a time, but by virtue of love he may rule the world forever," said Laotze six centuries before Christ.

It is said by critics that Shelley was an anarchist who taught that man was superior to law, and that each man should be a law unto himself. What Shelley taught in "Prometheus Unbound" was, that Love, not man, is superior to Law, and that only when Man-in-the-highest, Man Promethean, is governed solely and completely by Love can he safely be set free from Law. "The law was our schoolmaster to bring us to Christ," said the Christian Apostle. Jupiter was our schoolmaster to bring us to Prometheus, says Shelley. Christ and Prometheus are names for the spirit of Love.

Bearing this in mind, it is curious to note Mr. Aldous Huxley's declaration ("Do What You Will," chapter on "Fashions in Love") that Shelley believed that "you had only to get rid of social restraints and erroneous mythology to make the Grand Passion universally chronic......he failed to see that the Grand Passion was produced by the restraints that opposed themselves to the sexual impulse." Shelley saw quite as clearly as the critic the use of the restraints of law as provokers and intensifiers of the creative forces of life; but he did not limit the Grand Passion to sex. Love, to Shelley, is the integrating power in the universe. Sexual integration is only one of its phases, and is only justifiable when it is governed by spiritual integration. This is the clue to the falsely assumed sexual mobility of Shelley. The transfer of the focus of his human nature from Harriet Westbrook to Mary Godwin was not a transfer from body to body but from soul to soul. To the literal Puritan the distinction may not seem important. Francis Thompson went further than even the Puritan could go by observing, in his Essay, that Shelley left a woman "not because he was tired of her arms, but because he was tired of her soul," a shifting of personal allegiance which he attributed to "a straying, strange and deplorable, of the spirit,"—a dogma "strange and deplorable" that would, if it could, subordinate the allegiance of the spirit to the alliances of the flesh. The law of life is meaningless unless it takes us on to wisdom which recognises the love that is in all things; and recognises also that only in the spirit of love can we express the Prometheus who is within each of us. "Love is the fulfilment of the law." It is also, in the Shelleyan conception, the law of fulfilment.

So much for the general teaching of the poem, that true freedom is unattainable while the higher powers are inoperative; and that law cannot be set aside until love is the active principle in all life's affairs. This does not, of course, mean anything so foolish as a cessation of all struggle for liberation until love has been achieved. In stating the goal, Shelley did not mistake it as the starting-point, as Francis Thompson obtusely wrote, save in the subjective sense that one's ideal subtly influences every action towards its attainment. The drama has therefore its individual as well as its cosmic and general import: or rather (to state more truly the Shelleyan view), the triumph of Prometheus, being a cosmic event, is therefore an individual event. The triumph of the Flame-bringer over the forces of Darkness not only released himself from the rock to which he was bound, but released the inner powers of humanity. The Spirits who sing the following song are the living principles of the human mind; not thoughts as such, for they are but the masks and counters of the thinker, but the vital thing at their centre, "fair spirits," the Earth calls them,

> Whose homes are the dim caves of human thought,
> And who inhabit, as birds wing the wind,
> Its world-surrounding ether.
> Our spoil is won,
>
> Our task is done,
> We are free to dive or soar or run
> Beyond and around,
> Or within the bound
> Which clips the world with darkness round.

Unbound " with the great chant that follows the fifty-first stanza of the fifth canto of " The Revolt of Islam." There Shelley sings of Wisdom as the Mother and Soul, the source and living principle of the manifested universe. He sees Wisdom (the cosmic intuition or *vigna* of the *Upanishads*) re-ascending the human heart and her " irresistible children " chaining both the elements and their own wills in order to swell, not their own glory but Her's. In " Prometheus Unbound " he sees the same irresistible children building a world for the habitation, not of themselves alone, though they will share it, but of their Mother, the Cosmic Wisdom. In both poems Shelley's imagination shines and glows as it contemplates in one " the light of life " and in the other the " work......Promethean ;" the transmission from the higher regions of life to the lower, of that celestial flame that brings illumination to the mind, warmth to the heart, and beauty and intelligence to action.

In these days of ours, in this " new world of man," when fresh formularies are being sought for conduct, and when youth is consciously organising itself for a larger and freer share in the world's activities, it might do worse than form a Promethean League of men and women of all ages who retain the spirit of youth ; who would accept Shelley's Promethean vision of life, not as a system that cramps but as an inspiration that liberates who would put away the sword of antagonism even in symbolical speech and ceremonial, and raise instead the torch of spiritual illumination and foresight (the *Pramantha* of Sanskrit) who would decline to follow the spurious forms of " liberation " that are merely a putting on of new chains of habit, and would enter into the true liberation that comes from daily discipline of thought, feeling, desire and action; and who would do this with the single intent of hastening the coming of the era of wisdom which the English poet saw in his exalted vision, and which the sages of India saw as the *sat-yuga*, the coming spiritual era in which Wisdom will be tested in action and Action will be controlled by Wisdom, and both will be one.

Such formularies for action as those derived from great poetry are much more likely to be of deep and lasting service than the specialised formularies of ethics or morals. The latter do not base their formularies on the intuitive vision of the whole nature and process of human life and its relationship with the universal Life. But the utterances of the highest poetry, like that of "Prometheus Unbound," come charged with the high potential of Wisdom from the immortal spirit of humanity, and are capable of application in all times and lands. Ethics and morals are adaptations of a vague idealistic utilitarianism to the vagaries of human desire and conduct. Great poetry like Shelley's utters uncompromising ideals, and demands the adaptation of human desire and conduct to them. The poetry of Shelley, the Promethean, sings to life from its four corners of creation, emotion, thought and action. It is a flame that at once vivifies, warms, illuminates and purifies.

JAMES H. COUSINS

# RISE OF THE CALCUTTA MONEY MARKET IN RELATION TO PUBLIC BORROWING AND PUBLIC CREDIT [1]

## (1772 to 1833.)

1. A highly developed money market is a late growth in India. During the earlier part of the British rule, the East India Company paid greater attention to the consolidation of the empire and the establishment of law, order, and security, than to the economic improvement. At the same time, the decay of the old paramount power had led to many economic complications in a continent economically divergent by nature, so that it was beyond the power of any new Government to clear up the tangled economic situation within a few generations.

In spite of these facts, from the beginning of the English rule in India, markets for money and credit, however undeveloped they might have been originally, were on the way of formation. Several miniature markets developed round about the presidency towns, which being the seats of Government were centres of revenue receipts and disbursements, resorts of the trading and investment public, and places of European capitalists in India. The first and principal market grew up in Calcutta, the capital of the Supreme Government. It progressed side by side with the process of public borrowing.

Before 1772, however, the money market in Bengal was distinct from the seat of Government. It was Murshedabad, and not Calcutta, which attracted the monetary resources of Bengal. The *Khalsa* or the Treasury office was situated there and, as a necessary consequence, public revenues flowed into and out of it. Being at the same time the capital of the Subadar of Bengal, it was the resort of the wealthy and the opulent. In 1772, when on the recommendation of the Committee of Circuit the *Khalsa* was removed from Murshedabad to Calcutta,[1] all sorts of revenue work became centralised therein. Calcutta grew to be the virtual market. A vast influx of people were drawn to Calcutta. The officers, traders, money-lenders, etc., were all centralised therein, with a great increase of wealth.

---

[1] This article is a summary of two chapters of my researches into the "History of the Public Debt of India."

In this article we shall describe the growth of the Calcutta money market in its relation to public borrowing and public credit. The characteristic features of the market as they reflected upon loan operations and, conversely, the influence of the latter upon the market itself, will receive preponderating attention. The relation between the Government and the financial community in the market, and the effect of the activities of the one upon the other will form part of this investigation. The relation of the money market in its historical development to the growth of the public credit will be brought out. Rise and fall of Government credit, fluctuations in the price of public securities, and variations in the rates of interest, will form component parts of the present study. The discourse here will only be continued to the financial crisis of 1829-33, and hence, will describe the birth and childhood of the Calcutta money market.

2. The greatest disability in the early development of the money market was the lack of the commodity "money" itself. And this was the paradox. When the British came to India they found innumerable heterogeneous currencies—numbering about a thousand kinds of gold and silver coins with different standards of weights and fineness. When there were too many kinds of currencies circulating, there was almost complete lack of any

1000

---

[1] On June 4, 1772, the Governor of Bengal and his Council appointed a committee, called the Committee of Circuit, for the purpose of effecting the revenue settlement of Bengal and taking such measures best calculated to the financial interest of the country. Amongst the various proposals advanced by the Committee, was one proposing that the *Khalsa* or the Treasury office should be removed from Murshedabad to Calcutta. The whole trend of the Committee's recommendation was to centralise all sorts of revenue work in Calcutta.

9

note for [illegible] money, currencies.

standard of value. Exchange economy was practically reduced to barter economy. This phenomenon prevented in many ways money from serving in its capacity as a store of value, and therefore, hindered investment, as there was little stability in value. All attempts to fix a rate of exchange at a hypothetical standard which was known as the current rupee,[1] failed to improve the situation.

This state of affairs not only served as a discouragement to investors, but also implied a difficulty for the Government to find a wide range of investment market. A very limited sphere of influence of one variety of money or of its allied varieties, signified infinitesimal individual markets of narrow limits with minimum relation between one another. This state of affairs was in part a result of lack of communication and in part an outcome of political factors.

[illegible] Note

8. When communications were undeveloped and when the limits of markets were small, the resources of the interior were not available for public investments. Though the shroffs served on occasions as the media of remittance, their high charges formed a great handicap to the investors, who were unwilling to resort to them. They demanded an excessive margin of return for acting as intermediaries for the supply of public capital and the receipt of public annuities.

Note

1790s

From the nineties of the 18th century, new methods were being introduced for facilitating public investments and thus extending the investment market. Government treasuries throughout the interior were allowed to serve as links between the metropolitan market and the *mofussil* centres. Perhaps for the first time in 1790, the public were allowed to receive their interest from the Revenue Collectors in the "Provinces," and from the Residents at Benares and Oudh, provided three months' notice had previously been given to the officers.[2] Three

---

[1] The current rupee was a hypothetical money of account, without being represented by any currency. It bore a particular relation to such kind of currency.

[2] Calcutta Gazette, 29th April, 1790.

1793

years later, some of these Collectors and Residents (of Patna, Murshedábad, and Dacca) were also authorised to receive subscriptions to public loans. While making these departures from the old practice, the Accountant General of Bengal observed that the new methods would facilitate financial intercourse with the Presidency ; since it would open to the people a safe and, at the same time, a more advantageous remittance of capital, than was usually obtainable from the shroffs who usually charged from 1½ to 3 or 4 per cent., in all their remittance.[1]

In course of time, all the Collectors of Revenue and Residents were authorised to receive public funds, in subscription to loans floated at the capital.[2] In this way, so far as public borrowing was concerned, the capital market was extended from its previous narrow confines of Calcutta to the interior. But still for lack of developed channels of monetary flow and for undeveloped economic condition of the country, though there was movement of funds there was no easy and smooth mobility.

4. To describe the nature of the Calcutta money market : the agency houses and the banks associated with them formed one organ of it ; the shroffs and the allied Indian money-lenders constituted another ; the European servants of the Company supplied the third. Above all, however, the Government with its treasuries stood out as the principal factor.

The shroffs were the oldest members of the mercantile community in the country. They flourished from the days of the Mughal supremacy; and some of the big houses were known to finance the various Governments of the country. When the English came to be established as rulers, although the relations of the shroffs with the ruling body gradually became less important, they yet helped to a certain extent in the financial operations of the new Government. Carrying on, as they did, the lucrative business of extending facilities of exchange between various species of currencies and of remittance between different parts of the country, the shroffs formed one of the links—though a very defective one—between the different money markets throughout the country.

---

[1] Bengal Public Consultations, 11th June, 1793 [MS.].

[2] In this connection see the notification, dated 9th August, 1798, in the Calcutta Gazette of that date.

With the growth of European banking and the assumption of many of the exchange operations of the Government by the district treasuries, the importance of the shroffs still further declined. Yet in the very nature of their business, they were as susceptible as ever to the effects produced on the market by the financial operations of the Government. It is said [1] that these indigenous bankers traded on the surplus capital of the public, their own personal wealth constituting a very small portion of their trading capital. Hence, by drawing capital from one section of the public and supplying capital to another, the shroffs fed upon the difference between the prices of " money in " and "money down." A year of commercial prosperity became a year fruitful of interest to these dealers in money. Government loan operations, on the other hand, in those days of limited surplus capital, adversely affected these indigenous bankers. These loans generally caused a scarcity of cash in the market, and deprived them of the source of their capital. Likewise, the causes which checked the circulation of specie, checked the progress of trade. An absence of the medium of exchange caused a serious trade depression. These factors in their turn meant ruin to the shroffs. This was the reason why complaints from the shrotts at the time of many of the loan operations were frequent in the early days.

The function of the agency houses in the Indian money market has also special bearing on the subject. These houses commanded a large amount of capital arising from the savings of

Roots of Capital accumulation of the Agency Houses the Europeans. (11) They also pooled a small amount of Indian capital offered at low interest. Their long established credit was their principal asset in drawing public capital. (12) Their investments were principally made in what was aptly described as "profitable objects of permanent occupation,"[1] *viz.*, in indigo and other plantations. A certain amount used to be invested in British industries elsewhere—in Singapore, Penang, Malacca, Java, Sumatra, China, Manilla, New South Wales, Cape of Good Hope, Mauritius, etc. A portion of their funds was also employed in Government loans and in advances to European individuals in need of finance.

---

[1] From the frequent petitions to the Government on occasions of crisis much of the business of the shroffs and their relation to the market can be gathered. In an address, dated 22nd May, 1826, to the Government through the hands of Messrs. John Palmer & Co., the shroffs gave an elaborate description of this subject. *Vide* enclosure to the Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 4th May, 1826 [MS.].

Thus along with the shroffs, the agency houses were competitors with the Government in the investment market for the surplus capital of the investing community. But unlike the shroffs, their rivalry with the Government was more keen, as the spheres of both were more limited within the European public investors. With the shroffs, the agency houses suffered from any scarcity of specie brought about by loan operations. But they were more subject than the shroffs to sudden calls upon them during these operations, as the European investors tended to withdraw their capital from the houses for investing in gilt-edged securities. This was generally at a time when the resources of the agency houses were tied up ; their capital, as has been stated, used to be employed in such a way that there was very little chance of having it at call or short notice. In fact, until after the period of our investigation, when genuine banking on joint-stock principles developed, there was very little of what was called floating capital, and there was very little tendency on the part of the public to short-term investment; money at call was almost non-existent. In other words, the state of the money market was very rigid. This will explain most of the financial crises of early periods in India.

---

[1] An elaborate description of the business of the agency houses can be found in a petition to the Government of Bengal by the Calcutta Agency Houses during 1826 when a financial crisis was developing. *Vide* enclosure to the Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 4th August 1826 [MS.].

5. A survey of the history of the metropolitan market in Bengal from the beginning of the English rule to the middle of the eighties of the 18th century when Warren Hastings ceased to be the Governor-General, enables us to make some definite statements.

Firstly, since 1772, a market was in the process of formation in Calcutta; but for many years it was in an embryonic state. There was very little cohesion between the various organs of the money market.

Secondly, partly due to these reasons and partly due to the nascent state of the Government, and also partly due to the unfamiliarity of the Indians with what is called public investment, there was nothing like a wide public credit. Whatever existed was mainly confined to the European inhabitants of the town. Indians had other ways of employing their money, such as purchases of landed property, loans on mortgages at usurious rates of interest, etc. [1] And how could investment be encouraged when there was no standard Government security in the market in a proper sense ?—for, Government debts were contracted in various ways evidenced by no standard form or forms of paper. Whatever might have been the cause, it is evident that not only was investment market limited in area, but it was also confined to a small number of people. Hence, in that nascent state of the market, lack of public credit did not only mean a want of confidence, as the term invariably implies today, but it also indicated a lack of means or capital in the small circle of creditors, the fall of credit resulting from this scarcity.

Lastly, because of the economic isolation of the metropolitan market from the rest of the provinces, and because of the limitation of the investing circle within narrow bounds, the condition of the whole country did not, as a rule, coincide with the economic state of the market in which the Government appealed for loans. These statements will be fully borne out by the state of wealth in Bengal in contrast to the rate at which the Government borrowed money.

---

[1] See in this connection the statement of Warren Hastings on the then nature of public credit in his Memoirs relating to the State of India, 1787, p. 18.

6. Before the Battle of Plassey, whatever the state of money market, the country absorbed much foreign capital in gold and silver bullion, mainly imported by the East India Company for investment. Of the total imports by the East India Company from the year 1708 to 1757, about 74 per cent. consisted of bullion.[1] After the Battle of Plassey, and particularly after the acquisition of the Dewani (1765), the revenues obtained in Bengal obviated the necessity of considerable import of bullion. While up to 1757, the annual import of bullion into India exceeded four hundred thousand pounds on the average, there was very little import of it from 1758.[2] The balance of trade turned against India, particularly against Bengal.[3] It is needless to enter into the details of the calculations on the nature and amounts of export of wealth out of India for some time after the battle of Plassey, and the diverse causes that led to it—an enquiry already carried on by another investigator,[4]—suffice it to say, that in no way did those events influence the rates of money and the rates of interest allowed on Government loans. Eight or nine per cent. were generally the prevalent rates of interest allowed on Government loans. These seem to have been the average rates from the earliest days of the East India Company's history when it was a trading body, with minor exceptions due to local circumstances.[5] During the administration of Warren Hastings, Macpherson, and Cornwallis, 8 per cent. was the average rate allowed for loans floated in

---

[1] Commons Paper, 152 of 1813.

[2] Commons Paper, 152 of 1813.

[3] Commons Paper, 33 and 225 of 1812-13.

[4] J. C. Sinha, Economic Annals of Bengal, London, 1927.

[5] For borrowing by the East India Company during the thirties of the 17th century, see E. B. Sainsbury and W. Foster, A Calendar of the Court Minutes of the E. I. Co., 1635-1639, Oxford, 1907, p. 24.

1813

Bengal and payable therein. And on one occasion in 1774 and 1775, it became possible to reduce the rate to as low a level as five per cent. This supplies another instance of the lack of relation between the economic condition of the whole country, and the special circle of the members of the money market supplying capital to the Government.

1780s 7. This was the state of affairs practically up to the seventeen-eighties. But soon after, in course of the evolution of the money market, other factors appeared to modify the position. The last two decades of the eighteenth century witnessed two important formative periods of the Indian money market ; firstly, the reforms introduced into the Government securities in order to make them sufficiently attractive to command surplus capital for investment in the market, and secondly, the other economic and financial factors brought into the field.

The most important of these, the registration of Government papers, first the certificates and then the bonds [1]—the two principal kinds of Government papers—was a great step in systematising Government securities and in putting them into order. It considerably facilitated the marketability of the papers.

The second reform in this connection facilitated the negotiation of bonds and certificates in the market by issuing them in amounts of fixed and standard face values instead of in large amounts which had been the practice for so long.

These securities did not possess any fixed face value, nor were they of denominations suitable for small investors. To cite an extreme case, some of them were even issued at a *lakh* of rupees. These bonds were rarely demanded in the market and, hence, they carried very high discounts. In order to remedy the inconvenience and to encourage the investment habit, the

---

[1] Certificates were made registrable in 1785, and bonds in 1793. *Vide* Calcutta Gazette, 29th December 1785; Bengal Public Consultations, 4th Jan., and 10th May 1793 [MSS.].

4

Government of Bengal, on the recommendation of the Accountant-General, Mr. William Larkins, brought about in 1787 a uniformity in the face values of the securities. Larger securities were replaced by those of smaller amounts; they were further equalised and standarised.[1]

Chronologically viewed, another important reform which came into operation was that protecting the securities from forgery. In 1790 it was arranged to prepare the promissory notes from engraved blocks, and rules were formulated for their issue. Hitherto, the practice had been to issue ordinary printed documents ; frequent cases of forgery brought home to the authorities the need for reform in this direction. These notes had coupons attached, probably for the first time, in order to extend facilities for periodical interest.[2]

About a decade after the above reforms Government securities underwent another important change. Till 1798, the securities were short-dated. Hence, a great part of the surplus capital of the society remained unexploited, which sought long-term investment elsewhere. From that year long-term loans were systematically floated.

As during the eighties and nineties of the eighteenth century Government papers were improved in such a wise as to encourage public investment and stabilise public credit, so also other factors appeared in the Calcutta money market, either of a temporary or permanent character, which played their part in developing the market.

Various attempts were made to introduce genuine banking in order to create demand for surplus capital, foster investment habit, facilitate movement of funds, and widen the influence of money market. As late as 1773, Warren Hastings established a bank known as the General Bank for the Province of Bengal and Behar. Unfortunately, the bank was short-lived, and was closed after working for only twenty months (Feb., 1775).[1] Within a few years another bank, called the Bengal Bank, came into existence, which in course of time received Government patronage.[2] In 1786, one joint-stock bank, bearing the title of the General Bank of India, put in an appearance for the express purpose of helping Government finance. It thus filled a big gap in the Indian money market.[3] With the growth of these banks in the Calcutta money market, competition ensued between them as a result of which, the market rates of interest and discount were reduced. But unfortunately the financial crisis of 1791-93 brought about the ruin of these banks (1791). While the General Bank was in course of liquidation, the public and the Government were contemplating another Central Bank managed by the State.[4] The future of these proposals is not known ; but it is true that they did not materialise.

---

[1] *Vide* Accountant General's Letter to the Governor-General in Council, 14th Jan., 1786 ; Bengal Public Consultations, 3rd Jan., 1787 [MSS.].

[2] *Vide* Calcutta Gazette, 22nd July, 28th July, 9th Sept., and 29th Sept., 1790 ; also Bengal Public Consultations, 9th June, and 30th July, 1790 [MSS.].

The second development in the Calcutta money market was the unification of currency throughout Bengal. As a result of vigorous and systematic attempts by Lord Cornwallis to unify currency, a rule was promulgated in 1793 that the 19th *sun sicca* should be the standard coin throughout Bengal.[5]

Lastly, the evolution of the money market in India was helped to a considerable extent by the establishment of the press in India, the origin of which was contemporaneous with the eighties of the eighteenth century when these financial reforms were on foot. The birth of the Calcutta Gazette (1784), and the decision of the Government to make it—originally a private venture—a vehicle for public notification, added to the importance of these developments in the money market.

---

[1] *Vide* Extracts of the Proceedings of the Council of Revenue held at Fort William, 13th April and 23rd April, 1773 ; Extract General Letter to Bengal, 30th March 1774 [India Office MS. Records, Home Miscellaneous, Vol. 776, pp. 205-83]. Also see P. Banerjea, Banking in the Days of John Company, Calcutta Review, Nov., 1927.

[2] The early history of the Bengal Bank is shrouded in obscurity. It existed and worked towards 1780 and 1781; some of its business notices are to be found in Hickey's Bengal Gazette of those dates. For the posterior history of the bank, see H. Sinha, Early European Banking in India, London, 1927.

[3] For full history of this bank, see H. Sinha, Early European Banking in India, London, 1927.

[4] India Office MS. Records, Home Miscellaneous, Vol. 434, pp. 549-52, 563-81; also see pp. 494-96.

[5] For full history of the monetary reforms in India till 1793, *vide* J. C. Sinha, Economic Annals of Bengal, London, 1927.

At such time and under the influence of these reforms, there seems to have been forming a real market for Government securities, though in a very crude state. For example in Hickey's Bengal Gazette, 1780-82 (so far known to be the earliest paper in Bengal), we do not find any trace of purchase and sale of Government papers, though the Gazette issued regular lists of prices current in other commodities. In the Calcutta Gazette of 1784 and 1785 (the first two years of its issue) we find only a very few instances of advertisement for the sale of Government bonds by the agency houses.[1] It was after the notification of registration that we find the prices of Bengal certificates being frequently quoted in the Gazette.

9. At this stage of the money market and at a time when there was something like marketable papers commanding purchase and sale, the following was the history of the economic condition of the market in Bengal during the last two decades of the eighteenth century.

Beginning from the closing years of Warren Hastings' administration, it is to be found that the effects of the Mysore and Mahratta wars in the south were to diminish the amount of specie in Bengal. Combined with this state of the market, the low state of the treasury and the inability to discharge debt obligations, caused a fall in Government credit. This state of affairs continued for some years during which the papers were at great discount. It is said that in November, 1785, the bonds bore a discount of 24 per cent., and yet few purchasers could be found.[2]

[1] For example, see Calcutta Gazette, 13th Jan., 1785.

[2] Letter from George Smith to Henry Dundus, 25th Nov., 1785 (India Office MS. Records, Home Miscellaneous, Vol. 434, p. 188 *et seq.*).

Macpherson's steps to discharge the debt regularly (the certificate plan),[1] raised the credit to a high level.[2] The plan of transferring Indian debt to England might also have added its credit.[3] In September, 1787, the average rates of the discount on the Company's papers ranged between 1 and 6 per cent., according to the proximity of discharge.[4] Though the famine of 1788 temporarily disturbed credit, it soon recovered from the shock. Towards November, 1789, the bonds were selling at a small premium in the market.[5] "With the Mysore War and the various rumours fostered in the Calcutta money market as to the invincible powers of the enemy, which broke down the regularity in discharge of the debt, the discount on the papers in the Calcutta market rallied to 10 to 12 per cent.[6]

In 1791 a banking crisis developed in Calcutta which, causing a forced sale of the securities, added to the loss of public credit.

The victory of the Mysore War, the influx of wealth brought by it, and the regularity revived in discharging the papers, restored credit. Towards 1793, the Government of Lord Cornwallis made attempts to bring down the rates of interest in conformity with the rise in premiums. 8 per cent. and 6 per cent. promissory notes were issued in Calcutta and Madras in the place of 12 per cent. notes.[7]

---

[1] For the history of the certificate plan see H. H. Wilson's footnote in Mill's History of British India, Vol. V, Bk. VI, Ch. I; and also John Prinsep, Proposal of a Substitute for Funding in Times of War, London, 1797.

[2] John Prinsep, *op. cit.*

[3] In 1785, a plan was promulgated to transfer Indian debt to England.

[4] Calcutta Gazette, 6th Sept. and 20th Sept. 1787.

[5] Letter to the Court of Directors, 2nd April 1789, quoted by Dundas in his Budget speech of 1790; and Letter to the Coourt, 8th Nov., 1789, quoted by Ross in Cornwallis Correspondence, Vol. I, p. 461.

[6] A letter from the chiefs of the agency houses of Calcutta, 12th March, 1792, quoted by H. Sinha, Early European Banking, *op. cit.*, p. 87; and Cornwallis's Letter to Dundus, 7th Feb. 1790, quoted by Ross, Cornwallis Correspondence, 1859, Vol. I. p. 556.

[7] Bengal Pub. Consns., 17th Jan., and 24th May, 1793 [MSS.].

The state of credit and the medium rate of interest continued in this favourable condition till 1796. A few years of prosperity, however, encouraged a "spirit of adventure," "commercial speculation," and "imprudent projects of trade beyond the real capital of the merchants." A very unusual scarcity of specie had become a matter of general complaint and distress. Money could not be borrowed by the public at a rate of 12 per cent., even with the deposit of Government paper.[1] This state of affairs was aggravated by the outstanding flow of specie from Bengal to other parts of India as financial help, and by the increasing remittance of wealth out of the country in investments. In these circumstances Government could not borrow at a lower rate than 12 per cent.[2] Yet public borrowing was necessary. Government borrowing, therefore, at such time aggravated the existing embarrassment of public and mercantile credit. Such embarrassment of credit continued, until in 1798 general depreciation of public securities rose on the average to 20 per cent. on the 6 per cent. papers, and 13 per cent. on the 8 per cent. papers.[3] Hence in 1798, a sinking fund was established in Bengal. At the same time the terms and conditions of the loans were altered to encourage greater credit. The effect of these steps was to improve it.

10. Thus we can observe some trends at this stage of the growth of the money market; firstly with regard to the tendency of the fluctuations of Government credit; and secondly, with respect to the tendency of variations in the rates of interest commanded by the public loans. And these indications, however inconclusive they might have been, were probably the results of the evolution that the market and the marketable papers had undergone.

To begin,—an increasing inclination was to be found in the economic condition of the country to reflect its effects upon the metropolitan money market; and hence, in accordance with the indication of the market, greater attempts were being made by the Government to regulate the rates of interest on its loans. In other words, fluctuations of credit in the market were being looked upon by the administrators as opportunities to be well utilised. Interest on loans were not totally disconnected with the state of the market. With respect to credit, it may be observed that it was still dependent mainly on the belief of the public in the stability of the English. Whenever a serious war broke out with any Indian Chief, public credit in the market was shaken to a great extent. On this great handicap, Warren Hastings observed in 1780 that any notification to invite money might raise alarm in the minds of the public, fostering belief in the danger of the Government, the immediate effect of which apprehension would lead to a concealment of treasure out of the market.[1] This danger in public credit remained till British power was looked upon by the public as firmly consolidated; and it was a very disturbing element to public credit. Firm steps, however, taken by the Government in the direction of discharge and the seriousness in the endeavour to preserve regularity in it, mitigated the alarm in the market and assisted greatly in restoring the state of credit.

---

[1] Minute of Lord Wellesley (Financial), 12th June, 1798.

[2] *Ibid.*

[3] *Ibid.*

Yet it must be admitted that till the end of the 18th century, the market was very crude and what is called public credit was very susceptible. The rates of interest were very high and fluctuated between wide extremes ; a capital had not accumulated with the agricultural and commercial resources of the country ; the Indians had not learnt to place confidence in public securities.[2]

11. With the advent of the nineteent the money market in India pursued its cou nt. The

---

[1] Bengal Secret Consultations, 4th
folios 156 *et seq.*).

[2] *Vide* Henry St. George Tuck
India Company in 1824, London, 1825,

conquests of Lord Wellesley extended British influence over wider areas ; and control over a wider range of commerce and trade brought within the scope of the market greater fields of activities. Further consolidation of powers in the rulers made it possible for still greater financial and monetary reforms to be introduced.

One important development of the money market was the appearance of a strong public bank under Government patronage and established on Government initiative. In 1806, as the first step of a long drawn deliberation from 1798, the Bank of Calcutta opened business as a provisional venture until it received a Government charter in 1908 as the Bank of Bengal, the first presidency bank in India. This bank inaugurated a new epoch in the development of money market in India. Its power of note issue marked the advent of a new system of credit capital.

1805

This bank amply justified its creation by its success in promoting both private and public credit. The Government of Bengal expressed high satisfaction within a year of its existence as affording great accommodation to the public. In its financial despatches to the Court of Directors the advantages derived from the bank were fully borne out.[1]

12. When these developments were in progress the state of public credit in the Calcutta money market was as follows.

From the year 1798, on account of some financial measures undertaken by the Government of Lord Wellesley, and perhaps with added force because of a considerable influx of treasure into Bengal,[2] the market recorded a gradual decline in the rates of discount on Government securities, and public credit was slowly recovering. This enabled Henry St. George Tucker, the Accountant General of Bengal, to conduct some reductions in the rates of interest upon treasury bills.[1] In September 1802, the price of eight per cent. papers reached parity, after which it was on the upgrade and in May 1803 the premium bordered upon 3 per cent. There was then a turn in the other direction ; but till the beginning of 1804, a premium prevailed in the market, after which the papers did not command much above par. Till the middle of 1806 the value of the papers was below the level of parity, but the discount might be taken at 1¾ per cent. on the average. For about a year Government credit showed a tendency to recover, though buoyancy was not very pronounced.

---

[1] Bengal Fi atch to the Court of Directors, 14th July 1807, 12th Feb., 1808, 30th July 1 gal Financial Consultations, 15th Sept. 1822, Nos. 1-4, 31st Dec. 18 so on.

[2] no export of bullion out of Bengal to places out- to Bengal, during 1795-96 to 1798-99, was . however, the import was Rs. 117 lakhs ; nmons Paper, 390 of 1833. igh or low import of bullion when

The following table will show the average price of the 8 per cent. papers issued from 1801.[2]

| Years and months. | Average of buying and selling price. | Ranges of variation. |
|---|---|---|
| | Per cent. | Per cent. |
| 1802 (June to Dec.) ... | Par | Rs. 1-6 disc. to 10 as. prem. |
| 1803 (Jan. to Sept.) ... | Rs. 1-8 prem. | 9 as. prem. to Rs. 2-12 prem. |
| 1804 (Aug. 24th only) ... | Rs. 1-12 prem. | ... |
| 1805 (March to Dec.) ... | Rs. 2-3 disc. | Rs. 1-8 disc. to Rs. 2-12 disc. |
| 1806 (Jan. to Dec.) ... | 8 as. disc. | Rs. 1-6 disc. to par. |
| 1807 (Jan. to April) ... | 6 as. prem. | 2 as. prem. to Rs. 1-6 prem. |

---

trade was not free. It is all the more difficult to make any definite statement as to the effect of the bullion import on a money market like that of India where there was no free flow of capital. How much remained in active circulation in the market and how much went into the interior cannot be analysed.

[1] Kaye, Life of Henry St. George Tucker.

[2] The preceding statements have been made, and the following table has been prepared, from the monthly lists of prices of securities given in the issues of theAsiatic Annual Register, London, 1803, *et seq*. Unfortunately systematic figures of all the months cannot be found; and for 1804, the price current on the 24th August only has been given.

24

1803,

The above picture of the money market during these years conveys a very remarkable solidarity in public credit and testifies to the financial solidarity of the Government of Lord Wellesley under the able guidance of Henry St. George Tucker. At a time when British rule in India was not consolidated and was compelled to face constant outbreaks of belligerency, it could still draw a very large amount from the public and yet maintain its credit in the Calcutta market at an unprecedentedly high state.

Partly due to the establishment of the Government bank and the artificial capital created by its notes, partly due to rehabilitation of finance during the period of peace, and perhaps due also to the greater influx of treasure into Bengal in 1806-07.[1] public credit in the Calcutta market showed increasing signs of recovery from 1807. Throughout the years from 1807 to 1810 credit was on the upgrade till the price of 8 per cent. public securities attained a premium of 4 per cent.[2] Lord Minto, taking advantage of this favourable situation, reduced the interest of the floating debt to 8 per cent.,[3] and of the funded debts at 8 per cent. to 6 per cent.

But reduction by 2 per cent., when the securities commanded a premium of 4 per cent. only, was quite unwarranted. At the same time, for certain financial reasons, some terms of the debt were altered. The "optional clause," by which the creditors (who were mostly European) were given an additional advantage of demanding in England their capital at any time or their interest when due at certain fixed rates of interest, was taken away.[4] These big changes caused a collapse of credit.

---

[1] The annual average import of bullion into Bengal, during the five years 1801-02 to 1805-06, was worth Sa. Rs. 68,94,792, while the import during the single year 1806-07 was valued at Sa. Rs. 1,14,87,544. The corresponding exports were practically *nil.* *Vide* Commons Paper, 390 of 1833.

[2] Based on various Financial Despatches to the Court of Directors; for example, of the following dates: 17th Dec. 1808; 28th Nov. 1809; 13th Jan. 1810 [MSS.].

[3] Minute of Lord Minto, 11th Feb. 1807, as an enclosure to the Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 18th Feb. 1807 [MS.]. In 1811 the interest on the floating debt was further reduced to 6 per cent. *Vide* Financial Consn., 18th Oct. 1811 [MS.]

[4] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 28th May 1810, § 72; and Calcutta Gazette, 26th April 1810.

Sinking fund was first established in 1798, Abolished in 1810, Reestablished, in 1812

The public creditors in England ordered their agents in India to remit the capital of their investments. Hence it occasioned a "hasty sale of large amounts of securities."[1] There was a sudden transition to an "absolute scarcity of money."[2] The market rate of interest rose to 12 per cent. Even in this state of the market, it is strange to note, the new 6 per cent. papers stood at a small discount not exceeding 2 per cent.[3] This optimism did not last long, and in the beginning of 1813 the discount rose to 10 per cent.[4]

The "optional clause" had to be renewed upon certain conditions.[5] The sinking fund was again established[6]—the original sinking fund of 1798 being closed in 1810. There was then a temporary subsidence in the fluctuation of Government securities, and towards the middle of 1813, the discount fell to 4 or 5 per cent.[7] But from subsequent evidence it appears that the rate did not settle then; it rose subsequently.[8]

The chronology of the whole period under review shows that sudden alteration of the terms of the loans from all aspects was unwarranted. The public did not even then view conversion with much confidence. The warlike policy of Lord Wellesley did not affect public credit to nearly the same extent as did the peace-time measures of Lord Minto.

13. The renewal of the Charter of the East India Company in 1813, the final abolition of the Company's monopoly of Indian

---

[1] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 6th Dec. 1811 [MS.]

[2] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 3rd Feb. 1812 [MS.]

[3] *Ibid.*

[4] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 6th Feb. 1813.

[5] Commons Committee, 1832—II, Finance; Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 17th Aug. 1812 [MS.]; Bengal Financial Consultations, 18th Oct. 1811, Nos. 13-15 [MSS.]; Calcutta Gazette, 10th Oct. 1811.

[6] Letter of the Accountant General, 20th Aug., 1812; Bengal Financial Consultations, 29th Aug., 1812, Nos. 16-18; Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 5th Sept., 1812, [MSS.].

[7] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 24th May, 1813 [MS.].

[8] On the 1st May, 1814, the discount was 7½ per cent., and on the days following this rate increased further. *Vide* Enclosure to the Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 10th Sept., 1824 [MS.].

trade, brought about definite economic changes in India. In the annals of Indian money market, the year 1814 marked a big turning point, since, in that year the Act came into operation. Indian trade was opened to the English capitalists. The monopoly was for so long a barrier to the flow of capital into the country. It being abolished, brisk trade with India followed; imports and exports increased; and much foreign capital began to flow into the Indian market. Free intercourse with Great Britain brought into being many other economic factors, the influence of which cannot be overrated. From that period the money market was affected by external commerce as much as by internal trade and—political situation. The history of such a market under the new conditions and their effects upon the state of public credit proved to be very complicated.

To describe the developments of the different organs of the money market in Calcutta, we find the agency houses increased in number. While in 1792 there were only 16 agency houses in Calcutta,[1] in 1815 their number was 23, in 1820 it was 31, and in 1834 the number rose to 50. The rate of progress of the indigenous banks in Calcutta was similar. The development of a market in the metropolis attracted many of them to it. In 1792 there had been only 17 houses of *shroffs and poddars* in Calcutta. Within twenty-five years, their number had doubled (34 in 1815), and within the next five years their numerical strength increased to 42 (1820). Within a decade they added about fourteen to their number making a total of 56 in 1830. Together with these agency houses and shroffs, the insurance companies—which constitute another organ of the money market dealing in credit—grew in Calcutta at a slow but steady rate as compared with the rapid pace at which the former organs progressed. In

---

[1] This and the following statements on the number of agency houses, shroffs, and nsurance offices working in Calcutta, have been compiled from the following sources :—(1) Bengal Kalendar and Almanack, Calcutta, 1792; (2) The Bengal Almanac and Directory, Calcutta, 1815-1824; (3) The Calcutta Annual Register and Directory, Calcutta, 1820-27; and (4) The Calcutta Annual Directory and Quarterly Register, Calcutta, 1829-35.

1792 we find only four companies doing business in Calcutta. The number of such companies working in 1815 was 14. In 1820 it was 15 ; and within a few years it added one more (16 in 1825). The numerical strength of insurance companies was 18 in 1830 ; and in 1834 it had grown to 20. In the sphere of banking, many mercantile banks made their appearance. Between 1814 and 1830, about half a dozen banks were established in Calcutta. From the thirties of the century many joint-stock banks came into the field.[1]

Yet a few more obstacles remained to hinder further growth of the money market. Firstly, restrictions on persons going to India, imposition of limits on their movements, and exactions through licenses for residing in India and holding land in farms. still remained as impediments to trade and free entry of capital [2] In the second place, inland customs charged upon transit of goods from place to place, and a variety of local taxes levied upon traders and manufacturers, checked the progress of industry and hindered the free operation of capital. They stood in the way of economic uniformity and a unified money market. By clogging the beneficial operation of commerce and creating barriers between the different trade centres, these duties created a number of patches of economic units, among which flow of capital was much impeded. This state of affairs continued until the thirties and forties of the last century when the inland customs were finally abolished.[3]

14. Looking to the short-term influence of the free trade, a sudden change can be observed in the very first year. Among

---

[1] *Vide* C. N. Cooke, Banking in India; B. R. Rau, Present Day Banking in India, Calcutta, 1930; *Bankers Magazine*, *London*, Banking in India, Dec. 1846, Feb., 1847, and Banking institutions of British India, March, April, May, 1847, and also Banking in India, June, Aug., 1847.

[2] Much evidence was recorded on this subject before the Commons and Lords Committees of 1830 to 1832. For a comprehensive history of the laws and regulations on this subject and the actual applications of them, see particularly, Commons Committee Report, 1832—I, Public, and the General Appendix V to the same.

[3] For a full history of internal duties in Bengal see C. E. Trevelyan, A Report upon the Inland Customs and Town Duties of the Bengal Presidency; Calcutta, 1834.

the new establishments founded in the Calcutta money market an active and vigorous competition ensued. At the same time the wars of the Supreme Government—causing capital to be expended in unproductive channel—combined with the activities of the mercantile community, resulted in an increased demand for money in the market. This is indicated by the rise in the Bank of Bengal rate of interest which advanced from 8 to 12 per cent.—the maximum limit allowed by law—within a year (Nov. 1814).[1] The progressive activity of trade and the high rate of interest in the market induced many individuals "to realise their securities either for the purpose of engaging in commercial adventures themselves or of obtaining a high rate of interest from those who embarked in such adventures."[2] Hence the discount on the Company's six per cent. securities rose from 7 per cent. to nearly 12 or 13 per cent. in the same year (Dec. 1814).[3]

The importation of bullion into Bengal nearly doubled in the year 1814-15, partly owing to the high rate of interest ruling in the market, but mainly in order to finance the increased brisk trade.[4] Save for a short set-back in the year 1817-18, throughout the period beginning from the time of the new charter to the year 1818-19, the amount of bullion annually imported increased gradually; in the last-mentioned year the import of bullion attained its maximum for many years before or after. Though much of the treasure imported found employment in trade, yet the rate at which the inflow progressed excelled the requirements of trade. This is evidenced by the slower rate of increase of export of merchandise out of Bengal. Hence from March, 1815, money in the market became easy.

---

[1] These and the following statements on the Bank of Bengal rates of interest are based on tables compiled from the various Financial Despatches in manuscripts.

[2] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 15th Oct., 1814, §17[MS.].

[3] These and the following statements on the price of securities are based on tables compiled from the various Financial Despatches in manuscripts.

[4] *Vide infra.*

The Bank of Bengal rate turned downwards, and up till the middle of 1817 it remained at 7 per cent. As a consequence, public credit recorded a very remarkable rate of recovery. By the beginning of 1817 the securities reached parity. The rapidity of this improvement enabled Lord Hastings to raise public funds for his war finance without serious impediment to the recovery of credit.

But the year 1817-18 showed signs of nervousness. The demand for capital in the market increased temporarily. Various causes contributed to this. There was a greater demand for the export trade which was very high in that year. In the next place, the import of bullion showed a certain fall. At the same time a new loan was opened. Three other local reasons of minor importance were adduced by Mr. Sherer, the Accountant General of Bengal, in explanation of the unusual state, into a description of which we need not enter.[1]

Hence, the price of public securities showed a tendency to decline. But this time a fresh operation of the sinking fund, which was again established for this particular purpose, somewhat checked the fall. Though the rate of discount was unsettled throughout the whole of 1817, it did not exceed 4 per cent. In 1818, the discount went up still higher. But in the following year the securities recovered with greater force, for reasons which had effects that lasted for a number of years. To understand those reasons we shall have to go deep into the long period influence of the first few years of free trade.

15. The following table will give a picture of the external commerce of Bengal from the year 1813 :—[2]

---

[1] Bengal Financial Consultation, 19th May 1817, No. 8[MS].

[2] H. H. Wilson, A Review of the External Commerce of Bengal from 1813-14 to 1827-28, Calcutta, 1830.

| | Import of treasure in lakhs of sicca rupees. | Export of treasure in lakhs of sicca rupees. | Balance of import over export. | Total import of treasure and merchandise in lakhs of sa. rupees. | Total export of treasure and merchandise in lakhs of sa. rupees. | Balance of total export over total import. |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1813-14 | 55 | ... | 55 | 2,12 | 5,39 | 3,27 |
| 1814-15 | 1,08 | 2 | 1,06 | 2,61 | 5,61 | 3,00 |
| 1815-16 | 1,82 | ... | 1,82 | 3,44 | 6,66 | 3,22 |
| 1816-17 | 3,82 | 2 | 3,80 | 5,84 | 5,99 | 1,15 |
| 1817-18 | 3,12 | 3 | 3,09 | 6,85 | 7,81 | 96 |
| 1818-19 | 4,65 | 3 | 4,62 | 7,62 | 7,09 | 53 |
| 1819-20 | 3,90 | 64 | 3,26 | 5,65 | 6,95 | 1,30 |
| 1820-21 | 2,21 | 12 | 2,16 | 4,52 | 6,71 | 2,19 |
| 1821-22 | 2,09 | 1,23 | 85 | 4,67 | 7,79 | 3,12 |
| 1822-23 | 1,62 | 52 | 1,10 | 4,30 | 8,71 | 4,41 |
| 1823-24 | 1,27 | 1,22 | 5 | 3,88 | 8,01 | 4,16 |
| 1824-25 | 1,18 | 35 | 83 | 4,04 | 7,75 | 3,71 |
| 1825-26 | 1,45 | 1 | 1,44 | 3,60 | 7,60 | 4,00 |
| 1826-27 | 1,23 | 11 | 1,12 | 3,40 | 6,80 | 3,40 |
| 1827-28 | 1,35 | 44 | 91 | 4,15 | 8,73 | 4,58 |

Looking over the course of the external commerce of Bengal between 1813-14 to 1818-19, as exhibited in the above table, some marked features can be observed, the cumulative effects of which influenced the money market in the years following. In these years, excepting 1818-19, the exports of Bengal on account of the Company and private merchants were gradually on the increase, which portended an active export trade. But throughout this period, the imports into Bengal of merchandise and treasure flowed in greater ratio, so much so, that in the year 1818-19, they attained a maximum nearly four times their value in 1813-14. In that year (1818-19), the imports exceeded the exports—" an occurrence quite unprecedented, it is believed, in the history of the Bengal trade."[1] Of the imports, bullion prevailed in an unusually high degree, the record of the last year (1818-19) being at its highest watermark; but there was very little export of bullion to counterbalance.

This state of affairs was due more to the zeal of the adventurers than to any other economic force. The imports into Bengal were pushed both beyond the demands of the country and beyond its ability to afford adequate returns. Naturally, the money market felt the effects of accumulation which, from 1819, began to be manifest. The Bank of Bengal rate for loans of money came down from 12 per cent. (Feb. 1, 1819) to 6 per cent. (May 15, 1819). The discount on public securities dropped from over 7 per cent. (Jan. 1819) to a negligible rate (4 as. per cent. on the 1st June, 1819).

16. The history of the Indian money market from this time, when peace was restored by Lord Hastings, till the outbreak of the Burmese War, was unusually favourable. Though the state of the market in India offered little to attract precious metal from outside, and hence the importation of treasure continued to decline, and though the total import and export of Bengal were on the wane, yet the accumulated effects of the previous years combined to make money easy. From these and other associated causes as well as the cessation of all heavy public expenditure by the re-establishment of tranquillity in India, money became exceedingly plentiful in Calcutta.

These circumstances caused rates for money to fall. By the middle of 1820, the rate of interest demanded by the Bank of Bengal on its loans of money was reduced to 4 per cent. With minor and temporary variations the Bank of Bengal rates of interest were, on an average, as follows :

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| 1818-19 | 11·5 per cent. | 1821-22 | 4·2 per cent. |
| 1819-20 | 6·2 ,, | 1822-23 | 5·5 ,, |
| 1820-21 | 4·1 ,, | 1823-24 | 3·9 ,, |

---

[1] H. H. Wilson, *op. cit.*

For the greater part of 1824, the rate maintained a constant percentage at 3½, and on some occasions it rallied to 3 per cent. These rates prove an unusually easy price of money.

Looking to the rate of advance in public credit, a phenomenal progress is noticeable. In March, 1820, the 6 per cent. papers were at a premium. In the next year they were selling at a favourable margin of 13½ per cent. (April, 1821)—a rate of premium previously unimaginable in the financial circle. By the end of 1821 the premium attained 20 per cent. and in April 1822, it reached another record by exceeding 22 per cent.

At this time in 1821 and 1822, the terms of the Government securities were further altered. Two kinds of papers, with definite but completely different stipulations, were in the market—the remittable and the non-remittable. The interest and capital of the former were payable, under certain conditions both in England as well as in India; while those of the latter were payable in Bengal only. On account of the high facilities afforded by the former and the favourable terms attached to them, such securities commanded very favourable demand. From 1821 the two kinds of papers showed a tendency to command diverging rates on account of the new change. Gradually the price quotations of the remittable papers ranged very high above the level of the non-remittable papers, excepting on few occasions when one temporarily rallied close to the price level of the other.

Taking advantage of the favourable credit of the public securities, a conversion operation was effected in 1823, when the rates of interest on non-remittable papers were reduced to 5 per cent. The operation gave a temporary shock to their credit, and precipitated a fall of their premium from 14 to about 8½ per cent. (February, 1823). They soon recovered from the shock and hardly three or four months passed before they showed their popularity by maintaining a premium of 16 or 17 per cent. (May and June)—which was certainly abnormal. Until the Burmese War broke out (March, 1824), the non-remittable papers progressed steadily on an average premium of 12 per cent. The history of these papers showed for the first time the success of conversion operation in India without impairing credit to a substantial degree. It also proved the advance and solidarity of public credit in the Indian market, attained after a chequered history of so many years only by the opening of free trade with India.

17. The Burmese War altered the situation in the Indian money market. The low rates of interest prevailing for so many years did not encourage any importation of bullion and was in fact instrumental in causing greater amount of treasure to be withdrawn from India. But more than the external commerce, the market was changed by internal factors occasioned by the war time financial operations. When hostilities with the Burmese commenced, the Supreme Government of Bengal came into the market for public fund—not impelled solely by military financial necessity, but also urged by ordinary financial assistance to provinces subordinate to Bengal, and compelled by an unexpected reduction of revenue due to a failure of rains in Bombay, Delhi, and Central India.[1] Fortunately, the favourable state of the market helped to make the first 4 per cent. loan, opened in September, 1824, yield a very high amount of return. About 76 lakhs of rupees were drawn from the market without producing any distinct effect on it.[2] When, however, more than a crore and a half of rupees was subscribed, the market steadily moved towards an unfavourable state, and the loan had to be closed in 1825 (May), and was replaced by another loan on higher terms.[3] The new 5 per cent. loan was kept open over a long period; between September 1824 and August 1826, Rs. 4,18,35,000 were drawn from the market as cash subscription.[4]

---

[1] Bengal Financial Consultation, 13th August, 1824; and Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 31st December, 1824, §§ 1-6 [MSS.].

[2] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 31st December, 1824, § 14 [MS.].

[3] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 4th August, 1825, § 18 [MS.].

[4] *Ibid.*

The whole of this amount with further additional subscriptions and a still larger amount received on account of revenue, were all withdrawn from the capital market of Bengal. They were spent far away in the fields—" unproductively without bringing in any return," to express the matter in the words of the Accountant General of Bengal—from which there was little hope of any portion of it returning back.

These economic forces had their necessary, though unpleasant, repercussions on the market. It is no wonder, therefore, that from a great abundance of capital there ensued a sudden and unexpected shortage. Interest in the money market moved quickly upwards. The Bank of Bengal rate of interest appreciated from 3½ per cent. (September 1824) to 10 per cent. (March 1826). The charge demanded by the private merchants was considerably higher.[1] The 5 per cent. securities in the market dropped from a premium of 13 or 14 per cent. current towards the close of 1823, to parity by the middle of 1825—a movement which was followed by a further decline below parity.

This sudden transition of affairs tended to impair the foundation of public credit, and " threatened to throw the operations of the mercantile community into most serious embarrassments."[2] As the capital of these firms was employed in " objects of permanent occupation " and not in a floating form, they were vainly seeking for capital in the market. In an application to the Government dated the 22nd May, 1826, through Messrs John Palmer & Co. as an organ, the shroffs of Calcutta lodged a complaint and solicited Government aid. In another petition to the Government of Bengal to come to their rescue, dated the 24th May, 1826, five English mercantile houses observed; " In fact, the money market has been so drained that it is no longer possible to raise large sums upon any terms. All commercial operations are paralysed. Goods known to be in demand are unsaleable for want of cash." [1]

---

[1] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 4th August, 1825 [MS.]. In the paragraph 19 of this despatch it has been stated that the interest demanded by the " respectable houses " was 12 per cent. In a petition to the Government the agency houses of Calcutta alleged that in August, 1826, the interest in the bazar rose from 6 and 7 per cent. to 15 to 18, and sometimes even to 24 per cent.

[2] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 4th August, 1826 [MS.].

On the whole, it appears from what is said above that the state of the market was on the verge of a crisis. In a financial despatch to the Court of Directors the Government of Bengal admitted the fact that the financial operation of the Government, however necessary and unavoidable it might have been, was to a considerable extent responsible for it. It was observed: "........... the large subscriptions to the 5 per cent. loan combined with other circumstances caused a great scarcity of specie in the market and threatened to throw the operations of the mercantile community into the most serious state of embarrassments." [2]

18. The history of the Indian money market in the years that followed, between 1826 and 1833, reveals one of the most severe crises through which the commercial and the banking system of the country had ever passed,—the full swing of the one that set forth from some months back. Many houses, both Indian and European, closed business with liabilities ranging over many millions of pounds sterling. Most of the principal firms like those of John Palmer & Co., Alexander & Co., and Mackintosh & Co., came down during 1830-33, when the crisis passed through the most critical phase.

It is not to be assumed, however, that the Government loan operations were the only cause of the calamity. The loans were only one out of many contributing factors. And indeed as the Government admitted a share of the responsibility, the authorities came forward with beneficial financial aid at regular intervals. Various causes were ascribed to the events that led to the crisis. It is not the aim of this paper to give full description of all the features of the crisis, and to criticise the cause or causes from which it developed; nor is it possible to do so in a short compass. They can be briefly summarised, however, as the influence of the season, sudden change from long drought to violent rains and consequent failure of the indigo crop (1826),[1] the reaction of the crisis in England (1825-26) which affected firms connected with London and which lowered the prices of all articles of export, stagnation of business there and locking up of capital sent to England in goods,[2] the fraudulent business conducted by one of the houses already bankrupt (Messrs. Mercer & Co.),[3] speculation, "overtrading, improvident enterprise, extravagant miscalculation, and excessive expense in living."[4] These were all held to be the immediate cause of the distress. Combination of banking with trade, locking up of banking capital in permanent investments,[5] inelastic issue of Bank of Bengal notes,[6] were all pointed out to be the defects inherent in the system of the money market which indirectly aggravated and added to the calamity.

---

[1] *Ibid*, enclosure.

[2] *Ibid*. Also see the note by the Acting Secretary to the Government of Bengal, dated 9th March, 1827, in the Financial Despatch to the Court, 19th April, 1827, [MS.].

19. The crisis raging in the commercial circle following closely upon the Burmese War, had a favourable repercussion upon Government credit as opposed to the serious depression of mercantile credit.

With the failure of the mercantile firms, demand for capital in the market diminished. At the same time a certain amount of capital was dislodged from investment. The Bank of Bengal rate of interest, therefore, came down from 10 per cent., the height attained in the first quarter of 1826. With temporary fluctuations in its downward trend, in consonance with the influence of seasonal and local conditions, the rate of interest was very low from the middle of 1827. The average rates of interest between 1826 and 1834 were as under :—

---

[1] Note by the Acting Secretary, *op. cit.*

[2] *Ibid.*

[3] *Ibid.*

[4] The Times, 2nd Oct., 1833.

[5] This cause was repeatedly admitted by the merchants in their several petitions to the Government recorded in the Financial Consultations and the Financial Despatches of the contemporary years.

[6] Financial Despatch to the Court of Directors, 11th Jan., 1827 [MS.].

| Years. | Average percentage. | Ranges of variation. |
|---|---|---|
| 1826-27 | 7·4 | 10 to 7 |
| 1827-28 | 5·6 | 8 to 5 |
| 1828-29 | 6·0 | 7 to 5 |
| 1829-30 | 6·0 | 7 to 5 |
| 1830-31 | 5·6 | 6 to 5 |
| 1831-32 | 4·5 | 5 to 4 |
| 1832-33 | 5·0 | 5 only |
| 1833-34 | 4·9 | 5 to 4 |

With these rates for money in the Bank of Bengal, the state of demand for Government securities was also favourable. As a necessary consequence of depression of mercantile confidence, capitalists increased their demands for investments; and they found the Government pa n his note of the 9th March 1827,[1]
to the Government of B
state of panic th
suffered

after the lapse of the first half of 1830, the five per cent. securities preserved a remarkably steady price, though they carried a discount of a few annas. From the close of 1830 the 5 per cent. papers attained parity. Henceforward, their market quotations were very firm; they were always carrying premiums of 3, 4 or 5 per cent. At these times some 4 per cent. loans were experimented upon; one remaining open between July 1828 and April 1831, and the other between June 1831 and October 1835. The former was not looked upon with favour, while the latter preserved a firm tone, the discount being always of a few annas only.

20. Taking a comprehensive view of the gradual development of the Calcutta money market, we find that it owed its birth solely to the English. Its development was concomitant with the increasing importance of Calcutta as the centre of administrative capital of the British in India. Its progress was parallel to the spread and consolidation of the British supremacy over increasingly wider range.

The influence of the English administration on the growth of
the Calcutta rket, was not merely a passive one. It
was, or the ell designed. The rulers sucked
the tected it from all attacks.
banks. their patronage
nd other financial
ing were all

such as were witnessed by the late 18th century—movements which often destroyed the confidence of the investors at a time when confidence was in its early formative stages, very sensitive and vulnerable. As a contrast to such a course of credit current in the previous century, the ups and downs of credit in the new century were slow and gradual. While pessimism was the general state of investment psychology in the former period, there were many signs of optimism in the latter. And during the critical days since the Burmese War, when the market was in its acid test, Government credit proved its conspicuous solidarity.

The annals of the rates of interest at which the public funds attracted capital also tell a similar tale. The rates of money came down from its margin of statutory limit (12 per cent.) to the level of 3 or 4 per cent.—rates which were on a par with those prevalent in any other markets of the world.

To conclude, the Calcutta money market had passed the first phase of its life, its childhood, and was stepping into its manhood, full of life and vigour. An unprecedented economic chasm separated its new life from the previous. The experience thus acquired imparted valuable assistance in its reorganisation hereafter.

P. DATTA

# KARMA

That night when first I met you. .
Karma, remember the thrill ?
When I swore that I'd never forget you
'Neath the tree on that silent hill ;
The air was all heavy with gold from the moon,
The breeze bore the fragments of some happy tune,
O Karma, the thrill of that night...do you miss
The touch of my hands—the warmth of my kiss?

The days are, oh ! so dreary
Now that we are apart,
Nothing is there to cheer me
But the sound of your voice in my heart ;
Ah ! when I meet you Dear, after a while
There'll not be a tear in your eye—but a smile !
Only the press of my lips in your hair,
But just for that only—what would I dare ?

That night when first I met you...
Karma, my heart is in pain,
At no time do I forget you
Longing to see you again !
But at last when we meet again ! never to part,
The joy of that hour will erase years' smart,
I will be thankful, and still keep in view
The night when Love guided my footsteps to you !

LELAND J. BERRY

## NEW COTTON GOODS TARIFF

Indian cotton mill industry has received further protection in order to save it from Japanese competition which became a serious menace because of the depreciation of Japanese yen. This fresh protection is given as a result of the recommendations of the Tariff Board to which the question of investigation into the grant of additional protection was referred by the Government in response to an application received by them from the Indian cotton textile industry.

The terms of reference of the Tariff Board were:

'To report whether cotton piece goods, not of British manufacture, are being imported into British India at such a price as is likely to render ineffective the protection intended to be afforded by the duty imposed on such articles under Part VII of the second Schedule of the Indian Tariff Act of 1894, by the Cotton Textile Industry Protection Act of 1930 to similar articles manufactured in India and if so, to consider—

(*a*) to what extent the duty on cotton piece goods, not of British manufacture, should be increased and whether in respect of all cotton piece goods not of British manufacture or in respect of cotton piece goods, plain grey only, or of cotton piece goods others only;

(*b*) whether the duty should be increased generally or in respect of such articles when imported from or manufactured in any country or countries specified, and

(*c*) for what period any additional protection found to be required should be given, and to make recommendations.'

### *Effect of Exchange Depreciation.*

The Report of the Tariff Board maintains that improved methods of manufacture and reduction in costs are somewhat responsible for the fall in prices. This question required detailed enquiry and, therefore, it was considered expedient, having in view the terms of reference, to restrict the enquiry to fall in prices caused by exchange depreciation and its effect upon Indian piece goods. The Report after dealing with Japanese currency has pointed out that its depreciation is caused by world-wide economic depreciation. Its effects on Japanese industries both at home and abroad and the suspension of gold standard by Britain are also discussed.

The Board has found that the only country, of those which send cotton piece goods to India, whose currency has depreciated in relation to Indian currency, is Japan and after tracing the course of the rupee-yen exchange and of the prices of imported goods into India from Japan, it has come to the conclusion that the main cause of the fall in prices of these goods has been the depreciation of the yen in relation to the rupee. This is proved, as the Board says, by two facts. Firstly, since June last, there has been a distinct upward movement in the price of cotton owing to large purchases of raw cotton by Japan. Secondly, the extent to which the precipitate fall in the value of the yen has assisted the imports of cotton piece-goods into India is proved by the large increase in the volume of such imports from Japan which took place in June last. These imports represented contracts made since February last when the fall in the value of the yen below the parity began. The Board obtained figures from the Calcutta Customs House and from the leading importers at Calcutta which indicated a further considerable drop in the quotations of forward prices for Japanese cotton piece goods.

The Board came to the conclusion that the position of the Bombay mill industry in 1931 appeared to show a marked improvement over the previous year, although the earnings were still insufficient to cover the depreciation. If, therefore, the fall in import prices caused by the exchange depreciation was allowed to continue, there was likely to be a serious set-back from such improvement as was shown by the figures of 1931. According to the report an indication of this was supplied by the fact that the number of spindles idle in Bombay at the end of June showed an increase of 15% as compared with February last and that while the number of spindles working double shift was 17% and looms 20% of the total in February, the corresponding figures for June were 7·8% and 8·6% respectively.

### *Serious Injury.*

In arriving at its conclusions the Board gave careful consideration to the various representations made on behalf of the Japanese cotton dealers and producers and made it clear that 'though the effect of a depreciated exchange upon the prices of exported goods is always of a temporary nature it is capable, while it lasts, of inflicting serious injury on a manufacturing industry in the importing country.'

The Report explains that to establish a case justifying the use of the powers conferred on the Governor-General in Council by Section 3 (5) of the Tariff Act, it is not necessary to show that goods are being imported at prices lower than the cost of production or than the internal sale prices in the exporting country, but only that the current prices of imported goods are lower than those on which the scheme of protection for the local protected industry had been based.

The Board took into consideration the fact that the object of the Cotton Industry (Protection) Act of 1930 was not to give substantive protection to the industry, but only to preserve it until the question of substantive protection had been considered and decided. This question is now being investigated by the Tariff Board.

### *Board's Recommendation.*

Alteration of the Tariff is not regarded by the Board as the best means of helping the industry. The Report observes, 'We desire to point out that alterations of rates of customs duties does not appear to us to be the most suitable form in which assistance may be given to an industry against the temporary and variable handicap involved in the depreciation of exchange. The general dislocation of the market entailed by a change in the rate of duty should, we think, be avoided unless it is clear that no other remedy is possible. Its consequences will be disproportionate to the duration of the evil and it is too inelastic to be adopted to the frequent variations to which the exchange rates are liable in the present case......, it appears to be particularly desirable that the additional assistance required should be provided, if possible, by other means than an alteration of Tariff rates.'

In response to the above view, the Board had suggested that the Tariff values of piecegoods imported from Japan should, for customs purposes, be estimated from time to time at the current landed cost multiplied by certain figures. They provided only for two rates of variations since frequent variations are always undesirable They further said that when once a particular figure was adopted, it should not be altered at least for a period of three months and no new figure should be adopted until the corresponding rate of exchange had been in force for at least four weeks. The rate of exchange was to be the bank's selling rate.

Failing the acceptance of this scheme the Board proposed that the necessary additional assistance should be provided by raising the *ad valorem* duty on cotton piecegoods from 20% to 50% and that the increased rate of duty should be in force till March 31, 1933. In making this recommendation the Board stated that the need for additional protection arose owing to the depreciation of the Yen. If, therefore, the Indo-

Japanese Commercial Convention of 1904 was held to be a bar to any increase in duty on Japanese goods alone, the Board recommended that the proposed increase should apply to all cotton piecegoods, not of British manufacture.

The Board considered that this proposal was not likely to involve any very serious addition to the burden of consumers because the quantity of goods imported from countries other than the United Kingdom or Japan never reached 5% of the total imports during the last three years.

It should be noted that the Board made no recommendation in regard to the minimum specific duty on plain grey cotton piecegoods in the belief that Sec. 3 (5) of the Tariff Act conferred no power upon the Government to alter that duty because it was not higher upon articles, not of British manufacture than upon articles of British manufacture.

### *Government's Decision.*

The Government have decided to impose the higher duty on all imported cotton piecegoods not of British manufacture in view of the fact that the Indo-Japanese Commercial Convention of 1904 does not admit of the imposition in any circumstances of a higher duty upon Japanese goods alone.

Minimum specific duty on plain grey cotton piecegoods has also been raised. According to the Government view, they have power to alter this element equally with the *ad valorem* rate in the duty with which the plain grey cotton piecegoods are chargeable for the two elements in the duty are not separable and the rate of duty as a whole applicable to all articles, not of British manufacture, is higher than the rate applicable to similar articles of British manufacture.

In view of the findings of the Board and in view of the fact that the plain grey class of piecegoods is of great importance to the Indian cotton textile industry, the Government rightly considered that any measure of protection which excluded from its scope this class of goods would fail in its object. Therefore, they decided to increase the duty on plain grey goods also not of British manufacture to 5¼ annas per pound or 50% whichever is higher from 3½ annas per pound or 20% *ad valorem* which was the rate of duty prior to the coming into force of the new duty. On other goods not of British manufacture the duty is raised from 20% *ad valorem* to 50% *ad valorem*. The additional duty has been exempted from surcharge.

### *Government's Prompt Action.*

The Government took as prompt an action as could be possible under the circumstances to save the cotton textile industry from Japanese competition. The powers of the Government were strictly circumscribed and action could be taken in the case of only a few articles. This state of affairs should be soon rectified in the light of the lengthy statement which has been submitted by the Bombay Mill Owners' Association to the Government providing for legislation on the lines of the safeguarding Acts in various countries. If the Government had withheld the relief recommended by the Tariff Board they would have proved themselves incapable of protecting national interests. The increase in the *ad valorem* and specific duty affords a fair measure of protection to the industry.

### *Views of Indian Business Community.*

The cotton interests in India, however, think that the measure of protection accorded is inadequate. They are generally of the opinion that the best course for the Government of India would have been to increase the duty on foreign piece goods by assessing the customs duty on the value of all piece goods imported at the rate of exchange current between the exporting country and India in September, 1931, soon after England went off the gold standard. According to them it would have effectively counteracted all advantages that the foreign producer has on account of the depreciated and manipulated exchange of his country and thus 'effectively protected the Indian industry against any peaceful penetration of foreign goods here.' The Delhi Peace Goods Association are of the opinion that the present decision of the Government of India can neither afford protection to the Indian textile industry nor to the piece goods trade of the country. This is a sweeping and scathing statement. It cannot be conceived that the decision of the Government will not help the cotton industry in any way. The fact of the matter is that it will help the industry a good deal. It has to be admitted that Japan has other advantages besides the advantage of a depreciating exchange. Depreciating foreign exchanges can never do good permanently to the industries of any country and the injury to the importing country also is only temporary. Japan has got superior arrangements for purchasing raw materials and for selling her goods. She has also got more efficient labour power and these advantages cannot be called unfair advantages. Indian cotton industry, it must be admitted, has defects of organization. Rationalization has not progressed to the extent that it should and the control of the managing agents imposes a great handicap upon the industry in India and the high commission charges of the managing agents even when there have been no gross profits are additional causes of the depression in the industry specially in the Bombay Presidency. These disadvantages in organization or defects in management have been clearly brought out in the lengthy statement of the Bombay Shareholders submitted by them before the Tariff Board while supporting the case of the industry for protection. Till the Indian mill-owners put their own house in order, no scheme of protection, however high it may be, or other artificial props, will be of any permanent avail. Protection always creates vested interests which are seldom satisfied and a cry is made for further protection. It is also the duty of the state to see to the interests of the consumers. The dissatisfaction of mill-owners, therefore, only proves the necessity of some check to higher and higher demand for protection. It has also to be remembered that the present measure is only a temporary one and the Tariff Board is investigating already into the question of substantive protection.

### *Preference to British Goods.*

It is, however, just possible that the scheme might give a very great advantage to Great Britain in the Indian market and the Indian cotton mill industry may be jeopardised by British Competition. It is true that Britain sends finer cotton goods to India, while Japan and other countries send coarser goods wherein India finds direct competition. But India is beginning experiments in the production of finer goods where the competition remains as before. Just possible, the rise in the price of coarser goods may stimulate the demand for finer goods in which case the advantage will largely accrue to Britain for the scheme involves Imperial Preference to a large extent in favour of Britain. Further, it is possible that the rise in the price of imported non-British goods as a result of fresh protection may pass on the advantage to British manufacturers to a large extent. If this happens—and this will depend upon the extent of preference—the Indian consumer will suffer the burden of protection and preference without the ultimate advantage of lower prices which can be brought about by the development of the home industry. If this is the fear of Indian cotton interests, probably it is not unjustifiable; but as far as the measure of protection against Japanese goods is concerned, it is not insignificant although it may not be high enough to secure fat profits for mill-owners. Given improvements in organization, the measure should secure adequate protection against Japanese goods. If the protection newly accorded against Japanese goods coupled with the overwhelming sentiment of Indians for purchasing Indian goods does not prove an adequate help to the industry, then there is something inherently wrong with the organization of the industry.

Of course, the grant of additional protection against the countries which are on a gold basis is unjustifiable because with a fall in imports from them, our exports also to them will fall *pro tanto* and this is bound to affect India's trade adversely. Though the imports from them do not exceed 5% of the total imports of cotton goods into India, it will be wrong to determine the extent of loss to India merely by the amount of imports. A fall in imports will mean a fall in exports also because imports are paid for by exports and the loss of trade will be very considerably more than appears at first sight. Indians can naturally read into this action of the Government the latter's keenness for safeguarding the Indian market for British cotton goods.

KRISHNAKUMAR SARMA

## QUESTION

Oh guide, guide, oh friend
To this my journey's end,
I doubt, I doubt, what path is right.
I think I see my home
But blinds my eye doubt-foam
I float in air a stringless kite.

## ANSWER

Oh look, oh look within
Be deaf to outward din
Of crafty men who claim sage-might
There's thy home of joy
That nothing can ever alloy
And ever dwell in peace, truth-bright.

Mohini Mohan Chatterji

# THE SERVICES OF THE MUSLIMS TO THE SANSKRIT LITERATURE

"Gottes ist der Orient!
Gottes ist der Occident!
Nord und Südliches Gelände,
Ruht in Frideden seiner Hände."

To the Muslims, knowledge had been like a lost property. They tried to take possession of it wherever they found it. To them it was a manifestation of God whom they should serve even at the expense of their lives. Orient and Occident, Greece and India, made no difference to them in this respect. Just as Greek learning had been patronised, preserved and re-introduced by them to modern Europe, so was the Sanskrit literature translated by them into Arabic and Persian languages and was introduced by them to the early European Orientalists.

But the Muslims, at first, had to face various almost unsurmountable difficulties in acquiring the Indian Sciences. Abú Maʿshar, a Muslim savant (d. 885) writing about a century after they had begun their study of them, has explained some of these difficulties in a passage which has been quoted by Ibnul-Qifti. He says, "The kings of India were known as philosopher kings because of their great interest in the science." "The Indians," he adds, "were considered, by all the nations of the world, as custodians of knowledge and as the very source of justice and righteousness. But India being far away from us, very few of the works of the Indians reached us. We therefore received little of their sciences and learnt of few of their savants." [1]

The first Arabic translation of a Sanskrit book, the Fables of Bidpai, was therefore rendered on the basis of its Pahlawi version, about the middle of the 8th century.[1] Soon after it was established cultural contact between India and Baghdad, the centre of Islamic learning. The second Abbaside Caliph, al-Manṣúr received embassies from India. Among them there were some Indian Pandits. Some of them presented to al-Manṣúr some important Indian astronomical works (the Brahma Siddhanta, and the Khandakhadyaka) and helped the Muslims in tanslating them into Arabic language.[2] During the reign of al-Rashìd and al-Mámún, many Indian scholars went to Baghdad where they attained high position and also translated many Sanskrit works of which a fairly long list might be made from the Fihrist,[3] the Táríkhul-Ḥukamá,[4] and the Ṭabaqát-l-Aṭibbá.[5] During the period, it is said, Muslim students visited India where they studied Astronomy and Medicine. Of such students, Abul Manṣúr al-Muwaffaq was the last to visit India before al-Bírúní.[6]

---

[1] Tarikhu'l-Ḥukamá, pp. 265-266.

But the cultural contact which was thus established between India and Baghdad could not result in any lasting influence of the culture of the one on that of the other. The Indian scholars living at Baghdad were very few. The Muslim students who might have visited India during this period, were fewer still. Even these few scholars and students failed to master each other's language. This is why most of the translations of the Sanskrit works into Arabic, during this period, were rendered through the medium of Persian language, and not directly from Sanskrit, as the case was with the Greco-Arabic translations of the same period. And even such translations of the Sanskrit works did not embrace all the branches of the vast Sanskrit literature. They were limited to the works on Medicine, Mathematics, Music and stories and fables. The philosophical works of the Indians were left almost untouched. These translations also could not have been so faithful and accurate as the Greco-Arabic translations were. This is apparent from the criticisms of these works by al-Biruni.

---

[1] Al-Fihrist, p. 118.

[2] Tarikhu'l-Hukama, p. 270; Indika, Vol. I. Intr. p. xxxi; *ibid*, Chap. 1.

[3] Pp. 270-271; 305, etc. [4] Pp. 266-267.

[5] Vol. II., pp. 32-34.

[6] Indika, Intr. pp. xxxi-ii.

All these obstacles in the path of the progress of Indo-Islamic literature, were swept away by the repeated invasion of India by Sultan Mahmud, and by the establishment of an independent Muslim power in this country. In the horrors of these wars were hidden the elements of the Indo-Islamic literature and culture which combined the vivacity and intense activity created by Islam and the lofty vivid imagination and intense deep thought which is natural to the Indian.

The invasions of Mahmud marked a new era in the history of Indo-Islamic literature. With these invasions is associated the name of the greatest Muslim scholar in this field, *i.e.*, Abu-Rayhan Muhammad b. Ahmad al-Biruni. Coming with Mahmud to India, he spent a good deal of his life in this country where, after meeting with many difficulties, he made friends with numerous Indian scholars, studied with them their language and literature, observed minutely their customs, manners and religious observances, discussed with them their beliefs and principles, and being thus well-equipped, he wrote his epoch-making book, the Kitábul-Hínd, the first comprehensive critical authoritative book dealing with the various aspects of the Indian life and literature. Over and above the Kitabul-Hind, he wrote many books and treatises on subjects connected with the Indian sciences and literature and translated many books from Sanskrit into Arabic or Persian. Not less than twenty such works are mentioned in his own list of his works, which has been published by Prof. Sachau as a part of the introduction to Al-Atharul-Baqiya. Even this list does not seem to be quite complete. Ḥájí Khalífa has attributed to him many books which are not included in it. This may be a mistake of Ḥájì Khalífa himself. But the recently discovered manuscript of the translation of Bacchiya Nand's book, by al-Biruni is a sure proof of the fact that either al-Bírúní's list of his works is incomplete or that he wrote some books after he had prepared the above-mentioned list. The credit of the discovery of the above manuscript, is due to Maulavi Abu Muzaffar of the Mahaviddialay of Allahabad.

Al-Biruni, by his critical study and indefatigable industry, advanced a great deal the high and noble task which was begun by b. Muquffaʿ and Muḥammad b. Ibráhim al-Fazárí. But no single individual could make the vast and varied literature of India available for the Muslim world. In order to do this, long continuous laborious work was indispensable and also state-patronage was necessary. This was supplied by the establishment of a Muslim power in India.

Certain essential features of the Muslim kingdom in India, influenced a great deal the growth of Indo-Islamic literature and culture. The Muslim power was established in India at a time when the Arabs had lost their supremacy in the Islamic world, when the Muslims had lost a good deal of their original true Islamic spirit, and worldly gain guided their actions more often than the Truth which had been their only guide during the early Islamic era. The influence of Islamic and Indian literature and culture on each other, therefore, could not be so thorough and deep as it had been in the case of Persia and other countries; the growth of Indo-Islamic literature had not been so rapid as the growth of Greco-Islamic literature, and Persian took the place of the Arabic language for translation of the Sanskrit works.

Most of the Muslim rulers of India, however, had been patrons of learning. Ghayasul-Din and Nasirul-Din Balban had great regard for the learned men. Firoz Shah, on conquering Nagarkot, took possession of the thirteen hundred Sanskrit books which were preserved in the library of its temple and with the help of the local Pandits got some of them translated into Persian. Some of these very translations were used by the poet Izzul-Din Khalid in his long poem known as Dalail-i-Firuz-Shahi, in which were described the physical sciences of the Indians.[1] The kings of the Lodi dynasty did not take much interest in the Sanskrit literature. Still, it was their reign that paved the way for the highest development of Indo-Islamic literature and culture which was attained during the reign of Akbar and his successors. It was during the reign of the Lodi kings that the teachings of Kabir Das and Guru Nanak and the poems of Khusraw and of Malik Muhammad of Jais remarkably manifested the influence of Islam and of Hinduism on each other.

---

[1] Maathiru'l-Umara, Vol. 2, p. 190.

Of the Moghal kings, the first two, had been too busy with wars, conquests, and re-conquests, to turn their attention to any serious literary task. The third of them made amends for the negligence of his predecessors. This was Akbar. He played the same part in the development of Indo-Islamic literature in India as al-Rashid and al-Mamun had played in the development of Greco-Islamic literature in Baghdad. His love for Hindu literature knew no bounds. His interest in the Hindu system of thought was profound, his appreciation for the Hindu art was extremely liberal. In one day, he bestowed a reward of two hundred thousand rupees on Tansen the musician.[1] He made the Pandits sit near him and tell him their legendary tales. He granted special private interviews to the Yogis and discussed with them the transcendental realities;[2] at times he also called on them.

Apart from his great personal interest, Akbar had realised that for a contented peaceful rule in India it was necessary to create an undying spirit of toleration between the Hindus and the Muslims, which, he thought, could not be done without their study of the literature of each other. Abul-Faḍl, in his introduction to the translation of the Mahabharata, has expressed this idea of Akbar. He says :—

"Having known that the hatred between the Hindus and the Muhammadans was excessive and that their abuse and revile of each other had gone up to the very limit, and being convinced that it was mainly due to their mutual ignorance of each other's literature, this far-sighted monarch decided that some of the authoritative works of each of the two communities should be translated into the language of the other so that each of the two communities instead of hating and reviling the other might try to learn the truth and might know the beauties as well as the blemishes of the other and each of them might try to better their own affairs.[1]

---

[1] Maathiru'l-Umara, Vol. 2; Muntakhabu'l-Tawarikh, Vol. 2.

[2] Munlakhabu'l-Tawarikh, Vol. 2, pp. 257, 324-25.

Akbar being led by his personal inclination as well as political consideration, made up his mind to make the important Sanskrit works available for the Muslims, created a translation department, which was housed in the Diwankhana at Fatahpuri, and chose the Mahabharata as the first Indian work to be translated into Persian.[2] He appointed several Pandits as interpreters of the great epic, and Naqib Khan as its translator, and the work proceeded for three days. Then al-Badayuni the historian was ordered to join Naqib Khan as translator. One-eighth of the gigantic work was translated into Persian in four months' time. Then it was divided into two parts: one part was to be translated by Naqib Khan in conjunction with Haji Muhammad Sultan and the other by Mulla Sheri. Mulla Faydi was appointed as supervisor of the whole work. When one-third of the huge work was finished Haji Muhammad Sultan was ordered to do the work, and to revise the whole of the translation. Thus was finished the Persian translation of the great epic of the Hindus and it was named Razm Nameh. It was then copied, illustrated and published.[3]

So great was the interest of Akbar in this work that he personally took part in the explanation of the text to the translators, and at the end, he ordered each of his courtiers to make a copy of at least a part of it.[4]

[1] Buhar Library Manuscript, f 6-b.

[2] Muntakhabu'l-Tawarikh, Vol. 2, pp. 319-21, 344.

[3] *Ibid.*

[4] *Ibid.*

Thus, under the supreme guidance of the genius of the great emperor and the strict supervision of the great scholars of his court, with the help of the learned Pandits of the time, were translated from Sanskrit into Persian, by competent scholars like Abul-Faḍl, Fayḍi, Naquib Khan, Haji Muhammad Sultan, Mulla Ibrahim, and Mulla Abdul-puadir Badayuni: the Mahabharata, the Ramayana, the Bhagwatgita, the Atharva-veda, the Yogavashishta, the Maheshmahananda, the Harivamsa, the story of the Animals and many other works of the Hindus.

After the reign of Akbar, the mastery of the Persian language by the Hindus made the task of translation comparatively easy. The double process of interpretation and translation was no more needed. The Hindus who combined a thorough knowledge of Sanskrit with that of Persian language revised the old translations and also made new ones. Girdhar Das translated the Ramayana afresh, in 1626 A.D.[1] Debi Das Kaith also claims to have translated it, independently, about the end of the 16th century;[2] a Hindu friend of Dara Shikoh made a fresh translation of the Jogavashishta.

No Persian version of the Vedas, however, was generally available before the middle of the 17th century. The Persian translation of the Atharvaveda, rendered under Akbar, was so bad that it was entirely forgotten just after it was completed. It was the Sufi prince Dara Shikoh, who had initiated the Persian translation of many Sanskrit works, that took up this great task also. He collected the Pandits of Benares and with their help translated the Vedas into Persian and completed the work in 1657. The translation of the Sanskrit books into Persian was however continued till the 19th century.

---

[1] Rens., Catalague of Persian Manuscripts in the British Museum, Vol. I, p. 54.

[2] *Ibid*, p. 56.

Ahlwardt's Catalogue of Staat-Bebliothek, Berlin.

Simultaneously with translation of the Sanskrit works into Persian, the process of assimilation of the Hindu ideas in Islamic literature also continued. The Naldaman of Fayḍi, the story of Ram and Sita by Masih Beg, the Miratul-Makhluqut of Abul-Rahman Chishti, the Tuhfatul-Hind of Mirza Fakhrul Din are only a few of the works of this type.

Of these books the Tuhfatul-Hind was written during the reign of Alamgir, for the use of his grandson, prince Jahandar Shah, at the instance of his tutor Kukaltash Khan. It deals exclusively with Hindu culture. It is divided into seven parts :—

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| *a.* | Preface, | on the | Hindu script. |
| *b.* | Chap. 1 | ,, | Prosody. |
| *c.* | Chap. 2 | ,, | Rhyme. |
| *d.* | Chap. 3 | ,, | Figures of Speech. |
| *e.* | Chap. 4 | ,, | Theory of Love. |
| *f.* | Chap. 5 | ,, | Hindu System of Music. |
| *g.* | Chap. 6 | ,, | Theory of Sexual Pleasure. |
| *h.* | Chap. 7 | ,, | Theory of Physiognomy. |

The above description of the composition of the Tuhfatul-Hind and of its contents throws tremendous light on the attitude of the Muslim rulers of this country towards its culture. Alamgir who is said to have been the most intolerant Muslim ruler of India at least tolerated that his young grandson might learn some of the Indian Sciences, and for this purpose was composed a book at the request of the tutor of the young prince.

It is this general interest of the Muslim royalties of India since the time of Akbar that can best explain the profound sympathy, admiration and love of Dara Shikoh for the culture of India in general and for Indian philosophy and mysticism in particular. The part taken by him in connection with the translation of the Upanishads into Persian which is known as Sirr-i-Akbar and the revision of many translations which were translated from Sanskrit into Persian before him and the composition of the Majmaul-Bahrayn which has been edited by an able and clever scholar, Mr. Mahfuzal-Haq, and in which the author has tried to reconcile the main teachings of Islam with those of the original pure Hinduism, all show the great love of Dara for the culture and learning of India and the tendency of the Muslim rulers of India towards the Hindu thought. Of course there were some Muslim scholars in the courts of some of the Muslim rulers of this country, who had a dislike for its culture. Abdul-Qadir, the author of the Muntakhabul-Tawarikh in which he indulges in objectionable remarks against the Hindus and their literature, is an outstanding example of this class of the narrow-minded Maulavies. But certainly among the Muslim divines also there were some that were not only sympathetic towards the general culture of this country, but were also free from prejudice against the religious practices of the Hindus and faced the wrath of the rulers in defending them. It is said that Sikandar, the son of Bahlol of the Lodi Dynasty, hearing of the religious respect which the Hindus had for a tank at Thaneswar, inquired from the Muslim divines the injunction of Islam about it. "It is not permissible to demolish an old temple. It is not incumbent upon you to forbid bathing in the tank, which is in practice since old days," was the reply. The prince putting his fingers on the dagger, turned towards the Maulavi and said, "You are taking side with the unbelievers." "I am telling you the injunction of the Koran; I have no fear in speaking the truth," replied the fearless Maulavi, and the prince was satisfied.[1]

These Arabic and Persian translations of the Sanskrit works in addition to being a source of information for the Muslims with regard to Indian Sciences, created a taste for them among the early modern European orientalists. Their knowledge of appreciation of the beauties of the Sanskrit literature began with the study of these translations or with their rendering in a European language. The early translation of the Kalila and

---

[1] Maathir-i-Rahimi, Part I, p. 475.

Dimna into Hebrew, Syriac, Greek, Latin, Spanish, Italian, Slavonic, Turkish, German, English, Danish, Dutch and French languages, were based on its Arabic rendering by Ibnul-Marquffa. Of its original Sanskrit no notice had been taken by the European scholars before the end of the 18th century. As a matter of fact almost all the Indian fables and tales which found place in the European literature before the last century had passed through their Arabic or Persian translations as suggested by Prof. Horowitz in his masterly article on the Influence of the Arabic Literature on the European Belles Lettres, published in one of the early issues of the *Islamic Culture.*[1]

The first appreciation of Indian philosophy by a great European philosopher, also, was based on the study of the Latin rendering of one of these translations of the Sanskrit works. Schopenhauer who remarked that " In the whole world there is no study so beneficial and so elevating as that of the Upanishads " had studied neither their Sanskrit original nor their translation based on their original text, but the Latin rendering, by Auquetil Du Perron, of the Persian translation of the Upanishads, with which is associated the name of Dara Shikoh, the brother of Alamgir. The knowledge of Indian Sciences which had reached Europe about the time of the invasion of Alexander the Great, had been buried in oblivion and forgotten. It would be difficult to find any reference to it in the medieval European literature.

The Arabic literature, as is well known, played a very important part in the renaissance of Greek learning in Europe. In reviving the critical study of the vast and varied Sanskrit literature in Europe also, the Arabic and Persian literature did not play a less important rôle. In fact the Muslims, through their Arabic and Persian literature, had introduced to Europe the wisdom of the world so far as it had been available to themselves.

---

[1] Brownes Lit. His. Pors., Vol. 2, p. 350.

In doing this they had done only their duty by following the precept of their Master, the Prophet of Islam, who had declared that a Muslim profiteth by three things : by an honest pious son who might pray for him, by knowledge spread by him, and by making gifts the benefit of which might last long.

M. Z. SIDDIQI

# PALMIERI'S SONG

*(From the Operettā "Gloria Romano")*

Whilst there is good wine for the drinking,
Whilst there is a laugh for a quip
Whilst there is a song worth the singing
Or some happy measure to skip,
You should never court worry or sorrow,
You should never know anguish or care,
Drink deep of life's joy every morrow,
Only then can your life grow more fair!

Whilst there is a lass worth the wooing
Who'll give you a smile for reward,
Whilst there is a deed worth the doing
And honour to uphold with the sword ;
Good fellows and friends will be toasting,
Pledging each cup to their love,
Caring for naught what may befall their wild boasting
Long life to sword-cup and glove!

LELAND J. BERRY

# THE RELIGION OF MAN

The ' Kamala Lectures ' of the current year is expected to be a remarkable event in the history of the Calcutta University. The greatest poet-philosopher of the world has accepted the Chair, and has chosen, with the approval of the Senate, the subject which constitutes the essence of life. The *aptas* of ancient India who built up the Sanatan dharma were poet-philosophers. Time works slowly and steadily, and what was at one time considered to be the everlasting religion of mankind has lost its cash value, and Humanity is anxiously waiting for a new religion.

Religion binds men together. It teaches men that they live in a universe, and not in a multiverse, that they have come from the same source and that they will be absorbed in the same sea, while the sea and the source are one and the same. Common experience shows that the Ganges rises in the Himalayas and falls into the Bay of Bengal. But science teaches us that the mountain is only a temporary resting place for the water which rises from the sea in the form of vapour and afterwards runs back in the form of a stream into the sea itself. Glaciers are places of short-term imprisonment for the running waters of the world. This world is like a jail where men live in thraldom for a while. They are free spirits with a glorious past and a better future. ' The Religion of Man ' teaches us that all men form one personality actually and not merely potentially.

## 2

All the existing religions of the world have an ancient origin. Buddhism is more than 2,500 years old. Christianity counts a little less than 2,000 years. Islam, the latest, has experienced 1,300 years of life. I do not venture to give the age of Hinduism for good reason. It has perhaps no beginning and no end, no definite continuity of consciousness. It is all-inclusive and therefore amorphous and changeful, weak in action, dazzling in thought and imagination, and ingenious in speech and expression, enlightening to the half-enlightened, and idiotizing to the defective. Its gates are open to the highest philosophy of Humanism and to the lowest animistic intellect of primitive life.

### 3

The truth is that all existing religions are old and effete, while human life is progressive. Its progress during the last four hundred years has been immense. Its progress during the last one hundred and fifty years has been amazing in several directions. It is wonderful to contemplate that until the fifteenth century, though he had lived for millions of years man did not know that the earth was a round body hanging in the sky and systematically moving round the sun, that only half the world was known, and most of that half but indistinctly known. When the whole earth was discovered, it was divided into the Old World and the New World as if there were two worlds and not one. The human beings who lived in the New World were but half recognized as men, and eventually treated as beasts for the most part.

The New World now dominates the Old. The most wonderful phenomenon in the history of the world is the rapidity with which the New World has eclipsed the glories of the Old, and now stands foremost in civilization, in wealth, power and enjoyment. The Old World is now literally indebted to the New. She lives by her pleasure, and distressfully feels an oppressive inferiority complex.

### 4

The secrets of nature have been laid bare by science, and the old gods to whom sacrifices were made by man for the growth and promotion of life have been sent into a catacomb. Thus ignorance and darkness at the heights as well as at the bottom have been largely extinguished. We no longer feel any sympathy for the Red Indians and the dark gods, the former of whom ruled in the New World and the latter in the Old. We have replaced the former by civilized men, but have not so far, at least in a systematic form, replaced the dark gods by new ones of an acceptable colour. We have illuminated the foreground of the world, but the background remains as dark as ever.

### 5

It is strange that while civilization has advanced furiously fast towards perfection, religion remains in its primitive condition. We love the present, but we revere the past. The light of the present dazes most of us and they seek the safety of the penumbra. There are still men who do not blush to call themselves Buddhists, Christians, Mussalmans, or Hindus, though the religions professed by them originated and spread long before modern civilization came into existence. There are men who consider it a glory to fumble for the secrets of life by lamp-light while the world, all round, shines bright with electric light. Is religion alone to remain fixed for ever in an absolute monarchy while the freedom of democracy asserts itself in all other departments of life ?

Modern civilization though glorious has proved defective in that aspect of life which lies at the centre of it. The body looks healthy, but the liver is diseased. The integrative character of civilization has developed wonderfully in the physical and intellectual fields of life, but the spiritual aspect is not merely non-progressive but positively disintegrative. There is good digestion but bad assimilation. Distance has been annihilated by science, and commerce has been promoted by the needs of civilization with the result that all humanity are now meeting in crowds in cities and sanitaria all over the world. They shake hands with one another, pleasantly speak to one another, sell and buy valuable commodities and new discoveries of science, but their hearts rumble with clouds of the blackest colour. While they embrace one another, they suspect one another, become jealous of one another, hate one another, rob one another, stealthily if possible, openly if necessary. In one word while the aim of civilization should be to put an end to the cosmic process of life, the spirit of exploitation increases with the progress of each scheme to frustrate it. The spirit sometimes bursts out and explodes in war and disaster. Huxley said, civilization transmutes the cosmic into the ethical process of life. That is the proper function of civilization. But civilization has failed to implement it, because it has injudiciously separated itself from religion, all but divorced the latter. I may at once confidentially inform the reader that the object of 'The Religion of Man' is to reconcile civilization to religion and to reunite the couple in rejuvenated love and cheerfulness.

### 6

The world is passing through a crisis. Civilization which has intellectually and physically conglomerated mankind, has made them close neighbours to one another, has failed to make them love one another. On the contrary the closer the physical contact the wider grows the gulf that separates them spiritually. Every man feels like Afzal Khan and Sivaji at the same time. There is something wrong in our civilization. The world requires a new religion which will fit it into the mould created by modern civilization. Humanity cannot segregate themselves without jeopardising their civilization. Dr. Tagore gives a sparkling description of the situation thus (p. 157):—

"The races of mankind will never again be able to go back to their citadels of high-walled exclusiveness. They are to-day exposed to one another, physically and intellectually. The shells which have so long given them full security within their individual enclosures have been broken, and by no artificial process can they be mended again. So we have to accept this fact, even though we have not yet fully adapted our minds to this changed environment of publicity, even though through it we may have to run all the risks entailed by the wider expansion of life's freedom."

What is to be done now? The world is badly in need of a new religion to give it unity, and add to its safety and beauty by a new truth. Dr. Tagore has generously undertaken to disclose this truth in India in the vernacular language of Bengal. He has already disclosed it before a more enlightened, yet distressed audience in England in the English language. The 'Kamala Lectures' of 1932 will, I think, be a revised edition of the 'Hibbert Lectures' of 1930. But I expect it will be ampler in explanation, less encumbered with mysticism, more precise in expression, more intelligible and attractive to youthful minds and more digestible to all kinds of intellect, young and old. Not that, 'the Religion of Man' is lacking in any of these qualities but it is meant for a class of men who combine in themselves the power of appreciating the beauty of poetry and of penetrating into the depths of science and philosophy,—men who are at home with the problems of biology and evolution, politics, social psychology and that most fascinating type of group life which is known as national life. The 'Kamala Lectures' on the other hand will be addressed to young men, who may have barely heard the name of Darwin as the discoverer of the theory that man is descended from the monkey with his tail cut at the upper end, but who know nothing of the unicellular origin of living beings, of their progress by the struggle for existence or of their further progress by putting an end to the perennial struggle, and supplying them with the surplus wealth of leisure, the essential instrument of creative work; and whose knowledge of the psycho-physical problem is of the vaguest kind, and who wonder how the loss of the tail changed the contents of the heart and brought strange compensations enabling love to usurp the throne of hate, or how the intellectual expansion of selfhood turned the individual personality of man into the grand personality of human unity.

## 7

In the natural order of time the 'Kamala Lectures' would have preceded the 'Hibbert Lectures.' But misfortune always dogs the footsteps of the prophet. No prophet receives his first glories in his native land. Dr. Tagore was not much thought of in his own country until the Nobel Prize was received by him. He personally complained of the shortcomings of his Indian neighbours when the latter hastened to honour him after the Swedish award. In the present case it is not impossible the Senators of the Calcutta University were roused by the chorus of European laudation of the 'Hibbert Lectures.' They ought to be thankful to Dr. Tagore for accepting the 'Kamala Chair,' broken as it is into two halves. It is uncertain however whether Dr. Tagore will find it easy to reproduce in an imperfect language thoughts which were originally formed in his mind in a more perfect language. But he is accustomed to this kind of trial. *Prabasi* has often re-incarnated in Bengali thoughts which originally found expression in the *Modern Review* or the *Viswa-Bharati Quarterly*. We may be sure that new coinage of words will largely enrich the Bengali language specially in the scientific parts of the book in which the origin and evolution of man are discussed in the language of biology embellished by poetry. Indeed the work is a magnificent poem, written without the restraints of verse or metre, and with the sonorous majestic freedom of stately periods, which produce a fascinating effect of beauty on the ear, the imagination, the emotions and the intellect alike. It is eminently a book to read with an athletic tongue as well as a wakeful mind, besides a seriously fixed eye. It required no mean effort to express in the sublime language of epic, ideas regarding the verminous origin of man and the evolution of mere bacilli into the finished final product of the creative spirit. The specifically religious part of the book has been helped by ideas derived from ancient Indian philosophy reinforced by modern Western thinking. The political parts reproduce the tone of Froude and Macaulay, while the scientific-philosophic part reflects the style of Huxley who as the friend of Darwin has done more to diffuse Darwinian ideas than any other person, living or dead, but who at the same time weakened them by his differentiation between cosmic and ethical evolution, which the European mind failed to appreciate, but which has enabled Dr. Tagore to build up a new religion of man, broadly based upon science, and nursed by emotional imaginativeness, the distinctive gift of the poet. For myself I may confidentially inform the reader that I have read the book not once or twice but many times without losing my interest and delight in the study of it as an aggregate of parts, though I cannot candidly say the same thing concerning the total effect of the book, regarded in its 'wholeness.'

8

In the circumstances noted above I believe a brief résumé of the book will be useful for the audience as well as for the reading public, whose religious cravings are not satisfied by the existing religions of the world and for whom the cash value of the commonly accepted god has been depressed in an atmosphere of science by the power which man has acquired over Nature, enabling him to turn her from a dreaded master to an obedient slave. Wherever circumstances warrant I shall not allow my admiration for the book to interfere with my freedom to scan and scrutinize it, albeit in a reverential spirit, with the best of my experience and understanding. Of course the résumé cannot follow the order of treatment adopted by the author. I shall only call attention to the fundamental features of the subject. 'The Religion of Man' is a religion intended for scientific men endowed with a poetic disposition. A religion of a parallel nature, but vastly inferior in its contents and elaboration of essence is contained in H. G. Wells' God, the Invisible King. In both, the accepted gods of the several existing religions are rejected, and for them are substituted—finite beings, more or less abstract in character. Dr. Tagore, it appears, was the first to conceive a religion of this kind, though the 'Hibbert Lectures' were delivered several years after the publication of "God the Invisible King." In the latter book there is a slight reference to Dr. Tagore's ideas regarding the kind of religion which the modern scientifico-poetic mind craves for. India did not know during these years that a new religion was embryonate in the mind of the poet. But occasional glimpses could be gained from interviews accorded to friends, like Mr. D. K. Roy, that something was effervescing in the poet's mind, waiting for distillation. 'The Religion of Man' was not a haphazard event. It must not be forgotten also that the 'Hibbert Lectures' were due to be delivered in 1928.

## 9

'The Religion of Man' propounds a new religion for man, and throws into the dust-bin of untruth all the existing religions of the world. The Brahmo religion came under the broomstick early in the life of the poet. It had come to him as a contagious disease, for he was born in a Brahmo family and lived and moved among Brahmos. He got rid of the bacillus of Brahmoism by severing his connection with his father's church. This is clearly indicated at pp. 109 and 110. A beggar belonging to the Baul sect of Bengal helped him in the exorcism.

The loitering religions of the world imply the existence and necessity of a being, superhuman and supernatural in origin and character, guiding and controlling the destiny of man by power, either directly exercised or indirectly manifested through precept and example. The deity presiding over the new religion has a human origin with cash value as an exemplar only. He is variously named as the "Ideal Man," "God-man," "Man-god," "Multipersonal humanity of man," "ideal of human unity," "god of human personality," "man the whole," "The supreme spirit invoked by the spirit of civilization," "The greater man in the individual man," "man the eternal," "man the divine" and so on and so forth.

The ideal man is the man to be imitated as exemplar. The god-man and man-god mean in effect the same thing. He has the looks of a man with the brain and heart of a god. He is a man evolving into a god, not a god degenerating into a man.

## 10

Dr. Tagore is a humanist, a pragmatist, an empiricist, paradoxically but deeply touched by the power of imagination to which he is inclined to give a higher place than to the intellect, in the make-up of man, as endowed with a greater value for practical life which is fundamentally emotional in character, and only secondarily helped by reason. The primacy of the emotions is gradually coming to be recognized in cultivated minds and Dr. Tagore speaks with no uncertain voice when he says (p. 130): "Reality in all its manifestations reveals itself in the emotional and imaginative background of our mind. We know it, not because we can think of it, but because we directly feel it." He is a humanist in both its cardinal aspects. His religion is opposed to devotion to god, as commonly understood in theology and current philosophy. It is opposed to treacherous nationalism, which entering into life as a uniting social force turns in adult life into a strong disintegrative power, defiantly standing out as an impediment to the evolution of the collective personality of man. He takes no part in the present national movement of India because it is ultimately destructive of humanism, of the unity of humanity, the ultimate ideal of man. He is a man first, and an Indian next. If he has sometimes taken part in politics he has done so rather to check undue enthusiasm in the cause of nationalism. His object has been to create love rather than to excite hate, to unite Indians rather than to separate them from the Englishmen. He has never encouraged boycott though he has sometimes forgetfully supported Swadeshi. By his humanism he is opposed to self-containedness and self-sufficiency. A world-market, a world-university, a world-society, a world-philosophy and a world-religion constitute the essence of his thought, speech and action, of desires, purposes and aims of his life itself. The pity is he has been born at a wrong place and time.

## 11

The use of the words "god-man" and "man-god" is regrettable in a work which rejects god as the unknowable, inscrutable central power which has very little time to devote to provincial concerns. Man's universe forms an infinitesimal fraction of the total universe. God has conceded full autonomy to it and naturally feels the delight of freedom from the oppressive consciousness of further personal responsibility. He has in a manner proclaimed to man that he has nothing to fear from him and nothing further to expect from him. The use of his name as an adjunct to man is misleading, and injurious to the doctrine of Humanism, which regards man as the maker of his own destiny, and excludes god as devoid of cash value for him. It is for men to elect the President of their universe and to build up a White House for his residence in their imagination. I cannot say whether it is a defect or a merit of their religion that it provincialises humanity, for if on the one hand it places man above the limits of nationalism and sectionalism of all kinds, it removes him from contact with the imperial, universal interests of man. The pragmatic pluralistic idea of multiverseness is dimly visible in the religion. But the words 'universe' and 'multiverse' have not yet attained definiteness of denotation. Man has local interests, provincial interests and imperial interests. 'The [illegible] unduly excludes local and the eternal person manifested in all persons. It may be one of the numerous manifestations of god, the one in which is comprehended Man and his Universe. But we can never know or imagine him as revealed in any other inconceivable universe so long as we remain human beings" (p. 155).

In the above passage mark the words "it may be." They introduce an element of uncertainty which mars the value of the relationship. Prophets never allow their revelations to hang upon uncertainties. But a prophet of the 20th century living in the mixed atmosphere of pure science and diabolical doubt has to be more careful and less dogmatic in his expositions than a prophet of the 1st century or of the 7th. Mysticism, unconscious obfuscation, even unmistakable confusion must be taken for granted as far as possible, and not too severely scrutinized by the audience, who must listen with a spirit of reverence, adequately insured against the spirit of the scoffer, which is making religion progressively impossible. Dr. Tagore's is a sincere though feeble effort to rescue the world from the abyss of irreligion into which it is being rapidly driven by an oppressive atmosphere of unbelief and materialism. I call it a feeble attempt because the

## 13

It is quite possible that previous to his conversion to humanism Dr. Tagore was unaware that in ordinary theology god is not merely the king of kings but also the supreme preceptor and exemplar of humanity. This appears from the following passage at page 165 :—

> " And therefore whatever character our theology may ascribe to him in reality he (god) is the infinite ideal of man towards whom men move in their collective growth, with whom they seek their union of love as individua ls, in whom they find their ideal of father, friend and beloved."

'The Religion of Man' lays stress on the collective growth of humanity, not on the salvation of the individual man in looking upon the god-man as the exemplar of mankind, whereas ordinary theology more or less completely ignores the collective growth of humanity, and lays stress on the salvation of the individual soul in looking upon god as the exemplar of mankind. The god of theology is an ideal family man. The man-god of humanism is an ideal citizen of the world-state. The demon-god of modern civilization is an ideal citizen of the nation-state. The man-god stands between the god of theology and the demon-god of the nation-state.

Indian philosophy has a more definite and expansive idea about god as exemplar. "Tat-twam Asi," " Soham" and " Paramahamsa" imply the ultimate potentiality of the individual man, not of the collective personality of humanity. These sayings have a higher power of inspiration because they are pregnant with a directness for purposes of realization which is lacking in the Religion of Man, which imposes a more complex and complicated burden on shortlived mortal man for his final smoky salvation. To determine what is good for humanity in its " corporate wholeness" and to love it is certainly not less difficult than to know god and to love him.

## 14

The only religion of pre-modern time with which Dr. Tagore has sympathy is Buddhism, which regards god the creator as a mere superfluity for the practical life of man. He says (p. 70):—

" When somebody asked Buddha about the original cause of existence, he sternly said that such questioning was futile and irrelevant. Did he not mean that it went beyond the human sphere as our goal, that though such a question might legitimately be asked in the religion of cosmic philosophy or science, it had nothing to do with man's dharma, man's inner nature, the ultimate truth of man ?"

## 15

Humanism is opposed to divinism on the one hand and to nationalism on the other. ' The Religion of Man ' seems to be animated more by opposition to nationalism than by the sense of the superfluity of god. Nationalism is another name for racialism or tribalism. It calls upon all nationalists to give up their own religion of nationalism and to accept the doctrine of humanism for their guidance in the practical concerns of life. At page 162 we read, " The god of humanity (the ideal man) has arrived at the gates of the ruined temple of the tribe. Though he has not yet found his altar I ask the man of simple faith wherever they may be in the world to bring their offering of sacrifice to him, and to believe that it is far better to be wise and worshipful than to be clever and supercilious. I ask them to claim the right of manhood to be friends of men, and not the right of a particular proud race or nation which may boast of the fatal quality of being rulers of man. We should know for certain that such rulers will no longer be tolerated in the New World, as it basks in the open sunlight of mind and breathes life's free air." Nationalism develops into imperialism, and the passage quoted above particularly alludes to imperialistic nationalism, like the nationalism of the British race. It required great courage for a member of a subject race to face an audience of the ruling race with a seditious message visualising prospects of a most damnatory nature, and warning them to repent.

16

The spirit of civilization is the creator of the god-man as the spirit of creation is the creator of man. By ethical evolution man means his growth into the god-man,—the growth of the unipersonal average man into the multipersonal ideal man. Civilization is the vulgar name for this evolution. This is the essence of Dr. Tagore's views. He says (p. 126): "The animal in the savage has been transformed into higher stages in the civilized man, in other words, he has attained a truer consonance with man the divine." The fundamental function of the god-man or man the divine is to bring about complete unity for all humanity. Multipersonal humanity is one of his names. But what is the actual situation ? The difference between what is and what ought to be has been forcefully exposed in a passage of classic importance, which I shall presently reproduce. Civilization is uniting mankind physically and intellectually. It has created a world-market and a world-university, but it has failed to create a world-spirituality. On the contrary it carries in its bosom germs of world disruption. It has developed racial and national egotism and created all manner of normal perversity which are bound ultimately to prove destructive to humanity. Instead of creating the god-man it has created the diabolical man. The process has been going on with acceleration down to the present time of advanced civilization. The author strongly regrets the situation as follows (p. 159) :—

"Hitherto the cultivation of intense race egotism is the one thing that has found its fullest scope at this meeting of men. In no period of human history has there been such an epidemic of moral perversity, such a universal churning up of jealousy, greed, hatred and mutual suspicion. Every people weak or strong is constantly indulging in a violent dream of rendering itself thoroughly hurtful to others. In this galloping competition of hurtfulness, on the slope of a bottomless pit, no nation dares to stop or slow down. A scarlet fever with a raging temperature has attacked the entire body of mankind, and political passion has taken the place of creative personality in all departments of life."

It will be useful to tell the reader that the heading of the chapter in which this passage occurs is "The Meeting." It means the commercial meeting of men, facilitated by the inventions of science, specially in the transport department. The spirit of self-interest and that of exploitation are the promoters of the meeting. They are promoters of refined savagery, not of true civilization.

The appeal to the emotions is a weakness in the poet's heart. It makes him run into mysticism. The present spiritual situation in the spiritual world is universally acknowledged to be distressful. But is the situation the result of a steady evolution or a sudden drastic deflection from the line of advance? Both the ways of interpretation are indicated in the passage almost with equal emphasis. In the first case the fundamental principle of the promised evolution is violently contradicted. We read at page 14:—"Before the chapter ended Man appeared and turned the course of evolution from an indefinite march of physical aggrandisement to a freedom of a more subtle perfection. This has made possible his progress to become unlimited and has enabled him to realise the boundless in his power." Again at page 15 we read:—"His multicellular body is born and it dies; his multipersonal humanity is immortal. In this ideal of unity he realises the eternal in his life and the boundless in his love." At page 47 the author writes:—"For centuries his evolution has been the evolution of a consciousness that tries to be liberated from the bounds of individual separateness to comprehend in its relationship a wholeness which may be named man." Again:—"Physical evolution sought for efficiency in a perfect communication with the physical world; the evolution of man's consciousness sought for truth in perfect harmony with the world-personality."

The present disastrous moral and political situation of the world violently contradicts this idea of evolution as opposed to that of biological evolution by exploitation. The only possible way out of this contradiction is to affirm that the present situation of the world represents a sudden pathological attack, issuing from internal or external forces. The words "epidemic" and "scarlet fever" seem to point to this interpretation. But no diagnosis of the disease has been attempted. On the other hand the first sentence, "Hitherto the cultivation of intense race egotism, etc.," points to the conclusion that it is in the nature of modern civilization to foster moral perversities, specially, jealousy, greed, hatred and mutual suspicion. The question loudly and urgently calls for further explanation and clarification, without which the religion of man remains open to serious criticism in its very fundamental principle. The "background of emotional imagination" may be a safe hiding-place for subjective reality, but reality has no value for the world at large, if the intellect does not invade the foreground and knock the door afar. Life behind the screen may be beautiful and attractive, but devoid of truth. It is this screen which made Dr. Tagore disgusted with his father's god and church. The same screen ought not to be allowed to hide the truth in the new religion of man. It is to be hoped that supplementary enlightenment will come through the 'Kamala Lectures.'

The mysterious transformation of the everlasting cosmic process into the glorious ethical process discovered by Huxley, has not been accepted by the civilized world for good and sufficient reason. The latter believes in no love but self-love, no interest but self-interest. Its altruism is a refined form of egoism. Its self-sacrifice and disinterested work are names for enlightened self-interest. Exploitation has not been abandoned, but delicately refined. The general belief in cultivated minds in the West is that the existing disastrous situation is the result of inadequate refinement of exploitation and defective enlightenment of self-interest. There is no question of love or hate. Both the civilization and the present disaster are intellectual phenomena with which ethics has nothing to do. The sole question before the civilized world is how to enlighten self-interest, how to refine exploitation to the point of making it invisible.

Is it unreasonable to suspect that Dr. Tagore discovered the heart of the new religion in the 'Romanes Lecture' of 1883 in which Huxley tried to knock down Darwin at the very point where his theory of evolution promised to exhibit the greatest value for human civilization? Why the cruel spirit of life should suddenly jump into the sea of love has been convincingly explained neither by Huxley nor by Dr. Tagore. Man has attained boundless power. He will never realise the boundless in love.

Indeed the movements, after many thousand years of civilization, hardly warrant the belief that the cosmic process can ever be transformed into an unmixed ethical process. Jealousy, greed, hate, malice and mutual suspicion do not belong to the latter process.

Dr. Tagore's own personal experiences sometimes perturb him so violently that he is compelled to appeal over the head of the man-god to the god of theology for relief. In the article headed '*Prasna*' in the Magh number of the *Prabasi* he says : "*Bhagawan,* you have sent prophet after prophet to tell mankind to forgive and to love." The man-god is not an absentee god. He lives personally among men, even in their heart. He has nothing to do with an ambassador.

The god-man seems to have died within the heart of man, assassinated by devil-man, who encourages jealousy, greed, hate, malice and mutual suspicion among men, also non-co-operation, civil disobedience, boycott, picketing and even assassination of the innocent and helpless. He concludes the articles thus: " Have you forgiven and loved the devil-man and the legion who have poisoned your breath and extinguished your light ? "

## 17

Dr. Tagore is not the only person in the civilized world who regrets the present deplorable condition of humanity and its civilization. Man in his evolution seeks to realise, first, "the boundless in his power," and, secondly, "the boundless in his love " (pp. 14 and 15). The first realization has been going on with leaps and bounds during the last few centuries, while the second realization is lamentably lagging behind, whereas for the perfection of man they ought to have advanced in parallel lines, and with equal pace. Power is intellectual and love is spiritual. Science has given power to man. Religion is intended to give him love. "When the Bishop of Ripon, " says Dr. Radhakrishnan (p. 8,

" Kalki)," " suggested a scientific holiday for a short period of time he meant to warn us that while science is progressing pretty fast, furnishing us with new inventions, man the user of them is not refining himself at an equal rate." Very recently Sir Alfred Ewing, the President of the British Association, in a learned discourse on the Engineer's outlook, showing the vast and rapid progress in man's power over Nature, concluded as follows: " Man was ethically unprepared for so great a bounty. In the slow evolution of morals he is still unfit for the tremendous responsibility it involves. The command of Nature has been put into his hands before he knows how to command himself." Blessings have been showered on mortals, but they habitually turn them to evil. The present condition of man may be briefly described as wickedness endowed with power, or as the legion of the devil reinforced by science. The psychology of man is badly in need of a re-adjustment which no amount of "curbing or stressing" can accomplish. Man has been civilized and barbarized at the same time, and chaos has come.

18

Man, as shown by Dr. Tagore, is savagely self-seeking. Love and self-interest are not good companions. Self-love is the foundation on which love of neighbour rests, however much we may try to think to the contrary. The God of the Bible rested it in that way. The history of civilization shows that love of neighbour is indulged in where it is calculated to promote self-interest. Disinterested love of service is an unknown quantity in human relations. Even the mother's love originates, and develops as self-love during the period of gestation, and continues with growing weakness for a number of years, that is, until the separateness of the child is fully realized by her. Love of neighbour implies an expansion of selfhood. The partial realization of the self in others is rendered possible by the foresight of self-interest. Dr. Tagore at page 49 says :—" We have our greatest delight when we realize ourselves in others, and this is the definition of love."

This realization of self in others manifests itself in patriotism or nationalism as its final limit of expansion. Hegel and Mazzini were of this opinion. The misfortunes of the Great War followed by trade depression have awakened in some cultivated minds the idea of a greater expansion of selfhood. It is a desperate idea in the sense that it has arisen out of despair. Civilization is expecting a catastrophe. The desire of rescuing it lies at the bottom of the idea. The optimism which nurses it has its origin in deep pessimism, and is therefore extremely feeble and uncertain. Dr. Tagore wants to give selfhood as wide an expansion as humanity. This expansion might have been possible in earlier days, when power was weak and more or less unequally distributed. Experience shows that the greater the power of the nation the weaker becomes the desire for the expansion of selfhood. India is not an expansion of British selfhood. It only concentrates that selfhood. The present political troubles of India owe their origin to the inadequate progress of the enlightenment of self-interest in the British nation. There is no question of increasing hate or decreasing love.

## 19

The most serious obstacle in the way of the expansion of selfhood to the limits of humanity lies in the fact that it leaves no scope for hate. Love is jejune without hate. It dries up in a sterilized atmosphere of hatelessness. If we had economic relations with the people of Mars the position might be more hopeful. But it will be a long time before the power of science can connect the two planets in that way.

### 20

Another obstacle is the growing population of the world. The present population is nineteen hundred millions, and it seems too large for any person to realize himself in them either jointly or severally. To love so many people individually is, of course, impossible. They must be loved in groups, if at all. What kind of grouping is the most advantageous for the purpose of loving humanity in its wholeness? I think the national grouping ought to be the best. But it has proved so far to be the worst. Nationalism breeds more hatred towards foreigners than love for the members of one's own groups. Communalism breeds hatred among different groups in the same nation. It is when danger faces one nation from another that communal disputes are forgotten. They are merely kept in abeyance, not ended for good. A war between two nations thus supports the solidarity of each of them. The abolition of foreign war would disrupt every nation into atoms. The general tendency of civilization is thus to send humanity back to primitive conditions. It is war, strife and hatred that keep up the solidarity of each nation, and of all nations, that is of humanity taken separately in groups. A joint humanity, at all events, cannot stand permanently any more than a joint family. Bickerings and bitternesses make love superficial. On the whole it seems a regrouping of humanity will be necessary to facilitate the expansion of selfhood. But it seems also that at the end there will be two groups, not one, mutually hateful and hurtful. That seems to be the ultimate limit of the expansion of selfhood. It is easier to conceive two humanities separately united, than one complete unbroken humanity. These will be much wider than national unities.

## 21

Nationalism does not require that two nations should permanently prove mutually hurtful. One nation may be temporarily bound in love with another when common danger is expected from a third. A group of nations may thus be united in love against another. It is possible to conceive half the nations of the world bound in love for the purpose of hurting the other half. The bond of union cannot extend further than this. He who hates most loves most, feels most the value of life. This is true also of national personalities. Hating is necessary for loving. Hurtfulness is a necessary condition of beneficence. Self-love lies at the root of amity and enmity in relation to neighbours. The entire history of the evolution of life shows that man is a crass self-seeker. The God of the Bible and his son Christ knew that self-love is supreme in the heart of man when they tried to inculcate love for neighbour. Self-love seeks self-preservation above all things else. It may commit murder when self-preservation is in danger. The relation between egoism and altruism presents a complicated problem for civilized life. It is more an intellectual problem than an ethical one. The cultivated mind of Europe regards it almost exclusively as an intellectual problem. The Eastern mind believes in the power of love and morality. The partial unification of humanity, as a question of politics, is exercising the highest intellects in Eur-America. In India Dr. Tagore has treated it as a problem of religion and morality. While we complain that civilization has not made men sufficiently moral, the most advanced people are dissatisfied with it because it has not made man sufficiently intelligent to deal with the present situation. Various schemes are being put forward, it being taken for granted that self-interest must be respected as a divine principle of the existence of life. The object is to add the light of pre-vision to self-interest, and not to weaken the sentiment. We in India think that a change of heart is able to bring bliss to mankind. The truth is that the heart has never changed. It is immutable. But the intellect is subject to evolution. In its evolution lies the future of man. The intellect of man has shown great progress in its action upon Nature. It has not been sufficiently cultivated in its relation with neighbour. Humanists or universalists in the West believe that all men may be made equally happy by the manipulations of the intellect. But this too seems to be an error. Inequality is the law of life in every department of it. The world is passing through a crisis. If it recovers it will be through the sharpening of the intellect, not by the change of heart, the change of the primeval principle of self-love and self-preservation and self-promotion; and recovery will not mean equality of freedom, happiness or power.

### 22

Dr. Tagore seems to have accepted without due scrutiny Huxley's theory that civilization kills the biological evolution, propounded by his friend Darwin as effected by the struggle for existence and survival of the fittest, and starts a new evolution in the psychology of man. Huxley's idea was that as civilization advances this struggle for existence shows proportionate relaxation. The struggle for existence is a wide term. Existence for the rich man is different from the existence for the poor man. The latter can live upon starvation wages, the former requires a thousand pounds a year. Besides the struggle for existence has now developed into the struggle for power. Man wishes not only to exist in the present and to ensure existence for an idefinite future, but to ensure a higher kind of existence for himself while conceding bare existence or a lower style of existence to his neighbours. In short he seeks for power to overpower. He struggles for power and not merely for existence. The struggle for power among individuals gives rise to communalism. When this struggle is carried on by nations it is called nationalism. Internationalism is invoked to regulate wild nationalism. Its success so far has been insignificant. The League of Nations is a sickly unpromising infant. The struggle for existence among the nations is hardening, as well as the struggle for power.

## 23

I have indicated that 'the Religion of Man' is a poem dealing with a subject that refuses to lend itself to poetic treatment. Mysticism permeates it and surrounds it. But it is possible to gather that in the opinion of the author the struggle for existence has either ceased or has lost its justification for further continuance by the fact that the surplus of leisure has enabled man to control Nature to that extent that it can be made to yield sufficient food, clothing and other necessaries for the support of life, and that if people still fight and tear one another it is because they are morally perverse and have transformed the struggle for existence into a struggle for power, which is quite unjustifiable. Where Darwin stopped Nietzsche has come in, and the consequence is that the man-god is not allowed to find his altar. The expansion of selfhood to national dimensions has added tremendously to the fierceness of the struggle. This struggle has disturbed cultivated minds all over the world. In India Dr. Tagore standing at the apex of modern culture has devoted himself heart and soul to the problem from a new angle of vision. He thinks that his success depends on his ability to convince the world that the idea of "Humanity is not an abstraction, subjective in character, but that it has a concrete objectiveness though men can never see it from outside, for they are one with it." The poet's mind legitimately craves for idolatry. It is not satisfied with mere abstraction. It wants a concrete personality to worship, to love, to fear and to revere. But the general culture of the world is disgusted with it. It is disgusted with untruth. The utmost that can be said is that Humanity is born as an abstraction, and is transformed into concrete objectiveness by the ingenious nursing of imagination and bottle-feeding. Hydrogen may be powerful as a gas but it lacks beauty until it is crystallised.

24

'The Religion of Man' is in essence Humanism with idealism superadded. The god-man is the ideal man, the exemplar of Humanity, taken individually as an aggregate as well as collectively as a corporate whole. Its morality is different from the morality of ordinary religion. The latter morality has very little to do with the wholeness of man. It is not humanistic morality, but humanitarian, or mere superstition which leads nowhere. In humanistic morality the final product is what counts. The methods by which that finality is reached are not matters of much concern. Eugenics necessarily gets blended with ethics, which develops a mechanical aspect as in the refinement of steel out of pig iron. There are several stages in the process of refinement, and the greater the speed with which one stage follows another the higher is the value of the method. The cost of refinement also enters into the calculation of value. The object is to refine ordinary men into god-men, and the more quickly the result is achieved the better for humanity.

The law of heredity must be manipulated with skill. Infirm and defective women must be positively sterilized. Motherhood must be endowed. Women must submit to an examination to determine their qualification for motherhood. The law of population must be sedulously kept in view. If the actual population falls short of the optimum, special encouragement must be given to maternity. If it exceeds the optimum special modes of discouragement must be introduced.

Eugenic morality is not a novelty in the world. The families which have taken advantage of it in the selection of matches for marriage shine in the world. In a multi-formed and multi-coloured race, the most enlightened and thriving families tend to become uniformed and unicoloured. Intellectual progress is also insured by eugenic methods. Eugenically developed families realize the ideal man more quickly than the average family.

The mass production of beauty and intellectuality requires collective eugenic action. The Aryans of India in the early days introduced mass production with partial effect. They replaced aboriginal blood by the Aryan variety by methods which the White men living among Red Indians used with better effect in America in a subsequent age. Their methods are sometimes stigmatized by normal puritans as cruel and inhuman. But the result has more than justified the means. Their methods were humanistic, while the puritans can think of nothing but humanitarian methods. The distinction between the humanist and the humanitarianist is stupendous. The latter has no idealism. His love is untouched by reason. He is almost exclusively emotional. At his death he leaves the world where he found it at his birth.

Wholesale massacre is justified by humanism, only in the absence of higher eugenic knowledge, as well as knowledge of birth-control. Birth-control is a better method than encouragement to death when an excess population has to be dealt with. It may be considered as almost certain that if the ancient Aryans of India or the White Europeans in America in the 16th-19th centuries had sufficient knowledge of science, they would have preferred to chemically sterilize the black women of India and the Red women of America instead of killing off their husbands.

Ideal humanity must be unilingual and uniracial. That is a matter of plain experience. Love cannot grow among polyglots and in plurality of race. America is great because it is unilingual and uniracial at the present day. It was not so three centuries ago. The production of unilinguality and uniraciality is a biological problem, involving the elimination of the inferior languages and the weaker races by chemical sterilization of women. Mere war and massacre cannot accomplish this end.

25

The morality of the idealist humanist is deeply touched by reason. In all activities he has to give preference to the collective interest of humanity : and where there is conflict between the interest of the whole of humanity and that of a part he is under the stern necessity of rejecting the latter. Interest includes present need and future good ; and future good extends up to the extreme limits of the perspective open to knowledge. Knowledge is progressive on the whole, but the knowledge of one individual is different in quality and quantity from that of another. What is moral for one person may be immoral for another. What is moral for one stage of civilization may be immoral for another. What is true for one is false for another. What is useful for one is useles for another. Judgment is always open to risk of error. In short, morality for the idealist humanist is an indeterminate quantity. This by itself turns morality into a farce. The humanist, otherwise called the pragmatist, is not only a utilitarian but a dangerous hedonist. The useful is good and the good is true. Useful for whom ? The law of self-love is inviolable. And the ordinary pragmatist considers that to be good and true which is useful for himself for the moment being. The idealist humanist has more lofty ideas. The upshot of this discussion is that the idealist humanist labours under a confused system of morality, and his moorings in the heart of the god-man are uncertain and weak. It is no wonder that Dr. Tagore while insisting with all the urgency and earnestness at his command on the necessity of approching and realising the god-man has nowhere attempted to envisage his moral character. This failure turns the religion preached by him into a mere fiction. He has been compelled by internal necessity to acknowledge that his religion is a poet's religion, a mere dreamer's religion, a religion existing in imagination only.

## 26

Nobody perhaps will regret the criticism on the Charka cult more than the critic himself. This cult, it was said, was not based upon truth, and any religion which is not based upon truth is bound to fail. The religion of man has no better chance of success for precisely the same reason. But the Charka cult was criticised several years ago. In the meantime it is possible truth has made a long jump from a permanently fixed star and turned itself into an irregularly roving comet. Divine truth has been transmuted into mere pragmatic truth. What is true for a poet is not true for a prosaic, practical man. This truth in the final analysis is the truth on which the new religion of man is founded.

## 27

The nearest approach to a definition of morality is given at page 69. I give *in evtenso* the relevant portions of the passage: "Our union with a Being whose activity is worldwide and who dwells in the heart of humanity cannot be a passive one. In order to be united with him we have to divest our work of selfishness, and become Vishvakarma, the world-worker, we must work for all. When I use the words 'for all,' I do not mean for a countless number of individuals. All work that is good, however small in extent, is universal in character. Such work makes for realization of Vishvakarma the world-worker who works for all."

Here the god-man is identified with Vishvakarma, the ideal creative worker for philosophers, and the god specifically selected by craftsmen for worship. Smiths, carpenters and potters are his devotees in a special sense. It is good work to make a pen-knife or a fish-knife. But a pen-knife may be used for stabbing a neighbour, and a fish-knife may be used to kill a wife. To that extent the making of a pen-knife or a fish-knife is bad work. In early days Vishvakarma used to make bows and arrows. He is now the managing director of armament factories all over the civilized world. But this is not the chief point which lays the passage quoted above open to serious criticism. The definition of good work places a dangerous limitation on the moral activities of man. Many activities which are ordinarily regarded as highly meritorious are thrown into the category of vicious work. Indiscriminate alms-giving, general relief of distress in flood, tornado and earthquake are open to casuistic criticism. The character of those who receive relief ought to be scrutinised. Are they given to anti-social habits ? Are they disturbers of law and order ? Is the country overpopulated ? These and a thousand other questions must be answered by the humanitarianist who opens an appeal for funds to give relief. The humanists cannot tolerate the humanitarianist without severe scrutiny of his doings. Does a man who marries and brings up a large family do more service to humanity than one who lives single and only talks of population ? Is it good work to use contraceptives ? Is it good for a stout and strong man capable of bringing to the world promising children to abstain from sexual intercourse ? Is monogamy a good institution ? Is self-government conceded to a weak people a good thing for humanity ? Are high tariffs good ? Is equality of armaments or complete disarmament a good thing for humanity ? Is it a good thing to fight for socialism or communism ? Are labour-strikes good ? Are non-co-operation and civil disobedience calculated to facilitate the realization of man the divine, who resides in our heart ? Good work and bad work are indistinguishable. The idealist humanist must pass his life in philosophising. He may have a highly contemplative life. He cannot have an active life. The " Religion of Man " is likely to create huge heads supported on weak limbs. It is calculated to paralyze humanity.

28

Dr. Tagore was born as a poet. He has lived as a poet-philosopher. He will probably die as a philosopher-prophet. A poet's aim is to stir the emotions. A philosopher works on the intellect. A prophet rouses the imagination. 'The Religion of Man ' combines in a copious fashion all the three functions. The emotions, the imagination and the intellect all receive exquisite excitation.

The god of the religion lives in luminous imagination. He lives as a concrete personality. He lives as an imaginative reality, as a sensible object, but not yet as a living personality. His body has been built out of the straw and mud of human imperfections. But life has not been breathed into it yet. The ideal man must be not merely a visible, imaginable or conceivable man, but a living man, an active man, an ideal man not merely in being but also in doing. But so far in the history of man the ideal man has shown no light, no activity, no imitability. His cash value as god-man is an unknown quantity. This is obvious from the expression (p. 162) : " The god of humanity has not yet found his altar." He is, so to say, god *de jure*, not god *de facto*. Men of simple faith, needles and mollycoddles, have been asked to bring their offering or sacrifices to him in the hope that he will find his altar one day, and in the belief that it is far better to be wise and worshipful by anticipation than to be clever and supercilious. The association between wisdom and simplicity of faith is rather far-fetched. In this age of science, doubt and democracy a god must exhibit the power of compelling belief instead of depending upon simplicity of faith. The ultimate aim of the god-man is to replace the race of men by a race of god-men. The god-man must be a very complex man.

29

The ideal man is undefinable, invisible, inscrutable. He must prove himself if he is to be worshipped. The author has wisely refrained from defining the ideal man. He has given him a lot of names each of which is undefinable. The only definition that has been attempted is that he is 'boundless in power,' and 'boundless in love.' Power and love do not exhaust the qualities of man. Besides, power and love are not fond of each other. Power means power to overpower; and to overpower the beloved makes love ludicrous. Love touched by reason is love enslaved by self-interest; and love unguided and uncontrolled by reason rots into poison. The loving man is a good man in being, but is generally a bad man in doing: Vishvakarma is a very good man in being; but he has proved to be a very bad man in doing. Love of neighbour does not exist in this world as a rule. The most powerful love is the love of power, which enfeebles the power of love. Krishna is the only person who combined boundless love with boundless power. By his love he kept 64,000 young women attached to him. By his power he extinguished 18 million able-bodied men, and virtually left India dead. But the love was shown in youth, and the power was shown in adult life.

The superman of Nietzsche had power only and no love. He is thus intelligible. He is disgusted by love and disinterested service and self-sacrifice and other inanities. He has thus gathered the most powerful congregation among statesmen, military men, business men, and all sorts of men. The ideal man has no chance against the power of the superman. For his heart is filled with painful love, his spirit is the spirit of self-sacrifice and all his good work consists of disinterested service. His good work after all is not work intended for the benefit of all humanity, for he excepts himself from the benefit. The ideal man makes himself miserable in order to make the rest of mankind happy. Those who try to realize him necessarily make themselves unhappy. Their object is not happiness but the complete evolution of manhood in humanity. In a letter addressed to a friend and published in the *Bhadra* number of *Prabasi*, Dr. Tagore gives expression to the following painful sentiments :—" Realization of the ideal man is sought not for personal delight but for the complete evolution of manhood in man. It was this ideal man that one day pulled me out of the narrow circle of the self-interested pursuit of literature to the field of work at Santiniketan. Did I follow him for the purpose of enjoying his company, of enjoying happiness ? Nobody will ever realize the excruciating pain I have suffered on the way during the last thirty years. It is by this distressful adventure that I have united myself with the ideal man." Mention of this disinterested adventure has been also made in 'The Religion of Man.' It is a redeeming feature in this kind of pain that it finds relief in elegant expression. It is different from the kind of pain which is caused by misfortune and which finds expression only to disgust those who listen. It is worth mentioning that there is not much to distinguish between pleasure and pain. " We often ask for pain mistaking it for pleasure and the god-man within us gives us pleasure and calls it pain " (a famous record in gramophone). The letter in the *Prabasi* is in Bengali. I have tried my best to translate it literally.

After all this nobody will have the heart to say that the ideal man will dethrone the superman one day. The man of love has no chance with the man of power. Disinterested service has no chance against service inspired by self-interest.

Self-sacrifice is sheer poison. The god-man must either give up his power or his love. He cannot retain both. Dr. Tagore really admires him for love and not for power. Indeed his power, if he has any, has no value. For his want of power he has failed to preserve the world of humanity from the power of the devil-man.

K. C. SEN

# INDIAN SCRIPT PALAEONTOLOGY

In 1928 at the suggestion of Sir John Marshall, Dr. D. R. Bhandarkar urged me to take up by way of a thesis an enquiry into the pre-Aryan elements in Hindu Culture with particular reference to the newly discovered Indus Civilisation.

At the very beginning Dr. Bhandarkar impressed upon me the fact that if anything holds the master-key to the understanding of the Indus Civilisation, it is the seals which have been found in plethoric abundance both at Harappa and Mohenjo-daro.

At that time the Library of the Asiatic Society of Bengal was the only place here where there was a complete album of the photographs of the Indus Valley seals. At the request of Dr. Bhandarkar, Mr. Van Manen, the kind-hearted Secretary of the Institution, gave me access to them and I commenced my study there. With the help of these photographs I prepared a complete chart of all the signs appearing on the seals.

While studying the seals, I chanced upon a series of four or five pictographic signs of Easter Island, illustrated on page 36 of the first volume of Harmsworth's Universal History. I noticed certain resemblances between them and the Indus Valley signs, but in the absence of any other data I could not push my studies further on the subject. I soon diverted my attention to the main subject of my enquiry.

My interest in the origin of the Indus Valley script, however, was re-kindled when early in October this year I received a letter from a friend of mine in London, informing me that on September 16, the famous scholar and explorer, Professor Paul Pelliot, made a communication to the Academie des Inscriptions et Belles Lettres of Paris to the effect that a

Hungarian savant named M. Guillaume Hevesy had discovered instances of striking resemblances between the Indus Valley and the Easter Island scripts.

## *Origin of the Brahmi Script.*

The importance of this discovery will be realised when we consider the bearing of the Indus Valley script on the development of the ancient Indian Brahmi alphabet, from which most of the modern scripts of North India are derived. The origin of Brahmi had for a long time been a matter of controversy. Three schools of scholars held three sets of widely different views. Prinsep, ascribing a European origin to it, supposed that Greek alphabet was the parent of Brahmi. He was supported by Otfried Müller and Senart. A Semitic origin of Brahmi was first broached by Sir William Jones as early as 1806. He had among his followers such well-known names as Deecke, Isaac Taylor, Weber and Bühler. There were, however, scholars who dissented from both these theories. Lassen, for instance, conjectured that Brahmi had its origin in India itself. Edward Thomas held the same view but he connected Brahmi with the Dravidian races of India. This theory of the indigenous origin of the Brahmi was also supported by Dowson and Sir Alexander Cunningham. The latter scholar most emphatically maintained that Brahmi was derived from a method of primitive Indian picture writing as represented by the Indus Valley script.

The European and Semitic origins of the Brahmi are no longer countenanced to-day. Modern studies have led to the general acceptance of the theory of the indigenous origin of the Brahmi. The first scholar who seriously sought to prove this theory was Dr. D. R. Bhandarkar, who some fourteen years ago wrote a paper in which he adduced Vedic and other evidences in support of this theory. Some twelve years ago Mr. K. P.

Jayaswal also championed the theory of the Indian origin of the Brahmi in the pages of the J.B.O.R.S., in which he expressed his conviction of the futility of deriving the Brahmi from the Semitic alphabet. This view has lately been endorsed by Mr. Langdon in his paper on the seals discovered from the chalcolithic sites of Mohenjo-daro in the Indus Valley. He is of opinion that Brahmi could not have been derived from the Semitic alphabet. Says he, for instance, "The syllabic alphabet of North India, Brahmi, is most probably a survival of the early pictographic system of the Indus Valley." Though Mr. Langdon is convinced of the development of the Brahmi from the Indus Valley script, yet he could not state his conviction categorically in view of the absence of any intermediate links between the Indus Valley script and the first appearance of the Brahmi centuries later. Mr. Jayaswal, however, assures us that the discovery in July last of the cave inscription at Vikramkhole in Sambalpur by Pandit Lochan Prasad Pandey, has stepped in to fill this breach. According to Mr. Jayaswal the characters in the inscription belong to a period intervening between the script of Mohenjo-daro and Brahmi. Some letters still retain their original or secondary Mohenjo-daro forms and some have already assumed the Brahmi or the proto-Brahmi forms. This inscription conclusively proves the origin of Brahmi to be Indian.

## *Origin of Easter Island Script.*

The fact of the origin of Brahmi from the Indus Valley script leads us straight to the crux of our problem. We irresistibly ask, from which source is the Indus script itself derived? Hitherto, Indus script has been found to possess affiliation with two kinds of scripts : Primitive Sumerian and Easter Island scripts. In a previous article contributed to this journal I have shown that the Sumerian culture was imported into Mesopotamia from India. Sumerian script was, therefore, derived from India. But how can we explain the affiliation of the Indus Valley script with the Easter Island script ?

### *Indo-Polynesian Cultural Relation.*

Easter Island is the most easterly and most isolated outpost of the Polynesian race. It is situated in 27° 10′ S. Latitude and 109° 26′ W. Longitude, about 2,000 miles from the coast of Chile and 1,100 miles from Pitcairn. At first sight it really seems very difficult to account for the resemblances of the Indus Valley script with the script found in such a distant place as this far-off Polynesian island. We cannot, of course, dismiss these resemblances as merely accidental, for out of a number of 288 pictographs discovered in the Indus Valley striking resemblances have been noticed in the case of 130.

The researches of a host of eminent scholars shed clear light on this obscure point of our enquiry. They have proved the racial, cultural and linguistic community of the pre-Aryan Indians and the Polynesians. Thus Pater Schmidt proved the existence of a linguistic family in which were included not only the Munda languages, Nicobarese, Khasi and Mon-Khmer group, but also various Melanesian, Polynesian, Micronesian and Indonesian languages. The most westerly member of this family of dialects is the Kanwari in the valley of the Sutlej, spoken at the confluence of the Sutlej and the Spiti. On the basis of certain important analogies Przyluski has established the affiliation of this family with the ancient Sumerian. It may be mentioned here, in passing, that M. Rivet has a theory which supposes the Sumerians as the transmitters of cultural traits between Oceania and Eur-Africa. In this connection the researches of Dr. Panchanan Mitra are very illuminating. He has studied Polynesian cultures *in* *situ,* and has found numerous cultural parallels between India and Polynesia. Lastly, eminent anthropologists have shown the wide distribution of a proto-Australoid racial strain in the whole of the region between India and Polynesia.

The consensus of opinion is that these Indo-Polynesian racial, cultural, and linguistic traits travelled from India eastwards. We can, therefore, naturally infer that in the wake of these migrations, the Indian script found its way to Easter Island. It only remains to establish the intermediate links, and I may suggest that our University will do well to encourage at least one of its students to undertake this line of research. May I also suggest that an enquiry into the scripts in use among the various pre-Dravidian peoples of India is also an urgent desideratum? I think that will shed further light on the Indo-Polynesian script palaeontology.

Atul Krishna Sur

# TO LIGHT

1

In the hazy twilight of the early morn
 Thou glidest quietly into my lonely bed,
And with thy golden hairs touchest my heavy lids
 And bringest me back to life with the dawn of day.

2

I look full into thy rosy face
 And at thy sacred feet droop again
In that ease of laziness and delight,
 That sweetens the soul with thy honeyed beams.

3

Brighter and Lovelier and Heavenlier still,
 At thy glorious approach the world is alive,
And awake in joy to welcome thee
 That bringest the thrill of life into the soul.

N. N. CHANDRA

# ON UNTOUCHABILITY

A few days ago it was reported, no doubt truthfully, that at a meeting held in favour of abolishing *untouchability* at Nagercoil in Travancore a seven-year old girl mounted the table and poured forth a fervent appeal to the electrified audience to forget that there ever was a custom by which large numbers of their fellow-beings and fellow-believers were shut out from the temples of their gods. It was an emotional appeal on an emotional issue for emotional justice, and coming from an unsophisticated child unsupported by argument or eloquence, it naturally made a profound effect, so that many that had come to scoff at the cause remained to commit 'reunion' scenes with their despised co-religionists.

Years ago I went to a temple-feast and we were many hundreds squatted on the floor in the inner enclosure and eating the sumptuous fare from plantain-leaves. A hungry predatory army of crows hung overhead excitedly and now and then, suddenly, handfuls and single individuals of them swooped down on the fragrant meal and flew away with the prizes of their courage. We were eating dangerously at that feast! In the outer enclosure were many hungry street-dogs looking piteously at us as we came out one after another from the plentiful feast so interestingly heightened by enterprising birds. At the outer gates of the temple were many 'unbelievers in Hindu gods' waiting for some possible 'crumbs' when the feast was over and done. About two hundred yards away from the outer temple-walls were seen a large number of '*unapproachable*' Hindus praying to the deity *more fervently* than some of us ever prayed, perhaps because unlike us it was not given to them to come nearer and pray.

And I thought, and many among us that had enjoyed the feast, no doubt, must have thought likewise, that the crow might plunder the temple-meal and cast its excrement on it and the dog might look at it in outraged desire and the Muslim and the Christian and the Jew might beg for it at the temple-gate and laugh at the 'heathen' deity in their minds, but some of them yonder that held the temple and its god in the same faith and reverence as ourselves must on no account so much as dream of coming nearer than where they stood.

To-day a great wave of religious equality is sweeping through the immense multiform Hindu community and if reason and justice will have the victory that equality is bound to be realized before many days are past. Baroda and Kashmir have opened the gates of their temples to the outcastes. Maharajas and Zamindars are rushing forth with generous donations to correct a primary basis of Hindu unity. The movement is gathering strength from hour to hour, and the representatives of the traditional orthodox sentiment, who are more numerous and more sensitive in Tamil-land and Malabar than, probably, in any other part of India, are justifiably alarmed. They are justifiably alarmed at this descending dissolution of things cherished by them through the centuries, at this surging tide of individualism and 'equality for unequals,' and they often lament in the anguish of their hearts that these new manners bode no good to the land.

The preservation of religious purity through religious segregation and exclusion is one of the most intimate traditions in South India, and although the end seems no longer preserved the means stand undiminished and command its customary honours from a vital section of the community. For it is idle to contend that our priests and pundits are extinguishers of light and enemies of progress, unanimated by patriotism or affection for their brethren. In the higher qualities of human nature and aspiration the reformer may have little to boast of that the pundit or priest does not really possess.

Nanda the Pariah, the epic events of whose life are recited alike by the orthodox and the *untouchable* reverently, did not win his case by its intrinsic justness but by his faith, fervour and feeling. Traditions generally are their own justification and like grey hairs must generally be respected. There is a natural instinct to stand up for imperilled traditions and a certain dignity in doing so, for when we suffer in defence of a tradition we do not generally seem to fight for our own hands. And this question of traditional caste-disabilities is beset with powerful living sentiments. Scriptural authority invoked by either side must avail little. Arguments lose their virtue in the face of the heart's impulses. Appeals rebound ineffectively from deaf ears. Threatening kindles the greater resistance, and were 'the consummation devoutly desired' wrung from unwilling hearts and hands there is a smoking trail of dissatisfaction and resentment raised up behind that takes the grace from the end achieved. Better were it that a fiat goes forth like an act of God, ordering the desired change, for then both fear and duty will be deprived of their lingering scruples. It is in this respect that Kashmir and Baroda have so strikingly scored off the half-blown democracy of British India. Perhaps, Mysore and Travancore may follow suit presently, and if they do, being in some respects, Travancore particularly, the most sacerdotal subdivisions of India, the greater part of the battle will have been won. It is easier to change an age-long sentiment by a swift act than by a slow cautious process.

But where such a course is inevitable owing to established circumstances, it is necessary that presumptions or assumptions are not hastily pressed into service by either side. An airy nothing is this *untouchability*, a nightmare in a dream and its danger lies in its utter unsubstantiality. When it is forgotten, little will have been gained and we will wonder how on earth it was necessary for a great man of the age to begin to lay down his life to set us moving to forget it. But if it continues, like the nightmare it is, it will work like hysteria in the public life of this land and prevent it from going onward. Bad dreams are the worst enemies of both individual and national life.

And the movement for the removal of *untouchability* is a movement for toleration. It is strange that the Hindus who through the changing ages have practised toleration as a national virtue have got to-day to struggle with such intense endeavour to re-affirm their most outstanding quality. But it is the spirit and sense of toleration that win the battle for toleration.

N. K. VENKATESWARAN

# AMONG THE NEW BOOKS

For sheer simplicity and beauty of style the story of Markus, the lone Norwegian fisherman, as portrayed by Gabriel Scott, is supreme. First published in the Norwegian language under the title "Kilden, eller Brevet on Fiskeren Markus" in 1918, it is now obtainable in English ("Markus, the Fisherman," English translation by Solvi and Richard Bateson, Messrs. George Allen and Unwin, Ltd., 7 *s.* 6 *d.* net).

Our interest is claimed from the very first paragraph...... "A man is born ; a speck of dust comes into the world. It lingers awhile, struggles against illness, injustice and want, then it dies and is forgotten, quietly mingling its dust with that of the earth. 'Markus' it says on the tombstone. But who was Markus ? "......and retained through a faithful chronicle of a good fisherman's life until the final chapter that details his death, and the thoughts that engaged his mind at that time. As we read we grow to love Markus for his greatheartedness and trustworthiness. His neighbours picked fun out of him, and publicly ridiculed him, but never once did he become hasty in speech or action. "After all," reasoned Markus, "it is all a part of life, and the beauties of life easily outweigh the evils." There are some remarkably fine paragraphs in this book dealing with fishing, in which we learn of the habits of the lobster, wrasse and eel, to mention but three of the many sea-creatures that are spoken of in its pages. If you want a really good rip-snorting tale of opium-ridden Chinatown, Walter C. Brown will more than satisfy you with his latest book "Laughing Death" (Messrs. J. B. Lippincott Company, London, 8 *s.* 6 *d.* net). It is packed full of thrills and intricate problems, and to give a brief description of the story I cannot do better than quote the publisher's cover-note ! "Tozzi, the gangster, was knifed, and in his room Detective-Sergeant Harper found a peacock feather—and quantities of opium. And there was raw opium under the finger nails and a peacock-feather thrust in the shirt of the Chinaman they dragged from the river, his face twisted into a travesty of laughter, his hands and feet horribly contorted. Had he died the Laughing Death ? Was the Greek Cosoupolis, king of the city's underworld, running the opium ring—or had the dreaded Quong returned ? The trail of hideous torture led to the mysterious dens of Chinatown, and ended in a desperate fight in the crooked cellars and underground passages of Paradise Court ! Conversation is a fine art. And an expert conversationalist—a man who hold our imagination and rigid attention without verging on boredom—is a very much envied man. Grenville Kleiser, who has written a whole host of works on social education, has produced an attractive volume for the use of the man or woman who desires an intensely thorough training in the uses of conversation. If you don't believe that conversation is a neglected art read "How to improve your Conversation" (Funk and Wagnalls Company, New York and London, 8*s*. 6*d*. net). Kleiser deplores the widespread use of senseless slang and meaningless phrases, which owe their world-wide growth largely to the talkie films. What to say, when to say it, how to say it, is the one main objective of this splendid book. We gain a good idea of the author's viewpoint in Chapter 1—Conversation is one of the most precious of the arts. Without it no man can really know his fellows ; but because we have grown too busy or too lazy or too self-conscious we have substituted for the polished speech of our forefathers a meaningless jargon, consisting of not more than some hundreds of words, in which a few overworked phrases and epithets are made to do duty for all occasions. We talk, we chatter, we gabble but we do not converse.

Mussolini is probably the best known, and the least understood, statesman in the world to-day. So I must tender my best thanks to Sir Charles Petrie, Kt., M.A., F.R.Hist.S., for his most illuminating volume on Mussolini and his life-work. "Mussolini," volume number three in the Makers of the Modern Age Series (Holme Press, London, 5 *s.* net) is an account of the man who has created the power, prestige and prosperity of Italy. From his birth in July, 1883, at Varano di Costa, the son of poor parents, the reader may follow the trials, privations, progress and triumphs of this most remarkable of all modern statesmen. This book is an exhaustive survey of Fascism as applied to modern conditions in Italy, its birth, growth and reception is little short of amazing. Mussolini must indeed be a proud man to-day when he surveys the result of his schemes for the prosperity and well-being of his country. Ironically enough, Mussolini was, at one time, exiled in Switzerland, and forbidden under grave penalties to enter Italy ! The name of Cecil Rhodes is linked forever with that of South Africa, and the title Rhodesia was, of course, founded on his name. But what of the man who so vitally helped Rhodes in his most strenuous days Alfred Beit ? Why is so little heard of him ? Well :partly because he was of his own nature retiring, and partly because he died so long ago as 1906, unwept, unhon'r'd and unsung. Alfred Beit was a German-born financier, and more than any one else he helped Rhodes to secure Rhodesia. He was probably the most munificent donor of his period in the cause of education, and in this respect for the past twenty-eight years each succeeding generation in South Africa, Hamburg and Oxford has reaped the harvest of his donations. Moreover than this as an important and influential financier he exercised a definite influence both in Imperial and International affairs. Seymour Fort, C.B.E., has presented us with a brilliant study of the man and his work in "Alfred Beit" (Ivor Nicholson and Watson. 44, Essex Street, W.C. 2, 8 *s.* 6 *d.*

net), which contains an admirable foreword from the pen of no less a man than Lieut.-General and Right Hon. J. C. Smuts, C.H., K.C., whose name, of course has long been identified with that of South Africa. Apart from his one time great political significance, Beit's greatest trait appears to have been his grants, bequests and scholarships. Many thousands of people to-day are benefiting from his wise foresight and unbounded generosity.

It may come as a surprise to many to learn that Buddhism thrived in Britain many centuries ago. Indisputable evidence of this is brought to light in Mr. Donald A. Mackenzie's " Buddhism in Pre-Christian Britain " (Messrs. Blackie & Son, Ltd., Glasgow, London and Bombay, 10 *s.* 6 *d.* net). Commencing with the subject of the early Celts this book goes on to prove that the Celtic god Cernunnos, who survives in Shakespeare as "Herne the Hunter," is no other than Virupaksha—a Hindu-Buddhist god of the West. The book abounds with illustrations of stone carvings, images, reproductions of paintings, etc., all showing to some extent their various associations with Western Buddhism. The compilation of this volume has meant a great deal of research on the author's part, as the amount of footnotes will prove.

Now we come to a book on educative methods that everyone ought to read, for it heralds the dawn of a new era in education. "The Triumph of the Dalton Plan" written jointly by C. W. Kimmins, M.A., and Belle Rennie (Messrs. Ivor Nicholson & Watson, London, 6 *s.* net) records the progress of the adoption of individual work in schools. Among the more progressive educationalists there are naturally very diverse opinions held and expressed with regard to such matters as the ideal curriculum for children at different ages, the best method of presenting the material of instruction, the necessity of maintaining a vivid interest in the subjects taught and so on. There are, however, many points on which there is absolute agreement among the various types of educators. It is now generally admitted that rigid class teaching in which a teacher has to deal with a large number of children, with a wide range of educational achievement among its members, can never be wholly successful. For, not only is there the obvious difficulty of the differences in educational achievement of the members of the group, but there is still the greater factor of an equally wide range in the native ability of the children as revealed by the intelligence tests. The natural and only solution to the problem is individual or sectional teaching. This book describes the experiments made in this direction, and very interesting reading it makes too. There is little doubt that this Dalton Plan of sectional teaching will shortly be adopted by all educationalists the world over.

Most of us are familiar with Tennyson's beautiful poetry, his vision is so grand, the poems of the adventures of Arthur and the Holy Grail being probably the finest of their kind. Mr. F. L. Lucas has brought out a new anthology of this poet's work; "Alfred Lord Tennyson" (Cambridge University Press, 5 *s*. net) which, although it contains much that previous anthologies have contained, is further enhanced by the addition of two or three hitherto unpublished poems—"Lisette ;" "Milton's Mulberry ;" and "How thought you that this thing could captivate?" being chief among them. This is a book to add to your collection of anthologies ; you cannot fail to extract enjoyment from it.

Lastly, those of you who like deep reading, will be well advised to tackle Mr. Francis J. Mott's "Law Emerges" (Creed Publishing Co., 5 Creed Lane, E. C. 4, 5 *s*. net). In the following lines you get its broad outlines and text :—All bodies are conceived, born, brought to maturity and finally killed and dispersed in accordance with what would appear to be a law of life. This applies, according to highly accredited authorities, to everything, from a slug to the universe, and thus of a necessity applies alike to the body of a man and to the social bodies into which he congregates.

It has now been discovered that this process is not quite so obvious as might at first appear. The conclusion reached is that there is no essential connection between the birth and death processes as interpreted and experienced by the mind of man and the actual cosmic necessity for putting off the Old and putting on the New, which is an essential part of that process of Becoming which characterizes the life of the Universe. In other words, the birth and death processes may operate in other ways, *viz.*, painfully or painlessly.

The painful method and static method is that which men have accepted as normal. It involves the disintegration of one organism and its succession by the other. The painless, positive and dynamic method is that whereby the birth and death processes are brought together and, as it were, cancelled out without involving the death of the organism and its replacement by another.

Mr. F. J. Mott's book attempts to set forth the fact that the emergence of this law into the experience of humanity began with the experience of Israel which, by linking inspiration with tradition, demonstrated in degree conscious evolution and survival by the perpetuation of its own social body. His book also explores the natural evolution of this idea and its reinstatement in the present day.

The reader who objects that this is high above the heads of the average man and woman, and moreover, does not answer the pressing needs of the moment, can be simply answered. The answer is that there is not a single need of to-day in any field of human experience that does not arise solely from the failure of men to evolve their societies and to prevent their social bodies from living without purpose and thereby battening on society.

The birth and death pains of men and their societies, along with the hideous mummery of its embalmed corpses of outworn organisations, account for all our woes. Moreover, the failure of established religion to perceive and overcome this error is the failure of humanity to the present day. Mr. Mott's book will not provide you with light reading; every sentence, paragraph and chapter makes you think—and think deeply too—but is a work of brilliant outlines, and will no doubt meet the success it richly deserves.

LELAND J. BERRY

# BECAUSE OF LOVE AND YOU

My wandering feet have strayed
  Down the white road to your lattice small,
Some wild tune you have played
  Leaps from my throat to lure and call.
Come, Queen of Hindustan, here is a man
  Who hath need of your love,
  Peep, peep, down from above!

Because of Love and You,
  I come from the South,
For a smile from your eyes
  And a kiss from your mouth!
In my strong arms you'll lie
  Life shall be divine,
I, to love and to cherish you
  You to be mine—just mine!

LELAND J. BERRY

# Reviews

**The Man who went on Business.** By Norman Tiptaft. Tiptaft Ltd., Birmingham, 1932.

Mr. Tiptaft toured round the world in quest of orders as a British business man and recorded what struck him as wrong in various walks of life. His experiences are divided in 21 chapters, and written in a strong, homely style: "This book contains no fairy stories, no far-fetched ideas. The scenes are what I have seen. The inferences are my own. The suggestion what I think needed." Against this attitude no one can reasonably complain. Nine of the chapters deal with India ; is that so because India is the greatest consumer of British goods in spite of Congress boycott ? His deep-rooted conviction, that India is not fit for home rule or swaraj, finds expression in many a page. One example will suffice: "These ignorant idealists in Parliament and elsewhere who, even as I write, suggest multiplying the voting power of the average illiterate Indian twenty or thirty-fold, are entirely and disastrously wrong......Under existing circumstances, the democratic method simply means governing it badly in the interests of none" (p. 39). "Another opinion " by one whom he calls Mr. Surenam Dass represents the opposite view,—" Here people are black or brown or yellow, but they feel as much as white people. They are as intelligent as white people. Their civilisation" ...(p. 43) what follows may be hauled up before a British court of justice on a charge of sedition, and we refrain therefore from quoting it *in extenso* but the only retort from the writer was: "If I were you, I should thank God that the British Government is as tolerant as it is," and then driving off in his car! The writer refers to "Mother India" on p. 50, with evident approval. He returns to the present Indian situation. Since the action of Congress and Gandhi has become definitely treasonable, people have been put in gaol and charged by the police with lathis, and on some few occasions it has been necessary to shoot." But what has been a matter of criminal omission is, he thinks, the works of propaganda, and unless the market is captured and captured by sound business methods which include "advertising " or propaganda, it is impossible to retain full hold on India and the world.

Though we do disagree in matters of opinion, we must praise the author's transparent honesty of belief and expression, and his style is very simple ; no mist of theorising obscures the view either of the writer or the reader. His last three chapters are full of suggestions that have come in due course to a practical man of business touring through the world for the capture of its market. " It's " and " your's " jar on the ears, though they come from a genuine Englishman, a real " home " product.

PRIYARANJAN SEN

---

" **Tuberculosis of the Lungs** " by S. L. Piplani:—

From a study of the book it would appear that Mr. Piplani is himself a victim of Tuberculosis. In his search for light on the subject the author has read widely but has not been able to acquire a clear idea of the subject. The opening chapters of his book on Physiology are extremely painful reading and will make matters more confounded to people who have not a thorough knowledge of the subject. The chapter on " Symptoms " may be of some value to the lay people and warn them to be on the look-out for some of them. The chapter on " Diagnosis " is of no value to the physician and of little help to the sufferer for whom the book is primarily meant. The chapters on " Treatment " contain a large volume of useful information, but the author would have done well if he had not attempted to determine the relative values of different lines of treatment. This is a field of extreme and bitter controversy and prominent medical men who have devoted their whole lives to the study of the subject are extremely careful when expressing their opinions. Finally I would bring it to the notice of the author that there is no want of good literature on the subject in English and with his poor command of the language he will not be able to improve on any of them. It would be far better for him if he would write in his vernacular and choose such subjects as he is qualified to deal with.

A. CHATTERJI

---

**Theory and Practice of Commerce and Business Organisation**, by J. C. Mitra, F.S.S., F.R.E.S., Professor, Vidyasagar College, 1932. Price Rs. 4/, pp. 744.

Sir R. N. Mookherjee in his interesting foreword rightly terms this book as an "omnibus work" for it succinctly covers the entire field which a student of commercial theory, practice and organisation ought to be acquainted with. His long experience has enabled the author to state the salient features of the subject in remarkably lucid and interesting manner. The fundamental rudiments of the subject are referred to in the important field of office organisation, industrial organisation, commercial organisation, import and export trade organisation, business organisation, banking, stock exchange and foreign exchange work and commercial law with reference to insolvency and liquidation. Negotiable credit instruments, insurance advertisement, and secretariat work are also dealt with in the treatise. The valuable supplement gives a bird's-eye view of the chief items of export and import trade of the country. The glossary of commercial and economic terms undoubtedly heightens the value of the exposition. The abbreviations of commercial terms are not forgotten altogether. An extensive bibliography and select references at the end of each chapter would undoubtedly have been helpful to the enquiring reader who might attempt to probe deep into the subject. The questionnaire at the end of each chapter affords an unfailing stimulus to the diligent reader and would doubtless serve the purpose of a text-book meant for College students. A greater number of commercial documents would have better illustrated the commercial practice of this country. We heartily commend this book to students, businessmen and lawyers.

B. RAMACHANDRA RAU

---

"**The Ottawa Agreement,**" by D. Ghosh, M.A. (Cantab.), Reader in Economics, University of Bombay. Bombay Book Depot, Girgaum, Bombay, 1932, pp. 76. Price Rs. 1 8 as.

Apart from clearly showing that the Ottawa agreement does not lead to freer international commerce, Prof. Ghosh points out that in spirit as well as substance the Ottawa agreement differs from the multilateral commercial conventions which are an important desideratum at present for increasing the value as well as the volume of the trade of the entire world.

After tracing the historical outline of the Imperial Preference idea he succeeds in establishing the statement that the present-day Imperial Preference move is a by-product of the recent tariff changes of the United Kingdom. Having become a ' high-tariff country ' the United Kingdom had no other recourse than to grant Preference to Empire countries. The anxiety to retain the Empire markets for the British manufacturer gave scope for no other alternative scheme than the Imperial Preference idea.

Apart from indirectly achieving Imperial unity as a by-product the idea of economic consolidation of the Empire resources actuated the sponsors of this new move.

Outlining briefly the differences between Protection and Preference the author proposes to strike a balance-sheet of the net gains and losses in the present as well as the near future so as to enable the reader to understand whether the Preferential arrangement is justifiable or not.

In Part II of his brilliant study he succeeds in convincing the reader that Indian exports do not stand to gain materially from British Preference. Analysing exports into characteristic groups he arrives at the conclusion that in Group I to which $\frac{2}{3}$ of our exports belong India cannot hope to gain materially from British Preference. Preference ought to have arisen in case of exports belonging to Group II while those belonging to Group III would have to compete with Colonial and Dominion Products within the British market. The natural result of British Imperial Preference will lead to a loss of India's export trade in neutral markets through increased competition and reduced purchase on retaliation by foreign countries. A neutral market which is expanding at a fast rate would thus be lost. He instances the loss of the Australian market in the case of Indian tea (p. 48). He proves effectively that Britain's capacity to absorb more of our export trade might not after all be existing in which case this new idea and dose of Imperial Preference will not materially aid our export trade situation (p. 46).

The main burden of his thesis is the increased cost which the Indian consumer has to bear in case of Preference to British imports into India for it is almost certain that British prices will seldom be as low as foreign prices though the quality of the product is the same. As mass production is also not likely to be developed in many of the British industrial lines it is not likely that there would be any direct benefit to British industrial situation itself out of this move of Imperial Preference. The net gain to Indian exports from preference will be smaller than the net loss on our imports both to-day and in the future. Hence India stands to lose by the total rejection of the Ottawa Agreement in the present form. A more discriminating preference is needed in the trade agreement and it ought to be confined to Group II of our exports and imports.

We heartily commend this brochure to all readers who wish to understand the economic implications of the Ottawa Agreement. A copy of the *proposed* agreement is included in the Appendix. We advise the author to lower the cost-price a little so as to place it within the reach of students.

B. RAMACHANDRA RAU

"**Woman Labour in India,**" by Rajani Kanta Das, M.Sc., Ph.D., International Labour Office, Geneva, 1931, pp. 72.

Those who have read of Dr. Das's works on Labour movement in India will undoubtedly welcome the publication of the interesting monograph dealing with woman labour in India. It is quite up to the high standard of his previous writings. It is gratifying to note that Dr. Das has collected his information from the material gathered by the I. L. Office and from other inaccessible sources to the average reader. So the monograph contains a great deal of hitherto unavailable statistical material and will be useful as a standard work of reference on the subject.

The present monograph deals with the position of woman labour in large-scale industries such as plantations, factories and mines, for nothing definite is known of their position, work and life in the unorganised industries of the country such as agriculture and domestic service.

Nextly he outlines historically the application of legislative measures in different directions to protect the interests of woman labour. Each of the branches in industry is taken in turn and the position of woman labour with special reference to conditions of employment, health and safety, hours of labour, efficiency of labour, wages and income, standard of living, welfare work and social conditions is stated clearly.

The most valuable part of the monograph consists in the outlining of different suggestions for the elevation of the political, social and industrial status of women. That Indian women should become " good mothers, intelligent citizens and responsible members of society " should be the objective of all social reformers. The social policy of the state should be guided on these lines. For enabling them to produce their fullest expression in all walks of life the Government of India ought to equalise the social, political and industrial opportunities by inaugurating such measures as free and compulsory primary education, creation of new industrial opportunities for women by regulating working conditions, the abolition of child marriage, the purdah system and the caste system with a view to giving opportunities for development of both body and mind and the formation of character and individuality.

At the time of framing new constitutional framework of the Government it is incumbent on the part of the framers to remember this angle of vision for the static and backward condition of India is specially created by the inferior status and economic position and unequal rights and privileges enjoyed by women. National wealth can be augmented only when women contribute their fullest.

Nothing is more important than the extending of the scope of labour legislation so as to cope more effectively than at present with insanitary conditions, fatal accidents, long hours, low wages, and sweating of women labour which sometimes prevail in some industrial centres of India. Thanks to the International Labour Office there has been some improvement in this direction but a higher standard is needed in the direction of their working and living conditions in the organised factories. The lowering of the hours of work from 60 to 54 at least in the perennial factories, the fixing of a minimum wage, the ensuring of prompt and regular payment of wages and the extension of the provisions of social insurance require immediate attention and now that the civic consciousness of women has been roused there is bound to be marked improvement in all directions, *viz.*, living and working conditions of women labour and an improved social policy on the part of the state with reference to women's rights, privileges and obligations.

B. RAMACHANDRA RAU

" **Men, Myths and Movements in German Literature**"—"a volume of historical and critical papers," by William Rose, George Allen and Unwin Ltd., London, 1931 (10 *s*. net), is a scholarly work by the Reader in German in the University of London who is now an acknowledged authority in England on German literature. The volume before us "offers the fruits of research," as the Preface quietly informs us, " extending over a period of eight years " and the fruits are, indeed, worth all the intelligent industry that has gone to their maturing. It consists of ten highly edifying and ably written essays on subjects like the mediaeval beast epic, Dr. Faustus, Grimmelshausen's *Simplicissimus*, Munchausen, Goethe's " Werther," the romantic symbol of the Blue Flower as used by Novalis, and modern German literature in its three aspects since 1913, "the year of the centenary celebration of the War of Liberation." To each of the first two essays is attached a short bibliography which is valuable and there is " a select bibliography of books " at the end " which deal with German literature since 1914."

A real service is thus done to students of German literature by this laudable attempt of the writer to present together in a single volume literary essays which were separately published (some as

Introductions to volumes in the Broadway Translations series) and remained hitherto scattered in different places.

The first essay is an important study of folk-lore and starts with a critical estimate of three important theories regarding the origin of the beast saga, ascribed to a wide-spread Indo-German tradition, to monastic writings and to folk-lore origin. Distinction is drawn also between Beast Fable, more or less international in character, and Beast Epics bearing marks of the country producing them. Then follow instructive and useful summaries of some of the best known works in beast literature as it flourished specially in France and Germany and the influence of the "branches," or collection of stories, of the *Roman de Renard* is carefully traced. These compositions of the *Trouvères* are distinguished from the Latin Beast Epics of monks or priests. The parts played by the oldest Latin Epic *Ecbasis captivi* and *Ysengrimus* are also clearly indicated. Subsequent popularity of the Beast Stories is supposed to be due to a Flemish epic which largely contributed to the fame of *Reynard* as it has developed since the Middle Ages.

The essay on Faust which is a valuable contribution contains four parts in the first of which the historical person behind the legend is shown to have a long history. The author has in a scholarly manner shown that it may be traced from 1507 to 1576 in various records and the contemporary references enable him to establish that if the real name of the personage was Georg it may have been replaced by Johann. In the other parts we have from him equally important accounts of (1) the German Faust Book showing how there was a development of the legend from historical fact and how a literary form was given to the legend and how the various threads of stories may be traced to different sources, (2) Faust in England and (3) the Faust Drama in Germany. Many obscure points have been successfully tackled in these discourses on the historical Doctor Faust and the conclusions reached are really helpful to the students of the Faust literature.

In the Baron Munchausen essay the question of the authorship is first settled, a short account of the Baron's life is given, the value of Professor Rudolph Erich Raspe's work based on the Munchausen stories properly estimated and the important suggestion made that the Baron did not so much invent his ancedotes as " he drew upon memories of what he had heard or read." An attempt is also made to indicate where most of the stories appear in one form or another.

The essay on the historical background of " Werther " is a remarkable piece of elaborate research in which is carefully discussed " the various incidents in Goethe's life which contributed to the shaping of the work." Goethe's life at Wetzlar, his relation with Kestner and Lotte, the unhappy fate of Karl Wilhelm Jerusalem, Goethe's idyllic relation with Frau von La Roche's daughter, Maximiliane, who was married to Brentano—all forming parts of *Werther*—are briefly but adequately dealt with to indicate the wonderful blending of truth and fiction in that famous work. The result is a revelation in the story of *Werther* of " a combination of three different elements " which are clearly elucidated. The paper next touches on " the causes of the morbid mood " then prevalent in Germany, Wertherism being only " one aspect " of " what is known in Germany as *Weltschmerz*." A very illuminating quotation from the writer's " From Goethe to Byron " on the definition of *Weltschmerz* is appropriately made (at page 143-44).

Goethe's attitude to the Jews forms the subject of one of the essays—in which the conclusion drawn from a mass of details is that it was, on the whole, one of dislike to that race, of intolerance if not of hostility and that it " was typical of his attitude to his oppressed countrymen in general, but he failed to soar beyond prejudices.

In the Novalis paper the author examines " the extent to which dream encroached upon reality in the life of one of the Romanticists." Unaffected materially by the French Revolution and even the German *Sturm und Drang* and continuing the sentimental tradition, Novalis made his famous Blue Flower " the symbol of the unattainable, of the object of that vague longing which cannot be satisfied, or even defined, because its roots are in the unconscious." His love for Sophie verges on a form of Mary-worship "with an erotico-mystical exaltation." Religion, Death and Love form for him a mystic trinity.

The three essays on contemporary German literature, dealing with Expressionism, the German drama from 1914 to 1927 and the Spirit of Revolt in German literature from 1914 to 1930, are very interesting and present in clear outline by means of an acute analysis of individual writers of note and their works the main tendencis of to-day. There is a good deal of overlapping in the first two papers but that was unavoidable. The background of this literature is furnished by the attitude of the rising generation to the War and the Revolution that followed it. There was in Germany a sudden " upheaval of the national soul which explains the ecstatic, mystic, even apocalyptic nature of much of the literature produced between 1917 and 1921." " The Expressionists sought to visualise the eternal " by way of a protest against materialism which made poetry approximate as closely as possible to life. Characters in this new literature tend to type-distinctions, tendency to concentration is carried to excess, socialistic hostility to the bourgeois is over-emphasized, revolt against large-town modern civilisation is pronounced and disillusion resulting from the materialism of industrial life leads to pessimism. Even the attitude to women is changed, the relation of man to woman is becoming less emotional and more intellectual giving to love a subordinate place in sex relation. The narrower conception of nationality yields place to a broader one of new humanity. Father-son conflict and that between the higher and the lower self are the staple themes of the dramas. Literature became fundamentally idealistic once more, there was an intense longing for a new world order and a revaluation of traditional ethics. Art became intuitive. Our author carefully brings out these aspects by a rapid survey of the writings of Kaiser, Werfel, Unruh, Toller, Mann, Hasenclever, Viebig and a number of workmen poets. There is a reference too made to post-Expressionist " New Objectivity " which came into existence after 1924. "Expressionism," according to this writer's estimate, " has left an indelible mark on German literature " and " its deepened consciousness of the ultimate significance of problems which previous generations had treated with less searching insight, will render necessary a revaluation of the literature of, at any rate, the nineteenth century and the first decade of the twentieth."

J. G. B.

---

"**A History of Fire and Flame,**" by Dr. Oliver C. de C. Ellis, published for the Poetry Lovers' Fellowship by Messrs Simpkin, Marshall Ltd., London, 1932 (15*s*. nett), is a really wonderful book and one of the outstanding publications of the year. It has a brief but suggestive Preface written by Mr. Lascelles Abercrombie who rightly says—" Fact, and feeling, knowledge and imagination—Dr. Ellis has written the history of them all: for all equally unite in man's experience of Fire."

Dr. Ellis in writing this " great Historie " has with equal success devised an incredible, nay romantic, tale full of fascinating interest. In the dedication to Richard Vernon Wheeler the author observes that he has attempted " to trace the development of a few ideas " and that his " book should stand or fall by the resulting map of this voyage of exploration." His ambition is " to offer a stereoscopic view to readers who have been too thoroughly habituated either to the single lens of 'Science' or to the single eye of the 'Arts." ' This ambition has been singularly fulfilled. The details, for all his modesty, in being fully illustrative have also become encyclopaedic and as a result the not-"feasible" is wholly achieved here. Dr. Ellis is remarkably loyal both to the genius of research and to that of the poetic imagination. The whole idea of a history of the thoughts of all the ages connected with the subject is courageously conceived and the execution is as lucid as it is brilliant. Fire is treated in a volume of 377 pages containing 252 sections or paragraphs arranged in 11 chapters with appropriate headings. The illustrations and the exhaustive index enhance the value of the volume considerably and there is also a supplementary bibliographical list.

The abundance of material is so bewildering that we find it difficult to attempt a summary. Dr. Ellis has practically ransacked the literature of the whole world in making this grand contribution to what is more than a chemical history, for, here facts, fables and fancies jostle with one another amicably. We are frequently reminded of Burton's "Anatomy of Melancholy" and Sir Thomas Browne's "Religio Medici."

In tracing the history of fire from hazy antiquity full of fables and myths through the intermediate stages of astrologers and alchemists to the days of modern scientific research and investigation he has also traced the civilising influence of fire and flame on the entire history of humanity and his digressions are as entertaining as those of Browne, rich as both these fascinating writers are in out of the way facts and attractive odds and ends of folklore. And the whole mass of valuable information is beautifully moulded into a fine literary form in which poetry forms with science a rich blend irresistible in its charm. Every branch of learning is here made to contribute its quota and Dr. Ellis lends the fluency of a lucid style and the accuracy of scientific touch to the fascinating narration. All the wonders of man's discoveries are harmoniously combined with his fancies and the myths and fables and anecdotes he has associated with fire, and the reader stands face to face with the beauty and mystery of life itself. The results of scientific experiment are illuminated with flashes of poetic fancy making the volume unique in its complexity calculated to powerfully appeal to a very wide circle of readers. Dr. Ellis carries us back to the beginnings of human progress. Philosophy, science, history, mythology and theology are all suitably laid under contribution by the writer's all-embracing imagination and he brings to bear on this varied wealth the power of lucid interpretation. How freely we are made to range with him at ease over this varied world of facts and fables and enjoy the beauty of a literary performance in which scientific accuracy is enlivened by poetic suggestiveness! Though the foundation of the whole book is laid deep in science, philosophical speculations, fanciful theories, wild conjectures, beliefs, happy guesses at truth, myths, fables, fancies, magic, superstition—all find their appropriate place in this unique work. We are sure this entertaining volume will be read and re-read.

J. G. B.

# Ourselves

## THE MOUAT MEDAL

A Mouat medal has been awarded to Mr. Adharchandra Das, M.A., on the result of research work done by him during the third year's term of his P. R. Studentship in Literary subjects for 1928.

* * *

## THE MAHENDRANATH RAY PRIZE AND MEDAL FOR 1932

The Mahendranath Ray Prize and Medal of full value for the year 1932 will be awarded to each of the following candidates :—

| Name. | Subject. |
|---|---|
| (1) Dr. Rohinimohan Chaudhuri, M.A., Ph.D. | " The Evolution of Indian Industries." |
| (2) Dr. Manomohan Ray, M.Sc., Ph.D. | " Foreign Investment in British India." |

* * *

## THE KEDARNATH BANERJEE GOLD MEDAL FOR 1932

The Kedarnath Banerjee Gold Medal for the year 1932 will be awarded to the following candidates, each being awarded a gold medal of half the value of the medal :—

(1) Jogeschandra Saha—University Law College.
(2) Haridas Ghosh—University Law College.

* * *

## THE MAHARAJA SIR J. M. TAGORE GOLD AND SILVER MEDALS FOR 1931

The Maharaja Sir J. M. Tagore Gold and Silver Medals for the year 1931 will be awarded as follows :—

(1) Amiyakrishna Chaudhury—University Law College (Gold Medal)
(2) Mrinalkumar Ghosh—University Law College (Silver Medal)

* * *

## SIR C. V. RAMAN TAKES LEAVE.

The Syndicate have recommended to the Senate that Sir C. V. Raman, Kt., M.A., D.Sc., Ph.D. LL.D., D.L., F.R.S., N.L., Palit Professor of Physics, be granted leave for the period from 1st April, 1933, to 31st May, 1934, and the Professor be permitted to accept his appointment as Director of Indian Institute of Science at Bangalore.

THE CALCUTTA REVIEW

MARCH, 1933

# SOME PROBLEMS OF EDUCATION IN BENGAL[1]

I must at the outset thank you most sincerely for the great honour you have done me in electing me to preside over the present session of your Conference. I am all the more sensible of the distinction you have conferred on me by reason of the fact that your past Presidents include distinguished scholars and administrators, some of whom have justly acquired a worldwide reputation. I lack their learning, their wisdom and their experience, although I venture to claim that I share equally with them an anxiety for the welfare of this great province and a readiness to devote myself to the cause of its future educational expansion.

Problems arising out of the present educational system of our country present such diversity and complexity that I cannot possibly venture to deal with all of them in the course of my address. I accordingly propose to refer only to some of the urgent questions which have recently been before us, and particularly to the almost universal dissatisfaction with our present educational system. Most of the unsatisfactory features of under-graduate and post-graduate education have their origin in a defective system of secondary education. And though this is a conference of representatives of teachers in the university and its affiliated colleges, I shall be forgiven if I first take up the New Matriculation Regulations which have been recently passed by the Senate. The future of university education depends vitally on the reorganisation of secondary education and to my mind a reference to these regulations is not only justified but also necessary. You will have noticed that they aim at several reforms of a comprehensive character. In the first place, our mother-tongue is to be recognised as the medium of instruction and examination in all subjects other than English,—a change which is long overdue and which is justly regarded as of far-reaching significance. In the second place, the present list of subjects has been revised in important directions so as to render the entire course more up-to-date, useful and practical. History and Geography are to be made compulsory and Elementary Science is, for the present, included in the list of optional subjects with the proviso that it will be made compulsory after five years. In the third place, certain new subjects, such as Domestic Science and Music, which are specially suitable for girls, have been added to the list. They are of course in addition to the subjects which are open to all. The educational needs of boys and girls are not exactly the same and the University must provide for the special requirements of the latter. In the fourth place, there is provision for imparting instruction in a number of "practical" subjects which may to a certain extent be expected to meet the demands of vocational education. I am under no illusion that the introduction of these subjects will immediately solve the burning problem of unemployment among educated youths. But I do feel that the reorganised courses of study, now made varied and practical, will stimulate our students to mental effort and will help to make them more earnest and self-reliant. The regulations are fraught with great possibilities and although there may be difference of opinion as regards the details here and there, I believe there is general agreement that the scheme is on the whole sound and will prove beneficial. You will remember that these changes were formulated by the University nearly eleven years ago and we are anxious that there should not be any further delay in giving effect to them. They are now before Government and we trust will soon receive sanction and begin to operate in the near future. I hope and trust the University will not remain satisfied with merely recognising the Vernacular as the medium for the Matriculation Examination but will proceed to take the necessary steps with a view to make it the vehicle of instruction and examination for all, including the highest, examinations of the University and thus give our national language its rightful place in the scheme of University studies.

---

[1] Speech delivered by Mr. Syama Prasad Mookerjee, M.A., B.L., Barrister at Law, M.L.C., as President of the All-Bengal University and College Teachers' Conference at Albert Hall, Calcutta, on 22nd February, 1933.

The question of girls' education is assuming considerable importance and magnitude. It is not perhaps generally known that the number of girls appearing at the Matriculation Examination is steadily increasing. In 1920, only 116 girls appeared at the Matriculation Examination, in 1926 the number was 183 and in 1932 it rose to 670. This is, no doubt, a welcome sign. It is true that many of these girls bring their educational career to an end at the Matriculation stage. Still, quite a large number of them join the University and study in some of our affiliated colleges. The question of making proper arrangements for their study and recreation has therefore to be very carefully considered. I have no desire to cast any reflection on the authorities of the only affiliated college for girls maintained out of the public funds. The fact however remains that a large number of guardians prefer their wards to be educated in non-Government institutions. A special responsibility, therefore, rests with the authorities of these colleges. I would ask you to consider the question of future arrangements for imparting instruction to girls in our affiliated colleges, particularly the question of co-education, and also to suggest, if you think it proper, any changes in the courses of study so as to make them suitable in every way for girls.

One of the questions now before the University is with regard to the congestion of students in our Calcutta colleges.

It appears that the number of students in mofussil colleges is decreasing rapidly and also that some institutions in Calcutta have on their rolls a disproportionately large number of students. Apart from the fact that too large a roll strength makes it difficult for the college authorities to properly look after the individual needs of the students, there is another aspect of the matter which requires our serious consideration. Calcutta has its attractions and, it must be admitted, its temptations. It will certainly be better if immature boys who generally matriculate at the age of 15 or 16 prosecute their studies at least for the Intermediate Examination in institutions near their homes and continue to remain as far as possible under the protecting influence of their parents and guardians. This perhaps is one of the reasons why the University has encouraged the establishment of small Intermediate colleges outside Calcutta. Unfortunately, however, a majority of mofussil colleges are not in a prosperous condition. I do not think it necessary to discuss the question in detail at this stage but I would ask you seriously to consider if it is possible or desirable to check the congestion of students in Calcutta, and if so, it is our duty to indicate the lines on which the University should proceed in the matter.

While dwelling on this topic, I would also like to refer to the possibility of securing greater contact between the colleges, at least in Calcutta. Much may be gained if we can work out a scheme which would make it possible for students reading in different colleges to attend lectures on selected subjects in particular institutions which enjoy special facilities for teaching them. This may with advantage be done with regard to certain Honours subjects. Every college need not necessarily arrange for Honours teaching in all subjects. Such inter-collegiate arrangements will not only benefit students but will also lead to a better understanding among the colleges themselves, a better utilisation of existing resources and may ultimately result in economy. We should also consider whether we should not request the University to permit its professors and lecturers to deliver special courses of lectures for the benefit of the students reading in our affiliated colleges. Many college teachers work as part-time lecturers in the Post-Graduate Department. There is no reason why Post-Graduate teachers also should not co-operate and impart instruction in special subjects to students of affiliated colleges.

I would next refer to another question which has for some time past assumed considerable importance and has evoked some controversy as well, I mean the question of deprovincialisation of Government Arts colleges and schools. I am glad to find that you have given this subject the special importance which it certainly deserves and propose to hold a separate meeting for its consideration to-day. I have no desire to anticipate the discussion but you will permit me to place before you certain aspects of this important question. I shall not deal with the deprovincialisation of Government schools but shall refer to Arts colleges only. There are 45 Arts colleges in Bengal; of these ten are maintained by Government and thirty-five are non-Government institutions. Roughly speaking, about 3,500 students are on the rolls of these ten Government colleges, while more than 17,000 students are reading in the other 35 non-Government colleges. Government spend more than 11 lacs of rupees annually for the maintenance of these ten colleges and provide grants-in-aid to 20 non-Government colleges to the extent of about Rs. 2,60,000 only. It is admitted that there is room for radical improvements in our affiliated colleges. It is further acknowledged that improvements on any wide scale are not possible without financial assistance. It is also conceded that the finances of the province being what they are, it may not be possible for Government to spend more on education than what they are doing at present. Even if some money is available, it is more than probable it will be required for Primary education. It might have been a different matter if Government had unlimited funds at their disposal, but things being what they are, what justification can there be for Government for spending 11 lacs of rupees for 3,500 students to the comparative neglect of the interests of the great bulk of the Bengali students reading in non-Government colleges ? The interest taken by Government in non-Government colleges has been amply proved by their decision to suspend the non-recurring grant of Rs. 1,29,000, distributed for many years through the University. I am fully aware that if the policy of deprovincialisation is accepted, the period of transition will be one of considerable difficulty. Existing contracts must be observed. Further, deprovincialisation does not necessarily mean abolition of Government colleges, but it involves their being handed over to non-official bodies and their administration in accordance with a system of grants-in-aid. The savings in the first few years may not be considerable but the policy of deprovincialisation must be accepted and a beginning made immediately.

There is one aspect of the matter on which I would lay great stress. We must demand that the money released must be spent on the improvement of collegiate education. To put it plainly, we do not want the introduction of a scheme of deprovincialisation, followed by a reduction of State expenditure and the absorption of the available surplus in the departments of Police and Jails. If that be the result of our efforts for deprovincialisation, I would much rather leave the Government colleges as they are and wait with what patience I may for better days to come.

It is not possible for me in the course of this address to examine in detail the arguments usually urged against deprovincialisation. But I cannot help referring to one objection which is raised whenever this question comes up for discussion. It is stated that generally in non-Government colleges discipline suffers and that political and extra-academic considerations usually play a large part in the actual administration of the institutions. I am not desirous of entering into the rather delicate comparison of Government colleges with non-

Government colleges. But I refuse to believe that Government colleges have proved ideal places for maintenance of discipline and that non-Government colleges have proved the reverse. If discipline be interpreted as meaning that the patriotic feelings and sentiments of the youths of the province have to be trampled under foot, if discipline means the threat of mass punishment of students for the alleged guilt of a few, or their drastic punishment if boys do not always behave in strict and rigid conformity with the old and musty departmental rules which were framed to meet the requirements of a remote by-gone period, if discipline means that boys are to be brought into their class rooms by the show of police force, then I would say that Government colleges are superior to non-Government colleges. But if discipline implies firmness accompanied by a sympathetic understanding and a tactful handling of difficult and delicate situations, if discipline is to be broad-based on obedience, spontaneously evoked more by personal respect and affection than by mere frigid authority, then I would refuse to place Government colleges in a position of superiority. I claim to know the inner working of many educational institutions both belonging to Government and outside their sphere of influence, and I feel no hesitation in saying that, on the whole, the authorities of non-Government colleges, although they had to pass through times of abnormal anxiety and excitement, have carried on their difficult task of administration and maintained order and regularity in a manner worthy of commendation.

Equally strongly do I feel that there is no foundation for the charge that the authorities of non-Government colleges are likely to be desirous of regulating their policy by political or extra-academic considerations. On the other hand, we may legitimately point towards the tendency on the part of Government to introduce openly and flagrantly extra-academic considerations in the matter of making appointments in Government institutions. We consider it deplorable that religion or community, and not merit, should be the deciding factor in making appointments to the teaching staff. We feel that the policy of de-provincialisation, if followed with adequate safeguards, will make education free from the cross-currents and under-currents of political and communal intrigue and place the institutions under the control of autonomous Governing Bodies whose sole aim would be to promote academic interests.

You will permit me to make a suggestion or two for carrying out some improvements in certain branches of activity of your Association. I would invite you to consider for a moment whether the magazine of your Association which is making its influence felt in educational circles, cannot extend its sphere of influence and make itself a more powerful organ for the spread of culture throughout the land. The promoters of the magazine have only to exert themselves a little in order to utilise to the fullest extent the vast intellectual resources at the disposal of the Association. A powerful press is a very potent influence both for good and evil and the Association can most effectively further its interests by extending and strengthening its activities in this direction.

I would further request the members of your Association to direct their attention to another field of activity which does not seem to have attracted much notice up to the present. Physical education, games and sports, have been relegated to a minor position and though the prevailing agitation for improving the national physique has caught the imagination of the students, it does not seem to have found any corresponding response from our teachers as a body. I would ask the teachers of colleges to guide this growing movement for improving physical education. Apart from its obvious and manifold advantages, it presents to them a unique opportunity for strengthening their hold on the affection and respect of the student community.

Before I bring my address to a close, I would like to say a few words on the general question of remodelling the present system of education. I have no desire to review historically the different stages through which the present system has passed. I fully recognise some of the great benefits which it has conferred on the people of this province. Even under this system, we have had many eminent personalities who in various fields of activity have shed undying lustre on their names and have served the best interests of their motherland. Western education has helped to rouse our political consciousness, has to a large extent unified the scattered elements spread throughout this vast country, and has had remarkable effects on our national awakening. No one can forget the inestimable value of these contributions. Leaving aside these generalisations, when we come to the immediate present, we are faced with a situation which appears to be almost baffling in character. The fact remains that the present system of education has now come to what practically amounts to a stage of collapse. The people of the province have from the beginning displayed a unique eagerness to take advantage of the educational facilities which were open to them and Bengal has witnessed a remarkable growth of secondary and collegiate education. But what do we find to be the present state of affairs ? The average student whom we are producing is not equipped to fight the battle of life and the question of unemployment amongst the educated middle-class population of Bengal is becoming more and more acute. The time has long passed by when we could console ourselves by quoting the cheap platitude that a great centre of learning should not apply itself to the solution of the "bread problem" and that its motto should be "education for education's sake." I do not mean to suggest that a University can directly make itself responsible on any large scale for finding employment for its alumni. But it has certainly an obligation to impart instruction to the youths of the country on lines which will not only keep alive in them their zeal for knowledge and truth but also make them manly and useful citizens, well-equipped to earn a decent living by means of some honest trade or profession. The present system of education does not generally fulfil these conditions and the time has come when the entire system has to be overhauled and given a predominantly practical turn. I have no sympathy with those who suggest that the remedy lies in simply reducing the number of educational institutions and curtailing the facilities now open to our youths. That is a policy of destruction, a negative policy which can only be worthy of reactionaries who are no genuine friends of our country. To my mind the remedy lies not only in re-organising the present scheme of studies but also in the establishment of new types of institutions which would provide adequate training in technical, commercial, agricultural and allied subjects immediately after the Matriculation stage. This would give the thousands of boys who pass through our hands every year a chance of choosing their careers, instead of being compelled to follow one type of education, which is predominantly literary and is practically the only avenue now open to them.

It is conceivable that many existing institutions may suitably re-organise their activities and provide for necessary instruction in one or more of such vocational subjects. One of the drawbacks of the present system is too much rigidity and standardisation by rules and regulations. I would certainly welcome the possibility of some institutions developing themselves according to their own light and providing for instruction of a specialised character. They cannot obviously do it single-handed ; financial assistance must be rendered to them and they must be encouraged to move on generally approved lines in accordance with a well-thought-out scheme. There must also be closer relationship between the University and practical business-men in whose hands lies the control of established trades and industries, for that alone will prevent us from making our teaching too theoretical. The University is at present considering a proposal for the establishment of small institutions where agricultural education, both theoretical and practical, will be imparted to a select number of students. We do hope that some acceptable scheme may be formulated and carried into effect in the near future.

The problem of future reorganisation of the educational system is one of vast complexity and magnitude. It will require the united action of Government, the University and the Colleges and must ultimately depend on public support. I would ask you to give this matter your most careful consideration and, if possible, to make some constructive proposals. In view of the present financial depression, it may not be feasible for us to launch upon too ambitious a scheme but it may be worth our while if we can make even a small beginning.

I do not intend to conclude this address with a note of despondency. However discouraging the present may appear, we must on no account lose our faith in the future. Believe me when I say that your share in bringing our present struggles for solving our immediate problems to a speedy and successful termination will be considerable. But you must proceed on right lines with that boldness of vision, which should always characterise persons who take upon themselves the sacred task of moulding the character of the rising generation. Though the teachers of this country have not yet been given their rightful place in society and though some of the facilities for work and service to which they are entitled by virtue of their profession and self-sacrifice are even now being denied to them, it will yet have to be acknowledged that they continue to exercise tremendous influence over the destinies of the future citizens of the country. I would appeal to you to examine with the utmost care all problems of educational reconstruction, some only of which have just been outlined by me and to lay down principles which should guide our future activities. I would again appeal to you to realise the vastness of the responsibilities that rest on your shoulders. It is for you to educate public opinion on right lines, to advise the University and Government in solving the complex educational problems of the day, such as—the adjustment of the needs of Primary, Secondary and University education; the conflicting claims of literary and vocational education; the co-ordination of various courses of study; the removal of the evils of the examination system; the building up of corporate life in our colleges; State-aid and Government control over educational institutions; the reconstitution of University bodies; the maintenance of a proper standard of teaching and examination and the improvement of the conditions of service of teachers. It is for you to give concrete shape to the measures that may be agreed upon after mature deliberation and to carry them out with steadfast loyalty and devotion to the sacred cause of Education. It is also for you not only to inculcate in the minds of youths the passion for knowledge and truth and the spirit of reverence, but also to foster in them that love of their motherland—that real patriotism—which impels one to sacrifice everything for the good of one's country. I look forward to the day when our teachers will be regarded as leaders of society not only in realms of thought but also in fields of action; when the nation will look up to them for initiative and guidance in its different spheres of activity. That day, I fervently hope, is not far distant; and in the meantime it may be expected that no efforts will be lacking on your part to rise to that eminent position to which you may legitimately aspire by virtue of your noble and sacred vocation.

# THEORIES OF ILLUSION IN INDIAN PHILOSOPHY

The explanation of errors of perception has been a perplexing question for all philosophy. The question is this: How are we to explain the false perception of silver in a shell? Is it due to the object itself? Or, is it due to our subjective attitude towards the object? According to the Nyāya, while valid knowledge (pramā) is objective in the sense of being grounded in the object itself (arthajanya), all error is subjective in so far as it is due to the introduction of a certain foreign character into the object by the knowing subject (adhyāropa). In the case of the mirage, for example, there is nothing wrong in the object. "The object all the while remains what it actually is. In regard to the flickering rays of the sun, when there arises the cognition of water, there is no error in the object: it is not that the rays are not rays, nor that the flickering is not flickering; the error lies in the cognition: as it is the cognition which instead of appearing as the congnition of the flickering rays, appears as the cognition of water, *i.e.*, as the cognition of a thing as something which it is not."[1] From this it follows that there is no error in the simple apprehension (alocana) of the object. The object as given in indeterminate (nirvikalpaka) perception consists of a number of actually present flickering rays of the sun. But on account of certain defects in the sense-organ and the influence of association and memory, the given datum is misinterpreted as water in the determinate (savikalpaka) perception of it. Hence the error lies not in the indeterminate perception of the given but in the determinate perception of it as worked up and modified by some representative elements.[2]

---

[1] Vārttika, 1-1-2; 1-1-4. *Vide* also Nyāya-Bhāṣya, 1-1-4, 4-2-35, 4-2-37.

[2] Tātparya, 1-1-4.

The modern school of the Nyāya shows great ingenuity to explain the perceptual character of illusory experience. That in illusion there is the attribution (āropa) of a false character to a perceived fact is no doubt true.[1] But the questions that arise here are: How do we come to ascribe the false character? How again does this false character appear as something actually perceived in illusion? The Nyāya rightly points out that an illusory experience is a single perception. It is not, as Prabhākara thinks, a complex of perception and recollection with their distinction blurred by obscuration of memory. Thus when we have the illusion of silver in a shell, we no doubt attribute silverness to the shell which is not its proper locus. But at the same time it is equally doubtless that the silver is somehow perceived and not merely remembered in illusion. This has been very well pointed out in a recent article by A. C. Ewing when he observes: "The difficulty in the case of perception is not the mere fact of error, but the demand that we should hold both that what we immediately perceive is numerically identical with a physical object or a part of such an object and yet that it is quite different."[2] To explain illusion, therefore, we have to explain its perceptual character, instead of trying to explain it away.

Taking the illusion of silver in a shell as an illustration, the Nyāya account comes to this. There is first the contact of sense with something present before it. Owing to some defects, the sense apprehends such general features of the thing as its brightness, etc., but fails to discern its peculiar and distinctive features. But the general features being associated with some other thing (here silver) recall the images or ideas of the peculiar properties of that other thing. Through such recollection there is a sort of contact (jñānalakṣaṇāsannikarṣa) between sense and that other thing (*i.e.*, silver). Hence there is an actual perception of silver in the illusion.[1] The perceived silver is then referred to the locus (idam) or the something which is present before and perceived by sense. Hence in the illusion there is perception of both the 'this' and the 'silver,' although in different ways. So far there seems to be nothing wrong. The error comes in and the illusion arises when the silver that is perceived elsewhere is referred as a predicate to the 'this' as its subject. It is this determinate knowledge of the 'this' as qualified by 'silverness' (viśiṣtajñānam) that can account for a man's efforts to gain possession of the illusory object. In recognition (pratyabhijñā), in which we say 'this is that man I saw yesterday,' we see how certain presentative and representative elements combine to make up one single perception.[2] Any ordinary valid perception also illustrates how a given sensum combines with associated ideas to make up one percept. But while in these, the combination has its objective counterpart, in illusion the relation between the perceived 'this' and 'silver' is not objectively real. It is contradicted and sublated either by a subsequent experience that corrects the illusory experience of silver and shows it to be false or by the experience of disappointment which ensues when we take possession of it. In the first case the cognition of silver is shorn of its objective (viṣayāpahāra), and in the second case we are put in possession, not of the silver, but of the shell (phalāpahāra).[3] Hence the error of perception lies not in the presentations concerned in the perception but in the determination of one presentation by another given through association and memory (jātyasaṁskārāt). And since this determination results in a judgment of the object as something other than what it is, the Nyāya theory of error is called 'anyathākhyāti' or 'viparitakhyāti.' According to it, an erroneous cognition is presentational in character and has some basis in facts. But the facts being misplaced and misrelated, error becomes a false apprehension of the real.

---

[1] *Vide* Tarkabhāṣā, p. 29, Vārttika, p. 24.

[2] Mind, April, 1930, p. 149.

---

[1] Nyāyamañjarī, pp. 180-85.

[2] Tattvacintāmani, Pratyakṣakhaṇḍa, Sec. on anyathākhyāti, esp. pp. 477, 484, 523 ff. *Cf.* "Mamatindriyajayatvāt jātyasaṁskārācca sāksātkāritvamevobhayatra," *ibid*, p. 525.

[3] Nyāyamañjarī, p. 186; Tattvaciṇtāmani, p. 532 f.

The above view of ‘ anyathākhyāti ’ is common to the Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika. It has been accepted in the main by Kumārila, Rāmānuja and the Jainas.[1] But the Bauddha, the Prābhākara Mīmāṁsā and Advaita Vedānta systems oppose the Nyāya view and propose different theories. Hence the Naiyāikas proceed to repudiate the other theories of error. According to the Yogācāras, there is no extra-mental reality and things are only thoughts or ideas. Reality is a stream of cognitions bifurcated into a subjective and an objective series. Error consists in an illegitimate process of projection of subjective ideas as objective and extra-mental facts. All cognition of objects thus objectifies the subjective and is therefore erroneous. This view is called ‘ ātmakhyāti ’ or ‘ jñānākārakhyāti,’ since it insists on the sole reality of ideas and looks upon all objects as cognitions wrongly taken for external things.

This theory, however, the Naiyāyikas object, fails to account for the facts of the case. On the theory of the subjective idealism of the Yogācāras, there is no difference between knowledge, and the subject and object of knowledge, everything being an idea only. Hence the cognition of silver should appear, not in the form of ‘ this is silver,’ but ‘ I am silver,’ which, however, is not the case. Then, if everything be an idea we do now know how to account for the difference between an idea and its corresponding percept. Finally, the Nyāya view, that error is the cognition of an object as what it is not, really includes the Yogācāra theory that in error the subjective is taken for the objective and is so cognised as what it is not.[2]

The Mādhyamika school of Bauddha philosophy negates all existence. It holds the ‘ asatkhyāti ’ view that error consists in the manifestation of the non-existent as existent. The cognition of silver in the shell is erroneous because it manifests the non-existent silver as existent, and we become conscious of this when our first cognition of silver is contradicted by the subsequent cognition of shell. Against this it has been urged by the Naiyāyika that the illusion of silver is not entirely baseless ; it cannot arise out of nothing. What is absolutely non-existent cannot produce even the wrong cognition of silver. The illusion of silver is due to something in the nature of the shell. It occurs generally in connection with a shell and the like, but not indifferently with everything. Even if error is cognition of the non-existent as existent, it is the cognition of a thing as what it is not. Hence we have in it a case of 'anyathākhyāti'—which thus includes the 'asatkhyāti' of the Mādhyamika. In truth, however, the utterly non-existent cannot be the object of any knowledge whatsoever.[1]

---

[1] *Vide* Nyāyakandalī, p. 178 f.; Śāstradīpikā, p. 58; Śrībhāṣya 1-1-1, Tattvārtha-Sutra, I, 31-32.

[2] Tātparya, p. 85 f.; Nyāyamañjarī, p. 178, 546 f.

The Advaita Vedānta puts forward the view of 'anirvacanīyakhyāti.' This does not differ so widely from the Nyāya 'anyathākhyāti' as it may appear at first sight. While the two views agree so far as the nature and mechanism of illusory perception are concerned, there is difference in one essential point. According to 'anirvacanīyakhyāti,' there is in the illusion of silver a contact of the defective sense-organ with the glittering shell and then a mental modification answering to the form of 'this object.' Now through the operation of nescience (avidyā), as aided by the past impressions of silver, revived by 'this object's' similarity to it, there is the production of some inexplicable silver which lasts so long as the illusion lasts. It is neither real nor unreal, nor both real and unreal, but indefinable and indeterminable. Hence in the illusion of silver there is an actual cognition of silver. The illusion is presentative in its character so far as it is connected with some silver actually present to consciousness. But while, according to the Nyāya, this presentation of silver is due to association and memory

---

[1] Tātparya, p. 86 f.; Nyāyamañjarī, pp. 176 f., 545-46.

(jātyasaṁskārāt), to the Advaitavādin, it is due to the production of the 'cognised silver' for the time being. To this the Naiyāyikas object that if the silver is actually produced, there would be no illusion but a valid perception. If it be said that the silver is supernatural (alaukika) and is erroneously cognised as natural (laukika), we have in it just a case of 'anyathākhyāti.' If not, a supernatural indefinable silver cannot account for our efforts to obtain it.[1]

The Prabhākara school of the Mīmāṁsā differs from all others and advocates the view of 'akhyāti' or 'vivekākhyāti.' According to it, error consists simply in the want of discrimination between percept and image, or between direct apprehension and memory. It is a sort of confused memory (smṛtipramoṣa). In the case of the illusion of silver in the shell what happens is that there is first the direct perception of an object with the attribute of brightness, etc. Then through association by similarity the perceived bright object revives the image of silver. Hence the state of cognition has the dual character of percept and image, of something seen and something remembered. On account of certain abnormal conditions the two things are not kept distinct but are allowed to fuse or coalesce, and we have the resulting cognition of silver referred to the piece of shell. When the illusion is corrected, there is no sublation of the silver but only an explicit recognition of the presentative and representative factors of the wrong cognition. The distinction between the two being cognised, there remains no confusion as to the fact of silver being only remembered and not to perceived.[2]

To this theory the Naiyāyika objects that it fails to account for the presentative character of illusion. So long as we are under the illusion we have a consciousness of the silver as something present and perceived, and not as what was perceived before and is now only remembered. Further, there can be no activity to secure the silver unless there is a positive and determinate cognition of it. Non-discrimination, as mere absence of knowledge, cannot be the ground of such actions as are generally connected with an illusory experience. Hence the illusion must be a single determinate cognition of an object. All this comes out in our subsequent judgment of the illusion as it stands corrected and negated. It is in the form : " What I had seen is not silver," and not " What I had remembered is not silver." This obviously shows that the illusion of silver is an error of perception and not of memory. Finally, even on the akhyāti theory it must be admitted that in error there is a cognition of the object as what it is not. This will mean that akhyāti is but a form of ' anyathākhyāti.' Hence the Naiyāyikas conclude that anyathākhyāti is the most satisfactory theory of error. It gives us all that the other theories require, but is not vitiated by their faults.[1]

---

[1] Tātparya, pp. 85-87; Nyāyamañjarī, p. 187 f.; *cf.* Śrībhāṣya, 1-1-1; Nyāyakandalī. p. 178 f. *Vide* also Vedānta-Paribhāṣā, Ch. I.

[2] *Vide* Jhā, Prāābhkara School of Purvamīmāṁsā, pp. 28-32, Sadholal, Lectures on Nyāya, Ch. III.

Among the theories of perceptual error or illusion as explained above that of the Nyāya seems to be more acceptable than any other. For the Bauddha idealist error consists in the objective appearance of subjective ideas. But this cannot explain the distinction between true and false perception. In both the object of knowledge is not really other than knowledge or an idea, although it may appear to be so. Hence both must be equally wrong. Further, there being nothing but ideas, one idea may be mistaken for another, but not for that which is no idea at all, *i.e.*, for an extra-mental object. Perceptual errors cannot, therefore, be explained on the theory of subjective idealism of the Yogācāra or the Berkleyian type. " For," as Ewing says," even in error we are concerned not with our ideas but with external reality......error is not a mere dwelling on our ideas but an unsuccessful cognising of objects."[1]

---

[1] Tātparya, p. 87 f., Nyāyamañjarī, pp. 179-83; Tattvacintāmaṇi, Sec. on anyathākhyāti, pp. 448 f., 484-86, *cf.* Nyāyakandalī, p. 180 f. Siddhāntamuktāvalī, p. 136.

The Mīmāṁsakas treat error as the subjective appearance of an object. In it an idea or image of the mind is referred to a given object so as to become one with it. This explanation of perceptual error was once generally accepted in European philosophy. According to most of the Western systems, in the illusory perception a real object is modified by subjective factors supplied by the mind through association, memory, emotion, etc. Among modern thinkers, Lossky holds that 'falsity is the subjective appearance of the object, since foreign elements can be introduced into the object only by the knowing subject.'[2] Bosanquet only puts the matter in objective terms when he says that ' in falsehood something actual pretends to be something else, or, like a false coin, has not the significance which it claims.'[3] But while this may be accepted as a general definition of error, it does not explain how in perceptual error certain subjective factors, ideas or images, are actually felt as perceived out there in space. It cannot be said that we do not really perceive the illusory object but only imagine that we do perceive it. Why should we doubt the verdict of experience here if we do not doubt it elsewhere ? And experience clearly tells us that we do perceive the illusory object.

To explain the perceptual character of illusory experience the Advaita Vedānta supposes the temporary production of certain positive entities of an indeterminate order (anirvacanīyā-prātibhāsikī sattā). These are neither real nor unreal, but actual facts. The illusory silver is not real, because it is contradicted by a closer experience. It is not unreal, because it is perceived as an actual fact so long as the illusion lasts. Hence it is an appearance which is undeterminable as real or unreal, and is ultimately due to avidyā or ignorance. But how ignorance can produce a positive entity and then make us perceive it as an existent fact is left unexplained. Further, as Alexander has pointed out, 'error does not give us a new and more shadowy being than the spatio-temporal reality, but is the world of determinate being misread.'[1]

---

[1] Mind, April, 1930, pp. 138-39.

[2] Lossky, The Intuitive Basis of Knowledge, pp. 227f., 267f.

[3] Bosanquet, Logic, VI, pp. 67, 70.

According to the Nyāya, illusion is a misplaced fact. All the factors of an illusory perception are real and perceived facts, but they are brought into a wrong relation. In the illusory perception of silver, for example, we have an actual perception of a certain locus and some silver, both as real facts. The error arises because the silver perceived at a different time and place, is related to the time and place occupied by the perceived locus, namely, the shell. Modern neo-realism gives a similar explanation of perceptual error. According to it, 'error consists in wrongly combining the elements of reality.' "Everything which is illusory in the illusion does actually exist in correspondence with the mental activity through which it is revealed; but the personal character of the activity dislocates the real object from its place in things, and refers it to a context to which it does not belong. So when I fancy a horse's body, and complete it with a man's head, the head exists in reality, but not upon a horse's body."[2] As Alexander also says: "Some of our objects are illusory; they are real so far as they are perspectives of space-time, but they contain an element introduced by our personality, and do not belong where they seem to belong."[3] This however does not explain how illusory objects can be perceived at the time and place, to which they do not belong. How can we perceive here and now something which exists elsewhere? Montague tries to explain this by some distortion of the real object in producing its effect on the brain. He thinks that the so-called sensory illusions result from certain physical or peripherally physiological distortions of the real object underlying them.[1] This means that illusory perceptions depend on certain objective and real conditions in the same way in which true perceptions are so conditioned. Holt goes further than this and establishes the objectivity of error. He thinks that all errors are cases of contradiction or contrariety. The perception of silver is illusory because it is contradicted by the experience of the same object as shell and not silver. But neither the experience of shell nor that of silver is subjective. Both of the contradictory experiences are objective, since the real object itself has contradictory characters. Holt says that "the case of hallucinations is paralleled by such cases as that of mirrored space, wherein sundry mirrored objects occupy the same spatial positions as are occupied by other 'real' objects situated behind the mirror." Hence we are to say that the error consists in entertaining mutually contradictory propositions, of which one may be preferable, but none subjective, because the world is full of such contradictory propositions.[2] On this view, however, the distinction between truth and error becomes insignificant. The same thing may, with equal truth, be called a shell or silver. The Nyāya does not go so far as to say that contradictory characters belong to the same thing or that contradictory propositions are equally objective. It is not the case that the same real has the contrary characters of shellness and silverness. It has really one character, namely, shellness. But the silver is also a perceived fact. Hence the crucial question is: how can the silver, which exists elsewhere, be perceived here and now? The Nyāya explains this by jñānalakṣaṇāpratyāsatti, by which the silver is presented through our previous knowledge of it. Hence there is a jñānalakṣanā perception of the silver. Among Western Psychologists Wundt, Ward and Stout admit the reality of the Naiyāyika's jñānalakṣana perception. To distinguish it from ordinary perceptions, they propose to call it "complication.'' Wundt explains complication as a simultaneous association between sensations or perceptions of different senses as parts of a single percept. The sight of sugar gives us a direct knowledge of its sweetness as a part of the visual presentation. Ward illustrates complication by the sight of a polished armour, which instantly reinstates all that we retain of former sensations of its hardness, smoothness and coldness. Stout also thinks that there is such a thing as "impressional association" in certain perceptions. Thus the visual appearance may, by its preformed connection with tactual experience, be modified in a peculiar way, so as to be the vehicle of percepts for which it would otherwise be incompetent. "Ice looks cold, because we have felt it to be cold. If it had always been warm to touch, it might have looked warm. Yet its cold look is not a suggested *idea;* it is something which is presented as if included in the visual appearance as an integral part of it.'' Similarly, the Naiyāyikas hold that the sensation of a particular bright colour calls up, by its previous association, the impression of silver and we have the perception of the silver in the shell. The silver does not appear as an idea or image of the mind, but is a content presented by the sensation of the bright colour of a particular kind. Still, the perception of the silver is illusory because the character of silverness does not really co-exist with the given sensation of bright colour. It is the presentation of the real silver in a wrong relation and therefore an illusion.

---

[1] Alexander, Space, Time and Deity, Vol. I, p. 202.

[2] Essays in Critical Realism, pp. 135-36.

[3] Space, Time and Deity, Vol. II, p. 249.

---

[1] The New Realism, pp. 288-92.

[2] *Ibid*, pp. 369-70.

S. C. CHATTERJEE

# MORNING

The Day was astir on her bed in the East,
And her Eye was still sleepy and red ;
Her splendour enwrapped in blankets of mist,
That clung to her bright golden bed.

The dew lay still glistening, the tears of the sky
It had spent the long dark night crying
But now morning had come, and with her shimmering smile
The tear drops had ceased and were drying.

The flowers all hung heavy drugged with the dew
That the mournful sad sky did weep,
But when the small sunbeams had kissed dry the tears
The flowers awoke from their sleep.

The dreams of the peasant are fading away
Some song bird's proclaiming the dawn
The cow's mellow moo and the cry of the sheep
Are sleepily greeting the morn.

The mists have all vanished and with them the dew
More golden than red is the sun
The world is awake, the peasant afield
And another day's labours begun.

R. J. N. MAHER

# THE OLD AGENCY HOUSES OF CALCUTTA

The establishment of British rule in the Ganges delta and its gradual consolidation and expansion throughout the latter part of the eighteenth century were much more than a challenge to the indigenous economy of India. As the nineteenth century rolled on, the new political factors brought in their train the competition of a more highly developed form of industry from England : the increase of manufactures in Britain under the magic influence of steam, the rapidity of turnover and the comparative cheapness of machine-made goods gave a severe shock to the native crafts and industries.[1] The shock was reinforced by certain accompanying factors: the disappearance of the native courts deprived many of the industries of an active patronage; [2] the rise of a new educated professional class with different tastes, and hence with a different demand, accentuated the dislocation ; and, to crown all, came the protective duties in Great Britain on certain manufactures from the East and these virtually shut out from the Indian traders and craftsmen a very steady and profitable market.[3]

The decline of the indigenous industries and arts was thus primarily due to factors other than those of actual finance. It is debatable how far the growing weaknesses of the trade and craft-guilds intensified the decline. Undoubtedly, capital and finance did not directly suffer on account of their weaknesses. It is more to the point to argue that the weakening of the powers of these bodies removed a very important force that regulated trade, maintained the quality of the materials produced and generally promoted the team spirit among the craftsmen and artisans concerned.[1] The actual decline of India's industries was due to quite different factors: the decline of the guilds and similar bodies owing to the impact of Western politics and Western industrialism could only aggravate an already worsened situation—it could do nothing more than that.[2]

---

[1] D. R. Gadgil : Industrial Evolution of India in Recent Times (London, 1924), p. 42.

[2] See, for example, S. M. Hadi : A Monograph on Dyes and Dyeing in the N. W. Provinces and Oudh (Allahabad, 1899), " The dyeing industry in Lucknow received its greatest impetus in the reign of Wajid Ali Shah, the last King of Oudh. On certain occasions admittance to the fancy fair at Káisar Bágh was not allowed except to persons dressed in saffron-yellow garment...On other occasions the courtiers and their attendants were ordered to put on salmon-coloured dress before they could be entitled to the privilege of waiting upon His Majesty...etc." (p. 3.)

[3] *Cf.* James Taylor : A Sketch of the Topography and Statistics of Dacca (Calcutta, 1840). Protective duty of 75 per cent. virtually shut out Indian Muslins from the British market (p. 364).

In one way, however, the question of finance had important consequences on industries. This was the changed status of the indigenous banker. Simultaneously with the cessation of his rôle as a revenue collector or a state-banker, came the loss of much of his money-changing business; and the political insecurity of the times combined with internecine disputes dealt a great blow to internal trade and commerce, out of which the indigenous shroff derived much of his profits. He also became the unfortunate victim of oppression by debtors; and so the decline of handicrafts and arts and the consequent poverty of the people compelled him to resort to more and more exacting terms for loans and advances.[3]

The result was that the banker of the old days had, of necessity, to degenerate into the rôle of an exacting money-lender: the general poverty of the artisans and craftsmen, the political insecurity of the times and the comparative dearth of his own available funds—all these combined to make his rates of interest high and his mode of advances exacting and severe.

---

[1] Gadgil: *op. cit.*, p. 46.

[2] It is very interesting to enquire into the causes of the declining power of these Indian guilds. Perhaps the same forces that caused the decline of the mediaeval guilds of England helped to bring about the decline of the Indian bodies as well. The physical impossibility of maintaining a system of apprenticeship, defects in guild procedure, intensification of particularism, pronounced cleavage between masters and men, and the general spirit of the age upholding free-trade were responsible for the death of the guild system in England. And some of these factors could be applied to the case of India as well. See Stella Kramer: The English Craft Guilds (New York, 1927), pp. 187, 205.

[3] For details see L. C. Jain: Indigenous Banking in India (London, 1929), pp. 18, 23.

In an indirect way the decline of the old trade and craft-guilds was an accession of strength to the independent shroffs and *mahajans.* Just as in mediaeval England the weakening of the guilds was followed by the increasing power of the middlemen, so also in India bankers and money-lenders, now relaxed from the obnoxious pressure of the community as expressed in meetings of the *panchayats* and guilds could exercise their control of loanable funds with some rigid exactitude. In the vicious circle that was set up the *mahajan* was no longer a banker, an issuer of bills or receiver of deposits, to the extent which he had been, but he became only a money-lender and pawnbroker;[1] his heavy rates of interest on advances of money coincided with the growing poverty of the people, and many industries and crafts, no longer in the old semi-monopolistic position, had to continue their operations under the greatest handicaps. Gradually, the craftsmen came to be entirely in the hands of money-lenders: and frequently it was the *mahajans* who supplied the raw materials, and the workers got nothing but bare subsistence wages.[2]

While the indigenous industrial system was in this melting pot, new factors were arising in the horizon of trade and industrial finance. These were the Agency Houses of the three Presidency cities (of which the Calcutta Houses were by far the most important) and the early European joint-stock banks. Of these the former dominated the mercantile and financial world in India till about the beginning of the second quarter of the nineteenth century. Now, previous to the year 1814, the East India Company enjoyed, by law, a monopoly of foreign trade, from the east coast of Africa to the west coast of America inclusive. As to internal trade although the company did not, for a great number of years, interfere in the local trade of the country, it meddled in the trade of staple articles and even precluded the non-official Europeans from engaging in the inland corn, salt and tobacco trades.[1] At the same time the restrictions on the residence of Europeans in India were severe and oppressive, Europeans being liable to expulsion for any offence given to the Government. Such a system greatly paralysed the efforts of independent Europeans to promote Indian trade and industries; and while it is debatable how far this was to the ultimate good of India, there is no doubt that this greatly strengthened the monopolistic position that the Company enjoyed.[2]

---

[1] W. Hoey : A Monograph on Trade and Manufactures in N. India (Lucknow, 1880), p. 26.

[2] N. G. Mukerji: A Monograph on the Silk Fabrics of Bengal (Calcutta, 1903), p. 64.

It was under this system that the great mercantile firms of Calcutta sprang up. The partners of these Houses consisted, in many instances, of the Civil, Military and Medical officers of the East India Company; these people entered them after quitting public service, attracted by the large profits that these Houses made. Now, although generally men of talent and acuteness, they were, for the most part, destitute of mercantile training and experience.[3] But as long as the East India Company's monopoly lasted, the great mercantile Houses were placed under circumstances which naturally secured to them a kind of sub-monopoly. Nearly the whole European business fell into their hands; they were the agents for the planters and merchants settled in the provinces; they were bankers receiving deposits, bankers making advances for the produce of the interior, and, frequently, bankers issuing paper money. They made large advances on ships, shipments and indigo factories; and as general merchants, they not only acted as the agents of others, but speculated largely in every quarter of the world, on their own account. And, finally, by foreclosing mortgages on the ruin of speculators to whom they had made advances and on ships, houses and factories, they became, eventually and to a very great extent, ship-owners, house-owners, farmers and manufacturers.[1]

---

[1] Sketch of the Commercial Resources, etc., of British India, p. 63.

[2] *Ibid*, p. 63.

[3] Very often the partners retiring with fortunes to Europe set up mercantile establishments in London, so that each local firm had a corresponding firm in England, not exactly in partnership, but intimately connected with it in business. *Ibid.*

As regards the capital of these Houses, the partners were often without any capital of their own at the outset; indeed, the deposits from the savings of the civil and military servants, may be said to have contributed throughout the principal funds with which their business was conducted.[2] These "Houses had also extensive transactions with Indians which answered the purposes of capital": they were not exactly partners in the business nor did they lend their capitals collectively but they had "*bona fide* transactions which in their nature, answered all the purposes of capital."[3] In short, these firms had come to acquire a high prestige in the eyes of the Indians and enjoyed the unbounded confidence of the great moneyed people of Calcutta as well as of many of the provincial towns.[4]

The fact should not be lost sight of, however, that these Houses were established primarily with a view to promoting the Company's business. An intimate and friendly connexion and intercourse had always subsisted between the great firms and the Company's servants who, before 1814, constituted nearly the whole European community. "Commanding their respect and friendship, with strong claims on the gratitude of many and possessing the undoubted confidence of all, it is little to be wondered at that the great annual savings of the servants of the government were poured in upon them—more especially after the great reduction which took place in the interest on investments in the public funds, and which, in seventeen years' time, had fallen from 10 to 5 per cent.'' It was a great advantage to mercantile enterprise that the savings of public officers, instead of being invested in public securities or remitted to Europe, came to a large extent into the hands of the Calcutta firms and continued in the country. Indeed, so high was their prestige that the civil and military officers even of Bombay and Madras invested their funds, to a considerable extent, in the Calcutta firms [1]

---

[1] *Ibid*, p. 64.

[2] Evidence of R. Davidson before the Select Committee on the Affairs of the East India Company (1830). Cmd. 646.

[3] *Ibid.* Davidson does not mention, however, what exactly these *bonâ fide* transactions were.

[4] Sketch of the Commercial Resources, etc., of British India, p. 65.

With the large funds, thus received by these great Houses in their capacity of bankers, they made advances to speculators for indigo, cotton, silk, opium, etc., to the annual amount of full five millions sterling.[2] The interest which they allowed on deposits was generally not less than 10 per cent. and that charged on advances 12 per cent. besides a commission on the advances. Further details about these advances are lacking, but we can have a glimpse of some interesting features from the state of the indigo industry which was primarily a European concern. The average indigo planter or manufacturer of this period did not carry any capital to India; he had large advances from the Agency Houses in Calcutta, paying an interest between 10 and 12 per cent. and even on this interest he made a large profit.[3] The advances were, in most cases, secured by insurance on lives; it was very seldom the custom to enter into a joint security with the manufacturer who borrowed the money of the Agency Houses.[1]

---

[1] *Ibid*, p. 65 .This was also due to the fact that the rate of interest was higher in Calcutta than elsewhere.

[2] *Ibid*, p. 66.

[3] Evidence of R. Davidson before the Select Committee on the affairs of the E. I. Co. (1830), Cmd. 646.

Side by side with these Agency Houses rose a new type of financial organisation—the early European joint-stock banks. Many of these so-called banks were, however, no better than virtual departments of some of the leading Agency Houses of the time: the Bank of Hindostan, established about 1770 was, for instance, practically a department of Messrs. Alexander & Co., and so also was the Calcutta Bank started by Messrs. Palmer & Co.[2] On the other hand, there were the real joint-stock banks like the Bengal Bank established (most probably) about 1784, or the General Bank opened in June, 1786. The establishment of these banks meant an encroachment on the monopoly of the Agency Houses; and the competition that ensued led to improvident advances, by both the banks and the Houses, to prodigal public officers of the Government and to needy and ignorant private adventurers. [3] Moreover, the year 1814 saw the first blow to the Company's monopoly of trade and large numbers of prudent and cautious commercial traders began to pour into India from Europe. In the general scramble that followed the Agency Houses were deprived, to a large extent, of the ordinary mode of employing the large amount of deposits which still continued to pour in upon them, and thus definitely entered upon their period of decline ; many of the new banks fared no better: improvement advances and speculative dealings affected their soundness and credit as well and quite a number went into liquidation during the general crisis of 1830-32.

It is this crisis that sealed the climax of the prosperity of the Agency Houses. The whole story is of exciting interest and not without important lessons for the student of banking and finance. The game started with the active competition of more enthusiastic and economical traders from about the year 1814 when the first check to the Company's monopoly of trade occured. The Calcutta Houses had already got into the habit of making speculative advances—advances to private adventurers who recklessly entered into any sort of speculation and who obtained additional advances in order to extricate themselves from the difficulties in which their rash transactions had involved them. "The balances against the speculators, increased by heavy interest charges, were yearly brought to the new books of the establishment as if they were real assets, until death either reduced the amount by recovery of the sum insured on the life of the party, or it cancelled the debt, when no insurance had been effected."[1] All these dangers were intensified by the new competition which deprived the firms, to a considerable extent, of the ordinary mode of employing their large deposits which still continued to pour in upon them. The Agency-Houses began to resort to new and more precarious forms of investment. Tempted by temporary high house-rents in Calcutta, they invested largely in houses; they also invested largely in indigo works, coal-mines, ships and ship-building, breweries, tanneries, distilleries, spice and coffee plantations, clearing desert islands, etc., and even in cotton mills, rice mills, flour mills and saw mills. The value of these rose in proportion to the influx of capital : in this manner was locked up a great share of their funds which, when the crisis arrived, could not be realised except at most ruinous sacrifices, such funds being practically unavailable to meet the firm's obligations.[2]

---

[1] Evidence of George Harris, *ibid.*

[2] H. Sinha : Early European Banking in India (London), pp. 4-5.

[3] Sketch of the Commercial Resources, etc., of Br. India., pp. 67-68.

Still, such was the unlimited confidence reposed in them by the Indian community that for a considerable time to come they began to receive deposits as usual.[3] This, however, only increased the hazardous speculation: more and more money was advanced to indigo planters without any capital of their own; goods were exported to China, Europe, etc., either directly on their own account or indirectly by lending largely on the security of the goods to those who did export; interests were purchased in Indian shipping and so forth. As might be expected many of these speculations turned out exceedingly ill. The cultivation of indigo was so much increased that its price gradually fell to a level at which it would not pay even the bare expenses of production; the investments in Indian shipping turned out even worse than those in indigo plantations, the shipping of England having nearly driven that of India out of the field; to crown all, several of the partners of the various Houses returned to Europe, taking large sums with them as their share of the capital of the firms. "The embarrassment produced by this locking up of their capital, by the withdrawing of portions of it to Europe and by the unfavourable termination of many of the adventures in which they had been engaged, began to manifest itself simultaneously with the scarcity of money occasioned by the drains on account of the Burmese War."[1] The big House of Messrs. Palmer & Co. failed in 1830 and although it did not lead to an immediate panic, public confidence had been shaken, deposits were rapidly decreasing and the depositors whose balances had accumulated had begun gradually to retire them. Even then the firms went on borrowing funds at heavy sacrifices by pledging every description of property within their power. So came the crash: these great Houses, which had been the principal channel of conducting the export and

---

[1] Sketch of the Commercial Resources, etc., of Br. India, p. 67.

[2] *Ibid*, p. 67.

[3] Even the failure of the Palmer & Co., in 1830 did not affect the remaining Houses

---

so immediately as was at first apprehended owing to the good assests of that House. *Ibid*, p. 68.

[1] Reasons for the Establishment of a New Bank in India (London, 1836) by an anonymous writer, pp. 13-14. The only available copy of this book is in the Guildhall Library, London, to which I was given access through the kind courtesy of the Librarian.

import trade of India for half a century, fell, one after another, in the course of three short years (1830-33), and in the aggregate, for the enormous sum of twenty millions sterling.[1]

The failure of these Agency Houses pointed to the fundamental lack of equilibrium in the economic position of the country. While there were vast sums of available funds in their hands, there were no adequate opportunities for investment at all. The whole political situation was in a flux; economic life had been disorganised by the impact of machine-made products from the West as well as by the weakening of the indigenous economy; and while old industries were dying, few new ones (except perhaps the indigo industry) were taking their place. On the other hand, both the Agency Houses and the early European joint-stock banks had been confronted with the problem of how to employ their capital as well as deposit resources. They could employ then only in the discount of approved bills at short dates, in the granting of cash credits or in the purchase of Government securities readily convertible into money; but mutual competition and the desire to make high profits led them to indulge in all sorts of adventurous speculation. Besides being bankers, they became merchants, and sometimes also indigo-planters and ship-owners. This vicious combination coupled with the fact that there was no effective area for safe but profitable investment of all the available surplus was primarily responsible for the ruin that overtook these great Houses of finance and banking.[2]

N. DAS

---

[1] Sketches etc., pp. 68-69.

[2] Reasons for the Establishment of a New Bank, etc., p. 13.

# THE PROBLEM OF FINANCIAL SETTLEMENT IN A FEDERATED INDIA

## *Introduction.*

The subject of public finance has an abiding interest for any one connected with the public life of a country, for a sound financial system is one of the many essential conditions of good Government as well as of the prosperity and contentment of the people. The subject has all the more interest for those in public life in India or those who take any interest in the future destiny of India, now that the constitutional system of India is in the melting-pot. The financial system of a country is an integral part of its Governmental system in the sense that it is to a very great extent conditioned by the latter. If the structure of the Government of India is changed, as it is bound to be very soon, the financial system must necessarily undergo a change and adapt itself to the new structure. But so far we have got only the broad outlines of the picture of the future constitution; much work remains to be done to complete the picture. So it is rather hazardous to assert dogmatically what should be the lines of development of the financial system in the future constitution of India. We can at most make some hypothetical statements on the assumption of a particular picture of the future constitution of India. That the solution of Indian constitutional problem shall be on federal lines has been accepted by all parties. It may also be taken for granted that the evolution of Indian federation would not be on orthodox lines. The Indian federation at least at the beginning would be characterised by certain peculiar features. What is important for our purpose to note is the classification of subjects into three groups, *viz.*, (1) provincial, (2) federal, *i.e.*, subjects administered in common by the federal authority on behalf of all the units, (3) central or British Indian, *i.e.*, subjects which are of common interest for British Indian provinces only but not the states. In respect to (3) the states will not be expected to share in the financial burdens incidental to such services. If this distinction remains, the federal budget will be a complicated affair and the voting of the grants in the federal assembly will also involve complexity in procedure. But fortunately the trend of discussion in the second R.T.C. as well as outside it reveals a distinct tendency towards effacing the distinction between the last two groups of subjects and merging them in one common category, *viz.*, federal, and it may be expected that the distinction would eventually disappear as the federal idea gains ground in course of working the proposed constitution.

### *Some Leading Principles underlying the proposed Financial System.*

With the picture of the constitutional system of an Indian federation so far settled, before us, we shall try to find out a possible scheme of financial settlement that would fit in with the constitutional structure. India would no longer be treated as two distinct units but as a single unit for fiscal purposes. But the fact that the states would not come into the federation exactly on the same footing as the provinces, would introduce some features into the fiscal system of India which are not perhaps found in other federations. The problem of federal finance, stated in most general terms is, in our opinion, to tap the resources or the taxable capacity of the nation and to manage the public expenditure through the federation and the units in such a way as to maximise the services rendered by the state to the people with the minimum of cost. In evolving a scheme of federal finance for India, we must bear in mind and try to apply as far as practicable the following principles. In the first place, it must be capable of expanding easily and adjusting itself to new circumstances as they arise.

(2) It must not contain any feature which goes counter to the federal idea or spirit.

(3) Undue emphasis should not be placed on the policy of a 'financial cleancut' as between the federation and the units ; rather the tax-system is to be viewed as a whole, although attempt should be made to avoid overlapping tax-jurisdictions.

(4) In the distribution of resources among the federating units, fairness and equity ought to be the guiding principles, having reference of course to the necessity of maintaining a fair and uniform scale of expenditure as far as possible.

(5) In relation to the states, attempt should be made, as far as possible, to begin on a clean slate, and not to complicate the settlement by reference to past transactions, but at the same time the principle of equity is not to be lost sight of.

(6) Lastly in the determination of the financial relations between the federation and the units the three well-known principles of efficiency, suitability and adequacy[1] should be kept in view. It has been observed by Sir W. T. Layton in his scheme contributed to the Report of the Simon Commission that "the problem of financial relations between the central and provincial authorities in any country is ideally solved where the sources of revenue which, from the administrative point of view, fall naturally within the sphere of the provincial Governments, harmonise so far as their yield and elasticity is concerned with the functions which are assigned to those Governments, while those which are naturally central sources accord with the functions of the central Government."[2]

---

[1] *Vide* Seligman, Essays in Taxation, Ch. XII.

[2] Simon Report, Vol. II, para. 240.

### *Transition from the Unitary to the Federal Type of Government and the necessary Financial Adjustments.*

The transition from unitary and centralised type of Government to a federal type would be marked by a redistribution of functions as between the federal Government and the Governments of the component units, and this would necessarily entail a reshuffling of the whole fiscal system, both on its revenue and expenditure side. The requisite financial settlement has to be arrived at by a two-fold process,—(1) by a redistribution of the existing sources of revenue, and (2) devising new sources.

### *Some Assumptions made.*

Before laying down the possible lines of settlement it is necessary to point out that we shall proceed on the basis of a few assumptions. In the first place, we shall ignore the present gloomy financial outlook in India, as in other parts of the world, as only a passing phase and assume that the federation would start under more normal conditions. We shall take the budget figures of the year 1929-30, just at the beginning of the present crisis, as our starting point instead of the present figures.

In the second place, we shall assume that Burma will be separated from India and some new provinces will come into existence by territorial readjustment in the existing provinces, with subvention from the federation rather than from the parent province.

In the third place, we shall assume that given responsibility for the management of their own affairs and particularly control over the finances the apathetic attitude of the people towards proposals of new taxation would disappear and further that the limit of taxable capacity in India has not been reached. As Sir Walter Layton in the course of his report referred to above observes : " In spite of the widespread poverty in India, I see no reason to doubt that the public revenues of India can be substantially increased without taxation becoming intolerable, provided that its incidence is adjusted to the capacity of tax-payers to pay and that heavy additional burdens are not put upon primary necessities. On the other hand taxation may be the only practicable means of creating a better and more secure livelihood. But in order to achieve this, the proceeds must be wisely spent."[1]

But if we assume that there is further scope for taxation, we also hold that there is room for retrenchment in expenditure and that new taxation should commence only when all avenues of economy have been explored. Every item of public expenditure has got to justify itself by the contribution it makes to the welfare of the community. Of course in public expenditure we have to take a long view of things. As one writer observes "mere reduction of expenditure is not necessarily economy. It may be, it often is, the most pernicious form of waste."[2]

### *An Outline of the Scheme of Federal, Provincial and State Finance.*

The financial scheme for a federated India would be conditioned by the mode of distribution of functions and obligations between the centre and the 'units.' As we have already seen there are likely to be two groups of subjects in the 'centre' apart from those administered by the provinces and the states, at the initial stages of the federation. In course of time, however, it is likely that these two groups will coalesce as the federal idea gains ground. As far as practicable the present distribution is likely to be maintained except where a disturbance is imperatively necessary for facilitating the federal process either by way of devolution to the provinces from the 'centre' or surrender from the 'states' to the 'federation.'

---

[1] *Op. cit.*, para. 239.

[2] Milner, " Questions of the Hour," p. 131, quoted in Gyanchand—Essentials of Federal Finance, p. 298.

The financial obligations of the federal Government are to be considered in two aspects—central and federal. The former have been divided by the Peel Committee (Federal Finance Sub-committee of the second R.T.C.) into three categories :—(1) expenditure on 'central' Departments, *i.e.*, the few departments in which the states are not interested and in relation to which they are not prepared to bear a share of the financial burden ; (2) a share in pre-federation obligations in respect of civil pensions; (3) possibly a share of the service of the pre-federation debt. As regards (3) the recommendation of the Percy Committee (Federal Finance Committee, 1932) is that the whole of the pre-federation debt may be taken over by the federal Government because its obligations would be covered on the whole by the assets taken over. As regards (2) it would be a small central liability perhaps not exceeding 80 or 90 lakhs of rupees per annum, and that a rapidly declining one. So it may be left out of account for all practical purposes. The only remaining obligation of the federal Government in its 'central' aspect is that under (1) mentioned above. So long as this head continues the financial obligations under it have to be met by some direct tax or source of revenue raised from British India alone, say, the share of Income tax allocated to the federal Government supplemented by some other such source. The financial obligations on 'federal subjects' have to be met by federal sources of revenue (more conveniently indirect taxes such as customs, excise, etc.) levied alike in British Indian provinces as well as the states. The states are to retain all their existing sources of revenue except such as, by agreement and negotiation, are made over to the federal Government. The provinces are to meet their obligations out of the resources placed at their disposal under the new financial settlement.

### *Proposals for Financial Settlement between the Federation and the Provinces.*

We shall now try to lay down the lines of a financial settlement between the federation and the provinces. We take the balance sheet of the estimated revenue and aexpenditure of the Government of India, for 1929-30[1] (after separation of Burma) as compiled by Sir Walter Layton, as a convenient starting point in making our proposals.

(Figures in crores of rupees.)

| Central Revenue. | | Central Expenditure. | |
|---|---|---|---|
| Customs | ... 47·91 | Defence (net) | ... 52·10 |
| Income-tax | ... 14·75 | Debt ,, | ... 10·19 |
| Salt | ... 6·00 | Civil Administration | ... 10·20 |
| Other Taxes | ... 1·09 | Cost of Collection | ... 3·12 |
| Total Taxes | ... 69·75 | Civil Works | ... 2·41 |
| Railways | ... 6·00 | Pensions | ... 2·48 |
| Opium | ... 2·35 | Other Expenditure | ... ·47 |
| Currency and Mint | ... 2·35 | Surplus resulting from separation of Burma | ... 1·00 |
| Tributes | ... ·74 | | |
| Other Receipts | ... 1·17 | | |
| Total | ... 82·36 | Total | 82·36 |

We may compare this with the approximate financial position of the federal Government and the provinces in the early years of federation (say 1935-36) as envisaged in the Report of the Federal Finance Committee on the basis of the present financial allocation ignoring, of course, the existence of the economic and financial crisis prevailing just now. We reproduce two tables below giving the federal and provincial forecasts :—

---

[1] *Vide* para. 264, Simon Report, Vol. II.

## I. FEDERAL FORECAST.

(In laks of rupees.)

| Revenue. | | Expenditure. | |
|---|---|---|---|
| Customs (net) ... | 50,30 | Debt Services ... | |
| Salt ,, ... | 5,55 | Interest (net) ... | 11,25 |
| Opium ,, ... | 05 | Sinking Fund ... | 6,50 |
| Railways ,, ... | 5,00 | Posts and Telegraphs (net) ... | *Nil* |
| Currency and Mint ... | 3,80 | Military Budget ... | 47,00 |
| Miscellaneous ... | 1,96 | Frontier Watch and Ward ... | 1,70 |
| State Contributions ... | 74 | Civil Administration ... | 6,85 |
| Income-taxes (net) ... | 17,20 | Pensions ... | 2,65 |
| Total | 84,60 | N. W. F. P. Subvention ... | 1,00 |
| | | Civil Works ... | 1,60 |
| | | Centrally administered areas (net) | 1,55 |
| | | Total | 80,10 |
| | | Surplus | 4,50 |

## II. PROVINCIAL FORECASTS.

| Province | Surplus (+) or Deficit (−) Rs. lakhs. |
|---|---|
| Madras ... ... | −20 |
| Bombay ... ... | −65 |
| Bengal ... ... | −200 |
| U. P. ... ... | +25 |
| Panjab ... ... | +30 |
| Bihar and Orissa ... ... | −70 |
| Central Provinces ... ... | −17 |
| Assam ... ... | −65 |

From a look at the above tables it would at once strike us that at least at the beginning of the federation the federal Government would be financially much better off than the provinces on the basis of the existing revenues and further that they would be unequal in financial strength *inter se.* But if we analyse the expenditure side of the balance-sheet of the federal Government it would appear to be better placed than even what it strikes one at first sight. Because the three principal heads of expenditure—military, debt services and civil administration—instead of expanding would certainly show a tendency to falling off with drastic retrenchments made by the future national Government on the basis of the average income *per capita* of the people of this country and their ability to pay as compared with those in other countries of the world. As regards 'Debt charges,' if India's credit remains even as it is, a downward tendency in the world rate of interest would tend to bring down the net expenditure under this head. Sir Walter Layton was of opinion that "the total expenditure of the central Government should be stationary or falling."[1]

As against this we must take into account any new expenditure incidental to federation. But such as they are, they are either so small as to be negligible or are not permanent in character. We may take the expenses of the federal court or the federal reserve bank or such other institutions as coming within the former category and the subvention to the N.W.F. Province or any other new province in the latter category. We may therefore, leave these out of consideration for all practical purposes.

Looking at the 'Revenue' side, although the prospects of increase in customs receipts are not very bright in view of the likelihood of a strong protectionist policy being pursued by the future National Government of India still it would remain the main prop of federal finance in India. As regards salt revenue although political considerations have rendered its future very much uncertain, it is doubtful whether the future responsible Government of India would be able to dispense with it altogether; at least it would not be well-advised to do so. For, sentiment apart, it is the only convenient head of revenue through which the state can make even the poorest of citizens contribute to the exchequer his mite and discharge his civic obligation with the minimum feeling of pain. Of course the rigours of the salt law can be very much relaxed on the lines of Gandhi-Irwin Settlement of 1931 and the rate may be brought down with reference to the economic condition of the poor people, the tax being given the first preference when the question of reduction of federal taxation arises, but it ought to find a place in the tax system of the federation to be utilised as a convenient lever for maintaining equilibrium when some unforeseen forces tend to throw it out of gear. We may, therefore, for our purpose, count on this head of revenue, making allowance for some decrease in receipts. The receipts under 'opium' would be reduced almost to nothing when its export is completely stopped in fulfilment of an international obligation, but it would not materially affect the balance-sheet, as the revenue is quite negligible. So also with contributions from states which should have no place in the federal budget, as being opposed to the federal idea. But the decrease under these various heads pointed out above should be more than offset partly by an expected increase in the contribution from Railways to the general revenues with the revival of trade and industry and more by the economies in expenditure already referred to. On the whole therefore the position of the federal Government is not expected to be worse than that shown in Table I, in any case, if it is not actually better.

---

[1] Simon Report, Vol. II, para. 253.

As against this a glance at the Table II shows that the provinces start not at all under bright financial auspices, all of them except two being saddled with more or less heavy deficits on the basis of the existing resources, taking into account the downward tendency of excise receipts in consequence of a deliberate policy towards restriction, if not total prohibition, in the use of intoxicants. All provinces are, however, not equally hard hit. It needs hardly to be pointed out that if the new constitution is to prove successful in the sense of bringing peace and content to the people it is necessary not only that provinces should start with an initial surplus in their new career but they should be provided with elastic sources of revenue which would keep pace with their growing needs. In a sense, no limit can be put to the expenditure of the provinces or states, because they are to be entrusted with the beneficent activities of Government or developmental services and no expenditure can be too much for such nation-building departments as education, sanitation, public health, etc. Expenditure on such services is never barren and, what is more, in the long run it liquidates itself. By contributing to the productive efficiency and therefore increasing the national dividend such expenditure adds to the taxable capacity of the people and financial strength of the state. The proportion that public expenditure on these developmental functions bears to that on protective functions is indicative of the standard of civilisation in the state. Sir Walter Layton pointed out that on a modest computation the "expenditure on functions falling within the provincial sphere could well be increased, without extravagance and to the great economic advantage of India, by from 40-50 crores within the next ten years (*i.e.*, 1930-40) as compared with an increased expenditure of 15 crores in the past decade"[1] He draws pointed attention, and he is not alone in doing so, to one of the most glaring anomalies of the present financial system commonly known as the Meston Settlement in the following words :—

---

[1] Simon Report, Vol. II, para. 263.

> "Although the provinces have rapidly expanding needs the sources of revenue assigned to them are insufficient and show no signs of adequate growth, whereas the central sources of revenue which have to meet comparatively stationary needs are expanding, or capable of expansion."

Two other principal defects of the financial settlements which have also been emphasised by him are : (*a*) the unequal treatment received by the provinces under it, some getting a greater proportionate increase of revenue than others, and (*b*) the provinces have been given no share in taxation on industrial activities within their jurisdiction with the result that industrial provinces like Bengal and Bombay have fared badly as compared with agricultural ones like Madras and U.P.

## *Transfer of Income-tax from the Centre to the Provinces and Commercial Stamps from the Latter to the Former.*

In making our financial adjustment between the federation and the provinces we must bear these facts in mind. The provinces must be given not only adequate resources but elastic ones. In effecting a redistribution of resources our eyes naturally turn to income-tax. This source of revenue must be transferred either in whole or in part to the provinces. There are also good reasons for transferring a part of the stamp duty, *viz.*, commercial stamps, from the provinces to the Federal Government. If, however, after the final adjustment is made, it be found that the provinces cannot afford to part with the proceeds of such an elastic source of revenue they may be assigned a certain share in the receipts, the collection and administration being in the hands of the federal Government. As regards Income-tax, we agree with the mode and principles of distribution proposed by the Percy Committee, although we are not in a position to scrutinise the actual proportions suggested by them in the absence of the necessary data. Their proposals are briefly these;—

(1) that part of Income-tax, which partakes of the character of a corporation tax, *i.e.*, the super-tax on companies along with the tax on the salaries of federal officials and personal income-tax and super-tax levied in federal areas—should go to the federal Government. On their calculation, this comes to 3,70 lakhs out of the total net yield of 17,20 lakhs of rupees.

(2) Out of the balance of 13,50 lakhs, 2,00 lakhs represent personal super-tax, which should be distributed among the provinces on the basis of origin. Of the remaining 11,50 lakhs about one-seventh representing the collections on undistributed profits of companies and the incomes of persons resident outside British India is to be distributed among the provinces on the basis of population thus giving some relief to the poorer provinces though at the cost of others and the remaining six-sevenths to be allocated on the basis of origin. ✓ Of course, we do not hold that the scheme of distribution given above is an ideal one from the standpoint of equal treatment and justice to the provinces. No one principle of distribution whether on the basis of origin, or needs or population can perfectly satisfy these tests. A scheme of contributions combining these principles is, however, likely to be more satisfactory than that on the basis of a single principle. But even so, this scheme is open to the criticism of according unequal treatment as between industrial provinces and agricultural ones. For instance, it has been pointed out in a memorandum prepared by the representatives of various associations and public bodies in Bengal protesting against the 'Percy Award' and forwarded to the Secretary of State— that justice demands that Bengal should receive two-sevenths

of the share of income-tax representing the undistributed profits of companies and tax on non-residents instead of one-seventh. It is not possible for us to enter into the merits of the claim in the absence of statistical information but we admit and the committee themselves were aware that such grievances are bound to arise under any scheme of distribution from a 'common pool.' It is with a view to removing the resulting inequalities that they have co-ordinated their scheme of 'provincial contributions' to that of distribution of 'Income-tax.' We shall discuss this in its proper place.

Let us now examine the situation of the federal Government after the allocation of Income-tax, which means a loss to it of about 13,50 lakhs. It would have been ideal if the federal Government could make good this loss by expansion of its existing revenues and imposition of new federal taxes but unfortunately it is quite unlikely that this would be possible at least in the early years of federation. Till the federal Government becomes self-supporting it will have to levy contributions from the units on a certain basis. Before considering the scheme of contribution let us see what new sources of revenue can be devised for the federation and the provinces.

### *New Sources of Revenue for the Federal Government.*

Excise duties have found a prominent place next to customs in the scheme of federal taxation in almost every federation of the present times, and there is no reason why the Indian federation should not explore the possibilities of a system of excises, of course, with the exception of restrictive excises such as on alcohol, narcotics, drugs, etc., which should be retained by the provinces. In view of the fact that indigenous industries would spring up in near future and thrive, partly as a result of the adoption of a deliberate protective policy and partly under the pressure of the "Buy Indian" movement, the efficacy of excises will be felt quite keenly not only for making good the loss in customs revenue due to high tariffs but also as offering an expanding and elastic source of revenue. The two of the excises that can be immediately levied and that have been recommended by almost every authority on Indian finance are those on tobacco and matches. As regards the excise duty on matches, it has been said that "the incidence of a duty of this nature on an article in very common use is very small per head of the population and is little felt by the individual;" but that "care should be taken to fix it at such a level as to absorb as far as possible (into the Exchequer) the whole of the increase in price."[1]

As regards exercise on tobacco, it had been in the contemplation of the Government even before now, but administrative difficulties stood in the way because tobacco in the form it was consumed in the country did not go through a process of manufacture in factories where the duty could be conveniently levied that was prepared in small establishments. But now that due to increased tariffs and also the universal boycott of foreign cigars and cigarettes a big manufacturing industry in these articles is growing up in the country, the administrative difficulty will disappear to a great extent, at least so far as manufactured tobacco is concerned. As regards tobacco consumed in other forms, it may be reached either by a system of vend licenses or a tax per acre of cultivated area.

On the calculations of Sir Walter these two excises at the rate of prevailing import duty are expected "to yield 7 or 8 crores of rupees in course of the next ten years and a steadily rising revenue thereafter." When the industries are fairly well established the rates can be increased, thus bringing in a larger yield. We may also suggest some other articles for purposes of an excise levy, *e.g.*, kerosene, petroleum, sugar, silk, etc. Of course the conditions of the industries should be subjected to a thorough investigation by the Tariff Board or some other expert body before the duty is imposed. It is quite likely that some articles will be found, on expert investigation, to be suited to an excise levy. If at least two crores more be derived in this way that would reduce the margin of loss to the federal exchequer to a considerable extent.

---

[1] Report of the Indian Tariff Board regarding the grant of protection to the match industry (1928), p. 98. Quoted in Simon Report, Vol. II, para. 293.

Another source of revenue that can be devised for the federal Government is a surcharge on some new provincial taxes which will be administered by the federal Government, *e.g.*, tax on agricultural incomes and death duties. Of course the rates should not be inordinately high.

### *New Sources of Revenue for the Provinces.*

One of the striking features, or we may say anomalies, of the present fiscal system of India is the exemption of agricultural incomes from taxation. This has not only deprived the state of a fruitful source of revenue which is tapped in every country but has made an invidious discrimination in favour of a particular section of the community. This has been sought to be justified on the ground that the imposition of this tax will involve double taxation, because agricultural classes pay their quota of contribution to the exchequer in the shape of land revenue. But we are not prepared to accept this argument; on the other hand we quite agree with Sir Walter when he says, "clearly in the provinces where there is a permanent settlement, land revenue has the same economic character as a mortgage or tithe rent. In other parts of India, there is the same tendency for land revenue to remain fixed, and it notoriously fails to respond to variations in the produce of the land." The slice of profits due to increase in productivity, growth of population and rising prices has mainly been appropriated by the agricultural classes. In a country like India where more than seventy per cent. of the total population live on agriculture it is difficult to see how the State can afford to lose this source of revenue. There is a great volume of opinion in favour of enlisting this as a source of revenue for the provinces. Although the provinces should be given the proceeds, the collection and administration should vest in the federal Government on administrative grounds.

Another source of revenue which finds a place in the tax system of almost every country and particularly in countries with federal constitution like U. S. A., Australia, Canada, Switzerland—is the tax on inheritance. There is no reason why the Indian federation should not adopt it for adding to the resources of the provinces, because it is quite proper that it should be appropriated on the principle of origin and in all the federations named above it is distributed on this principle. Of course a probate duty is levied here on inheritance even now but it partakes more of the character of a fee than a tax. The tax when imposed should be levied on a highly progressive rate and like the tax on agricultural incomes should be administered by the federal authority.

Another tax that has been mentioned in connection with the proposal for adding to the resources of the provinces is the terminal tax levied on goods traffic passing through railways or steamer route collected at stations. In order to avoid complications of one province imposing burdens on another it might be confined to inward traffic only.

### *Provincial Contributions.*

There are both theoretical and practical objections against such a tax. Being a tax on consumption its incidence would be heavier on poorer classes and further it would tend to obstruct the free movement of goods from place to place, thus hampering trade. We cannot, therefore, advocate this as a permanent feature of the tax system of the country. But at the same time we may point out that it has certain good features to commend it to our consideration for utilisation for the purpose of giving relief to some of the poorer provinces like Assam or Bihar and Orissa or the new provinces of N. W. F. P. and Sind. The possibilities of the tax should, however, first be investigated by an expert committee. If it is found practicable and desirable to impose it, its imposition by the provinces should be made subject to the control of federal authority both in respect of the rates and the general conditions. It ought also to be understood to be a temporary feature, to be dispensed with as soon as the provinces can conveniently manage to do without it. It may however be retained as a part of the scheme of local taxation in the provinces, as it even now is in the U.P. and some other provinces. In the early years of federation it may be kept as a scheduled tax included in Schedule I as defined in the scheduled taxes rules under the present constitution, to be levied in case of an emergency. The proceeds of these new taxes taken with their share of the Income-tax will, we may expect, not only wipe out the estimated deficits in the provincial budget but will leave them each with a surplus, of course of a varying amount, to start with.

Now comes the question of adjustment between the federal Government and the provinces. Assuming that for some time at least the federal Government will not be able to stand on its own legs, it is necessary to devise a scheme of contributions from the provinces. It is not for us to fix the amounts that the different provinces will be asked to contribute to the federal fisc. We can only say a few words on the principle of distribution. We may point out here that we cannot support the principle proposed by the federal finance committee following in the footsteps of the Meston Committee, *viz.*, distribution on the basis of additional resources assigned to the Provincial Governments—in other words in proportion to their shares of income-tax.) This is bound to result in an unequal treatment of the different provinces and be unfair to some of them. On the other hand, the scheme of contributions should be so devised as to remove the inequalities under the above plan of allocation of resources as far as practicable. Three factors should particularly be taken into account in this connection (1) the contributions that provinces already make indirectly in the shape of customs, excises, etc., (2) incidence of taxation per capita in each province, and (3) standard of expenditure per capita in each province specially on ' developmental services ' like education, sanitation, etc.

### *Need of Financial Adjustment with a View to removing the Inequalities.*

No scheme of allocation of resources between the centre and the provinces can secure absolute uniformity or equality in financial position as between the provinces, because of the diversity in the conditions of the different provinces in population, area, economic characteristic, etc. So after the allocation of resources has been made some adjustment has to be done between the centre and the provinces so that all the provinces may be enabled to start on level terms financially. So long as the contributions remain they may be utilised for this purpose. But when they are extinguished as a result of an improvement in the finances of the federal Government this may be done by a well-thought out plan of each assignments or subventions and subsidies in aid of specific services of the Provincial Governments. If some particular province is found to be in a specially bad plight after the allocation, as Bengal after the Meston Settlement, so much so that any assistance that the federal authority can give will not meet its needs it should be accorded special treatment, for instance, by assigning some portion of federal revenue raised within its borders or any special local tax such as terminal tax to enable it to stand on its own legs. What we propose is, that in no circumstances should the provinces be allowed to start in their federal career with weak finances. The principles of uniformity or 'financial clean out' should not stand in the way in this matter. Bengal's claim to the proceeds of the jute export duty should be reviewed in the light of what has been said above, of course if the necessity arises under the new dispensation. In our opinion, there is much to say in support of this claim. At least it cannot be lightly rejected on the ground that other provinces would put forward similar claims. Each case has to be dealt with on its own merits, not only from the standpoint of the justice of the claim by itself but also in the light of the special circumstances of the province. If taking all these into account the claim to special treatment put forward by a province can be justified, we think, it ought to be conceded.

## *Settlement with the States.*

So far we have been concerned only with one aspect of the federal financial settlement, *viz.*, that between the centre and the provinces. If we have not touched on the other aspect, *viz.*, the settlement between the centre and the states we have done so advisedly, not because it is less important but because it raises many complex issues which have to be settled by a tripartite agreement to which the Government of India, the native states and the paramount power would be parties. Administratively and financially they were so long completely separate from the body politic of India. Now they are coming into the federation with certain limitations and reservations designed to maintain their independence beyond the sphere of federal subjects and not on the same footing with the provinces. Necessarily the financial settlement with the states would be different both in respect to the method and conditions. It is quite likely that they would insist on retaining their tax systems subject to modifications necessitated by the federation. The details of the settlement can therefore be arranged only by an agreement among the parties concerned. But we can lay down some broad principles which should be taken into account in effecting the settlement. In the first place unlike the provinces the states will not be amenable to uniform treatment. Each state will have its own tax-system and will enter into a separate financial arrangement with the federation.

But whatever be the settlement, it must be based on the principle of equal distribution of the federal burdens, as far as possible, among the units of the federation including the provinces and the states. The states must fall in line with the provinces in certain matters for instance, in regard to the contributions so long as they are levied.

In the second place they must see that their taxes do not impinge on federal resources. Similarly in the federation they should not have overlapping services. For instance at present many of the states have their own post and telegraph systems, railways, currency, etc., which they must make over entirely to the federation. Lastly in effecting a financial adjustment with the states we should try to begin on a clean slate as far as possible. But this is complicated by the existence, on the one hand, of certain, immunities which the states have been enjoying, *e.g.*, in respect of external customs, and salt and on the other hand, certain contributions which the states have been making to the exchequer of the Government of India. The Richardson Committee have made a detailed investigation of these immunities and contributions or credits and debits respectively, as we may call them. Where a state has both debits and credits, in making a remission of contribution, it should be set off against a corresponding amount of the value of its immunities. The remaining portion of the immunities should be taken into account at the time of effecting an adjustment with the federation. When a state only makes contributions either in cash or through ceded territories but does not enjoy any immunities these should be remitted before the settlement takes place. But when a state has been enjoying immunities but making no contributions, the value of its immunities should be taken into account in making a financial settlement with the federation.

*The Problem of Residuary Powers of Taxation.*

As we have already perhaps exceeded the limits of space at our disposal we must now conclude with a brief reference to one other point which we cannot possibly omit without leaving a very serious gap. This is the question of the seat of residuary powers of taxation. It is not possible to make thoroughly comprehensive and exhaustive schedules of federal and provincial revenues. With whom, then, the right to levy an unspecified tax rest—with the federal authority or the units? There is no uniformity of practice in this matter in different federations. Of course we agree with the Peel Committee that with regard to such unspecified taxes " the correct solution cannot be to allocate them in advance either finally the federation or finally to the constituent units." Rather every case should be decided on its own merits. But it would be perhaps more convenient to vest such a general residuary authority in the federal Government and legislature. To meet the constitutional objections that federation should not have the authority to impose a tax on units without their consent it may be provided that any such proposal should be passed in the federal legislature, presumably consisting of representatives from the units, by a heavy majority, say two-thirds or three-fourths, or it may be required that after being passed by the federal legislature, it should be ratified by a majority of the legislatures in the units.

### *Conclusion.*

In conclusion we repeat once again that we can only claim a hypothetical validity for our conclusions and suggestions. The term 'financial settlement' used with regard to the arrangement of revenues and expenditure between the federation and constituent units is perhaps a misnomer. There can be nothing in the nature of a "settlement" claiming a fair degree of fixity and permanence. Any new element or some unforeseen contingency—and in a dynamic society there are too many of them—will at once 'unsettle' the "Settlement." Our suggestions in this paper should therefore be taken in the perspective of present conditions only.

Akshaykumar Ghosal

# HEROES AND SAVANTS

Men of light and men of lore
Are to the world like sun and moon :
The former by their nature pour
Their splendour like the sun at noon
And scattering clouds from drooping core
Make life boil with its own might ;
The latter come at the end of day
With soothing breath and lucent light
To bosoms yearning for a ray
Of warming light in hours of night.

P. M. Hari

# SOCIAL LIFE IN JAINA LITERATURE

## PART I

The major pre-occupation of the Canonical literature of the Jainas is matters of doctrine and discipline, and details of social life are noticed only incidentally. There is nothing in this literature to rank with the Jātaka and the Aṭṭhakathā literature of the Buddhists and in general it is far less awake to worldly affairs than the Pali literature although both of them belonged to monastic Orders. Inspite of this we come across princes and princesses, merchants, traders, artisans, householders, peasants, crimes and criminals, pleasures, amusements and vices in the literature of the Jainas to set off the long accounts of ascetical rigour and to relieve the boredom of wearying philosophical statistics. Some of these details emerge out of the stereotyped standard descriptions of persons, places, objects and events which are a characteristic feature of this literature. These artificial descriptions cannot be dated for through the long history of canonical revision and redaction attempts were obviously made from time to time towards augmenting and perfecting these set-forms.

### *Cities.*

Life in cities has been portrayed in this literature as gay and prosperous. Campā, Śrāvastī, Rājagṛha and other cities and towns in and around Magadha have frequently been described, and always in the same manner. The description really belongs to the city of Campā as we find it to be the city of cities in this literature, just as Rājagṛha is with the Buddhists; from Campā the description came to be appended to all cities. We find Campā described in this manner—" It was splendid, tranquil and prosperous. City-folk and country-folk alike were happy there. It was thronged with population. Its field-bounds were turned up by hundreds and thousands of ploughshares, and displayed far-reaching pleasant dykes. It abounded in troops of cocks and capons; it was full of sugar-cane, wheat, and rice crops; and it swarmed with oxen, buffaloes, and rams. Shapely temples, tenanted by damsels, were plenteous therein. It was free from bribers, torturers, brigands, robbers, and thief-takers, comfortable, and without offence. It was liberal in alms-giving, a home of secure and pleasant life, dense with many millions of citizens, content and happy. It was haunted by actors, dancers, rope-walkers, wrestlers, boxers, jesters, reciters, jumpers, ballad-singers, story-tellers, pole-dancers, picture-showmen, pipers, lute-players, and clappers in plenty. It had excellent pleasances, parks, wells, pools, lakes, and ponds. Its moat was broad on top and cut deep down. It was solidly built, and hard to enter by reason of discs, clubs, maces, barriers, drop-blocks, and double doors. It was surrounded by a wall bent in a curve like a bow, and decorated with cornices arranged in circles. Its bastions, rampart-paths, doorways, gates, and arches were lofty, its high-roads duly divided. Its gate-bars and bolts were stout, and fashioned by skilful artificers. It contained markets and bazaars thronged with craftsmen, content and happy. It had open places, junctions of three, four or more roads, and markets for goods, adorned with diverse sorts of treasures. It was very delightful. Its highways were thronged with princes. It was crowded with numbers of fine horses, fiery elephants, and troops of chariots, with palanquins and litters, and with cars and carriages. Its waters were brilliant with beds of lotuses whose buds were newly bursting into bloom, and it was fully decorated with fine white palaces..."[1]

---

[1] *Aupapātika*, 1; trans. by Barnett in *Antagaḍadasão*, pp. 1-2.

### *Shrines and Parks.*

The mention of a city is invariably followed in thi literature by a reference to a shrine (*ceia*) which is name after a *yakṣa* such as Pūrṇabhadra, Saurikadatta, etc. Th shrine was situated in a park or wood (*ujjāna*) outside th city having an expressive name such as Sahasrāmravaṇa Dūtipalāśa, Puṣpakaraṇḍaka, etc. Gorgeous descriptions ar given of the beauties of these parks and woods, of thei flower-laden trees, birds, bees, fruits, bushes, bowers, arbour pools and tanks.[1] The park was provided with sitting-shed sight-seeing-stands as well as with dressing rooms (*pasāhaṇa ghara*) and with *mohaṇaghara* which has been explained b the commentator Abhayadeva—an explanation which find support in many of Vātsyāyana's remarks—as *nidhuvana-gṛha*. These parks were much used no doubt by amorous peopl owing to the advantages offered by their seclusion an genial surroundings. In Campā, for instance, there wer two intimate friends named Jinadattaputra and Sāgaradattaputra, who were of the same age, of the same mind, an were brought up together from their childhood. Once a they sat together to a meal they decided to go next da to the park Subhūmibhāga outside Campā in company wit Devadattā, a celebrated courtesan of the city. They ordere the servants to take victuals, perfumes, etc., and pitch tent (*thūṇāmaṇḍapa*) by the side of a tank called Nand in the park. The two friends went in a well-decorated car to the house of the courtesan who dressed up handsomely an accompanied the friends in the cart to the park where the sported in the water, regaled and enjoyed themselves i the tent, and afterwards went about hand in hand throug the park.[1] On another occasion five friends went to the park with this courtesan Devadattā and sported with her—one of them held her on his bosom, the second held an umbrella on her from behind, the third put flowers in her hair, the fourth painted her feet, and the fifth fanned her with a yak-tail. The sight of this so moved a nun named Sukumārikā who had gone to the park alone against her Superior's wishes for practising penances, that she said within herself, "How happy are these women! If penances have any reward I wish I would enjoy such pleasures in my next birth!"[2]

---

[1] *Aup.*, 2.

[2] *Jñātādharmakathā*, p. 95B (Āgamodaya Samiti ed.).

### *Fortification.*

The principles of fortification of towns were well understood. These were erection of walls, gates and battlements, digging of moats and construction of *śataghnīs*. In the legend of the renunciation of king Nami, Indra is made to appear before him and exhort him to engage in these Kṣatriya occupations.[3]

### *Rural Settlements.*

Besides cities several other kinds of human settlements are named in the texts such as villages, mining settlements, townships, boroughs, townlets, thorps, hamlets, trade-towns, hermit's villages, market-towns, store-towns, and settlements.[4] The exact significance of these terms is not always clear.

### *Houses.*

In the cities there were lofty mansions belonging to the well-to-do and we find them described as having a gabled front, many polished and well-set tall pillars, latticed windows, semi-circular stairs, brackets, aviaries, and a room on the roof called *candraśālikā* from which the moon was viewed; the houses were painted with the dye of a moist and clear mineral rock outside and were figured inside with comely pictures; the floor was richly ornamented and the ceiling was figured with lotus-stalks, creepers in blossom, and excellent flowers; the doors were tastefully decorated with pitchers and lotus-stalks, sprinkled over with sandal-paste and with strings and garlands. Fragrant incense burnt in the rooms. The furniture in the room consisted mostly of richly upholstered beds, foot-stools, cushions, seats, etc.[1]

---

[1] *Jñātā*, pp. 90A-93B.
[2] *Ib.*, pp. 204B-205B.
[3] *Uttarādhyayana*, IX. 18.
[4] Abhayadeva's commentary on *Jñātā*, p. 55.

## *Dresses, Perfumes, Cosmetics, etc.*

In the descriptions of rich people we find them dressed gorgeously in clothes and ornaments such as necklaces, ear-pendants, armlets, rings, ~~etc.~~ The use of wreaths, paints, perfumes, unguents, etc., are frequently referred to. A householder of Vāṇijagrāma (another name of the city of Vaiśālī)[2] named Ānanda who took the Lesser Vows from Mahāvīra resolved to limit his use of tooth-cleaners only to one kind, *viz.*, a green stick of sweet taste, and renounced the use of every other kind of tooth-cleaner.[3] He also took the vow of limiting himself to only one kind of mouth-perfume,[4] *viz.*, betel with its five spices and to only one kind of bathing-towel, *viz.*, a fragrant red-tinted one.[5] These as also the other restraints the householder Ānanda put upon himself in respect of the use of unguents, powders, washing water, clothes, perfumes, etc.,[6] show the great variety that existed in the use of these articles of luxury. Women we find described as using very costly garments, embroidered and marked with figures of swans, and so fine as to be " blown off by the breath of the nostrils."

---

[1] *Jñātā*, pp. 12B-13A.

[2] See Hoernle's trans. of *Uvāsagadasāo*, p. 3, n. 8.

[3] *Upāsakadaśā*, I, 23.

[4] *Ib.*, I, 42.

[5] *Ib.*, I, 22.

[6] *Ib.*, I, 25-32.

### *The Bath and the Gymnasium.*

From the descriptions given of a bath it would seem that it was a great luxury with the rich in which different kinds of scented water and oils of " a hundred and a thousand distillations" were used. Princes are described as going to the gymnasium (*aṭṭhaṇa-sālā*) before the bath early in the morning where they took "manifold exercises of energy, leaping, limb-twisting, wrestling, and turning." After the exercise they were rubbed down on the oiling-skin by dexterous massagists.[1]

### *Processions.*

When princes or wealthy people went out we find them described as surrounded and followed by many attendants and an umbrella decorated with garlands of koreṇṭa flowers was held over them. On occasions of special importance, such as when a king is described as taking his son to Mahāvīra for conversion, we find gorgeous processions coming out in which the prospective convert was carried in a litter and was accompanied by beautiful damsels who held an umbrella over him, stood by his side yak-tail in hand, or carrying a pitcher. In front of the procession were carried the eight lucky symbols, *viz.*, a *svastika*, a *śrīvatsa* (a diagram resembling a flower of four petals arranged at right angles to one another), a *nandyāvarta* (" a peculiar geometrical pattern "), a *vardhamānaka* (a diagram commonly having the shape of a pair of saucers), a state-seat, a pitcher, a fish, and a mirror. Next to these symbols went series of garlanded umbrellas and decorated banners; then came parties of men carrying various arms, staves, etc.; next followed parties of singers and dancers; behind them came in due and successive order troops of horses, elephants, and chariots, all elaborately equipped with outfit and attendants; and, last of all, came the king himself on the back of a richly decorated elephant, followed by the fourfold army.[1] The queen rode in the same litter with the prince.

---

[1] *Aup.*, 48.

### *Public Appearance of Women.*

There does not appear to have been any prejudice against women appearing in public. In most of the conversion-stories we find the king seated in the outer hall of audience to hear dream-interpreters summoned to explain the dream of a lion or elephant, etc., seen by the queen, and on these occasions we find the queen seated behind a curtain in the hall. Skandaśrī, the wife of Vijaya who was the chief of the robber-village Sālāṭavī, had a craving during her pregnancy of going through the robber-village Sālāṭavī accompanied by female relations and female friends, all dressed in male attire and equipped with military outfit; when Vijaya, the robber-chief, came to learn of this craving of hers he gave his permission whereupon Skandaśrī satisfied her craving according to her desire.[2] Many instances are mentioned of women going to the *yakṣa*-shrines for worship. In the case of prince-converts, we find them being taken to Mahāvīra by the king and the queen who make a joint gift of their son to the Revered Ascetic. In the story of Saddālaputra, a potter of the town of Polāsapura, it is mentioned that his wife Agnimitrā went to Mahāvīra in a cart accompanied by maid-servants and took from him the vows of a householder.[3] It is also stated in many places in the texts that Mahāvīra was frequently accompanied in his tours by a large number of nuns as of monks. Nuns perhaps had greater freedom than women living in families; mention has been made before of the case of the nun who went alone to the park outside the city of Campā; from the rules made about the association of monks and nuns when out on alms-begging tours,[1] it would appear that nuns were accustomed to roam about freely.

---

[1] *Aup.*, 49.

[2] *Vipākaśruta*, pp. 43B-45B (Haragovinda's ed.).

[3] *Upāsakadaśā*, VII, 205-211.

### *The Harem.*

Houses had inner apartments for the women-folk and a king's harem is described as an elaborate affair containing many hunchback women, dwarf women, misshapen women, slave-girls, maid-servants, eunuchs, messengers and chamberlains.[2] Besides these are named also women belonging to various foreign countries "who dressed in foreign garb, with raiment taken from their own countries' fashions, understanding from gesture what was thought and desired of them, skilful and accomplished, well trained." Some non-Aryan races have also been mentioned in connection with these women. This list mentions Kirāta women, women of Babbara, Pausaya, Greek, Pallavi, Isiṇaya, Cāruiṇaya, Lāsaya, Lausaya, Dravidian, Sinhalese, Arab, Pulinda, Pakkaṇa, Bahala, Maruṇḍa, Sabara, and Persian races. It was customary in ancient India to put into the harem women taken captive after war; female slaves also formed a part of the exchange of presents between the rulers of different countries. It is not impossible that this long list of the Jaina descriptions had the motive of asserting racial superiority over neighbours.

### *Cravings of Expectant Women.*

The occasion mostly in connection with which we are led into the inner apartments of a house or palace in the

---

[1] *Kalpasūtra*, Rules for *yatis*, 36.

[2] *Aup.*, 55, 105; *Jñātā*, p. 37B.

Jaina narratives is the craving during pregnancy (*dohala*) of a woman; a queen or a merchant's wife or some other woman has a craving during her pregnancy of seeing a particular sight, such as rains out of season, or eating a particular food or going to a particular place or behaving in a particular manner; a long account is given of her sufferings due to her craving not having been fulfilled; then an inmate of the house informs the husband who thereupon enters into a long conversation with the wife and permits her to indulge her whims. She does so and then "carries the fœtus in happiness."

The story is told of queen Mṛgā, wife of king Vijaya of the town of Mṛgagrāma, who once conceived and observed that since the onset of her conception she had become unwanted to her husband. Imagining that her fall fron her husband's favours was due to the fœtus in the womb, she thought of destroying it by means of many kinds of fœtus-dismemberers, expellers, dissolvers and destroyers, and with that end in view began to eat and drink many kinds of acids, bitters, astringents, fœtus-dismemberers, etc., but failed to carry out her purpose and carried the fœtus in sorrow.[1]

### *Birth of a Child : Ceremonies.*

On the birth of a child—a male-child, as it happens to be in nearly all of the descriptions—the news was carried in a boisterous manner to the father by one or more of the women present in the birth-chamber. Between the day of birth and the day of name-giving eleven days were allowed to elapse; during this period gifts were given on the first day, the sun and the moon were seen on the third day, and a vigil was kept on the sixth day.[2] On the occasion of the birth of a prince, we find the kings issuing orders for the release of prisoners, manumitting slaves by ceremonially washing the head of the latter, announcing a general holiday, and remitting levies, taxes, fines and debts. Measures of volume and weight were ordered to be increased, buying, selling and husbandry were prohibited, and the entrance of the police into houses were forbidden. There was general merry-making by large numbers of play-actors, musicians and dancing-girls.[1]

---

[1] *Vipāka*, pp. 15A-16B.

[2] *Jñātā*, p. 37A; see also Barnett's trans. of *Antagaḍa*, p. 29, n. 2.

Some stories are found in connection with child-birth. Queen Mṛgā, mentioned above, gave birth to a son who was born blind and deformed; he had no limbs and organs but only the semblances thereof. At the sight of the new-born infant, queen Mṛgā ordered the chamber-women to cast it on a solitary refuse-heap. The chamber-women said "yes" to her but went and reported the matter to the king Vijaya who hurried to his wife and reasoned with her that if her first-born child was cast away the subjects would be unquiet, and advised her to hide the infant in a secret subterranean chamber and give food and drink to it in secret. Queen Mṛgā agreed to this and acted accordingly. Later in life, Gautama, the chief disciple of Mahāvīra, came to learn of this boy from his Master and paid a visit to the house of Mṛgā to see this strange boy. Mṛgā showed to the curious monk some of her later-born sons but he insisted on seeing the strange boy who had been given the name of Mṛgāputra. The secret was so well guarded that Mṛgā expressed considerable surprise that the monk should have come to know of it. The account says of course that by his supernatural powers Mahāvīra had knowledge of the secret but it is quite possible that this intelligent ex-prince was in the know of many of the secrets of Kṣatriya families. Mṛgā, however, led the monk into the secret subterranean chamber and took with her a small cart laden with food, for it was meal-time for Mṛgāputra, and showed the boy to the monk.[1]

---

[1] *Jñātā*, p. 37A.

The issues of Subhadrā, wife of a merchant named Vijayamitra of Vāṇijagrāma, used all to die after birth. She was delivered once of a son whom she put immediately after birth on a refuse-heap in secret, took him up again, and took care of him.[2] The idea was to defile the body of the child and make it "untouchable" to Death; this idea still persists among the common people of India and lies at the bottom of many practices including name-giving designed to foil Death. A similar story is told of another woman named Subhadrā, wife of a merchant named Subhadra of the town of Sāhañjanī. The issues of this Subhadrā also used to die after birth and once while she was delivered of a son she put, with the help of her husband, the baby under a cart, took it up again, and brought it up.[3]

### *The Name-giving.*

The sons of wealthy people are described as being put under the charge of five nurses, *viz.*, a wet-nurse, a bath-nurse, a tiring-nurse, a lap-nurse, and a play-nurse. The long list of foreign slave-girls is mentioned in this connection as among those who catered to the comfort of the baby. The next important event in the life of the young was the ceremony of name-giving which came off on the twelfth day after birth. The ceremony was preceded by a great feast after which the parents of the child declared before the assembled relations and friends what the name of the new-born was to be. Sometimes the name given had some reference to an earlier event. A son of king Śreṇika was named Meghakumāra because his mother had had the craving of seeing rainclouds out of season;[1] a huntsman's son was named Gotrāsa because after birth he gave out such a nasty yell that all the cattle in the town were frightened and ran away in all directions ; this was due to his mother having had the craving of eating with wine various limbs of cattle which she had satisfied with the help of her husband.[2] Subhadrā's son, mentioned above, who was put on a refuse-heap and taken up again was named Ujjhitaka.[3] Because Skandaśrī had the craving of dressing up and behaving like a soldier, her son was named Abhagnasena.[4] The boy who was put under a cart after birth, mentioned above, was named Śakaṭa.[5] A boy was named Umbaradatta because his mother had had the craving of worshipping the yakṣa Umbara ;[6] similarly, another boy was named Śaurikadatta.[7]

---

[1] *Vipāk*, pp. 6B-9B.

[2] *Ib.*, p. 31B.

[3] *Ib.*, p. 56B.

### *Education.*

After the name-giving followed in due time the ceremonies of walking and moving the legs, the feasting, the increase of food, the teaching to speak, the boring of the ears, the anniversary of the birth, and the dressing of the hair.[8] Next came the ceremony, in the eighth year, of taking the boy to a teacher. The teacher taught his pupil " with text, explanation, and demonstration " the " seventy-two arts " (*bāvattari kalāo*), *viz.* :—

### *The Seventy-two Arts.*

(1) *leha*, writing
(2) *gaṇiya*, arithmetic
(3) *rūva*, fine arts
(4) *naṭṭa*, dancing
(5) *gīya*, singing
(6) *vāiya*, instrumental music
(7) *saragaya*, vocal music
(8) *pokkharagaya*, drum-music
(9) *samatāla*, timing in music
(10) *jūya*, gambling

---

[1] *Jñātā.*, p. 37B.
[2] *Vipāk.*, pp. 26B-30A.
[3] *Ib.*, pp. 31A-31B.
[4] *Ib.*, pp. 43B-46A.
[5] *Ib.*, pp. 56B-57A.
[6] *Ib.*, p. 80B.
[7] *Ib.*, p. 84B.
[8] *Aup.*, 105.

(11) *jaṇavāya*, a kind of dice
(12) *pāsaya*, dice
(13) *aṭṭhāvaya*, chess-playing
(14) *porakavva*, ready-verse-making
(15) *dagamaṭṭiya*, knowledge of the constituent materials of objects
(16) *aṇṇavihi*, rules of food
(17) *pāṇavihi*, rules of drink
(18) *vatthavihi*, rules of dress
(19) *vilevaṇavihi*. rules of toilet
(20) *sayaṇavihi*, rules of bed
(21) *ajje*, *āryā*-verses
(22) *pahelia*, riddles
(23) *Māgahiya*, Māgadhī composition
(24) *gāhā*, *gāthā*-composition
(25) *gīia*, ballad-making
(26) *siloga*, *śloka*-making
(27) *hiraṇṇa-jutti*, preparation of unwrought gold
(28) *suvaṇṇa-jutti*, preparation of wrought gold
(29) *cuṇṇa-jutti*, preparation of powders
(30) *ābharaṇavihi*, rules of ornaments
(31) *taruṇī-parikamma*, means of improving the complexion of damsels
(32) *itthi-lakkhaṇa*, points of women
(33) *purisa-lakkhaṇa*, points of men
(34) *haya-lakkhaṇa*, points of horses
(35) *gaya-lakkhaṇa*, points of elephants
(36) *goṇa-lakkhaṇa*, points of kine
(37) *kukkuḍa-lakkhaṇa*. points of cocks
(38) *chatta-lakkhaṇa*, points of umbrellas
(39) *ḍaṃḍa-lakkhaṇa*, points of staves
(40) *asi-lakkhaṇa*, points of swords
(41) *maṇi-lakkhaṇa*, points of gem
(42) *kāgaṇi-lakkhaṇa*, points of the *kāgaṇi* jewels
(43) *vatthuvijjā*, science of building
(44) *khamdhāramāṇa*, measurement of camps
(45) *nagaramāṇa*. measurement of cities
(46) *vūha*, columns
(47) *paḍivūha*, counter-columns
(48) *cāra*, spying
(49) *paḍicāra*, counter-spying
(50) *cakka-vūha*, wheel-column
(51) *garula-vūha*, kite-column
(52) *sagaḍa-vūha*, cart-column
(53) *juddha*, fighting
(54) *nijuddha*, wrestling
(55) *juddhātijuddha*, heavy fighting
(56) *diṭṭhī-juddha*, eye-fighting
(57) *muṭṭhi-juddha*, fist-fighting
(58) *bāhu-juddha*, arm-fighting
(59) *layā-juddha*, clasped-fighting
(60) *īsattha*, knowledge of arrows
(61) *charuppavāya*, sword-playing
(62) *dhaṇuvveya*, science of the bow
(63) *hiraṇṇa-pāga*, casting of unwrought gold
(64) *suvaṇṇa-pāga*, casting of wrought gold
(65) *sutta-kheḍa*, play with strings
(66) *vattha-kheḍa*, play with cloth
(67) *nālikākheḍa*, play with tube (a kind of dice)
(68) *pattacchejja*, boring of leaves
(69) *kaḍacchejja*, boring of several objects situated at a distance from one another
(70) *sajjīva*, giving of life
(71) *nijjīva*, taking of life, and
(72) *sayūṇa-ruta*, birds' cries[1]

---

[1] This list is mentioned in many places in full such as in *Jñātā*, p. 38A, in *Samavāyāṅga*, 72, and in the account of the education of Dṛḍhapratijña in *Aupapātika* and *Rājapraśnīya*, as also in other places with some variations. See also the English translation given by Barnett on pp. 30-31 of *Antagaḍa*. I have differed from Barnett on several points. The exact meanings of some of the items are obscure; lexicons, the *Abhidhānarājendra* included, render little help in elucidating the obscurities, for they explain these items merely as *kalā viśeṣa*. I have followed the interpretation given by Sānticandra, the author of the commentary on the *Jambudvīpaprajñapti* (Devchand Lalbhai Fund, Bombay, pp. 136B-139B), except in respect of Nos. 48 and 49 which he explains as movement of stars.

### *Vātsyāyana and the Jaina Arts.*

It would be interesting to compare the above list with the account of the "sixty-four arts" as given in the chapter on *vidyā-samuddeśa* (*Kāma-sūtra* I. iii) by Vātsyāyana. Although the Jaina list is longer than that of Vātsyāyana, yet from our comparison we find that the former may be fitted into the latter. We give below the relevant items in Vātsyāyana's list in the left-hand column and in the right-hand column are placed their Jaina parallels, indicated by their numbers in the above list.

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 1. | *Gīta* | 5 and 7 |
| 2. | *Vādya* | 6, 8, and 9 |
| 3. | *Nṛtya* | 4 |
| 4. | *Ālekhya* | 3 |
| 5. | *Viśeṣakacchedya* | 68 |
| 7. | *Puṣpāstaraṇa* | 20 |
| 8. | *Daśana-vasanāṅgarāga* | 31 (?), 19(?), and 18 |
| 10. | *Sayana-racana* | 20 |
| 11. | *Udaka-vādya* | 6 |
| 15. | *Sekharakāpīḍayojana* | 30 |
| 16. | *Nepathya-prayoga* | 18 |
| 17. | *Karṇapatra-bhaṅga* | 30 |
| 18. | *Gandhayukti* | 29 |
| 19. | *Bhūṣaṅayojana* | 30 |
| 22. | *Hasta-lāghava* | 68 and 69 |
| 23. | *Vicitraśāka-yūṣa-bhakṣya-vikārakriyā* | 16 |
| 24. | *Pānaka-rasa-rāga-āsava-yojana* | 17 |
| 26. | *Sūtrakrīḍā* | 65 and 67 (?) |
| 27. | *Vīnā-damarukavādya* | 6 |
| 28. | *Prahelikā* | 22 |
| 37. | *Vāstuvidyā* | 43 and 45 |
| 38. | *Rūpya-ratnaparīkṣā* | 41, 42, 27(?), 28(?) |
| 39. | *Dhātuvāda* | 63, 64, 70 and 71 |
| 42. | *Meṣa-kukkuṭa-lāvaka-juddha-vidhi* | 53 (?) |
| 49. | *Nimitta-jñāna* | 32-42, 48, 49 and 72 |

| | |
|---|---|
| 55. *Chandovijñāna* | 21, 23, 24, 25 and 26 |
| 56. *Criyākalpa* | 14 |
| 59. *Dyūtaviśeṣa* | 10-14 |
| 60. *Ākaroakrīḍā* | 12 |
| 63. *Vaijayikī* | 44, 46, 47, 50-62 |

It would appear that thirty out of the sixty-four items of Vātsyāyana cover more or less the whole of the Jaina list with the exception of four items, *viz.*, Nos. 1, 2, 15 and 67. Vātsyāyana's list is no doubt much fuller and compared with it, the Jaina list looks more primitive. The Commentary of the *Jambudvīparajñapti* gives another list of sixty-four arts for women which, however, has not been explained therein. This list comprises the following, *viz.* :—

### *The Sixty-four Arts for Women.*[1]

1. Dancing
2. Propriety (*? aucitya*)
3. Painting
4. Music
5. Charms
6. Incantation
7. Knowledge
8. Insight
9. *Dambha*
10. *Jalastambha*
11. Musical scale
12. Timing in music
13. Raining of clouds
14. Fruit-growing
15. Gardening
16. Disguise
17. Moral discrimination
18. Omens (*? śakuna-sāra*)
19. Ceremonials
20. Refined speech
21. Art of pleasing (*? prāsādanīti*)
22. Proper conduct
23. Improvement of the complexion
24. Purification of gold
25. preparation of scented oils
26. Graceful movements
27. Examination of horses and elephants
28. Points of men and women
29. Discrimination of gold and jewels
30. Differences in the eighteen scripts (*see below*)
31. Presence of mind
32. Art of building
33. Varieties in pleasure (sexual ?)
34. Treatment of diseases
35. *Kumbhabhrama*
36. *Sāriśrama*
37. Preparation of unguents
38. Preparation of powders
39. Dexterity of hand
40. Cleverness of speech
41. Rules of food
42. Rules of trade
43. Toilet of the face
44. Paddy-husking (*śālikhaṇḍaṇa*)
45. Story-telling
46. Making of wreathes
47. Indirect speech
48. Poetic talent
49. *Sphāravidhiveśa*
50. All the languages
51. Knowledge of meanings
52. Wearing of ornaments
53. Dealing with servants
54. Deportment at home

---

[1] *Jambū.*, pp. 139B-140A.

55. Explanation (? *vyākaraṇa*).
56. Repelling strangers
57. Cooking
58. Dressing the hair
59. *Vīṇā*-playing
60. Argument
61. Science of numbers
62. Knowledge of the world
63. *Antyākṣarikā* (a kind of verse-making?)
64. Riddles

### *The Eighteen Provincial Dialects and Scripts.*

Besides the above, an educated person is also described as knowing the eighteen provincial dialects (*aṭṭhārasadesibhāsā*). Unfortunately the texts nowhere explain what these varieties are. The eighteen scripts mentioned among the "sixty-four arts for women" are stated in the *Prajñpaṇā* and the *Samavāyāṅga* to consist of

1. Brāhmī
2. Yabanānī
3. Dosāpuriyā
4. Kharoṣṭhī
5. Pokharasāriyā
6. Bhogavaiyā
7. Paharāiyā
8. Antakkhariyā
9. Akkharapuṭṭhiyā
10. Veṇaiyā
11. Niṇhaiyā
12. Aṅkalivī
13. Gaṇitalivī
14. Gāndharvalivī
15. Haṅsalivī
16. Māheśvarī
17. Domīlivī
18. Polindī

These are said to be included in the Brāhmī script. The commentary of the *Viśeṣāvaśyaka* mentions the eighteen scripts in a different way, *viz.*,

1. Haṅsalipi
2. Bhūtalipi
3. Yakṣīlipi
4. Rākṣasīlipi
5. Uḍḍīlipi
6. Yavanīlipi
7. Turukkīlipi
8. Kīrīlipi
9. Draviḍīlipi
10. Sindhavīyalipi
11. Mālavīnīlipi
12. Naṭīlipi
13. Nāgarīlipi
14. Lāṭalipi
15. Pārasīlipi
16. Animittīlipi
17. Cāṇākyalipi
18. Mūladevīlipi

### *The Hundred Crafts.*

The *Jambudvīpaprajñapti* refers to "the hundred crafts" (*sippasaya*) which Śānticandra, the commentator, has explained as the crafts of the potter, the smith, the painter, the weaver, and the barber, each of which admits of twenty divisions, but the latter he has not explained.

The list of the "seventy-two arts" is designed to lay down the requirements of a man of the world, and is mentioned mostly in connection with the education of Kṣatriya princes. From the details given of the art of fighting and of military formation, etc., it would appear that the list had its origin in the requirements of a capable and accomplished Kṣatriya. In regard to the education of Brahmans, we find a learned Brahman described as one who was a teacher of, prevented corruption from entering into, retained in his memory, and was well versed in the four Vedas—Ṛk, Yajus, Sāman, and Atharvan—to which is added Itihāsa as the fifth, Nighaṇṭu as the sixth, along with the Aṅgas, Upāṅgas, and the Rahasya, knew the six Aṅgas and the philosophy of the sixty categories, arithmetic, phonetics, ceremonial, grammar, prosody, etymology, and astronomy, as also many other branches of knowledge.

AMULYACHANDRA SEN

# TO CALCUTTA

Great City, flush'd in Grandeur's lavishment,
Whose tinctures deck thyself, and earth's increase
Once shaked thy thriving pulse of Trade, and Ease
Renewed thy laboured limbs, what ravishment
Enfolds the heart that views in wonderment
Thy Statues, Parks, and Palaces that please
The eye of Joy ? but wonders such as these
Yet melt; for mem'ries in their sentiment
Wake with the waking bliss, and painful Past
Remembers sadly its mad Tragedy,
And this unlucky present seems to blast
Thy past regrets and plunge in Misery ;
O silent Sufferer of thy innocent Care
Nurse hope of rosy days, and not despair.

JOHN J. PINTO

# OLD PUNCTUATION AND NEW

One of the most interesting discoveries of recent English scholarship is about punctuation in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Even so late as the first decade of the present century the customary attitude towards the old punctuation was one of undisguised contempt, as if it represented little better than the insane antics of the printer's devil. It is true that the printer of that day had his own way of dealing with an author's text, as, no doubt, the printer of our time has his; also that, being more ignorant, he could be relied upon for making more mistakes. Yet one might have paused to think that proof-reading,—of which there is ample evidence,—must have put a stop to the printer's liberty, making none but the author responsible for at least some of the supposed eccentricities and inaccuracies. But no such thing happened, and, instead of trying to understand the old punctuation in the light of laws inherent within itself, editors started with the calm assumption that it was chaotic and must be 'improved' by ruthless modernization. The characteristic attitude is well illustrated in the words of Dr. Johnson in his preface to his edition of Shakespeare: "In restoring the author's works to their integrity I have considered the punctuation as wholly in my power; for what could be their care of colons and commas, who corrupted words and sentences." Well-known is the story how the Doctor's power did not remain confined to Shakespeare's colons and commas, but spread to words and phrases as well, altering, for instance, 'good' into 'god' in Hamlet's speech to Polonius: "If the sun breed maggots in a dead dog, being a good kissing carrion." How far, in the matter of punctuation, the self-confidence of eighteenth and nineteenth century editors could carry them is seen in the well-known example of Theobald printing the lines from *Macbeth* as

> Till that Bellona's bridegroom, lapt in proof,
> Confronted him with self-comparisons,
> Point against point rebellious, arm 'gainst arm,...

In its earliest version, *i.e.*, in the First Folio, the last line appears with the comma after 'point,' which, besides giving the correct sense and rhythm, is in keeping with the characterstic practice of Shakespeare, who, in a passage containing a double antithesis like the above, generally introduces an adjective before the second pair. This helps him to gain emphasis and to avoid monotony. Similarly, it will be a surprise to many of us to learn that in its original version another, and a more famous, passage in *Macbeth* read :

> .....that but this blow
> Might be the be all, and the end all. Heere,
> But heere, upon this Banke and Schoole of time,
> Wee'ld jumpe the life to come.

Both sense and rhythm have been destroyed by later editors since Hanmer, in omitting the period after 'end all.' The words 'Heere, But heere' have thus been deprived of their close connexion in meaning, and 'But' of the emphasis for which it was intended. Even more regrettable than these has been the loss of the period after 'end all,' arresting the rhythm both abruptly and long, in conformity with the brooding nature of the speech.

But the objection to modernization does not rest on extreme cases of senselessness like the above; nor even on the general principle that to divest an old text of its original characteristics (care being taken that they are not misprints) is like scraping a work of old architecture, and destroys both its beauty and historical character. A special significance attaches itself to punctuation, for it need not always be a mere mechanical aid to the understanding of a passage, and may, in the hands of an artist pre-occupied with verbal music like Shakespeare or Shelley, become a highly sensitive apparatus faithfully recording his minute spiritual disturbances and the subtle nuances of his thought. With the exception of the colour of the sounds, the most beautiful thing in a verse-line is the disposition of its pauses, the intricate harmony that the poet weaves by varying their position and duration according to the change of his mood and feeling. And the tale of this rhythmic ebb and flow is best told by punctuation. Also, if by style we understand not so much the words with which an author expresses his ideas as the order and the movement that he imparts to them, there is always the possibility that in brushing aside the original punctuation we are sacrificing an integral part of an old text. Nobody will deny, for instance, that the following passage from *Sonnet* XCIII with its original pointing gives us a better key to Shakespeare's mind than its modern and 'corrected' form :

> So shall I live, supposing thou art true,
> Like a deceived husband, so loves face,
> May still seem love to me, though alter'd new:
> Thy lookes with me, thy heart in other place.

To take another example, Perdita's well-known speech was originally punctuated as follows:

> Here's flowers for you:
> Hot Lavender, Mints, Savory, Marjorum,
> The Mary-gold, that goes to bed with 'Sun,
> And with him rises, weeping:

The momentary check to the rhythm given by the comma after 'rises' fixes our attention on 'weeping' following, and suggests the tremulous faltering of Perdita's voice corresponding to the idea in her mind. The grammatical correctness or uniformity gained in modern versions by omitting the comma is poor compensation for the loss of this most sensitive pointing.

Similarly, the original version of Antony's speech in the Forum was as follows :

Looke, in this place ran *Cassius* dagger through:
See what a rent the envious *Caska* made:
Through this, the well-beloved *Brutus* stabbed,
And as he pluck'd his cursed Steele away:
Mark how the blood of *Caesar* followed it,
As rushing out of doores, to be resolv'd
If *Brutus* so unkindely knocked, or no:

An accomplished actor or orator will consider the colon after 'away' to be most significant, as supplying the necessary long pause that Antony, the perfect rhetorician that he is, deliberately allows himself in order to prepare his audience for the most moving part of his speech.

The reason, therefore, is not far to seek why the present-day attitude towards the old punctuation is more conservative and respectful. Thanks to the labours of modern scholars (see Percy Simpson, *Shakespearean Punctuation*), editors of to-day know that the old punctuation had a system, and that for poetry and drama at least, that system was superior to ours. But the general reader does not know this so well, accustomed as he is still to reading old authors in modernized versions.

The chief difference between old and modern punctuation is that while the latter is based on structure, the former was based on elocution. Modern punctuation attempts to be logical and is used to point the syntax, the earlier was mainly guided by sense and was used to point rhetorical and rhythmical pauses. It was the punctuation, so to say, of a spoken rather than a written language, and aimed at the ear rather than the eye. As Richard Mulcaster, the grammarian, and Shakespeare's contemporary, said, it was a 'help to our breathing, and the distinct utterance of our speche.' In introducing or dispensing with a stop it took little notice of the grammatical relation of words, and was chiefly guided by the consideration as to where and how long the voice should pause for an impressive delivery of the passage. It would, therefore, omit many points which our modern grammatical punctuation would insert, as well as introduce some,—whether it be for the sake of the rhythm or for some other purpose like emphasis —to which grammar would object. It would take the same liberty with duration as with position, and, as in the speeches of Macbeth and Antony quoted above, if at any place it felt the need of a longer pause than the one allowed by grammar, it would have no hesitation in fulfilling that need.

> Have by some Surgeon Shylock on your charge
> To stop his wounds, lest he should bleede to death.
> —*Merchant of Venice*, IV, i.
>
> Y'are deceiv'd my Lord, this is Monsieur *Parolles*
> The gallant militarist.
> —*All's Well that Ends Well*, IV, ii.
>
> For which I would not plead, but that I must,
> For which I must not plead, but that I am
> at Warre, twixt will, and will not.
> —*Much Ado About Nothing*, II, ii.
>
> ......no: this my Hand will rather
> The multitudinous seas incarnadine,
> Making the Green one, Red.
> —*Macbeth*, II, ii.
>
> ......As for you,
> Say what you can ; my false, ore-weighs your true.
> —*Much Ado About Nothing*, II, iv.

Modern punctuation is uniform, the earlier was individual. As is to be expected, usage was less settled in those early days of printing—as a matter of fact punctuation did not get standardized till the eighteenth century—and though it is true that the printer took advantage of this, he was not the only person to do so. The flexible system favoured the author as well, giving him ample scope for modulating his stops according to need. This will be evident by comparing the irregular pointing of the rhetorical speech of Antony quoted above with the ordered and uniform pointing of the logical speech of Brutus in the same scene. The sentences seem all to have been cut out of the same pattern, and every point in the argument is indicated with an adequate stop :

> As *Caesar* lov'd mee, I weepe for him; as he was fortunate, I rejoyce at it ; as he was valiant, I honour him: But, as he was ambitious, I slew him. There's tears, for his Love: Joy, for his Fortune: Honour, for his Valour: and Death, for his Ambition.

To-day the tyranny of our standardized system has driven writers like James Joyce to revolt, and whatever may be the merits or demerits of their innovations, it cannot be denied that they have their authority in the best English tradition.

Applied to the drama, the rhetorical punctuation of the seventeenth century would naturally resolve itself into hints for guiding the actor. And this is what we find it to be, as is exemplified in the use, in an average play of that time, of fewer stops compared to a play of our own. This omission of punctuation brings the language of the plays of the earlier period nearer to normal speech than is allowed by our grammatical system that demands the insertion of many stops which we do not make use of in speaking. Also of the stops that the old plays use, a considerable number that puzzled the eighteenth and nineteenth century editors will be found on careful study to be related to some stage "business" or to be meant to convey some important suggestion to the actor. It is not unusual, for instance, to find a comma at the end of a speech, showing that the utterance is interrupted, and doing the work of the modern dash. Witness also how the comma after *Caesar* marks an innuendo in the following passage, where Pompey, to the annoyance of Antony, is slyly referring to Cleopatra's having been the mistress of Caesar ;

*Pomp.* .........your fine Egyptian cookerie shall have the same, I have beard that *Julius Caesar*, grew fat with feasting there.

*Ant.* You have heard much.

*Pomp.* I have faire meaning Sir.

The comma, the semicolon and the colon in the following passages are used for marking emphasis:

Repent that ere thy tongue,
Hath so betraide thine acte.
—*Antony and Cleopatra*, II, vii.

.........If not the face of men,
The sufferance of our Soules, the times Abuse;
If these be motives weake, breake off betimes,
And every man hence, to his idle bed.
—*Julius Caesar*, II, i.

It will have blood they say:
Blood will have Blood
—*Macbeth*, III, iv.

Note also how the punctuation of the passage below is admirably suited to the deferential hesitancy of Mecenas, the speaker, in offering advice:

If it might please you, to enforce no further
The griefs between eye: to forget them quite,
Were to remember: that the present neede,
Speakes to attone you.
—*Antony and Cleopatra*, II, vii.

What other punctuation could reproduce better the broken utterances of the repentant Iachimo than the following?

Upon a time, unhappy was the clocke
That strooke the houre: it was in Rome, accurst
The Mansion where: 'twas at a feast, oh would
Our Viands had bin poyson'd (or at least
Those which I heav'd to head:)

The dramatic nature of the punctuation of seventeenth century plays is also seen from the lightness of stopping which is its most conspicuous characteristic. The comma, as even a most casual reader cannot help noticing, would be made to do the work of the modern semi-colon, colon or even period. This would be possible because to the dramatist the comma would represent nothing more or less than just an indication to the actor that his voice should pause. Also, in a passage where the speaker is in an excited mood or is thinking rapidly, the comma would be the only punctuation used. The following is a good illustration of the latter:

> He hath an Argosie bound to Tripolis, another to the Indies; I understand moreover upon the Rialto, he hath a third at Mexico, a fourth for England, and other ventures hee hath squandered abroad, but ships are but boards, Saylers but men, there be land rats, and water rats, water theeves, and land theeves, I meane Pyrats, and then there is the perril of water, windes, and rocks: the man is notwithstanding sufficient, three thousand ducats, I think I may take his bond.
>
> —*Merchant of Venice*, I. iii.

This lightness of punctuation was no doubt connected with the question of the production of the plays. The average length of a Shakespearean play is three thousand lines (*Richard II* and *Hamlet* are over three thousand and five hundred) and Shakespeare himself speaks of the "two hours' traffic" of the stage. The pace of the acting, therefore, must have been pretty fast, even if we make allowance for 'cuts' and stretch Shakespeare's two hours to something between two and three. That such a supposition is not wrong may also be argued from Hamlet's advice to the players: 'Speake the speech I pray you as I pronounc'd it to you, trippingly on the tongue, but if you mouth it as many of our Players do, I had as li(e)ve the towne-cryer spoke my lines.'

J. C. GHOSH

# RECOVERY OF CALCUTTA BY THE ENGLISH (1757)

## PART II

The recovery of Calcutta by the English was not the grave of mutual antagonism between them and the Nawab. It was merely the prelude to the great drama that was soon to be acted on the political stage of Bengal. The English could not rest satisfied till they had provided sufficient guarantees for future safety, more especially because their actions at Hugli had inflamed the Nawab's rage and he had left his capital with a determination to punish them. With a view to prevent the second plunder of Calcutta by the Nawab, the English adopted various defensive measures. The Select Committee in Bengal wrote to the Select Committees at Bombay and Madras for further reinforcements and troops in order to complete their "re-establishment and procure reparation" for their "losses, damages and charges."[1] They made their Fort defensible by "digging a Ditch 30 feet wide round the Walls, levelling the houses within...paces round, and throwing up a Glacis with the dirt of the Ditch and the rubbish of the houses."[2]

About a mile to the northward of the town, and half a mile from the bank of the river, they fortified a camp with several outposts around it.[3] Colonel Clive requested Admiral Watson for landing the King's forces and ordering the Commander to put himself under his (Clive's) command, as the troops under him did not exceed 300 Europeans.[4] The Admiral complied with his request by giving orders to the Captains of the several ships to discharge their troops, and directing Captain Waller to join Colonel Clive and to put himself under his command.[1]

---

[1] Letter from the Select Committee in Calcutta to the Secret Committee in London, dated, Fort William, the 26th January, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, pp. 166-172.

[2] *Ibid.*

[3] Orme, Vol. II, p. 128.

[4] Clive's Letter to Watson, dated 20th January, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, p. 124.

About the 16th of January, the Nawab encamped near Niaserai. He had with him 15,000 horse and 7,000 gunmen, a train of about 50 pieces of cannon, six of which were large and the rest small. There were six wagons of gunpowder and 4 wagons of shot, where the red flag was hoisted. The Nawab had also sixty boats with him, by which he intended to cross the river with his army after he had recovered Hugli.[2]

But the renewal of actual fight between the English and the Nawab was delayed for a few days by negotiations for peace and settlement, carried on through the mediation of the French and the Dutch. Already, when the news of an outbreak of a war between Great Britain and France had arrived Bengal, Colonel Clive had written to the Seths at Murshidabad requesting them to act as mediators for peace between the Nawab and the English.[3] Jagat Seth had replied to Colonel Clive on 14th January, 1757, complaining about the conduct of the English, and informing him that he could not accommodate matters between them and the Nawab, unless they had given up all acts of hostility and had stated their intentions definitely.[4] But on 17th January, Coja Wajid wrote to Colonel Clive proposing to settle matters between the Nawab and the English through the mediation of the French.[5] Colonel Clive informed Coja Wajid and the Seths that he would accept their intervention, but would not tolerate the mediation of the French.[6] He sent to the former a copy of the demands of the English, *viz.*: —"That the Nabob cause satisfaction to be made to the Company, to the English and all other inhabitants under their protection, for all the losses they have sustained by the captures of Calcutta, Cossimbuzar, and all their other settlements; that he cause restitution to be made of all goods, effects, merchandize, etc., seized at the different aurungs.

---

[1] Watson's Letter to Clive, dated H. M. S. *Kent*, 21st January, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, p. 127.

[2] Ranglal Brahmin's Intelligence, Hill, Vol. II, p. 110.

[3] Orme, Vol. II, p. 127.

[4] Letter from Jagat Seth to Colonel Clive, dated 14th January, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, p. 104.

[5] Hill, Vol. II, p. 110.

[6] Letters from Colonel Clive to the Seths, and to Coja Wajid, dated 21st January, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, pp. 123-126 : 'Their behaviour to our Deputies, their written proposals and a thousand other accessories......show conclusively that they had no desire to see us take part in this business." Memoir of M. Jean Law, Hill, Vol. III, p. 181.

(2) That he put the Company in full possession of all the countries, villages, privileges, etc., granted them by the royal phirmaund.

(3) That he suffer the English to secure and fortify themselves in their own possessions in such manner as not to be liable to the like misfortunes in future.

(4) That he suffer the Company to erect a mint in Calcutta, endowed with the same privileges with the mint at Muxadavad, and that if the rupees of Calcutta be of equal weight and fineness with those of Muxadavad they may pass current, without any deduction of batta.[1]

However, two Frenchmen named Messrs. Laporterie and Sinfray were deputed by Mr. Renault to Calcutta.[2] They informed the Council in Calcutta that they were not empowered to propose terms on behalf of the Nawab but could act as mediators and could forward the proposals of the English to the Nawab.[3] So the Council verbally informed them of the proposal already sent to Coja Wajid.[4] After a few days Coja Wajid sent a reply through the French deputies, wherein he mentioned that the proposals for peace should be translated into Persian and signed or at least sealed with the Company's seal, so that the Nawab might himself see and examine these proposals and then might reply to them under his seal. He further expressed his opinion that the Nawab might condescend to satisfy the first three demands of the English, but with regard to the fourth one, he remarked, that as "the English nation has never had this privilege in Bengal, it is not right to demand it, and further the Nawab is not able to grant a right which depends upon the Mogul Emperor and which might damage the currency of that Prince."[1] But the English remained firm, and so the French deputies returned to Chandernagore.[2] The English wanted not only to "compel the Nabob to make restitution and reparation for the private and public losses sustained by the Europeans but likewise exact a more punctual obedience" to the tenor of their Phirmaund and claim such an increase of their revenues and such immunities for their commerce "as to render this settlement more beneficial to the Company than it has been since its first establishment."[3] With that object they wrote[4] to their authorities at home requesting them for a permission to erect a strong fortification and for sending an able engineer in order to plan it. The maintenance of a strong and large force was also regarded as indispensable, and a second request was accordingly made to the authorities at home for sending out to Bengal "by the first opportunity a considerable body of disciplined troops if possible, with positive orders to the Gentlemen at Madrass not to detain them upon that coast on any account whatever."

---

[1] Hill's Bengal, Vol. II, p. 126.

[2] *Ibid*, p. 175.

[3] *Ibid.*

[4] Letter from the Select Committee in Bengal to the Secret Committee in London, dated 26th January, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, pp. 166-172.

In the meanwhile, the Admiral received the following letter, dated 23rd January, 1757, in reply to his one which he had written to the Nawab on his arrival at Fulta—"You write me, that the King your master sent you into India to protect the Company's settlements, trade, rights and privileges: the instant I received that letter, I sent you an answer, but it appears to me that my reply never reached you, for which reason

---

[1] Hill, Vol. II, p. 127.

[2] Memoir of M. Jean Law. Hill, Vol. III, p. 181.

[3] Letter from the Select Committee in Bengal to the Secret Committee in London, dated 26th January, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, pp. 166-172.

[4] *Ibid.*

I write again. I must inform you that Roger Drake, the Company's Chief in Bengal acted contrary to the orders I sent him and encroached upon my authority: he gave protection to the King's subjects, who absented themselves, from the inspection of the Durbar, which practice I did forbid, but to no purpose. On this account I was determined to punish him, and accordingly expelled him from my country. But it was my inclination to have given the English Company permission to have carried on their trade as formerly had another Chief been sent here. For the good therefore of these provinces and the inhabitants, I sent you this letter; and if you are inclined to re-establish the Company, only appoint a Chief, and you may depend upon my giving currency to their commerce, upon the same terms they heretofore enjoyed; *if the English behave themselves like merchants and follow my orders, they may rest assured of my favour, protection and assistance.* If you imagine that by carrying on a War against me, you can establish a trade in these dominions, you may do as you think fit."[1] Colonel Clive was at this time convinced that the Nawab was sincere in his desire for peace, as on the 24th January, the Nawab's 'Private Minister' had sent to him the Armenian Coja Petrus with a letter asking him therein to send his proposal to the Nawab through a faithful person.[2] On the 27th January Admiral Watson sent the following reply to the Nawab's letter of the 23rd:—"Your letter of the 23rd of this month I this day received. It has given me the greatest pleasure, as it informs me you had written to me before; a circumstance I am glad to be assured of under your hand as the not answering my letter would have been such an affront as I could not have put up with unnoticed without incurring the anger of the King my master. You tell me in your letter that the reason of your expelling the English out of these countries was the bad behaviour of Mr. Drake, the Company's Chief in

---

[1] Ives' Voyage, p. 108.

[2] Clive's Letter to Pigot, dated 25th January, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, p. 133.

Bengal. But besides that princes and rulers of states, not seeing with their own eyes, nor hearing with their own ears, are often misinformed, and the truth kept from them by the arts of crafty and wicked men; was it becoming the justice of a prince to punish all for one man's sake? or to ruin and destroy so many innocent people, as had no way offended but who relying on the faith of Royal Phirmaund, expected protection and security both to their property and lives, instead of oppression and murder, which they unhappily found? Are these actions becoming the justice of a prince? Nobody will say they are. They can only have been caused by wicked men, who have misrepresented things to you through malice, or for their own private ends; for great princes delight in acts of justice and in showing mercy. If therefore you are desirous of meriting the fame of a great prince and lover of justice, show your abhorrence of these proceedings, by punishing those evil counsellors who advised them; cause satisfaction to be made to the Company and to all others who have been deprived of their property; and by these acts turn off the edge of the sword which is ready to fall on the heads of your subjects. If you have any cause of complaint against Mr. Drake, as it is but just the master alone should have a power over his servant; send your complaints to the Company, and I will answer for it, they will give you satisfaction. Although I am a soldier as well as you, I had rather receive satisfaction from your own inclination to do justice than be obliged to force it from you by the distress of your innocent subjects."[1] The Nawab wrote the following letter to the Admiral:—"You have taken and plundered Houghley, and made war upon my subjects: these are not actions becoming merchants. I have therefore left Muxadavad, and am arrived near Houghley; I am likewise crossing the river with my army, part of which is advanced towards your camp. Nevertheless, if you have a mind to have the Company's business settled upon its ancient footing, and to give a currency to their trade; send a person of confidence to me, who can make your demands, and treat with me upon this affair. I shall not scruple to grant a Perwannah for the restitution of all the Company's factories, and permit them to trade in my country upon the same terms as formerly. If the English, who are settled in these provinces, will behave like merchants, obey my orders, and give me no offence, you may depend upon it, I will take their losses into consideration, and adjust matters to their satisfaction. You know how difficult it is to prevent soldiers from plundering in war; therefore if you will on your parts relinquish something of the damages you have sustained by being pillaged by my army, I will endeavour to give you satisfaction even in that particular in order to gain your friendship and preserve a good understanding for the future with your nation. You are a Christian, and know how much preferable it is to accommodate a dispute, than to keep it alive, but if you are determined to sacrifice the interest of your Company, and the good of private merchants, to your inclinations of war, it is no fault of mine to prevent the fatal consequences of a ruinous war. I write this letter."[1]

---

[1] Ives' Voyage, p. 109.

From the tone of the Nawab's letters it appears that he was desirous of accommodating the disputes with the English, if the latter behaved like peaceful merchants. But he continued his march towards Calcutta with the whole army, and crossed the river 10 miles above Hugli on 30th January, 1757.[2] "He was followed," as Gulam Hasain says, "by a numerous army, furnished with every necessary for war."[3] Ives mentions that it consisted of 18,000 horse and 15,000 foot, 10,000 pioneers, and about 40,000 coolies, horse-keepers, cooks, bazarmen, etc., 50 elephants, and 40 pieces of cannon,[4] while the English had 711 Europeans in battalion, about 100 artillery, 1,300 sepoys, with 14 field pieces, 6-pounders, besides the cannon on their batteries. This prevented the villagers from bringing in provisions either in the town or in the camp of the English. The sick and the women were put on board[1] and many of the natives who had been hired by the English for military service left Calcutta.[2] According to M. Law, they left Calcutta "with the intention of giving confidence to the Nawab and encouraging him to approach so that they might be more certain of the blows they struck him."[3]

---

[1] Ives' Voyage, p. 110.

[2] Orme, Vol. II, p. 128.

[3] Seir-ul-Mutakherin, Vol. II, p. 221.

[4] Ives' Voyage, p. 111; Coote in his Journal says that the Nawab's army consisted of 40,000 horse and 60,000 foot, 50 elephants and 30 pieces of cannon, Hill, Vol. III, p. 43.

Colonel Clive was struck with terror on the Nawab's approach; and, according to the advice of Ranjit Ray, the agent of the Seths, he wrote a letter to the Nawab, on 30th January, with proposals for peace.[4] The Nawab sent the following reply to this letter on the same day "........ ..Assure yourself I will make no scruple of complying with the demand. I find it is both our intentions that measures for the Company's losses, the country's good, and the safety of the inhabitants should be pursued. Therefore send a person of entire trust and confidence with orders and power to treat upon these affairs. You may send such a person without being under any apprehensions of his safety. You may depend upon my giving a currency to the Company's business at all their Factories upon its former footing. I make no doubt things will soon be accommodated upon your sending such a person............ If you are willing to make up these troubles and will live in friendship with me, I shall never be wanting to forward Company's business, and shew their servants my favour upon all occasions. To render justice and to study the good (of) my country and tenants are what I am desirous of."[5] On 2nd February the Nawab sent Coja Petrus to Colonel Clive with a letter, desiring thereby the despatch of English envoys for the settlement of the disputes.[1] On the day after that Clive informed the Select Committee of these negotiations.[2] Accordingly Messrs. Amyatt and Hastings were deputed to the Nawab with instructions to put forward not only the demands already sent to Coja Wajid but also the following additional ones:—"(I) That the Nawab should not demand or molest any of the merchants or inhabitants of Calcutta. (II) That the Dastak of the British should protect all their boats and goods passing through the country. (III) That articles to the above effect should be signed and sealed by the Nawab and his ministers."[3]

---

[1] Hill, Vol. III, pp. 17, 24.

[2] Orme, Vol. II, p. 128.

[3] Memoir, Hill, Vol. III, p. 182.

[4] Orme, Vol. II, p. 129; Hill, Vol. II, p. 183.

[5] Hill, Vol. II, p. 184; Orme, Vol. II, p. 129. *Cf.* a similar letter written by the Nawab to Clive on 1st February, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, p. 208.

But before Coja Petrus had returned from the English, part of the Nawab's army appeared along the Dumdum road and proceeded southwards towards the camp of the English in Calcutta, and several of his cavalry approached within about 400 yards of the advanced battery of the English.[4] On hearing that small parties of the Nawab's army had arrived within the outskirts of the town, the English sent Captain De la Beaume with 80 Europeans, 150 sepoys, and two pieces of cannon to the redoubt of Bagbazar in order to defend that part of the town. This he effected after having killed a good number of the Nawab's soldiers and having taken 30 or 40 of them as prisoners. Colonel Clive also went forward with the major part of his battalion and sepoys in order to harass the Nawab's troops and to determine the place where they intended to encamp. As they advanced, a sharp but indecisive cannonade ensued. At last the Nawab's party drew off their cannons, whereupon the English withdrew to their camp. There was no great loss on any side. The

---

[1] Orme, Vol. II, p. 129.

[2] Hill.

[3] Hill, Introduction, p. cxliii.

[4] A Journal of the Expedition to Bengal, etc.; Coote's Journal; Journal of the Proceedings of the Troops commanded by Robert Clive on the expedition to Bengal, Hill, Vol. III, p. 52; Clive's letter to the Secret Committee, London, dated 22nd February, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, pp. 237-241; Orme, Vol. II, pp. 129-130.

English lost one 'matross'[1] and three sepoys, and Captain Weller and Fraser were slightly wounded. On the Nawab's side six horsemen and a number of ordinary soldiers were killed.[2]

The Nawab, who was then at Nawabgunge, sent, towards the evening of 3rd February, the following letter to Colonel Clive:—

"This place being unfit for encamping my army, for this reason my forces have marched forward and are encamped in Omichand's garden. Let not this give you any uneasiness. Your business is with me. Rest contented and send me your relation and the other person whom you shall depute to settle affairs with me as soon as possible. I swear by God and His Prophet that no evil shall happen to them. Let them fairly represent your demands to me and I will grant (them). I have given orders to all jemindars that they commit no disturbance. Do not be under any apprehensions on this account but send away the deputies to me with safety."[3] It is difficult to understand what were the real intentions of both the Nawab as well as the English. We have seen that on 30th January, 1757, the Nawab sent a letter to Colonel Clive in terms of cordiality and with proposals for peace; but on the same date he wrote a letter to M. Renault, the Director of the French Factory at Chandernagore, expressing his determination to punish the English.[4] Here also he wrote to the English for sending envoys, while part of his army was engaged in actual fight with them. Similarly the English were not slow in taking measures of defence, and had not given up their hostile designs, though they were sending and receiving proposals for peace. We may say with Gulam Husain that "both war and peace subsisted at one and the same time."[1] In fact, the intentions of both the parties were far from what they professed ; the one wanted to amuse the other with a view to gain time for proper military preparations.

---

[1] An inferior class of soldiers in the Artillery.

[2] Ives' Voyage, pp. 110-111.

[3] Hill, Vol. II, p. 209.

[4] Hill, Vol. II, p. 185: "This is why I notify you, that if you, who are the model of true friends, employ your power to aid me, and if you continue in this intention, you should prepare the ships of war which you have in this country, put one of my people on each, and send them to punish this faithless people (the English) and chase them from this country."

According to the Nawab's request in his letter of 3rd February, 1757, the English sent to him, on the morning of the 4th February, Messrs. Walsh and Scrafton with the Select Commitee's proposals. The Nawab had by that time left Nawabganj and had fixed his quarters in Omichand's gardens, situated at a distance of two miles from Calcutta.[2]

The English deputies had, therefore, to go from Nawabganj to Omichand's garden, where they reached in the evening. M. Law writes that in order to "deceive him (Nawab) more completely and to examine the position of his camp the English sent deputies the day before the attack they meditated."[3] The author of the Muzaffarnamah holds the same opinion,[4] and Gulam Husain writes that "the English, who had their particular views in that doubtful state of things, made it a practice now and then to come into camp, under pretence of an agreement but in fact to examine it, as they intended all this while to surprise the enemy ; and such a manœuvre required a man that should take a full knowledge of the chart of the country. They took care therefore to send with their envoys a man conversant in Geometry, and who to that added an enlarged understanding, a keen memory, and much acuteness of comprehension. This man, in his frequent trips, acquired a comprehensive notion of

---

[1] Seir-ul-Mutakherin, Vol. II, p. 221.

[2] Ives' Voyage, p. 111; Journal of the Expedition to Bengal, etc. ; Journal of the Proceeding of the Troops commanded by Colonel Clive, etc ; Orme, Vol. II, p. 130. The author of the Muzaffarnamah (p. 122 (b) says that the Nawab encamped in Omichand's garden against the instructions and requests of his officers, who had pointed out to him that the English might attack them in the night.

[3] Memoir, Hill, Vol. III, p. 182.

[4] P. 122 (b).

Seraj-ed-doulah's camp, as well as of his own private quarters, with all the roads that led thither, and every other important matter, that had a relation to his object ; so that after having hoarded up all that knowledge in his memory, he made on his return a very circumstantial report of what he had observed."[1]

The English deputies were introduced by Ranjit Ray, an agent of the Seths, to Raidurlabh, the Nawab's minister, who asked them to give up their arms before they entered the durbar; but they refused to submit to this humiliation and were conducted by Raidurlabh to the durbar, where the Nawab was sitting-" in full state, accompanied by all his principal officers."[2] The deputies complained before the Nawab that they were "greatly surprised in finding him entered in an hostile manner into their very city, and that unless he would manifest some desire of peace by withdrawing his troops from the neighbourhood of Calcutta, they could not enter upon the business they came about,"[3] and they handed over to him a paper containing the proposals of the Select Committee.[4] After having perused these proposals the Nawab asked the deputies to confer with his Dewan and dismissed his assembly.[5] But the deputies suspected that the Nawab intended to detain them as prisoners and they ordered their followers to extinguish the lights. Instead of proceeding to the Nawab's Dewan, they fled away quickly to their camp.[6]

Immediately after their arrival, Clive formed a strong determination to make a surprise attack on the Nawab's army before daybreak. Clive gives the following reasons for this immediate attack :—"I determined to attack him the next morning before daybreak while two-thirds of his army were still encamped without the Moratta Ditch, for when they had once passed and got into the streets of the town, pressing reason for the immediate execution of this enterprise, notwithstanding the smallness of my force, was the sudden distress we found ourselves in upon the approach of the Nabob's army by a general desertion of our workmen, coolies and servants, the breaking up of our markets and no provisions to be had but what was supplied from the fort by water, in which condition we could not have continued long but must have retreated into the fort with disgrace."[1] He then wrote an express letter to Admiral Watson soliciting his help in the enterprise,[2] in response to which the Admiral sent Captain Warwick ashore with 569 men[3] and the latter joined Clive at about 2 A.M. The whole force of the English, which numbered 500 rank and file, 100 artillerymen, 800 sepoys, 6 fieldpieces, one howitzer, and 70 of the Train besides the above body of seamen (half of whom were employed in drawing the guns, whilst the other half bore arms),[4] marched against the Nawab in the following order :—' the King's and Company's grenadiers in the front; the sailors with the train next; then followed the battalion; and the sepoys brought up the rear. At 3 the Colonel altered his disposition and placed the battalion before the Train.[5]

---

[1] Sheir-ul-Mutakherin, Vol. II, pp. 221-222.

[2] Orme, Vol. II, p. 130 ; Scrafton's Indostan, p. 64.

[3] Clive's letter to the Select Committee, London, dated 22nd February, 1757.

[4] Orme, Vol. II, p. 131.

[5] *Ibid.*

[6] Orme, Vol. II, p. 131 ; Ives' Voyage, p. iii.

---

[1] Clive's letter to the Secret Committee, dated 22nd February, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, pp. 237-241.

[2] *Ibid*; Ives' Voyage, p. iii.

[3] Captain Warwick's account of the attack on the Nawab's camp, Hill, Vol. II, p. 258; Coote's Journal, Journal of the Proceedings of the Troops under Clive, etc., Ives' Voyage, pp. 111-112, Orme, Vol. II, p. 131.

[4] *Ibid.*

[5] Ives' Voyage, p. 12; Captain Warwick's account of the attack in the Nawab's Camp. *Cf.* " The order of march was a line advancing in half-files that is three men abreast : half the Sepoys marched before, and half behind the battalion of Europeans; in the rear were the field-pieces with the artillery-men and Lascars and all the sailors. To lessen the incumbrance of carriages, there being no bullocks to draw them, the Lascars carried the ammunition of the fieldpieces on their heads; and to deter them from flinging away their loads and taking to flight, they were guarded on all sides by a part of the sailors; other sailors were alloted to draw the field-pieces, and the rest of them marched as they could, immediately behind the rear divisions of Sepoys; Colonel Clive kept in the middle of the Battalion." Orme, Vol. II, p. 131.

They were guided in their way by Mr. Amyat, a member of the Council in Calcutta, and also by a native of Calcutta.[1]

About 5 A.M. the English army got over the trenches within the Nawab's camp and began firing on all sides, receiving at the same time a brisk fire from several quarters.[2] A sharp and bloody engagement followed, descriptions of which have been left by Coote, Warwick, Orme, M. Law and others. As all of these descriptions are almost similar, I quote here the description given by Coote :—"………about daybreak we arrived unperceived at an encampment of their horse, but the alarm was soon given, and some popping shots fired at us, upon which our Sepoys in the front began firing but with some confusion. As I had a Company of grenadiers formed out of the king's troops, and my post being next to them, I was not without some apprehension of being broke by them ; I therefore endeavoured to make them advance as fast as I could and sent for a piece of cannon to come in front; while this was doing a shower of arrows came among us with some fire rockets, one of which unfortunately fell on one of the Company's grenadiers (who were in my rear) and blew up almost the whole platoon; immediately after this a body of their choice horse came riding down upon us sword in hand ; as there was a very great fog we could not perceive them till they were within ten yards of us, upon which our battalion faced to the right and gave them a full fire, which destroyed almost the whole of them ; after this we kept marching through their encampment without any of their horse or elephants coming near us; their foot kept firing at us from several places, being dispersed up and down behind banks ; about 9 o'clock the fog began to disperse, and we find ourselves nearly opposite the Nawab's quarters, which was behind an entrenchment made many years ago by the English for the defence of the town against the Morattoes. Here we could perceive their greatest force lay, and they began to cannonade us briskly ; they sent some bodies of horse to surround us, but they never attempted to come near for us to fire our musketry at them ; finding we could not force this part of the entrenchment we marched about a mile further in order to get over at another place ; while we were marching the carriage of one of our cannon in the rear broke and we obliged to leave it behind; soon after being pressed in the rear, and the people that drew the cannon being very much fatigued, another shared the same fate. Ensign York with a platoon of the King's was ordered from the front to the rear, in order to recover the cannon ; when arrived he found the rear in some confusion, and another piece of cannon in great danger of being taken, as there was a body of horse and foot pressing upon it ; it being at some distance from the battalion ; he then marched beyond the gun and drew up his platoon in rear of it, and by keeping a constant fire secured the gun till it was drawn to the front ; in this affair he had one man killed and three wounded ; after we had passed the entrenchment at the place intended, we began to cannonade on both sides very briskly, and continued it for half an hour, after which we marched for Fort William, which was about a mile distant, and arrived there at noon ; about five in the evening marched out of our camp.''[1] In the English party about 27 soldiers, 12 sailors (15 according to Ives), and 18 Sepoys were killed ; 70 soldiers, 12 sailors and 55 sepoys were wounded.[2] Captain Pye and Bridges and Mr. Blecher, Secretary of Colonel Clive ; Captain Gauff, Lieutenant Rumbold, Lieutenant Lulwidge of the Salisbury, Ensign William Ellis (a Company's servant), and Keshar Singh, a commander of Clive's troops, were wounded.[3] In the Nawab's party 1300 men were killed and wounded, including 22 officers of distinction, such as Dost Mohammed Khan and others and 4 elephants, 500 horses, some camels and a great number of bullocks were lost.[1] Being apprehensive of another attack the Nawabs troops kept firing the whole night.[2]

---

[1] Ives' Voyage, p. 112.

[2] *Ibid*; Coote's Journal.

---

[1] Coote's Journal.

[2] Journal of the Expedition to Bengal, etc.

[3] Ives' Voyage, p. 112; Orme, Vol. II, p. 134; Clive's letter to the Select Committee, Fort St. George, dated 6th February, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, p. 214.

This surprise attack intimidated the Nawab and his army.[3] Thinking it unsafe to stay any longer near the camp of the English, they went away to Dumdum early on 6th February.[4] On the same day Admiral Watson sent the following letter to him:—"The letter which you will receive with this was written the day before yesterday,[5] but before that I could get it translated into the Persian language in order to its being sent to you, I was informed by Colonel Clive, that you had treated his deputies with disrespect, and that you were within the bounds of Calcutta, from which you have refused to retire—evidences so full and positive, of your bad intentions towards us, that however strong my inclinations might be towards peace, I could no longer entertain any reasonable hopes of seeing it accomplished. I therefore desired Colonel Clive to shew you what any army of Englishmen was capable of doing, that before it was too late you might agree to the proposals, which would be made to you. He yielded to my desire, and marched through the whole camp, as if it had not been filled with armed men; after which he returned to his own, where he will remain yet a little while in hopes of seeing you accede to the reasonable proposals, which are now offered to you for the last time, from the Secret Committee. If you are wise you will grant them the justice that is their due, otherwise, the sword is going to be drawn that will never be sheathed again "[1] Clive also wrote to him in a similar tone and remarked that he had " catiously hurt none but those " that had opposed him.[2]

---

[1] Ives' Voyage, p. 112; Orme, Vol. II, p. 135; Journal of the Expedition to Bengal, etc.; Seir-ul-Mutakherin, Vol. II, p. 222.

[2] Journal of the Expedition to Bengal, etc.; Journal of the Proceedings of the Troops Commanded by Clive, etc.

[3] Seir-ul-Mutakherin, Vol. II, p. 222; "Troubles in Bengal," Hill, Vol. III, p. 157.

[4] Clive's letter to the Secret Committee in London, dated 22nd February, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, pp. 237-241.

[5] The contents of the first portion of the enclosed letter were almost the same as this one of 6th February. I quote here the last few lines only :—

"If you really and sincerely mean to treat of peace, listen to the proposals which will be made by the gentlemen, who are now with you. They ask nothing but justice, nor anything more than the mutual good of both nations. If you refuse it, remember that princes are only placed at the head of mankind to procure their happiness, and that they must one day give a very severe account, if through ambition, revenge or avarice, they fail in their duty. I have done mine in giving you advice." Ives' Voyage, p. 113, footnote.

According to M. Law these letters were written to threaten the Nawab " with a much more serious attack and even to capture him and take him to England."[3] None of the Nawab's party were willing to continue the fight any longer. His father-in-law Mohamed Irez Khan, the principal officers of his court, and the chief commanders of his army,—all asked him to listen to proposals for peace.[4] Just at that time the victory of Ahmad Shah Abdali over the Mughal force made the Nawab also apprehensive of his advance towards Bengal.[5] Thus, difficulties within and the fear of a danger from outside the province forced the Nawab to agree to the proposals for peace. Accordingly, Ranjit Ray sent to Colonel Clive, through the Armenian Coja Petrus,[6] the following letter, dated 6th February, 1757 :— "......The Nawab agrees to give you back Calcutta with all the privileges of your phirmaund and whatever goods you lost at Cossimbazar or elsewhere, and will grant you permission to coin siccas in your mint at Calcutta or Allenagur, and that you may make what fortifications you please in Calcutta. Your conduct yesterday morning greatly amazed me and put me to shame before the Nawab. What passed between the Nawab and myself Coja Petruse will inform you; what was happened will occasion no difference in this affair. If you want to accommodate matters send a letter to the Nabob with your proposals, and I will get them signed and send them back to you, with a sirpah, elephant and jewels. If you think war necessary acquaint me seriously with your intentions and I will acquit myself of any further trouble in this affair."[1] But Admiral Watson regarded this letter as a mere trick of Ranjit Ray intended to amuse them, as the Nawab's army had, just at that time, moved to a place about three miles north-east of the Salt lakes,[2] and so he wrote to Colonel Clive for attacking the Nawab's army and for holding a Council of War for that purpose.[3] Clive, of course, summoned a council of War,[4] but he was not himself desirous of renewing the war and was supported in his desire by the same Council.

---

[2] Ives' Voyage, p. 113; Hill, Vol. 11, p. 212.

[3] *Ibid*, p. 213.

[4] Memoir, Hill, Vol. III, p. 183.

[5] Seir-ul-Mutakherin, Vol. II, p. 223; Scrafton's Reflections, etc., p. 66.

[6] Clive's letter to the Secret Committee in London, dated 22nd February, 1757 ; M. Law's Memoir ; letter from M. H. Ribault to Messrs. Frans Adam Carelson and Arnoldue Habick, Amsterdam, dated Hugli, 13th February, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, p. 233.

[7] Clive's letter to the Secret Committee in London, 22nd February, 1757.

On 9th February, 1757, Colonel Clive sent the terms of a treaty to Ranjit Ray and wrote to him that the Nawab should without delay comply with the demands of the English, and should sign 'agreed' to each separate article, otherwise "war must take its course."[5] The Nawab promised to abide by these articles, and wrote the following letter to Admiral Watson:—"The Colonel's letter I have received, with the agreement of the Governor and Council signed and sealed. He desires me to get the articles of the treaty now made, ratified by my great men and principal officers. I have complied with his request. It will be proper likewise for you and the Colonel on one part, and myself on the other, to execute an agreement, that hostilities between us shall cease: that the English will always remain my friends and allies; and that they will assist me against my enemies. For this purpose, I send a person of distinction and confidence who will speak at large the sentiments of my heart, and I hope you will inform him of your disposition towards me. The articles which were sent to me, I have returned, signed by myself, the King's duan, my own duan, and the Bukshi of my army· I should be glad if you would confirm this treaty by a paper under your hand and seal, as the Colonel has done. I have in the most solemn manner called God and the Prophets to witness, that I have made peace with the English. As long as I have life I shall esteem your enemies as enemies to me, and will assist you to the utmost of my power whenever you may require it. Do you likewise, and the Colonel, and Chiefs of the English Factory swear in the presence of the Almighty God to observe and perform your part of the treaty, and to esteem my enemies as your own, and always be ready to give me your assistance against them : and though you may not come yourself, I flatter myself you will send the aid I shall at any time ask for God is the witness between us in this treaty...".[1]

---

[1] Hill, Vol. II, p. 214.

[2] Orme, Vol. II, p. 136.

[3] Hill, Vol. II, p. 215.

[4] Clive's letter to Watson, dated 7th February, 1757, Hill, Vol. II, p. 218.

[5] *Ibid*, p. 219.

Thus the treaty was concluded between the Nawab and the English on the following terms :—

"(I) Whatever rights and privileges the King hath granted to the English Company in the phirmaunds and husbhalhookums [2] sent from Delhi shall not be disputed, or taken from them, and the immunities there in mentioned stand good and be acknowledged. Whatever villages are given by the phirmaunds to the Company, shall likewise be granted, notwithstanding they have been denied them by former Soubahdars, but the Zemindars of these villages are not to be hurt or displaced without cause.

---

[1] Hill, Vol. II, p. 220; Ives' Voyage, p. 114.

[2] "According to command. The initial words and thence the title, of a document issued agreeably to royal authority, by Vezir or other high officer of the Govt." Wilson's Glossary, p. 201.

I do agree to the terms of the phirmaund.

(II) All goods passing and repassing through the country by land or water in Bengal, Bihar and Orissa with English dustucks, shall be exempted from any tax, fee or imposition from choquedars, Gaulivahs, Zemindars, or any others. I agree to this.

(III) All the Company's Factories seized by the Nabob shall be returned, All the money, goods and effects belonging to the Company, their servants and tenants, and which have been seized and taken by the Nabob shall be restored. What has been plundered and pillaged by his people shall be made good by the payment of such a sum of money as his justice shall think reasonable.

I agree to restore whatever has been seized and taken by my orders, and accounted for in my Sircary (Government) book.

(IV) That we have permission to fortify Calcutta in such a manner as we think proper without interruption. I consent to it.

(V) That we shall have liberty to coin *siccas* both of gold and silver, of equal weight and fineness to those of Mûxadavad, which shall pass current in the province, and that there be no demand made for a deduction of *batta*.

I consent to the English Company's coining their own bullion into *siccas*.

(VI) That the treaty shall be ratified by signing, sealing, and swearing in the presence of God and His Prophets to abide by the articles therein contained not only by the Nabob but by his principal officers and ministers.

I have sealed and signed the articles in the presence of God and His Prophets.

(VII) That Admiral Charles Watson and Colonel Robert Clive, on the part and behalf of the English nation and of the Company, do agree to live in a good understanding with the Nabob, to put an end to the troubles, and be in friendship with him, whilst these articles are observed and performed by the Nabob.

I have signed and sealed the foregoing articles upon these terms that if the Governor and Council will sign and seal them with the Company's seal, and will swear the performance on their part, I then consent and agree to it."[1]

The English also made the following declaration :—

"We the English East India Company, in the presence of His Excellency the Nabob Munser Muluk Serajah Dowlah, Soubadar of the provinces of Bengal, Behar and Orissa, by the hands and seal of the Council, do agree and promise in the most solemn manner, that the business of the Company's Factories, which are in the jurisdiction of the Nabob, shall be transacted as formerly; that we will never do violence to any persons without cause; that we will never offer protection to any persons having accounts with the Government, to any of the King's Talukdars or Zemindars, to any murderers or robbers, nor will ever act contrary to the tenor of the articles granted by the Nabob, we will carry on our trade in the former channel, and never in any respect deviate from this agreement."[2] The Nawab then sent the usual presents to Messrs. Watson, Drake and Clive, giving to each an elephant, a dress or vest and head jewel. Messrs. Clive and Drake received those presents as representatives of the Company, but Mr. Watson, as a representative of of the King of England, refused to accept those. The Nawab then proceeded hastily to Murshidabad.[3]

It is apparent that the terms of the treaty were greatly favourable to the interests of the English in Bengal. Clive himself wrote to the Secret Committee on 22nd February, 1757—"I have little to observe on the terms obtained from the Nabob except that they are both honorable and advantageous for the Company. The grants of a mint and the villages hitherto detained from us are very considerable, and the abolishing the duties lately exacted by the Chokies, as well as confirming the free transportation of goods without customs of any kind, and the rest of the privileges of the royal phirmaund are no small points gained."[1] The formal recognition by the Nawab of all the claims of the Select Committee materially enhanced the power and prestige of the English.

---

[1] Hill, Vol. II. pp. 215-217; Stewart's History of Bengal, Appendix XII; Bolts' Considerations, Appendix I, Orme, Vol. II, pp. 135-136.

[2] Hill, Vol. II, p. 217; Ives' Voyage, pp. 1-16.

[3] Ives' Voyage, p. 117.

KALI KINKAR DATTA

---

[1] Hill, Vol. II, p. 241.

# VISION OF LOVE

## I

### Life and Death

While lingers life in frame of flesh
And thence when life departs.
I'm Thine, I'm Thine, O Love, O Love
Me pierce Thou with sharpest darts.

In Joy thou kindlest fire of life
Thy viewless flame is death.
The same thou ever truth and joy
Oh eye of deathless faith.

Oh Love, Thou joy, Oh Love Thou ruth
Make Life Thou ever shine with truth.

## II

### Desire and Love

Mouth speaks to ear and eye to eye
  But speaks to heart who straight ?
'Tis Love alone, unheard unseen
  Breaks heart's desire-closed gate
Dissolve in Thee, Love, heart and mind
Out-spew desires, the poisoned rind.

## III

### JOY-CHILD LOVE

My sins, deep dark, mount high to sky,
My virtues, shreds of cast-off pot.
My passions rage in Vulcan's fire
Untouched by peace my life and thought
Be thou, oh Love! joy-child of mind
To me, in mercy, make me blind.

## IV

### VOW OF LOVE

Thy vow of love be now fulfilled,
  Myself, my all to thee I give.
Desires of mine, as incense, burn
  I die, in thee to live.
In love they sleep, they run, they crawl
  And love is love and love is all.

## V

### LOVE UNKNOWN

I ask not what thou art, oh Love!
  To know thee, I've no care;
Be thou whatever thou may'st be
  In thee make me all bare.
O, make my name in silence live,
  My life rejected toy,
O, make thy name the magic call,
  To man, of peace and joy.

## VI

### Love's Looks

Oh tell me, love, oh tell me, love,
What thy looks can ev'r be;
My looks are but a magic glass—
Of Time all breeds to see.
As banyans live in tiny seeds
So live in love what time ev'r breeds.

## VII

### Love and Heart

How wondrous are thy beauties, love,
 These two flesh eyes can't see nor count,
For e'er love is love to heart
 This heart is love bathed in joy-fount.
Love and heart are ever one,
And make all one and done undone.

## VIII

### Am I Mine ?

O am I mine, O am I mine!
 Then why have I lost youth?
O love descend, O love descend
 And show me what is truth!
Whenever I ask, oh what I am ?
 My mind but finds a putrid sham.
O, now I'm this, now I'm not,
 By me I'm but oft forgot.
O love, unveil and make me thine,
 A naked child on thy breast shine.

## IX

### THOU AND I

Oh tell me, tell me what Thou art,
And lift me from doubt-hole,
Out or a near the same I swear
Yet Thou, my life and soul.
Glaze with love, Thy mirror of heart
Make it love-shine pure
And see Thou me and Thee and all
As one in Love ev'r sure.

MOHINIMOHAN CHATTERJI

# WHEN WILL THE FEDERATION COME INTO BEING?

The politically-minded people of the country have been filled with despair noticing the reluctance of the Princes to make any substantial sacrifice whatsoever for the privilege of coming under the proposed federation. When for the first time on the eve of the First Round Table Conference and also during the session of it the Princes expressed their willingness to come under an All-India Federation our hopes ran high. Taking it for granted from the established practice of all the federations in the world that the Princes were really willing to sacrifice a substantial part of their autonomy for the privilege of coming under an All-India Federation we were filled with thankfulness towards them. But when they began to clarify their views and gave us to understand that they were ready to put up with no diminution of the powers and privileges which they have been enjoying or to shoulder any additional financial burden our feeling of hope was changed into one of despair. But still we held our souls in patience knowing full well that the indispensable condition of our getting central responsibility was the setting up of an All-India Federation. But after the reports of the Percy Committee and the Davidson Committee have been published it has become no longer possible for us to suppress any longer our feeling of despair. The states will not only not come forward to afford any financial relief to the federation but according to the estimate of the Davidson Committee the financial settlement between the states and the federal government would impose a fresh burden of one crore upon the latter. Such a prospect has driven even a confirmed optimist like Sir Sivaswamy Iyer to express his doubt whether under such conditions as have been foreshadowed in the reports it will be worth our while to enter into such a federation. The princes seem not in the least inclined to make any monetary sacrifice to enter into the federation. Under no circumstances will they agree to the imposition of a direct tax like the Income tax within their territories for federal purposes. Neither will they agree that the posts and telegraphs or railways running in their territories (as have such) should be federalised for they want to retain them as symbols of their sovereignty. On the self-same ground some of the major states are opposed to the introduction of a uniform currency and coinage. But these very privileges upon the retention of which they are so very insistent are looked upon in countries possessing the federal form of government as the very subjects which ought to be federalised. Over and above this the Princes seem equally reluctant to abolish inland customs from which many of them derive a large part of their revenue. But there is perhaps no other subject which is more likely to stand in the way of the birth of a common citizenship as these interstate trade barriers. There may be an inland tariff war between neighbouring states as there was once in America between New York and New Jersey and between Virginia and Maryland before real union was effected there. It will be quite clear from this that the union which has been proposed in our case will be a union only in name and not in reality.

But we need not lose heart. It is only natural that high hopes should be succeeded by despair for such wild optimism, as was ours, can never be warranted by the experiences of any country having the federal form of government. A federation like every living organism must require a long time before it comes into being. It can't be got ready-made, fit for immediate use. We must allow sufficient time for the seed to germinate and the sapling to grow into a sturdy plant. This has been the invariable experience of all countries possessing the federal form of government. On an average we find that a period of from 40-50 years has elapsed from the time that the proposal was first made and the federation became a reality. Secondly we notice that in no case a union has been effected unless there has been a compelling necessity for it. It is only when the very existence of states is menaced whether by danger from within or without and also when they feel impotent to meet it individually or for the nobler purpose of living a fuller life which would have been impossible otherwise that the states form this sort of perpetual union. In America where the federal idea first originated, we find that so far back as 1643 the New England Colonies had formed a sort of confederation against the Indians which lasted for about 40 years; in 1754 Colonial delegates who had met at Albany for conference with representatives of the Six Nations discussed a premature plan of union; in 1765 delegates from nine of the Colonies met at New York to protest against taxation by Parliament; and in 1774 sat the first of the series of "Continental Congresses" with which began American union; it was in 1777 that the Articles of Confederation were drawn up and these again were practically adopted in 1781 and lastly it was only in 1789 that real union was effected. In the sister country of Canada the idea of a federation was first envisaged by Lord Durham in his famous report of 1839 and union was effected in 1867 after a total breakdown of administration and when the menace of American penetration into western Canada had become real and thus cutting it off from the western seaboard. In the case of Germany again we find that the idea of a federation was first mooted in 1806 when the "Confederacy of the Rhine" was formed by Napoleon. The German Confederation lasted from 1815-1866 being succeeded by the North German Confederation (1866-1871) and it was more than after half a century after the birth of the idea that the German Empire was at last formed in 1871. In her case it was the rivalry and fear of France which fused into one mighty union the rival units which composed it. Nothing was more eloquent of this fact than the time and place where this federation had its birth. It was when the siege of Paris was in progress that the central German states like Bavaria, Baden and Wurthenberg being suspicious of the object of Napoleon III sent delegates to King William at Versailles and formally united themselves with their northern compatriots. Once again in Australia we find that the idea of a federation was first mooted so early as in 1847 when Lord Grey outlined his scheme and it was on 1st January, 1901, that the Commonwealth of Australia entered into life. As in other cases it was the occupation of the northern part of New Guinea by Germany and the fear of her expansion in the South Pacific as well as the bogey of "yellow peril" that brought the recalcitrant states to their senses and put fresh impetus into the movement for union since 1883. Lastly in the case of South Africa the seeds of a union were first shown so far back as in 1856 by Sir George Grey and it was after more than fifty years that union became a reality, this time the fear of a native rising which would be beyond the power of any individual state to put down as well as the need of having a uniform system of railways and uniform customs duties serving as the motive behind it.

So from all these cases we can very well discover that nowhere in the world a federation has come into life all on a sudden as also when there was no compelling necessity for it. In our case it is quite sure that the Princes living as they have been doing under the protecting arms of the British Raj have up till now felt no such pressing necessity. The time will be ripe for it when they will realise that they are going to lose a great deal if they hold out any longer. At present it is clear from their attitude that they are not ready to take serious notice of the democratic movement in British India (or within their territories) Perhaps they think that they can well afford to wait for some time more before they will think of parleying with the leaders of it. Perhaps they thought during the earlier sessions of the R. T. C. that the time was ripe and so they were loud in their protestations of love of the proposed federation but when they discovered their mistake (?) their hearts hardened once more It is quite sure that when they will realise the necessity for this union they will be ready to make any legitimate sacrifice that will be demanded. It is better for us under the circumstances abandoning, for the time being, all our hopes of having an All-India Federation to concentrate all our efforts on winning central responsibility and to have a federation only of the British Indian provinces. The time spirit will surely be working to bring about this greater union for when we shall be masters of our own household and arbiters of our destiny the Princes will surely be anxious to fall in line with us. But before that it is idle to expect this consummation. In politics only hard facts count and enlightened self-interest serves as the guide and not generosity nor the spirit of self-sacrifice or noble idealism. To expect that the history of Japan will repeat itself in India and the Princes like the Samurai of Japan will pass a self-denying ordinance against them will be betraying colossal ignorance of human nature.

HARI CHARAN MUKHERJI

# SONG OF RENUNCIATIONS

I am a runner on scarlet roads,
Who dares not grasp the prize
Of body and soul's bewilderment
That dangles before mine eyes.

From windows latticed with longing,
And court-yards jasmine sweet,
Red lips of magic beckon,
And tinkle of jeweled feet;

But I, whose hot blood fashions
A mad, delirious tune,
Go back along a road of stars
Powdered with dust of moon,

To where my sweet-heart lingers
Upon a darkling stair;
And all my longings nest like birds
In the black dusk of her hair.

WADE OLIVER

# Reviews

**An Anthology of Haiku, Ancient and Modern,** by Asataro Miyamori, Maruzen Company, Ltd., Tokyo, 1932, pp. 841 xxix. Price Sh. 20.

Japan, to modern India, is more widely known as the first Asiatic victor against occidental aggressors than as the nation producing great *litterateurs* and artists : Chikamatsu and Basho, Korin and Hiroshige. But Japan is no less great in the arts of peace than in the arts of war and diplomacy; and it is extremely opportune that while the journalistic world is convulsed with the news of Japanese aggressions in China, the Maruzen Co., Ltd., the most famous and enterprising publishing house of Tokyo, publishes this grand anthology of ancient and modern Haiku poetry, translated and annotated by a renowned Japanese authority on the subject. Prof. Asataro Miyamori is a graduate of the College which developed later on into the present Keio University, specially famous for its courses in English literature. He has earned a reputation by lecturing on English language and literature at Keio, Meiji, Chuo and Toyo Universities. His *magnum opus* is entitled *Masterpieces of Chikamatsu, the Japanese Shakespeare*, published by Kegan Paul & Co. Deeply interested in drama, he visited England, France and U. S. A. in 1914-15 and his reputation as a critic attracted the attention of his Imperial Highness, Prince Takamatsu who invited him to deliver a series of lectures in 1930 on " British and American writers who have translated Japanese literature into English." In that connection the author made a comprehensive study of *Haiku* epigrams and very appropriately dedicated the present volume to the enlightened Prince who is a great patron of literature. His first study published in 1930 was entitled *One Thousand Haiku, Ancient and Modern* which was so enthusiastically received and reviewed by eminent scholars and critics like Prof. Nitobe and Prof. Igarashi that within a couple of years another sumptuously illustrated edition was published by the enterprising firm, Maruzen Co. Ltd., who enriched the volume with beautitul illustrations that Japan alone is capable of, the most important series being that of Mr. Hirafuka who contributed 18 charming coloured sketches to help the readers in visualising the plays of Japanese poetic fancy. Over and above this we find 72 valuable autographs and pictures which go to add to the documentary value of this superb volume. In book production this is no doubt a high water-mark, specially in these days of depression and it will take its well-merited place of honour by the side of another grand volume, the Japanese study on *Sandro Botticelli* which took the European world by surprise as much as a production of art as a specimen of art criticism. We wish that more and more of such volumes will be forthcoming from Japan to rectify the wrong impressions created by ill-informed and interested journalism (specially Occidental journalism) which betrays an unholy glee in dubing Japan as a sort of *enfant terrible* of the Eur-Asian and Eur-American world.

The anthology alone runs to 700 pages and this section is edited and translated with examplary care and erudition : the original Japanese texts followed by a transliteration in Roman script and a faithful and poetic rendering into English, backed by explanatory notes here and there. The difficulty of translating the iridescence of these cut-gems of Japanese poetry into the florid style of our modern lyrics has been very shrewdly demonstrated by the author with reference to a concrete poem on the *Butterfly* by the renowned Japanese poet, Buson :

"Tsurigane ni
Tomarite nemuru
Kocho kana

Upon the temple bell
A butterfly is sleeping well.

To the people who are accustomed to wallow in luxuriant poetic imageries, such a flash of suggestive brush work seems uncanny, nay unconvincing ; yet short as the poem already is, the Japanese translator is shortening it further by dropping exclamatory items like " Behold " or " Ah " warranted by the texts. Reticence in poetry reaches its very limit here and the concentration of the *rasa* (as conceived by the Hindu masters of æsthetics) is phenomenal. Haiku is a brilliant sketch, nay more, " outlines of a sketch " whose expressiveness and harmony baffles expression. One has got to meditate upon the lines to get its full value just as the Buddhist monk used to meditate on his *Vija-mantra,* finally filling up the outlines of spiritual nihilism (Nirvana) with the glorious poetry of the ineffable Lotus. An American writer, Dr. Curtis Page, in his attempt to translate the same baffling poem, spoiled it by giving a long paraphrase in addition to the translation:

" The butterfly sleeps well
Perched upon the temple bell......
Until it rings!

" The last line ' Until it rings ! ' which was never intended by the poet, spoils the entire poem; nay, utterly destroys it. In this form, it is no *Haiku* but a clumsy, ill-understood paraphrase. This poem is an objective description of a momentary impression."

The author's judgement upon the American translation is relentless but none the less true. And to enter into this world of scintillating poetry, our Indian public may get remarkable help from the wonderfully condensed phrase-poems of our Sanskrit masters as well as from the brilliant volume of our Poet, Rabindranath Tagore, who was provoked (as I can attest personally. as a humble companion in his Far Eastern tour in 1924) to compose his Bengali Haiku, published later on as *Fire-Flies* in English and *Luciols* in French. A master poet that he is, Rabindranath could manipulate Japanese technique with such an uncanny dexterity that many of his Japanese admirers were agreeably surprised to find the flashes and flavour of Japanese Haiku masters in the unpremeditated sparkle of his Indian fire-flies which he fixed on the fans or silk handkerchiefs brought by so many enthusiastic Japanese men and women during his visit. The poet's *Kanika* also is strangely reminiscent of some of the Japanese two-line masterpieces and the poet's beloved disciple, Satyendranath Dutt, catching the infection rendered several of *Tanka* poems of Yone Noguchi and other modern Japanese writers into Bengali.

So we are sure that the present volume will be keenly appreciated by all Indian lovers of poetry. specially those of the classical temperament; and the 100 pages of introduction which the learned author has given as a preface to the volume should be studied carefully by all interested in the history of Japanese poetry from early classical days of the Nara period (700 A.D.), through the epochs of Basho (1644-90), of Buson (1716-84) to the great modern master, Issa (1763-1817). Even a great poet like Shiki (1867-1902) carried on the torch of poetry down to the days of Russo-Japanese war, proving the vitality of the tradition of Japanese aestheticism which found its first sonorous modern voice in Count Okakura who through his *Book of Tea* and specially through his epoch-making volume, *The Ideals of the East* inaugurated a new era in the history of Asiatic self-assertion in art and forged the golden link of idealism connecting India, China and Japan in a grand modern Asiatic Renaissance.

KALIDAS NAG

---

**Outlines of Indian Philosophy** by M. Hiriyanna, M.A., George Allen & Unwin Ltd., p. 419. Price 15*s*. net.

Although the author of this book disclaims a more ambitious title and prefers to designate it as 'Outlines of the Indian Philosophy,' it has all the virtues and none of the vices of the treatises that keep only to 'outlines.' His treatment of the problems of Indian Philosophy is nowhere perfunctory, sketchy or shadowy, nor is its usefulness impaired by undue prolixity or inordinate partiality for texts in the original. In an authorship of this kind. fidelity to the texts is a pre-requisite of first-rate importance, which, if allowed to develop into an intemperate passion, is likely to defeat the very purpose of interpretation. Accordingly, as the present reviewer has remarked elsewhere, "a philosophic interpreter must at all costs refuse to remain in the outskirts of Indian Philosophy as a mere hewer of texts and drawer of commentaries. Indeed, accumulation of texts is one thing and illumination quite another : where many are the accumulators, only a few are torch-bearers." Truly speaking, a good many writers on Indian Philosohpy, on the plea of the objectivity of their presentation, have succumbed to the temptation of citing original texts *in extenso* and *ad nauseam*—which can have but one effect, namely of scaring away many a would-be enthusiast and admirer of Indian Philosophy. They may indeed secure to their credit (?) this much-advertised objectivity in their works, but only at the cost of their intelligibility. For, invariably do these works prove too scholarly to be of any use to scholars fresh to the field, and unaided in their efforts at philosophic construction. Imposing or impressive as they are, they can never be instructive in the end. This mishap in the way of an intelligent appreciation of Indian Philosophy is somewhat similar to the unhappy state of things prevailing among an influential section of modern philosophers in the West. Some of our modern philosophers seem to think, as C. E. M. Joad once remarked while taking stock of modern European Philosophy, that obscurity of statement is synonymous with profundity of thought and this is just the reason why they are always criticised but seldom understood. If brevity, as the saying goes, is the soul of wit, obscurity is the soul of sophistry. Our author, however, it is pleasing to note, stands in a class apart, and does not fall an easy prey to this seductive method of imposing upon his readers at the cost of enlightening them. His presentation is at once clear and concise, precise and perspicacious, intelligent and illuminating. On all these counts the present work will eminently serve, to quote his own words from the preface, "as a text-book for use in colleges where Indian philosophy is taught." In this respect the author's ' Outlines of Indian

Philosophy ' is destined to accomplish what Zeller's ' Outlines of Greek Philosophy' has achieved so far in a kindred sphere of thought.

Now, to recount in detail the different aspects of his writings and justify, in reference thereto, the clarity of his exposition are evidently out of the question here. What would be worth attempting, and what we propose to do here, is to select some salient points from the introduction which serves as an excellent synopsis of the work as a whole. We are fundamentally in agreement with him as he announces at the very outset: " A striking characteristic of Indian thought is its richness and variety. There is practically no shade of speculation which it does not include. This is a matter that is often lost sight of by its present-day critic who is fond of applying to it sweeping epithets like 'negative' and 'pessimistic' which, though not incorrect so far as some of its phases are concerned, are altogether misleading as descriptions of it as a whole " (page 16) This is as much a discovery as it is a warning to all critics of Indian thought. Philosophical labels are, as a rule, misleadng, and their inappropriateness or inaccuracy increases proportionately when they are torn out of their native context and imported into a foreign soil. As against the incident of exotic standards and criteria of judgment, what is worth emphasising and preserving at all costs is the individuality of Indian philosophy which, in the simple but convincing language of our author, " aims beyond Logic. This peculiarity of the view-points is to be ascribed to the fact that philosophy in India did not take its rise in wonder or curiosity as it seems to have done in the West ; rather it originated under the pressure of a practical need arising from the presence of moral and physical evil in life " (page 18). Further, the dictum that " the goal of Indian philosophy lies as much beyond Ethics as it does beyond Logic" (pages 22) is a striking evidence of the philosophic discernment of our author. One will go, with enthusiastic assent, further with him as he developes the thought in the next paragraph : "an extension of the world of moral action accords well with the spirit of Indian ethics whose watchword is devotion to duties rather than assertion of rights."

It is *prima facie* impossible to go on garnering such sparkling gems of thought and flashes of insight. We whole-heartedly recommend the study of this book to the students interested in Indian philosophy, particularly to those preparing for the ' Outlines of Indian Philosophy ' paper of the M. A. Examination in philosophy.

S. K Das

**The Contribution of Ancient Greece to Modern Life.** By G. Lowes Dickinson. George Allen & Unwin Ltd., London. 2*s*. cloth, 1*s*. paper, net, 1932, pp. 32.

This is the inaugural lecture on the subject running through 28 12mo pages and delivered at the Local Lectures, Summer Meeting, Cambridge University, 1932. The writer, with his characteristic lucidity, describes Greek Literature and contrasts its brief spell of greatness, apart from the two Homeric epos, with its wide and far-reaching influence. It has not only broadly touched the different forms and moods of literature—tragedy, comedy, idylls, lyrics, elegies, epigrams as well as different forms of prose—but also the thought, the subject-matter of literature, because the Greeks had great original ideas on religion, science, etc. But their studies should not be crabbed and dry-as-dust ; they should be made living by bringing them on to a level with our own age; as the writer says, "Greek studies are nothing unless they live; and they live only when we breathe into them the life of our own age."

There cannot be a better introduction for us of this age to the study of Greek thought and literature, and its perusal creates a desire for access to the lectures that followed.

PRIYARANJAN SEN

**The Principles of Civil Government, Part I.** By Akshaya K. Ghose, Bar.-at-Law, published by D. B. Taraporewala Sons and Co., pp. 323, price Rs. 2.

Civics is to-day the envy of other subjects. No doubt it might be due to the topical interest in the subject. Politics is fast becoming the daily employment of a large number of educated youths. A general demand exists for a knowledge of the fundamental political principles so that people might easily follow the kaleidoscopic political events of the day. For an intelligent understanding of the platform speeches and council orations an adequate idea of politics and economics is becoming essential. No wonder they are becoming topics of national interest just at present. The Indian Universities are undoubtedly recognising this tendency and this treatise explains the fundamental political principles in a lucid manner.

After making a brief mention of the primitive institutions he comments on the political meaning of citizenship and how it can be acquired. The rights and obligations of citizenship are given out in the second chapter.

In Chapter III the conception of State is very well brought out " as a society of people joining together with their families and their children to live well for the sake of a perfect and independent life." The essential and non-essential functions of the State are outlined briefly in the second half of the chapter.

After briefly defining a federal constitution a short account of the existing federal states is given in the 2nd book under the heading " Types of Government." Beginning with the salient features of the unwritten constitution of the English Government, the constitution of the U. S. A., the Swiss Cantons, the Union of S. Africa, the Dominion of Canada, the Australian Commonwealth, the recently formed Irish Free State, Japan and the Egyptian Constitution are referred to. It need not be stated that this forms a highly valuable contribution to our knowledge when we have been aiming at the federal constitutional idea for a United India.

After providing a historical summary of the organisation of the Government of India and the recent attempts made to secure cultural, material and economic progress of the people, the recent change from the early principle of British Rule is clearly enunciated by the author who remarks that " the Government of India Act of 1919 aims at founding a government upon the consent and co-operation of the people governed." The author is evidently very hopeful of the political future of India as consisting of a congeries of states enjoying full responsible government so that completest nationhood might be realised in course of time.

The select bibliography at the end of the book is a boon to the enquiring reader who may be interested in making an advanced study of the subject.

A very comprehensive account of our civic and political life can be gleaned out of the book. The examination-going student will find a complete and valuable summary of the essential rudiments of the subject.

B. Ramachandra Rau

---

**Empire and World Currency**, by Arthur S. Baxendale, Commonweal Press, 1*s*. 6*d*., pp. 57.

Clearly summarised by Mr. A. S. Comyn Carr this small pamphlet places before the reader the scheme of Mr. Baxendale who has been consistently propounding a remedy for the consequences of the financial and currency folly of 1925 perpetrated by Great Britain. His five books—*Britain's Coming Crash*, *Currency, an Indictment*, *Sane Currency*, *Defeat of Gold and the Doom of Gold*—give us a penetrating analysis of the after-war currency measures of the different countries. Briefly speaking his remedy is the internationalisation of the Anglo-Egyptian exchange experiment which has been working satisfactorily from 1915 to the present-day. Greece and Great Britain experimented with this scheme. France and America were virtually on this basis from 1910 till 1918. So why should not the world revive this method and be rid of the tyranny of gold ?

Aiming at the expansion of international trade and that of Great Britain at the same time Mr. Baxendale proposes to have a currency system which deposes gold from the monetary reserve. Part one of his scheme which deals with internal currency, aims at making bank-notes freely available without any limit and these are regulated by the absolute currency needs of the people. No metallic backing is needed for these notes. It would be neutral towards the influence of prices and discount rates. Grave national injuries arising during the periods of financial crises would be eliminated. The Currency Guarantee Fund does not contain barren gold yielding no profit to the state but it will be invested in international securities whose interest might in course of time enable the safe repayment of the debt of the National Debt Commissioners of England.

Part two of his scheme aims at absolute stability of exchange under all circumstances and the rate of exchange for converting one currency into that of another might be fixed at any level but "pegging arrangements" can be made to maintain this level under all circumstances.

The restoration of the exchange will take place as soon as the internal currency automatically contracts with every export of currency. No adverse balance need arise under these circumstances.

The total issue of currency in any country under this scheme will just amount to securities *plus* money awaiting investment in the Currency Guarantee Fund at home and the various funds stationed in other countries. " So long as bank-notes are issued against full value no inflation can take place under the scheme, " observes the author. The artificial limitation of money under the gold standard is a grave peril to industrial prosperity and economic progress of the nation.

This scheme by pronouncing an unfavourable verdict on gold proves to the world that it cannot keep pace with world's increasing requirements for the media of exchange as greater and greater production of goods and services is daily taking place in the modern scientific world.

The main keynote of the scheme is the *automatic system of issuing currency* and the placing of currency in the hands of consumers which have never been adopted *in toto* in any country as yet.

The author easily refutes the suggestions for managed currencies on the ground that no provision is made for stabilisation of exchanges. Likewise he rules out the proposals for bimetallism. The world has outgrown barter and a return to it is impracticable. So he opines that money is needed as a medium of exchange. But as the modern gold standard means the unforeseen coexistence of plenty and riches on one hand and poverty, beggary and sloth on the other these have to be removed. These can be removed only by the adoption of this scheme, says the author. Neither the banking industry nor any other section of people need suffer as a result of this scheme. We advise our readers to read the entire set of his writings, for without that exhaustive study they cannot easily realise how the "Empire of Gold" and the dictation of the "financial oligarchy" might soon pass away in the near future.

B. RAMACHANDRA RAU

---

# Ourselves

## LAL CHAND MOOKERJEE ENDOWMENT.

The Syndicate recently received a letter, which is given below, from Dr. Harendracoomer Mookerjee, M.A., Ph.D., forwarding 3½ per cent. G. P. Notes of the face value of Rs. 1,50,000 for creating an endowment in memory of his father, the late Mr. Lal Chand Mookerjee, under the following terms and conditions :—

*Letter from Dr. Harendracoomar Mookerjee, M.A., Ph.D., proposing to create an Endowment of 3½% G. P. Notes of the face value of Rs. 1,50,000.*

2, Dehi Serampore Road,
Entally P. O.,
Calcutta.

To

THE VICE-CHANCELLOR,
CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY,
CALCUTTA.

*The 14th November, 1932.*

SIR,

I desire to create an Endowment in memory of my late lamented father, Mr. Lal Chand Mookerjee, for sending properly qualified Bengali Protestant Christian students abroad for a course of theoretical and practical training in technical, industrial, mechanical, agricultural and allied subjects.

The Endowment is to be called Lal Chand Mookerjee Endowment and will consist of 3½ per cent. G. P. Notes of the face value of Rs. 1,50,000. My proposal is that from the interest accruing to the fund a number of scholarships should be created the largest of which should not ordinarily exceed Rs. 250 per month. The object of these scholarships is to encourage the proper type of young men of my community who may not be in affluent circumstances to avail themselves of the facilities thus offered to acquire up-to-date scientific training and be in a position thereby to serve their community and their country as leaders of industry.

I shall be obliged if you kindly move the University to accept the terms and conditions outlined below.

I have the honour to be,  
SIR,  
Your most obedient and humble servant,  
H. C. MOOKERJEE.

I propose to make over to the University of Calcutta 3½ per cent. Government Securities of the face value of Rs. 1,50,000 on the following terms and conditions:—

1. Notwithstanding that the University shall, after formal acceptance of my proposal, become the custodian of the Government Securities and hold the same in deposit for the creation of scholarships out of its interest only as laid down below, only the interest shall belong absolutely to me during my life-time and after my death it shall belong absolutely to my wife Srimati Bangabala Mookerjee during her life-time and the said interest periodically accruing shall be realised by the Registrar of the Calcutta University for the time being and made over to me and after my death to my wife, unless I in my life-time or my wife after my death give or gives notice in advance to the Registrar of the Calcutta University of re-investing the interest in approved Government Securities, in which case it shall be added to the corpus of the Endowment. After the death of both of us any portion of the interest which is not spent on scholarships shall be added to the corpus of the Endowment.

2. That after my death and the death of my wife, whichever shall happen later, monthly scholarships payable out of the interest shall be created and their number shall be determined. They shall be styled "The Lal Chand Mookerjee Foreign Scholarships for Protestent Bengali Christians."

3. That these scholarships shall be tenable for not more than five years outside the territorial limits of India and the amount of each scholarship shall not ordinarily be more than Rs. 250 per month and that the minimum amount of each scholarship which may vary in different cases as well as the period thereof shall be determined by a Committee of Management of Governing Body mentioned below after consideration of the subject or subjects selected for study and the ordinary expenses of decent living in the place or places where the study is to be pursued.

4. The subject or subjects for the scholarships will be selected from among the following technical subjects:—

Spinning, weaving, dye-making, mechanical and electrical engineering, aviation and applied aeronautics, film making, manufacture of photographic plates and materials, mining and colliery work, soap-making, pottery, enamel, glassware, leather and leather goods, celluloid work, fruit-preserving, biscuit-making, sugar-refining, manufacture of drugs and medicines from indigenous products, manufacture of cheap building materials, motor car parts, carpet-making, hosiery, scientific agriculture, scientific horticulture or floriculture, cultivation of medicinal plants, dairy and poultry farming. The present list of subjects is by no means exhaustive, the Committee of Management mentioned below having the power to add to them, from time to time.

5. That for the purpose of general management, control and more specially for selecting suitable candidates, for sanctioning the subjects, the institutions and the places of study, for fixing the amount and the period for which each scholarship is tenable and the like, a Committee of Management shall be formed the personnel of which shall be determined by the Syndicate of the Calcutta University provided, however, that the majority of the members shall be Indians and the Vice-Chancellor shall be its Chairman, *ex-officio*, and it shall contain at least two Protestant Christian members nominated by the Syndicate from among the Principals and Teachers of colleges affiliated to the University of Calcutta and provided also that my pupils Messrs. Ramaprasad Mookerjee and Syamaprasad Mookerjee, sons of the late Sir Asutosh Mookerjee, and Mr. Susilkumar Lahiri, M.A., B.L., Vakil, High Court, shall be life-members of the said Committee. The proceedings of the Managing Committee will be subject to confirmation by the Syndicate.

6. Every applicant of " The Lal Chand Mookerjee Foreign Scholarship " will be required strictly to conform to the following conditions:—

(*a*) He shall be a Protestant Christian and a native of Bengal and born of Bengali parents and he shall be called upon to submit conclusive evidence that his father and mother are or were both Bengalis by birth and speak or spoke the Bengali language as their mother tongue and furthermore that both of them are or were Protestant Christians at the time of his birth.

(*b*) He shall be of sound health and ordinarily between 20 and 26 years of age.

(*c*) He shall be a graduate in Science or Engineering preferably of Calcutta University or shall have passed an examination which will be regarded by the Committee of Management as equivalent thereto and shall produce satisfactory evidence of previous practical training in workshops in the subject of his study or in any other allied subjects. Poverty of the applicants and their guardians must be taken into account in awarding the scholarships.

(*d*) He shall be required to submit once a year or more frequently if so directed by the Committee of Management a certificate of good conduct, satisfactory progress and regular attendance from the head of the institution where he studies and failure to produce this certificate will entail discontinuance of his scholarship. The said certificate shall also contain details of attendance at lectures and practical classes, examination results if any and reports from the teachers or engineers or other officers under whom the scholar is undergoing training.

7. If at any time the Committee of Management are satisfied that no applicant for scholarship possesses the minimum qualifications as laid down above generally, the Committee shall have the right of rejecting all applications and adding the unexpended amount or amounts to the corpus of the Endowment.

8. That in conformity with the aims and objects of the Endowment as laid down above, the Committee of Management shall have the power of making bye-laws and regulations from time to time regarding the selection of candidates, of subjects of study, of places where such study is to be prosecuted as well as regarding the amount of the several scholarships.

9. The University shall permit me to make such further additions to the corpus of this Trust Fund as I may be able to add from time to time.

10. That the Committee of Management will keep themselves in touch with the student on return after completion of his study and assist him in being apprenticed to any factory or industrial concern if he so desires with a view to his acquiring experience of Indian conditions of the particular industry in which he has specialised.

11. That in case interest accumulates to such an extent that a larger number of candidates may be trained on the above terms and conditions, the Committee of Management will, if practicable, send more candidates for study abroad or continue the scholarship to any selected student for a further year.

12 That the University acting as Trustees will forthwith deposit the G. P. Notes in safe custody with the Imperial Bank of India, Calcutta, and will open an account in the name of the above fund to be termed "Lal Chand Mookerjee Foreign Scholarship Fund" and will also realise

the interest of the said G. P. Notes for credit in the account of the aforesaid fund.

While I have no desire to bind down any one who might in future be benefited by this endowment, I think it desirable to record that it would please me much if scholars returning from abroad live in the Indian style and, if possible, try to help some other poor and deserving student."

This generous offer of Dr. Mookerjee was accepted with thanks by the Senate on the 21st January, 1933.

* * *

## XVIIITH INTERNATIONAL MONTESSORI TRAINING COURSE TO BE HELD IN BARCELONA, SPAIN, FROM FEBRUARY TO JUNE, 1933.

The changed and more favourable political and social condition of Spain, a new European Republic, anxious for educational progress, has decided Dr. Montessori to give in Barcelona her XVIIIth International Training Course, theoretical and practical, of her pedagogical method. Before the Dictatorship, in 1916, the IVth course of the series was also given in Barcelona.

Dr. Montessori has extended this new Barcelona Course to the teachers of all countries, specially to those of the Spanish-speaking Republics ; to no other course will it be so much to their advantage to attend as to this, which represents the nearest approach to America.

The general characters of this new course are the same as in previous courses. *It will be directed personally by Dr. Montessori herself* and three weekly lessons will be given. Although Dr. Montessori speaks Spanish well, she will deliver her lectures in Italian. These will be translated into Castilian and Catalan (if a number of hearers wish it) and into another language. Other translations into convenient languages spoken by those registered will be facilitated. (There will also be given a course in the Italian language, Practical lessons, given in excellent Montessori Schools, will include the cultural cycle which begins with the child of four and proceeds on up to the elementary school boy who is to enter a secondary school.

Special lectures will be devoted to religious education. Others still will be given on the care of babies and on the education of abnormal children.

Foreigners in the Course will have a chance to learn the graceful folk dances of Catalonia which Dr. Montessori has incorporated into her school.

There is also the possibility for them to study in their spare time eurythmics in a qualified Jaques-Dalcroze Institute, and to follow regular courses in the Spanish and Catalan languages, in literature, geography, history, art, etc., in the University of Barcelona, and in other educational centres of the city.

Further details to be had from the office, Ronda Universitat, 7, Barcelona, Spain. Letters of enquiry are to be addressed to Mr. Edward Barba. Adequate facilities will be arranged for English-speaking teacher students proposing to join the course.

Ordinary fee for foreigners: 36 pounds for the whole Course. (Special terms to those coming from Spanish and Portuguese-speaking countries.)

FORM OF APPLICATION

(*Name*)

..............................................................................................................

(*position and degrees*)

*a resident in*

(*home town and state*)

*address* ..............................................................................................................

*hereby registers to the XVIIIth International Moutessori Training Course and forwards*..................................................

(*amount*)

*in*.............................................. *payable to Mr. Edward Barba,*

(*order, cheque, etc.*)

*Ronda Universitat, 7, Barcelona, Spain.*

..............................

(*signature*)

* * *

## INDIA INSTITUTE OF DIE DEUTSCHE AKADEMIE OFFERS STIPENDS TO INDIAN SCHOLARS FOR THE ACADEMIC YEAR OF 1933-1934.

On behalf of India Institute of Die Deutsche Akademie, we wish to announce that the following stipends in Institutions of higher learning in Germany, will be available for Indian scholars (male or female) of outstanding ability for the academic year of 1933-1934:

1. Berlin: An Indian physician will have the opportunity of securing practical training in *St. Hedwing's Hospital in Berlin.* He will be taken as a Volunteer Assistant. The candidate must be a graduate of a Medical College (M.B.) with hospital experience in India. He will receive free Board with the hospital staff.

2. Freiberg (Saxony): One stipend at the *Mining University of Freiberg* consisting of free tuition, free lunch in the Student's Mess (Mittagstisch in Mensa Akademia). The stipend-holder will have the special opportunity of securing lodging including breakfast and supper for RM. 60—(sixty marks) per month.

3. Hamburg: One stipend at the *University of Hamburg,* consisting of free tuition and a pocket-money of RM. 30—(thirty marks) per month. The candidate will be given free private coaching in the German language.

4. Hohenheim (Württemberg): One stipend at the *Agricultural University of Hohenheim,* consisting of free tuition and free lodging.

5. Jena: One stipend at the famous *University of Jena,* entitling the scholar to receive free tuition at the famous *University Institute for Applied Optics and Microscopy* (Institute für angewandte Optik und wissenschaftliche Mikroskopie) and a poket-money of RM. 30—(thirty marks) per month. Only the most highly qualified students, possessing qualifications for specialising in this branch of study, should apply.

These stipends are tenable provisionally for two academic semesters only. The first semester begins early in November 1933; and the second semester ends in July 1934.

Applicants for these stipends must be graduates of recognised Indian universities, preferably scholars possessing research experience. Applications from non-graduates will be given consideration, only if they have recognised literary or scientific achievements to their credit. Every applicant must possess good health and supply at least two recommendations from professors or Indian public men, about his scholarship and character. *It is desired that the applicant should have fair knowledge of the German language, as all academic work in Germany is carried on through the medium of German.*

No application will be given consideration, unless it is guaranteed for by some prominent professor or an otherwise well known Indian public man that the applicant is really earnest about his application and will certainly come to Germany before the 1st of September 1933, if a stipend is offered to him.

It is imperative that a stipend-holder should arrive at Munich by the 1st of September and stay in the city *at his own cost* till the academic year begins in November, *devoting these weeks to intensive study of German language* in the German language courses for foreigners at the University of Munich, where he will be exempted from tuition-fees. It is however, presupposed that an applicant for a stipend possesses working knowledge of German. We are forced to take this measure, because a student not having adequate knowledge of German, before beginning his academic work, fails to get the benefit of his attending the University and often loses six months' time.

We want to make it clear that apart from the stipend, the stipend-holder must be prepared to spend at least RM. 100 per month for the necessary expenses not included in the different stipends.

All applications should reach India Institute of Die Deutsche Akademie before the 15th of April 1933. A special committee of experts will select the successful candidates who will be promptly notified of the decision. Selection of successful candidates will be determined solely by the academic qualifications of applicants. Certificates and testimonials of applicants *will not be returned.*

All applications should be *directly* sent to the following address :—

Dr. Franz Thierfelder
Hon. Secretary, India Institute of Die Deutsche Akademie
"Maximilianeum," *Munich* Germany.

North German Lloyd Company offers a reduction of 10% on the fare for single trip in cabin class or second class for the Indian student of the Deutsche Akademie coming to Germany and returned to India from Germany ; provided they travel during the "off-season," *i.e.* from Europe during April to July and from Colombo from July to January. Detailed information on this subject can be secured from the representative of North German Lloyd at Colombo, c/o the office of Hanseatic Trading Company, Colombo, Ceylon.

We are glad to report to the public that the University of Königsberg has created facilities for an Indian student who is willing to teach Hindi at the University. Since the Königsberg University authorities want the student to take up his work by the 1st of May 1933, the candidate had to be selected from the Indian Students already studying in Germany.

In co-operation with the Academy of Fine Arts of Munich we succeeded in granting facilities to an Indian sculptor, Mr. Sudhir R. Khastgir of Dacca, who will begin his studies at the Academy in April next.

* * *

## REPORT OF THE SECOND CONVENTION OF THE FEDERATION OF INDIAN STUDENTS ABROAD, HELD IN MUNICH ON THE 20TH AND 21ST DECEMBER, 1932.

In pursuance of the resolution adopted at the first convention held in London, December 1932, the second convention met in Munich on the 20th and 21st December, 1932. A fair number of student delegates from England, France and Germany participated in the convention. Mrs. Rena Datta of the International Student Service, Geneva, Mr. P. K. Dutt, Educational *Adviser to* the High Commissioner for India in England, attended. Mrs. Rena Datta was elected President of the convention. The convention met for the first time in the Goethe Institute of the Deutsche Akademie at 9 A.M. on Tuesday the 20th December when formal business was gone through. Messages from Mr. James Parkes from Geneva and Dr. Taraknath Das from Italy were read at the meeting. A large number of letters and telegrams from people who were debarred by previous engagement or otherwise from attending the meeting, were also read.

The inaugural meeting, which was attended by a large number of prominent personalities of Munich, was held at 3 P.M. on the same day in the Deutsche Akademie. The spacious auditorium of the Maximilianeum palace, where the Deutsche Akademie is housed, was full to overflowing. After the address of welcome by Dr. Miss Maitreyi Bose, Chairman of the Reception Committee, His Excellency Dr. Goldenberger, Minister of Education, Bavaria, in a few well chosen words extended his hearty welcome to the convention and wished it all success. He was followed by Regierungspräsident Dr. von Winterstein, who stressed on the value of such nonpolitical organisations towards a better mutual understanding of Indo-German cultural problems, Direktor Fritz Beck of the Deutsche Akademische Auslandsstelle next associated himself with the foregoing remarks and extended his hearty welcome to the Indian guests. Dr. Franz Thierfelder, the Secretary of the Deutsche Akademie, then gave an inspiring address, in which he expressed his fervent hope for a closer cultural union between the two nations and referred to the part played by the Deutsche Akademie towards that end. Baron von Könitz, Direktor of the South-German Luft-Hansa and Professor Aufhauser also spoke. Dr. P. K. Dutt then made an exhaustive survey of the general problem of Indian Students Migration abroad. His address which lasted for about half an hour was keenly followed and much appreciated. A special message of greeting was at this stage received from Oberbürgermeister Dr. Scharnagel, the Mayor of Munich, and was read at the meeting.

The convention met on Wednesday, the 21st December, in the Committee Room of the Deutsche Akademische Auslandsstelle, when a number of papers on facilities of education in different countries were read and discussed. The convention then adopted certain resolutions, which are given in the annexed sheets. As the President had to leave Munich at midday, Mr. P. K. Dutt was requested to carry on the duties of the President, which he kindly did for the remainder of the session. The convention came to a close with a Dinner, which was organised under the joint auspices of the convention and the Hindusthan Club, Munich, on the night of the 21st December in the Hotel Bayerischer Hof, one of the most fashionable hotels in Munich. Covers were laid for 45 people and a varied musical programme was gone through. The Company broke up late at night.

But for the ungrudging help and co-operation of Dr. Franz Thierfelder and Direktor Beck, the convention could not have achieved the success it did. Dr. Thierfelder, who is reputed to be the friend, philosopher and guide of Indian students in Germany, placed the resources of the Deutsche Akademie at the disposal of the organisers. Direktor Beck, whose sympathies for Indian students, have been practically demonstrated in more than one way, helped the convention by granting free use of rooms and relieved it of financial burden by undertaking to pay for the expenses of the President's stay in Munich. He also entertained the members to afternoon tea. The leading papers of Munich took prominent notice of the conference and devoted considerable space in recording the proceedings. The convention, it may be finally added, was wholly non-political and only matters affecting interests of Indian Students Abroad were discussed.

* * *

### RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY THE SECOND CONVENTION OF THE FEDERATION OF INDIAN STUDENTS ABROAD HELD IN MUNICH ON THE 20TH AND 21ST DECEMBER, 1932.

1. This Second Convention of the Federation of Indian Students Abroad expresses its thanks to the Deutsche Akademie, Deutsche Akademische Auslandsstelle, Ministry of Education, Bavaria, the International Student Service and the Education Department of the High Commissioner for India in England, for the help they have rendered to the Federation by their active participation in this convention.

2. This convention requests the High Commissioner for India to take up with the proper authorities the question of assessment and equivalence of Indian and Continent of European degrees for the benefit of Indians studying in those countries.

3. With a view to the amelioration of unemployment amongst educated Indians, this convention requests the different University bodies in India to undertake a scientific investigation of this problem and to make practical suggestions for the guidance of their students in the choice of a career.

4. This convention urges upon the Indian merchants and commercial organisations having business relationships with firms abroad to exercise their influence wherever possible in securing facilities for practical training for Indian students.

5. In view of the present state of the Federation, this convention requests the International Students Service to render

assistance and act in the name of the Federation in securing the election of the Central Council.

6. Resolved that steps be taken to publish an Annual of the Federation containing: (*a*) a descriptron of the various organisations comprising the Federation, (*b*) a record of the achievements of the Indian students abroad, and (*c*) such other matters as may be of interest.

7. Resolved that the next convention be held in Paris during the X-mas holidays, 1933.

8. Resolved that these resolutions be circulated to the proper authorities.

9. A vote of thanks to the Chair was moved and carried with acclamation.

* * *

### A NEW Ph.D.

Mr. Binaychandra Sen, M.A., B.L., P.R.S., Mouat Medallist, Lecturer in the Post-Graduate Department of Ancient Indian History, who went to Europe on study leave in 1930, has recently returned after completion of his work. He has been awarded the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History by the University of London on a thesis on Indian Epigraphy. Dr. Sen carried on his researches under the supervision of Dr. L. D. Barnett of the British Museum.

* * *

### SIR PRAPHULLACHANDRA ROY FELLOWSHIP.

(*i*) The Sir P. C. Roy Fellowship which was awarded to Dr. J. C. Bardhan for one year in February, 1931, has been renewed for a further period of one year with effect from the 1st February, 1932.

(*ii*) Dr. Satyaprasad Roychoudhury, D.Sc., has been appointed Sir P. C. Ray Research Fellow on the usual terms and conditions with effect from the 1st February, 1933.

* * *

## DATE FOR THE M. B. EXAMINATIONS.

Monday, the 24th April, 1933, has been fixed as the commencing date for the next M.B. Examinations.

* * *

## DATE FOR THE B. COM. EXAMINATION.

The 3rd May, 1933, has been fixed as the commencing date for the next B. Com. Examination.

* * *